A Comparative Study of the Teaching Methods of the LDS and Non-LDS Sunday School Movements in the United States Prior to 1900

Ronald Lewis Knighton
Brigham Young University - Provo
A COMPARATIVE STUDY OF THE TEACHING METHODS OF THE
L.D.S. AND NON-L.D.S. SUNDAY SCHOOL MOVEMENTS
IN THE UNITED STATES PRIOR TO 1900

A Thesis
Presented to the
Department of Graduate Studies in Religious Instruction
Brigham Young University

In Partial Fulfillment
of the Requirements for the Degree
Master of Religious Education

by
Ronald Lewis Knighton
May, 1968
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

The writer wishes to express sincere appreciation and gratitude to the following persons who have contributed to the completion of this study:

To Dr. LaMar C. Berrett, chairman of the thesis committee, for his helpful suggestions, patience, and encouragement in completing this work;

To Dr. Howard H. Barron, member of the thesis committee, for his suggestions, friendly encouragement, and personal interest;

To Larry G. Best for his time spent in editing this work and for his helpful criticism and suggestions;

To my parents who have encouraged me in this study and for instilling in me throughout my life the principle of not being content with mediocrity when excellence is within view;

To my children who have been most patient during the many hours of researching and writing;

Finally, and above all, to my dear wife, Shirlee, for her patient support, constant encouragement, and helpful suggestions which have helped bring this study to completion.
TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CHAPTER</th>
<th>PAGE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I. INTRODUCTION.</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Statement of the Problem.</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Importance of the Study</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Delimitations of the Study.</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Limitations of the Study.</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Definition of Terms</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sunday schools.</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sunday school union</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Church or L.D.S. Church</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teaching methods.</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Research Design</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Organization of the Remainder of the Study.</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II. HISTORICAL SETTINGS</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Background and Development of English and American Sunday Schools</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Early Sunday schools in England</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Early Sunday schools in America</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Sunday school unions.</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Religious education in the Sunday school.</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Background and Development of Sunday Schools in the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints.</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Richard Ballantyne and the first Sunday school.</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHAPTER</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------------</td>
<td>-----------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A period of independent Sunday schools.</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>George Q. Cannon and the Juvenile Instructor.</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Deseret Sunday School Union</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III. AN ANALYSIS OF TEACHING METHODS USED BY NON-L.D.S.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SUNDAY SCHOOLS IN AMERICA PRIOR TO 1900</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Student-Centered Methods.</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reading, writing, and spelling exercises.</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Workbook and manual assignments</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Catechization (questions and answers) and question books.</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Memorization and recitation</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oral reading and narrations</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Instructional singing and praying</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Library work.</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Discussion.</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Problem solving</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Home study, application assignments, &quot;tickets&quot; and &quot;leaflets&quot;</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Researching</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Examinations and reviews.</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Harmonizing</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Counseling.</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Themes, compositions, and reports</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Finger plays.</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CHAPTER

"Selected or Limited Lessons" and
"International Lessons" .......................... 38
Teacher-Centered Methods ....................... 40
Reading by teacher ................................ 41
Lecture ........................................... 41
Example .......................................... 42
Story telling ...................................... 42
Elucidation ....................................... 43
Individualization ................................. 43
Object-Centered Methods ....................... 44
Maps, charts, and outlines ..................... 44
Cards ............................................ 45
Physical objects .................................. 46
Illustrations, pictures, and photographs .... 46
Bulletin boards .................................. 47
Blackboard ....................................... 47
Summary .......................................... 48

IV. AN ANALYSIS OF TEACHING METHODS USED BY L.D.S. SUNDAY
SCHOOLS PRIOR TO 1900, AND A COMPARISON OF THE
SIMILARITIES AND DIFFERENCES BETWEEN THESE METHODS
AND THE TEACHING METHODS OF THE NON-L.D.S. SUNDAY
SCHOOLS DURING THAT TIME .................... 49

Student-Centered Methods of L.D.S. Sunday Schools .. 53
Reading and spelling exercises .................. 53
Instructional singing and praying ............... 54
CHAPTER | PAGE
---|---
Oral reading by students. | 55
Library work. | 56
Examinations and reviews. | 57
Catechization (questions and answers) and explanatory questions | 59
Memorization and recitation | 60
Home study and application assignments. | 62
Field trips | 63
Student readings, narrations, and dialogues | 64
Student reports, talks, essays, and compositions | 65
Study periods | 66
Drill exercises | 66
Discussion. | 67
Researching | 67
Student testimonies, comments, explanations, and stories | 68
Notebooks | 69
Student projects. | 69
Exhorting and counseling. | 70
Problem solving | 70
Question box. | 71
Finger plays. | 72
"Leaflets". | 72
Teacher-Centered Methods of L.D.S. Sunday Schools | 76
Reading by teacher. | 76
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CHAPTER</th>
<th>PAGE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Story telling</td>
<td>76</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lecture</td>
<td>77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Elucidation</td>
<td>78</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Example</td>
<td>79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gem thoughts.</td>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Individualization</td>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Harmonizing and summarizing</td>
<td>81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher testimony</td>
<td>82</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Visiting authorities</td>
<td>82</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Object-Centered Methods of L.D.S. Sunday Schools</td>
<td>83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Illustrations and pictures.</td>
<td>83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cards</td>
<td>84</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Charts, maps, and outlines.</td>
<td>85</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Sacrament of the Lord's Supper.</td>
<td>87</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Physical objects</td>
<td>88</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Blackboard</td>
<td>89</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Similarities and Differences between the Teaching</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Methods of the L.D.S. Sunday Schools and the</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non-L.D.S. Sunday Schools in America Prior to</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1900.</td>
<td>90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Similarities between student-centered methods</td>
<td>90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Differences between student-centered methods</td>
<td>92</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Similarities between teacher-centered methods</td>
<td>94</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Differences between teacher-centered methods</td>
<td>94</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Similarities between object-centered methods</td>
<td>95</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHAPTER</td>
<td>PAGE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Differences between object-centered methods</td>
<td>96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Summary</td>
<td>96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V. SUMMARY, FINDINGS AND CONCLUSIONS</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Summary</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Purpose of the study</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Delimitations of the study</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Research procedure</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Findings</td>
<td>101</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conclusions</td>
<td>102</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BIBLIOGRAPHY</td>
<td>104</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CHAPTER I

INTRODUCTION

One of the great arts that has spread its influence throughout most areas of education and learning is the art of teaching. Speaking of this art, William Douglas Mackensie, past president of Hartford Theological Seminary and the Hartford School of Religious Pedagogy, stated:

The art of teaching is, when we regard it calmly, the loftiest of all arts. He who gives himself deliberately to this work is fashioning forms more beautiful than those of any sculptor, and producing pictures more beautiful than those of the greatest artist. More wonderful are his products than the poems of the greatest singers of mankind. For he who can accompany one child after another, even to scores and hundreds of them, through the critical stages of their development, and help to mold them for an eternal life, is not only himself living among the noblest ideals and filling his heart with the sweetest hopes, but he is teaching other hearts to hope, other minds to see the truth, and filling other lives with an eternal song. Surely if there is an art in this, and if it is the loftiest of all arts, we who believe in it, and love it, we who have given our lives in any measure to its pursuit, must set ourselves to know and master its principles and its methods.¹

The art of teaching requires that the teacher become involved in the study of three distinct topics. First, he must have investigated the nature of the learner—the subject of psychology. Second, he must have selected some subject of instruction, or the particular subject with which he is concerned—history, language, science, one of the arts,

a Scripture story, a Christian doctrine, or a law of conduct. And third, from all the problems arising out of the relationship of the first two, he must have come to an understanding of the teaching methods by which the subject may be adapted to the learner. This thesis is concerned with the last of these topics.

Religious education, like all other fields of education, has endeavored to develop the art of teaching among its teachers. During its two hundred years of development, the Sunday school has been a part of this religious education movement and has sought to improve its methods of instruction. From early methods of catechizing and scripture memorization to its present forms of instruction, the Sunday school has utilized a variety of teaching methods. One of the many denominations to utilize Sunday schools in the development of a religious education program was The Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints. Just how the early efforts of this Sunday school movement have compared with the efforts of other denominational Sunday school movements in America in the development of teaching methods is the body of this study.

I. STATEMENT OF THE PROBLEM

It was the purpose of this study (1) to investigate the teaching methods used in the Sunday school movement in America prior to 1900 and the teaching methods of the Sunday schools of The Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints prior to that time; and (2) to compare the

---

2Ibid., p. 179.
similarities and differences between the teaching methods of these
Sunday school developments.

II. IMPORTANCE OF THE STUDY

The study of religious education in the Sunday schools of The
Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints concerns just one of many
areas of religious education which have developed in this Church.
Nevertheless, the Sunday school has been a significant area, and the
teaching methods used in the Sunday schools have been an important part
of their development. In addition to the Sunday schools developed in
The Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints, many other Sunday
schools have developed as part of the religious education movement in
America. The problem is raised: what are the similarities and
differences between the teaching methods used by the Sunday schools of
The Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints and those used by the
other Sunday schools of America? To the writer's knowledge a comparison
to determine these similarities and differences has never been made.

III. DELIMITATIONS OF THE STUDY

This thesis was delimited in its scope to include as Sunday
schools in The Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints (1) the early
independent Sunday schools, (2) the Parent Sunday School Union, and
(3) the Deseret Sunday School Union. The Parent Sunday School Union,
through a reorganization, became the Deseret Sunday School Union in
1872. The Sunday schools of the American Sunday school movement have
been delimited (1) to the early independent Sunday schools of America;
(2) to the American Sunday School Union; and (3) to auxiliary unions of the American Sunday School Union. The American Sunday School Union and its Auxiliary unions were supported by the Methodist, Baptist, Presbyterian, Congregational, Lutheran, Reformed Dutch, and Episcopal denominations. The study was further delimited to include teaching methods found in the above mentioned Sunday schools prior to 1900.

IV. LIMITATIONS OF THE STUDY

The study was limited by the absence of information about part of the Sunday schools conducted prior to 1900 in America. The lack of exact dates indicating when many of the teaching methods were introduced as part of the instructional program of the various Sunday schools has also limited this study, particularly in the comparative sections where dates of implementation were necessary to fully compare the various methods used by the different Sunday schools.

V. DEFINITION OF TERMS

Sunday schools. Schools held on Sunday under the direction of church connected personnel.

Sunday school union. An organization uniting individual Sunday schools under a common set of regulations and a joint supervising board.

Church or L.D.S. Church. The Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints.
Teaching methods. Methods of instruction used in the Sunday schools.

VI. RESEARCH DESIGN

This study was conducted by reviewing information about the historical background of non-L.D.S. Sunday schools in Europe and America and the Sunday schools of the L.D.S. Church. Such information was then collected and developed into a brief historical overview of the development of these Sunday schools. A comprehensive study of teaching methods in Sunday schools of the L.D.S. Church and the American Sunday School Union and its auxiliary unions was then made. Findings from this study were analyzed, and a comparison was made of similarities and differences between the teaching methods of the Sunday schools of the L.D.S. Church and those of the American Sunday School Union Sunday schools.

VII. ORGANIZATION OF THE REMAINDER OF THE STUDY

The remainder of this thesis is organized and reported in the following order:

CHAPTER II is a review of the development and background of non-L.D.S. Sunday schools in England and America, and Sunday schools of the L.D.S. Church.

CHAPTER III is an analysis of the teaching methods used in the Sunday schools of the American Sunday School Union and its auxiliary unions prior to 1900.
CHAPTER IV is an analysis of the teaching methods of the L.D.S. Sunday schools prior to 1900 and a comparison with those of the American Sunday School Union Sunday schools during that time.

CHAPTER V is a presentation of a summary, the findings, and the conclusions.
CHAPTER II

HISTORICAL SETTINGS

Sunday school teaching methods were affected by their time and place of introduction into the Sunday school movement and by the background of those introducing them. Therefore, the historical events surrounding the origin of non-L.D.S. Sunday schools in Europe and America and of L.D.S. Sunday schools is discussed here (1) to establish a proper setting for the study of teaching methods in these Sunday schools; and (2) to provide background information about key individuals associated with their origin and development. Two examples are given to illustrate these purposes.

The need for proper setting is illustrated by Robert Raikes' Sunday school in Gloucester, England, in 1871. He utilized methods of alphabetizing, reading, and spelling because he was working with children in an area where most of them had never been taught to read and spell. 1 A Scottish Sunday school, on the other hand, did not need these methods since all children were taught reading and spelling in public schools. 2

The effect of a person's background upon his teaching methods is


illustrated in the Sunday schools of Richard Ballantyne. He had a background associated with Scottish Sunday schools and organized his Sunday school in the Salt Lake Valley according to his Scottish experience. Therefore, his Salt Lake Sunday school did not utilize alphabetizing and spelling, but centered in methods of story telling and Bible reading. 

Some of the similarities and differences between teaching methods of the non-L.D.S. Sunday schools in America prior to 1900 and those of the L.D.S. Sunday schools prior to that time may be better understood by a study of the historical development of these Sunday schools.

I. BACKGROUND AND DEVELOPMENT OF ENGLISH AND AMERICAN SUNDAY SCHOOLS

Early Sunday schools in England. Sunday schools had their earliest beginnings in the middle of the seventeenth century in England. From then to 1781, Sunday schools were individually established and generally very short lived because of persecutions received from those who felt Sunday schools desecrated the Sabbath. These early beginnings were conducted in homes or churches. The instruction usually consisted of catechizing and reading the scriptures. On some occasions time was spent studying the fundamentals of reading and spelling or singing some devotional hymns. The "real" beginning of the general Sunday school movement began with Robert Raikes in Gloucester, England, in 1781. Born

3Conway B. Sonne, Knight of the Kingdom (Salt Lake City: Deseret Book Company, 1949), pp. 45-49.

in Gloucester in 1735, the son of the printer and proprietor of the Gloucester Journal. Raikes grew up with a strong character of benevolence. As years passed, he took over his father's printing business which brought him in contact with many of the depraved conditions of society. Mr. Raikes soon gained a desire to develop a program of education to aid those with unfortunate circumstances of life. He began by spending much time with prison inmates teaching them the fundamental principles of reading and writing and attempting to encourage them in the principles of the Christian life.⁵

One day... he went into the suburbs of his native city to hire a gardener. The man was from home, and while Mr. Raikes awaited his return, he was much disturbed by a group of noisy boys who infested the street. He asked the gardener's wife the cause of these children being so neglected and depraved. Her emphatic reply was, "Oh, Sir! if you were here on a Sunday, you would pity them indeed, we cannot read our Bible in peace for them." This answer operated with the force of electricity, and called forth all the energy of his benevolent soul. "Can Nothing, be done for these poor children? Is there any body near that will take them to school on a Sunday?" He was informed that there was a person in the neighbourhood who would probably do it. "At this important moment (to use his own language) the word 'try' was so powerfully impressed upon his mind as to decide him at once for action," and he accordingly hired a woman in the neighbourhood to teach the poor children on Sundays, and thus commenced the first Sunday School.⁶

Following the success of this first Sunday school, Mr. Raikes began the establishment of others throughout the British Empire. They soon spread throughout all of Europe. He died thirty years later in

⁵ The Christian Teachers Manual (Boston: Bowles and Dearborn, 1828), I, pp. 7-8.

It is estimated that over three hundred thousand children were enrolled as Sunday school scholars at that time.\(^7\)

*Early Sunday schools in America.* Sunday schools in America were begun somewhat independently of the European movement. As early as the middle of the eighteenth century the occasional Sunday school was found in America. Similar to the early efforts in England, these were limited to a small single setting and were generally short lived because of persecutions from those who felt Sunday schools desecrated the Sabbath. The "real" Sunday school movement in America began in Philadelphia with a meeting of the city's leading philanthropists in December, 1790, for the purpose of establishing Sunday schools for the city. By December 26, a constitution was adopted for the establishment of The First-Day or Sunday School Society. Its first school was opened in March, 1791.\(^8\)

It was not until the beginning of the nineteenth century that American Sunday schools began to share with and utilize materials from English Sunday schools. Apparently there was no earlier contact due to the American Revolution of the latter part of the eighteenth century. During this time Americans attempted to isolate themselves from England. Since it was during this same period that Raikes established Sunday schools in England, it is doubtful that the Americans ever really knew

---

\(^7\)Ibid.

\(^8\)Pray, *op. cit.*, pp. 203-205.
of English Sunday schools until some years following their establishment. 9

The Sunday school unions. When Sunday schools began in England and America, they used paid teachers; however, the expense of hiring teachers became a great impediment to Sunday school progress. Not long after the establishment of Sunday schools in both places gratuitous teachers came to their rescue. 10 By 1816 gratuitous teaching had been generally established in American Sunday schools. 11 Societies and unions, primarily nondenominational, were also established in England 12 and America 13 for the promotion of the Sunday school cause.

The development of Sunday school unions in America came in 1791 with unions being organized in a number of the principal cities. These later combined their resources and interests in 1824 to form the American Sunday School Union. 14 The purpose of this united effort, given in the preamble of its constitution, is
to concentrate the efforts of Sabbath School Societies in the different sections of our country; to strengthen the hands of the friends of pious instruction of the Lord's day; to disseminate useful information, circulate moral and religious

9 Ibid., p. 203.
10 Lloyd, op. cit., p. 51.
11 Pray, op. cit., p. 207.
12 Lloyd, op. cit., p. 35.
14 Ibid.
publications in every part of the land; and to endeavor to plant a Sunday School wherever there is a population. . . .15

The American Sunday School Union was a nondenominational union and received support by donors of several denominations.16 The nondenominational aspect of the union enabled it to be of great importance in the educational and religious educational development of much of America. Especially was this true in the frontier areas where population was sparse and the people were composed of a few from several denominations. The American Sunday School Union was able to set up nondenominational Sunday schools for the religious and educational training of the people—particularly children. Children were taught not only principles of Christian living and moral behavior, but they were also taught to read, write, and spell. By 1900, this union had established approximately one hundred thousand Sunday schools throughout America.17 Its desire to maintain a nondenominational service in its organization is evident from a statement appearing in its publications:

No books are published by the American Sunday School Union without the sanction of the Committee of Publication, consisting of fourteen members, from the following denominations of Christians, viz. Baptist, Methodist, Congregational, Episcopal, Presbyterian, Lutheran, and Reformed Dutch. Not more than three of the members


can be of the same denomination, and no book can be published to which any member of the Committee shall object.  

**Religious education in the Sunday school.** Sunday schools had their early beginnings in both England and America among the poor. Their first concern was to give children who were unable to attend public and private schools the opportunity to learn how to read, write, and spell. Since many of the poor children had to work to assist their families, Sunday became the only day they had available for schooling, thus bringing about the need for Sunday schools.

It was not long, however, before specifically religious education became important. Two things led to religious education in the Sunday schools. First, the Bible became the basic textbook. It was the only book common among the poor. Secondly, the people desired to teach Christian principles and good moral behavior to their children. Soon many of the Sunday schools were brought under a curriculum of exclusively religious education. Many on the frontier regions of America, where public schools had not yet been established, maintained primers and spellers as part of the curriculum. They were continued in order to give the children an opportunity of learning to read and write.  

---


II. BACKGROUND AND DEVELOPMENT OF SUNDAY SCHOOLS IN THE
CHURCH OF JESUS CHRIST OF LATTER-DAY SAINTS

Education, both secular and religious, has always been an
important part of the philosophy of the L.D.S. Church; thus, schools and
educational programs have been established for youth and adults. As the
people moved to Utah, the need was felt by some for the establishment of
Sunday schools for the specific purpose of instructing the youth in
principles of religion and Christian living.  

Richard Ballantyne and the first Sunday school. The first person
to begin a Sunday school program in the L.D.S. Church was Richard
Ballantyne. He was a young Scotsman, a devout religionist and Bible
student, who had previously been associated with the Sunday school
movement in Europe. At the age of twenty-one, he became an elder in the
Relief Presbyterian Church, and during the next few years he became very
disturbed over the neglect of boys and girls who were growing up without
being taught the principles of freedom and religion for which many had
died. In expressing his feelings to his minister he was encouraged to
organize a Sunday school for the youth. This he did in the town of
Earlston, Scotland.  

While studying diligently in the Scriptures for his Sunday school

---

20Jubilee History of Latter-day Saints Sunday Schools (Salt Lake
instructions, young Ballantyne found that much of what his church taught was not in harmony with what he found in the Bible. When he heard the message of the restoration of the gospel by L.D.S. missionaries, he joined the Church along with the other members of his family.

Following his conversion to the L.D.S. Church, Richard Ballantyne immigrated to America to be with the main body of the church. He arrived in Nauvoo, Illinois, on April 11, 1843. He later moved west with the church and arrived in the Salt Lake Valley in September 1848.22

In the summer of 1849 a hailstorm destroyed the crops on Richard Ballantyne's farm. As he thought of the beautiful fields of Scotland in his moments of discouragement, his thoughts reminded him of the Sunday school of Earlston and the joy he found in teaching children. It was at this time that he decided to start a Sunday school for the children of his ward,23 the Salt Lake Fourteenth Ward of the L.D.S. Church.

By winter, Brother Ballantyne had built a large room on the front of his small home. This he equipped with simple benches, and on Sunday, December 9, 1849, commenced the first Sunday school in The Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints.24

This first Sunday school was for children between eight and


23A ward is an organized congregation of L.D.S. Church members living within a given area. A stake is made up of a number of wards comprising a larger area.

24Sonne, *op. cit.*, pp. 45-49.
thirteen years of age. Among those children who attended this school were members of a number of prominent families including those of John Taylor, Wilford Woodruff, Parley P. Pratt, and Franklin D. Richards. The first meeting consisted of songs, prayer, and the story of the birth of the Savior. Most lessons throughout the next year came directly from the Scriptures which students were required to bring. At the end of the year, the school numbered about fifty pupils and was moved into the newly completed chapel of the Salt Lake Fourteenth Ward.25 Speaking of this early school, Brother Ballantyne stated:

I felt that the Gospel was too precious to myself to be withheld from the children. They ought to have the privilege of Gospel teaching, and that was the main purpose—to teach them the Gospel—because I felt it was very precious to me and I thought it would be precious to them; and it was my duty to do that.26

In addition to this Sunday school, Richard Ballantyne also organized Sunday schools in the Salt Lake Fifteenth Ward in 1856, in the Nephi Ward in 1858, and in the Eden Ward in 1864. As part of the general organization of the Deseret Sunday School Union throughout the L.D.S. Church in 1872, he was appointed Stake Superintendent of the Weber Stake Sunday Schools of the Church.27

Education in Scotland was provided through common schools for all children as a result of a statute passed by the Scottish Parliament in 1696. All children were given a chance to learn how to read, write,

---

25 Ibid., pp. 49-52.
26 Jubilee History of Latter-day Saints Sunday Schools, op. cit., p. 12.
27 Andrew Jenson, Latter-day Saint Biographical Encyclopedia (Salt Lake City: Andrew Jenson Historical Company, 1901), I, 703-706.
spell, etc., in the common schools. Religious education was also given consideration in the curriculum. The Presbyterian Church in Scotland, however, had begun a program of catechizing their young people long before the advent of Sunday schools in Scotland. When the Sunday schools did begin to develop around 1800, they followed the catechizing program and developed into schools strictly for religious education. 28

The Sunday school of Richard Ballantyne in Earlston was of this strictly religious education style, and similarly his Sunday schools in the L.D.S. Church were for the purpose of religious education. This influence continued throughout the development of L.D.S. Sunday schools.

A period of independent Sunday schools. In addition to the Sunday schools of Richard Ballantyne, many other independent Sunday schools developed in the Church through the 1850's and 1860's. According to the Deseret Sunday School Union, Sunday school had been organized in twenty-seven wards prior to 1860. 29 Twenty of these were organized in the Salt Lake and Provo, Utah, regions. Four of the other seven were organized in 1858 while the Salt Lake Valley members of the Church were moved south due to the invasion of "Johnston's Army." 30 One of these, as mentioned, was organized in Nephi by Richard Ballantyne. Each of

---

30 The expedition of the U.S. Army sent to Utah in 1858 under General Albert Sidney Johnston to settle troubles between L.D.S. Church and U.S. Government officials.
these efforts was made independently by individuals interested in the Sunday school cause. It was not until 1867 that the Church became involved in Sunday school organization and establishment.

The curricula of the early Sunday schools in the L.D.S. Church were influenced by the background experience of those helping in the development of these early schools. Those with experience in the eastern states and Scotland were much more oriented to having exclusively religious education in their Sunday schools, while those with experience in England and the central or frontier states were more inclined to include reading, writing, and spelling in the Sunday school curriculum. A study of persons helping in the development of these early Sunday schools revealed background information about twenty of them. Three had backgrounds in England, three in Scotland, twelve in the eastern states, and two in the central states. Reflecting these backgrounds of experience, the early curricula in the L.D.S. Sunday school movement utilized some reading, writing, and spelling, but the greater emphasis was centered in religious education. 31

George Q. Cannon and the Juvenile Instructor. The Juvenile Instructor, first published through the efforts of George Q. Cannon in 1866, notably influenced the promotion and organization of L.D.S. Sunday schools. This magazine was for the benefit and furtherance of the Sunday school efforts then being made independently throughout the

Church. B. H. Roberts wrote: "On the 1st of January, 1866, the first number of the Juvenile Instructor was issued, a magazine designed to educate the rising generation of the Latter-day Saints, and to give support to the Sunday School movement." Mr. Edward W. Tullidge summarized the value of the Juvenile Instructor in his History of Salt Lake City.

The special design of this magazine was to educate the rising generation of the "Mormon" people, and to secure select readings for the homes, adapted to both parents and children. In this special mission, the Juvenile Instructor has been a power in every city and hamlet throughout Utah. Its class of literature for variety, instruction and entertainment, and also in the quality of its subjects, entitles the Juvenile Instructor to a first rank among church magazines. . . . The volumes of the Juvenile Instructor are not only copiously illustrated with wood cuts to accompany their subjects, but it frequently publishes original music from Utah composers. Indeed, though others of our home magazines have appeared with a few sheets of music type-setting, to the Juvenile office belongs the honor of sustaining a semi-musical magazine.

George Q. Cannon was born in England. He learned the printing business from his uncle, John Taylor, while assisting him in the publication of the Times and Seasons and The Nauvoo Neighbor in Nauvoo, Illinois. Later he published The Western Standard in California, translated and published The Book of Mormon in the Hawaiian language, operated the Deseret News Press from Fillmore, Utah, in 1858, and directed the publication of the Millennial Star in England. For fifteen years he served missions in Hawaii, the eastern states, and

---


33 Ibid., pp. 478-479.
England. During the winter of 1865 he organized and taught a Sunday school in the Salt Lake Fourteenth Ward. This background of experience adequately prepared Brother Cannon for his work in publishing the *Juvenile Instructor* for the benefit and aid of the Sunday schools. 34

The *Deseret Sunday School Union*. The first Sunday school organization in the L.D.S. Church was the Parent Sunday School Union organized in 1867 for the promotion of the Sunday school cause throughout the Church. The term "union" was used by the L.D.S. Church in their Sunday school organization the same as other earlier Sunday school organizations in America. This union was stimulated by an article written by William H. Shearman in the April 15, 1866, issue of the *Juvenile Instructor*. It suggested the organization of a Sunday school union to give uniformity and greater efficiency to the Sunday school movement in the Church. George Q. Cannon, the publisher of the *Juvenile Instructor* for the promotion of Sunday school work in the Church, became the first president of the new organization. This organization was the first move by the Church to organize, correlate, and supervise the growth and development of Sunday schools in the Church. Prior to this organization all efforts to promote Sunday schools in the Church had been made independently by various interested Church members. This union was later reorganized in 1872 to become the *Deseret Sunday School Union*, and George Q. Cannon became the General

Sunday School Superintendent in the new organization. Under the union organization in the Church, every Sunday school, to be fully organized, was to have "a Superintendent, First and Second Assistant Superintendents, Secretary, Assistant Secretary, Choir Leader, Librarian, Assistant Librarian, Treasurer, and sufficient teachers." Apparently, the L.D.S. Church "borrowed" this type of an organization from other early American Sunday school unions who were recommending a very similar organization. One Sunday school supporting the American Sunday School Union recommended as early as 1847 that the best organization was a "superintendent," "assistant superintendents" as needed, a "secretary," a "librarian," and "teachers."  

Following the organization of the Deseret Sunday School Union in 1872 to the turn of the century, the Sunday schools in the L.D.S. Church developed rapidly in organization and instructional procedures. 

The history of the Sunday school from its independent beginnings in England, America, and the L.D.S. Church all followed similar courses of development, and the individuals who devoted their lives to the establishment of those Sunday schools have left their marks of influence upon the religious education program of the Sunday school. The one-room Sunday schools of Gloucester, Earlston, Philadelphia, and Salt Lake  

35 Jubilee History of Latter-day Saints Sunday Schools, op. cit., pp. 15-16.  
37 Pray, op. cit., p. 247.
pioneered a course that by 1900 had developed into a vast system of Sunday school unions. During that period of development the Sunday schools gained the support of both family and church. They developed from schools for the poor to training schools for all classes in principles of Christian living. They overcame the problems of early financial difficulties from paid teachers through the services of thousands of gratuitous teachers. Finally during this developmental period, improved teaching methods brought better instruction.
CHAPTER III

AN ANALYSIS OF TEACHING METHODS USED BY NON-L.D.S.

SUNDAY SCHOOLS IN AMERICA PRIOR TO 1900

Teaching methods used by non-L.D.S. Sunday schools of America developed from very few at the beginning to a wide variety by 1900. Instruction in the earliest schools primarily engaged students in practices of reading, writing, and spelling. During the nineteenth century many new methods came into use such as researching, problem solving, story telling, and object lessons. Factors stimulating the development of these new methods were the dedicated teaching principles being followed by Sunday school teachers and the graded Sunday schools which increased the need for a greater variety of teaching methods.

Many early Sunday school workers and organizations were encouraging more effective Sunday school instruction by following sound teaching principles. An excellent set of these principles was offered in 1847 by Lewis G. Pray. He encouraged Sunday school teachers (1) to love their pupils; (2) to apply their lessons to the student's needs; (3) to be enthusiastic and dedicated in their teaching; (4) to make their lessons interesting and entertaining; (5) to keep their lessons short; (6) to use simplicity and much detail in their teaching; (7) to make proper lesson preparation; (8) to have good deportment and be natural with the students; (9) to develop a single major concept each lesson;
and (10) to have faith in their students. The American Sunday School Union in 1830 stressed the principles of personal interest in and love for each student and spoke of their great need as part of a devoted teacher's service especially to neglected children.

Let this deserted creature (the child or student) feel, from his early childhood, that there is an individual—but one—who, unprompted by natural affection, and unconstrained by social laws is seeking his best interest; watching with solicitude his daily conduct; leading him by doctrine, reproof, correction, and instruction, into the good and right way; storing his mind with profitable knowledge, and preparing him for respectability and usefulness here, and for inconceivable and everlasting joy in the world to come:—and the influence of such a conviction will be seen in every change and circumstance of that child's life. A faithful Sunday-school teacher seldom parts with a pupil without a confidence that he has this feeling.2

Programs for instructing Sunday school teachers in teaching methods were more forcefully introduced by the graded Sunday school which had its earliest beginning in America in 1834. Students were divided into classes or grades according to age, learning ability, and schooling experience. The number of grades depended upon the number of students in the Sunday school. Teachers were encouraged to learn and use methods of instruction geared to the age level and learning ability of their particular grade.3 Grading of Sunday schools motivated

---


teachers to take greater advantage of teacher training classes were
conducted weekly to train Sunday school teachers in more efficient use
of various teaching methods. The success of these early classes
stimulated the development of normal schools started in 1857 to train
Sunday school teachers in teaching principles and methods. These
schools were followed in 1880 by teaching method seminars called summer
schools. These were held in summer months, a week at a time, to provide
Sunday school teachers with a comprehensive course in teaching
techniques. Teacher trainer classes, normal schools, and summer
schools not only aided Sunday school teachers by training them in more
efficient use of teaching methods, but they also helped develop sound
methods of instruction for the teachers. The methods developed and used
in the Sunday schools of America prior to 1900 fall into three areas:
(1) student-centered methods, (2) teacher-centered methods, and
(3) object-centered methods.

I. STUDENT-CENTERED METHODS

When the concept of a lesson is developed by an activity or
process carried out by the student or students, it is referred to as a

4 The Eleventh Annual Report of the New York Sunday School Union

5 A. Caswell Ellis, "Sunday School Work and Bible Study in the
Light of Modern Pedagogy," The Pedagogical Seminary, III (June, 1896),
383-406.

6 Development of the Sunday School 1780-1905, op. cit.,
p. 586-590.
student-centered method of instruction. The majority of the teaching methods used in the Sunday schools of America prior to 1900 were of this type. Many times more than one method was combined in the actual teaching process, but each is treated separately in this study. These methods are discussed as chronologically as possible according to the findings of this study.

**Reading, writing, and spelling exercises.** Exercises in reading and writing were the first recorded methods of teaching in the early Sunday schools of America, dating from 1791. At that time the basic purpose of Sunday schools was to teach children unable to attend public and private schools how to read and write. Before a child was admitted to public school, he was required to have already learned to read by private instruction. These early schools used primers from the public schools in their instruction and by 1793 were also giving students spelling exercises through the use of alphabet and spelling books. These early schools were basically established for secular education, so exercises geared to learning fundamentals of reading, writing, and spelling were the basis of the curriculum. In 1793 the Philadelphia

---


Society for Sunday Schools voted

... that the instructions to be given in their schools should be
confined to reading and writing from the Bible; but for such
scholars as had not learned to read, spelling-books and primers
might be used. 11

Following the introduction of religious education curricula in the early
1800's, the Sunday schools generally discontinued secular instruction
except in frontier regions. In these regions reading, writing, and
spelling exercises were continued for those unable to attend public
schools or pay for private instruction. 12 These exercises were also
used in the Sunday schools as late as 1826 to instruct illiterate adults
how to read and write. 13

Workbook and manual assignments. Workbook and manual exercises
were introduced as part of the writing and spelling work in 1793. 14
Students worked various exercises of this type as late as 1855. 15 Pupils
of the same class were encouraged to stay on the same lesson at the same
time and use the same manual and workbook. 16

11 Ibid.
12 Ellis, op. cit., p. 383.
13 The First Annual Report of the Massachusetts Sabbath School
Union (Boston: The Board of Managers of the Massachusetts Sabbath
14 The Second Annual Report of the Massachusetts Sabbath School
Union (Boston: The Board of Managers of the Massachusetts Sabbath
School Union, 1827), pp. 95-96.
15 Charles Greenwood, The Children, the Sabbath School, and the
16 Pray, op. cit., p. 258.
Catechization (questions and answers) and question books.

Catechizing, the method of the teacher asking questions and the students giving the answers, began in 1810. Many catechisms were prepared on a variety of subjects by various groups and individuals. A. Caswell Ellis pointed out that general secular instruction (reading, writing, etc.) was dropped from the Sunday school courses of instruction "as rapidly as the necessities of the case would allow, and the whole work devoted to catechism and Bible classes." He continued by stating:

The old catechisms were used again. New ones were published, good, bad, and indifferent. There was no unity in the work, nor even uniformity within any denomination. . . . There were practically no books printed for young children in those days, and the Sunday school library idea was yet to be developed.  

Catechizing remained one of the dominant teaching methods throughout the nineteenth century; however, the old catechisms began to be replaced by new question books in 1827. The question books were prepared to give direction and uniformity to Sunday school instruction. They were also prepared to last over a period of time as Sunday school courses.

. . . Many question books and keys were issued by different publishers, but these generally had no definite order of development, and led to little besides memorizing answers to a lot of heterogeneous and often superficial and valueless questions.

---

17 Temple, op. cit. pp. 9, 18, 139.

18 Ellis, op. cit., p. 384.

The "Union Question Books" were brought out in 1832, containing 125 to 150 pages each. Some devoted a whole year to a single book of the Bible, others followed the life of Christ by "Harmony of the Gospels," others, still undertook to go through the Bible in course, a certain part each year. Later, in 1869, an "Explanatory Question Book" with answers was published. All these books consisted of a mere string of questions with no analysis, but they were widely used. Of the earlier ones over six million were sold in 1810.20

Memorization and recitation. Products of catechization were memorization and recitation. Students were required to memorize verbatim answers to the catechism questions for their Sunday school class.21 By 1816 this led to rote memory of scripture verses to be recited to the teacher in class on Sunday.22 As time passed longer recitations were required, even that of memorizing whole books of the Bible on some occasions.23 Girls were found to be more capable of memorizing scriptures, and boys were found to be more capable of memorizing catechisms.25 Recitation methods varied between random individual recitations,26 rotating recitation from one student to the

20 Ellis, loc. cit.
21 Temple, op. cit., p. 30.
23 Ellis, loc. cit.
25 Temple, op. cit., p. 34.
next around the class, and concert recitations where all would repeat hymns, prayers, or scripture verses together.

**Oral reading and narrations.** By 1817 the method of having students read orally from the scriptures and other texts was practiced. This led to student narrations as early as 1824. By this time the *American Sunday School Magazine* was being published with narrations prepared for Sunday school use. It also contained various articles, poems, stories, and hymns which were read orally in class by the Sunday school students.

**Instructional singing and praying.** Sunday school students learned hymns as early as 1818 and Sunday schools used instructional singing as early as 1826. Hymns were published in the form of books, cards, and sheets, and were learned primarily for opening and closing Sunday school meetings. They were generally sung or recited in

---


28Temple, *op. cit.*, pp. 77-78.

29Ibid.

30*Weekly Lessons for Scholars,* *loc. cit.*

31Temple, *op. cit.*, p. 27.


33*Second Annual Report of the Massachusetts Sabbath School Union,* *op. cit.*, p. 95.

34Pray, *op. cit.*, pp. 249-250.
and often students were asked to stand for the hymns. In 1850 William B. Bradbury published a book entitled *Bradbury's Sabbath School Melodies* in which he provided general instructions in music followed in each section by practice exercises for the students. Instructions were given about "elements of vocal music," "length of sounds called rhythm," "pitch of sounds called melody," "power of sounds called dynamics," plus other general instructions. Some singing—especially singing practice—took place in the classroom. Prayers were read by students as part of their Sunday school training as early as 1826. Students were later required to memorize prayers which were often recited in concert.

Library work. One of the more important contributions made by the Sunday schools of America was the Sunday school library which began about 1820. Students often too poor to own books of their own

---

35 Ibid.
36 Ibid.
38 Temple, *op. cit.*, p. 57.
41 Ibid., p. 249.
were provided large amounts of reading material through these libraries.\textsuperscript{44} They increased so rapidly that by 1900 there were "tens of thousands of libraries and millions of books in the Sunday schools."\textsuperscript{45} Sunday school unions published books and sold them virtually at cost to member schools.\textsuperscript{46} Students were allowed to check out a book for a week at a time,\textsuperscript{47} and often those with good behavior records were allowed the extra privilege of checking out extra books.\textsuperscript{48} The unions made books available only if the books had moral or spiritual value and were interesting.\textsuperscript{49} In 1833 the American Sunday School Union reported it was producing over 100 varieties of children's books.\textsuperscript{50} Charles Greenwood stated that by 1855 the Sunday school libraries contained "question books, catechisms, valuable commentaries of the Bible, Holy Land illustrations, Bible dictionaries and manuals, scripture illustrations and histories, manuals, guides, and devotional books." He continued,

\textsuperscript{44}The Sixth Annual Report of the American Sunday School Union, op. cit., p. 13.

\textsuperscript{45}Development of the Sunday School 1780-1905, op. cit., p. 142.

\textsuperscript{46}The Second Annual Report of the Massachusetts Sabbath School Union, op. cit., p. 100.

\textsuperscript{47}The Eleventh Annual Report of the New York Sunday School Union Society, op. cit., p. 20.

\textsuperscript{48}The Sixth Annual Report of the American Sunday School Union, loc. cit.

\textsuperscript{49}The Eleventh Annual Report of the New York Sunday School Union Society, op. cit., pp. 5-6.

The volumes that compose the libraries are, many of them, biographies of eminently great and good Christians, who have filled high places in the church and State, while others record the examples of devoted youths. All the graces of the spirit, and all the tempers of the heart that God approves; the great purposes of life, and the most successful means of overcoming temptation, are here illustrated, both by pen and print. The purest and most wholesome literature, pointed and pungent, yet attractive and popular, through the beauty and appropriateness of its style, is here offered to the child, "without money and without price." The head and the heart of the youth share at once in the benefit received from these volumes. The world of nature, art, and science, is expanded before the admiring gaze of the youthful eye, and all its diversities are made to become eloquent and practical preachers of truth and righteousness.\(^51\)

Mr. Greenwood also pointed out that library books were prepared "according to the capacity and wants of the children" in the Sunday schools.\(^52\)

**Discussion.** Theology classes were using the discussion method of teaching by 1826.\(^53\) This method involved all students in resolving given theological questions and problems by discussing them until the class reached reasonable conclusions. This method was also used in other classes to determine the meanings of various recitation scriptures.\(^54\)

**Problem solving.** Teachers were also using the problem solving method of instruction by 1826. Students were given various problems—doctrinal, theological, scriptural, etc.—which they were to solve by

---

51 Greenwood, op. cit., pp. 69-70.

52 Ibid., p. 98.


54 Ibid., pp. 11-12.
searching out scriptural passages that would resolve them.\textsuperscript{55} One type of this method was referred to as "proofs." Students were required to cite four texts of scripture to receive credit for a "proof" of something.\textsuperscript{56} It was also used in resolving questions from the question books.\textsuperscript{57}

Home study, application assignments, "tickets" and "leaflets." Teachers began assigning their Sunday school students home study as early as 1826.\textsuperscript{58} The types most generally used were assignments requiring reading,\textsuperscript{59} memorizing,\textsuperscript{60} or answering questions.\textsuperscript{61} These assignments were sometimes prepared with accompanying instructions on sheets called "tickets."\textsuperscript{62} The "leaflets" came out in 1875. They were published by the Sunday school unions to give greater aid to teachers

\textsuperscript{55} Ibid., p. 9.

\textsuperscript{56} The Eleventh Annual Report of the New York Sunday School Union Society, op. cit., p. 23.

\textsuperscript{57} Union Questions; or, Questions on Select Portions of Scripture, from the Old and New Testaments (Philadelphia: American Sunday School Union, 1834), I, 5.

\textsuperscript{58} The First Annual Report of the Massachusetts Sabbath School Union, op. cit., p. 17.

\textsuperscript{59} Ellis, op. cit., p. 385.

\textsuperscript{60} The Second Annual Report of the Massachusetts Sabbath School Union, op. cit., p. 94.

\textsuperscript{61} The First Annual Report of the Massachusetts Sabbath School Union, loc. cit.

\textsuperscript{62} The Second Annual Report of the Massachusetts Sabbath School Union, loc. cit.
and parents in helping the children with assignments. They gave background information about lessons and general instructions about student assignments. Home reading was done mostly through the use of library books. By 1828 Sunday school teachers were stressing application of the principles of Sunday school lessons by giving home assignments wherein students were to put into practice the principles they had learned. Home study departments were established as part of the Sunday school organization later in the century to further encourage home study programs.

Researching. The method of having students research answers to questions regarding dates, definitions, historical points, geographical locations, and biographical information began in 1827 with the use of the Christian Almanack. This method of instruction was aided by the Scriptural Biographical Dictionary published in 1833 and the Union Bible Dictionary published in 1838 by the American Sunday School Union. Sunday schools also began using Bible biography, geography, and commentary books by 1847, and by 1855 historical manuals and

63 Ellis, op. cit., p. 387.
64 The Christian Teachers Manual (Boston: Bowles and Dearborn, 1828), I, 16.
65 Ellis, op. cit., p. 388.
67 Pray, op. cit., p. 7.
68 Greenwood, op. cit., p. 69.
gazetteers were in use. These various resource and reference books enabled Sunday school teachers to more effectively use the method of assigning research questions to their pupils.

Examinations and reviews. Examinations were being administered in Sunday schools as a teaching method in 1827. They were generally administered orally and were given monthly, quarterly, semi-annually, and annually depending on the policy of the particular Sunday school. They were often conducted publicly to promote the value of Sunday school instruction. Reviews had become part of teaching methods used in the Sunday schools by 1834 and were used both weekly and monthly.

Harmonizing. The use of Gospel Harmonies also became part of Sunday school instruction by 1834. By use of the Harmony, students studied the message of the Gospels in unison relating and comparing the

---


72 Ibid.

73 Union Questions; or, Questions on Select Portions of Scripture, from the Old and New Testaments, loc. cit.

74 Ibid., p. 6.
different accounts.\textsuperscript{75} This method of instruction continued through the century.\textsuperscript{76}

Counseling. Charles Greenwood pointed out that Sunday school teachers were employing counseling as a method of instructing students, especially in the "principles of integrity," during the middle of the nineteenth century. Counseling was the process of giving students the "word in season" to check their lives before they entered into problems and difficulties which would damage their character. Students were appraised of problems endangering them and given direction concerning how to avoid them. This method was used more for individually instructing the students than for general classroom use.\textsuperscript{77}

Themes, compositions, and reports. During the latter part of the 1800's some limited use of the method of having students write themes, compositions, and reports was made.\textsuperscript{78} Success was apparently limited since very little is recorded of its use.

Finger plays. One of the last teaching methods to be introduced into the Sunday schools prior to 1900 was the use of finger plays. They were being used in the primary or kindergarten departments in 1896.\textsuperscript{79}

\textsuperscript{75}Pray, \textit{op. cit.}, p. 254.
\textsuperscript{76}Ellis, \textit{op. cit.}, p. 384.
\textsuperscript{77}Greenwood, \textit{op. cit.}, pp. 122-124.
\textsuperscript{78}Gifford, \textit{loc. cit.}
\textsuperscript{79}Ellis, \textit{op. cit.}, p. 404.
This method was limited in its use to the small children wherein they learned to do various maneuvers with their hands and fingers. No information was found indicating exactly what types of maneuvers were being done.

"Selected or Limited Lessons" and "International Lessons." The "Selected or Limited Lessons" were introduced into the Sunday schools in 1825. The New York Sunday School Union Society stated:

The design of this system is to exclude the unprofitable plan of committing large portions of Scripture to memory without religious instruction; and to introduce a method whereby the scholars shall receive particular instruction on all that they commit to memory, and the teachers themselves be more duly prepared for the Sunday school duties, through the pastoral instruction of their weekly lecture on the appointed portion for the school.

The "Union Question Books" of the American Sunday School Union were patterned after this system. The question books were not to be considered as an absolute rule for instruction on the lesson, but they were to be used as a guide and auxiliary to the teacher in the duty of giving religious instruction to his class. The lesson questions were to be enlarged upon, others added or substituted, or the forms of

82 Ellis, op. cit., p. 384.
expression varied at the teacher's discretion in adapting them to the needs and circumstances of his students. 83

Its "Selected or Limited Lesson System" chief claim to popular favor was that it "required every class to receive instruction in the same lesson at the same time." It soon became so widely introduced that the American Sunday-School Magazine said that the method of memorization and the choice by every child of his own memory text was "now exploded from every well-conducted Sunday-school, and all now have the same, and that a limited portion of Scripture to study, understand and commit to memory."

This lesson system was the first effort to unite all American Sunday School Union Sunday schools in lesson subject matter. 85 It stopped extensive rote memorization of scripture and strengthened the question book system. Mr. A. Caswell Ellis stated:

The first attempt to rise above the various catechisms and ceaseless memorization of verses, chapters and whole books of the Bible, was made in 1825 by the American Sunday School Union in the "Limited Lesson Scheme." These were selected portions of Scripture printed on cards. The scheme was extended to a five years' course that included the principal parts of the Bible. A series of questions was arranged to go with these texts. This system was said by the American Sunday School Magazine of that period to have been adopted by every well ordered Sunday school. 86

The "Limited or Selected Lesson System" continued until 1872 when the "International Sunday School Lessons" were introduced. 87 This new

83 The Eleventh Annual Report of the New York Sunday School Union Society, op. cit., p. 16.

84 Development of the Sunday School 1780-1905, loc. cit.

85 Ibid., p. 108.

86 Ellis, loc. cit.

system of lessons was prepared internationally by the Lesson Committee of the International Sunday School Union of which the American Sunday School Union was the dominant auxiliary union. The Eleventh International Sunday School Convention Report stated:

The Lesson Committee is composed of fifteen men selected from different portions of the field and the various denominations of Christians cooperating in the convention, for their representative positions and scholarship, for a term of six years. They are charged with the duty of selecting, under certain broad principles laid down by the convention, the texts of Scripture which from Sunday to Sunday constitute the uniform lesson, with appropriate "Titles" and "Golden Texts" for the same. To comments or expositions or treatment of the lessons, in any way, are prepared by this committee. These are the work of the different denominational Sunday-school and publishing organizations, and of individual editors and publishers, who alone are responsible for them.

"Golden Texts" were the scriptural references supporting the lesson titles--one reference for each title usually consisting of ten to fifteen verses. The "International Lesson System" became the dominant system in the Sunday schools throughout the remainder of the 1800's. By 1899 over one hundred thirty thousand Sunday schools in the United States were connected with the "International Lesson System."

II. TEACHER-CENTERED METHODS

Methods of instruction where the concept of the lesson is

---

89 Ibid., pp. 565-566.
90 Ellis, op. cit., p. 385.
developed by a process or activity carried out by the teacher himself are referred to as teacher-centered methods. The early American Sunday school teachers utilized some of these types of methods, but they were not nearly as prevalent as student-centered methods. These methods were often combined in their use with each other or with student or object-centered lessons but are treated separately in this study.

Reading by teacher. At the very conception of the American Sunday school movement in 1791, teachers began reading parts of the lessons to their students. This was sometimes a necessity where pupils who were unable to read were being taught how to read. This method was not used as widely following the advent of religious education into Sunday school curricula in the early 1800's. After that time it was restricted more to occasions when the teacher read a scriptural passage or an article as part of the lesson.

Lecture. The lecture method was being used in Sunday schools by 1826. It was not used extensively in the early Sunday schools because of the popular use of catechisms and question books. Later in the century short lectures were often given as part of the opening exercises.

92 Hobbs, op. cit., p. 211.
94 Temple, op. cit., p. 154.
of the Sunday schools and were generally given by the minister.\textsuperscript{97} The subject of his lecture was usually on the subject of the next "Limited or Selected Lesson" or in later years upon the next "International Lesson" to be taken up the following Sunday. Their purpose was to give background information in order to better understand the coming lesson.\textsuperscript{98}

**Example.** Early Sunday schools could not escape teaching by example. For good or bad, students were learning by observing their teacher. The influence of the teacher's example as a method of teaching was strongly stressed as early as 1827;\textsuperscript{99} and teachers were admonished to live closely enough to God that He could inspire the students through the personal life and teachings of their Sunday school teacher.\textsuperscript{100}

**Story telling.** By 1828 story telling had entered the teaching methods of Sunday school teachers.\textsuperscript{101} This method was especially stressed for use among the smaller children because of its entertaining and interesting nature.\textsuperscript{102} It was also used in other classes particularly when teaching about Bible personalities.\textsuperscript{103} This method remained

\begin{footnotesize}
\begin{itemize}
\item[97] Pray, op. cit., p. 249.
\item[99] Ibid., p. 4.
\item[100] Greenwood, op. cit., p. 142.
\item[102] Ellis, op. cit., p. 388.
\item[103] Pray, op. cit., p. 254.
\end{itemize}
\end{footnotesize}
a dominant method of teaching in the Sunday schools throughout the century. 104

**Elucidation.** Teachers in the Sunday schools were using the method of elucidation or explanation in their teaching by 1828. By the use of commentaries and other resource and reference books, the teacher explained parts of the lesson by giving background information--historical, geographical, biographical, etc.--necessary for students to clearly understand the subject being discussed. 105 This method was also used to make certain texts and principles more intelligible by clearly explaining them to the students. 106

**Individualization.** About the middle of the 1800's, teachers became more concerned with adapting their lessons to individual needs of the students. 107 This general method of individualizing lesson material was stressed throughout the remainder of the century. Charles Greenwood wrote:

> You will feel the importance and learn the art of adapting your instructions to the capacity and condition of each child. As children, like adults, are individuals and mutually unlike, so they need personal instruction and adaptation. We are taught by apostolic example to deal with human souls separately and privately, --to warn every man, and teach every man...  


---


107 Ibid., p. 259.
No two pupils are precisely alike, and hence no precise and undeviating course of discipline should be adopted, but a constant effort should be to have an adaptedness to individual circumstances and wants. Hence, the instructor must avail himself of every means to find out all the faults and excellences, the strong and weak points of his pupil's character, --their temptations, their predilections, their difficult and easy processes. In short, he must study them symptomatically, as a faithful and discriminating physician does his patients, to know what they are, what they may become, and what ought to be done for them.108

III. OBJECT-CENTERED LESSONS

Object-centered lessons are lessons where the concept of the lesson develops out of the use of some object implemented as part of the teaching process.109 The use of object-centered lessons was generally used in connection with other student-centered or teacher-centered methods and are treated separately in this study.

Maps, charts, and outlines. Apparently the first maps used in Sunday school instruction were maps of Palestine included in the "Union Question Books." They were used to locate answers to questions about Palestine geography.110 By the middle of the century large roller111 and relief112 maps of the holy land and the scripture world as well as

109 Hobbs, op. cit., p. 228.
110 Union Questions; or, Questions on Select Portions of Scripture, from the Old and New Testaments, op. cit., p. 1.
111 Pray, op. cit., pp. 222-225.
112 Gifford, loc. cit.
Bible atlases were in use.\textsuperscript{113} In the 1890's students were drawing their own maps as part of their Sunday school training.\textsuperscript{114} Maps were especially useful in studying the travels of Bible personalities. The use of charts and outlines did not come until later. Chronology charts were being used in study of the scriptures by 1879,\textsuperscript{115} and by 1880 outlines were used to help students organize and correlate their study.\textsuperscript{116}

Cards. Cards of various types were used as part of Sunday school instruction through most of the nineteenth century. The first of these to be used was "alphabet cards" in 1827,\textsuperscript{117} and they were followed in 1828 by "hymn cards" from which students recited hymns.\textsuperscript{118} Next to be used were "lesson cards" in 1833 in the primary departments containing parts of the lesson,\textsuperscript{119} and by 1889 "picture cards" were in general


\textsuperscript{116} Development of the Sunday School 1780-1905, \textit{op. cit.}, p. 162.

\textsuperscript{117} The Second Annual Report of the Massachusetts Sabbath School Union, \textit{op. cit.}, p. 94.

\textsuperscript{118} The Christian Teachers Manual, \textit{op. cit.}, p. 31.

use.  

In 1896 "scripture cards" and "kindergarten information cards" became part of Sunday school teaching. The use of these visual-aid cards aided Sunday school teachers in maintaining interest of the students while presenting the lesson.

**Physical objects.** Various physical objects resembling some object or relating to some principle being taught as part of the lesson were used in Sunday school teaching as early as 1828. These objects were used to help students better visualize in their mind the principle or object being discussed. Often these objects related to objects mentioned in the Bible.

**Illustrations, pictures, and photographs.** Geographical and historical illustrations were also utilized in Sunday school teaching by 1828; however, it was not until the middle of the century that illustrations came into general use. The advent of the blackboard in the early 1860's made the use of this method much more practical and

---


121 Ellis, *op. cit.*, pp. 385-387.


123 Ellis, *op. cit.*, p. 403.

124 The *Christian Teachers Manual*, *loc. cit.*

extensive. Pictures were used throughout most of the century, but it was not until the 1890's that photographs were used as part of Sunday school instruction.

**Bulletin boards.** The use of bulletin boards also began about the middle of the nineteenth century in very simple form. They had developed into quite general use by the 1870's. They were often used to promote the value of Sunday schools and their instruction.

**Blackboard.** One of the greatest object-centered methods was the use of the blackboard introduced into the Sunday schools in the early 1860's. It became useful for illustrations, diagrams, outlines, notes, and instructions.

To Mr. S. W. Clark belongs the honor of introducing the blackboard in Sunday-school instruction. This was in the early "sixties," and though the innovation was criticised as secularizing Bible teaching, Mr. Clark soon proved that the blackboard could be utilized to teach "through the eye to the heart," as well as "through the eye to the mind."

---

127 Trumbull, op. cit., p. 37.
130 Gifford, loc. cit.
131 *Development of the Sunday School 1780-1905*, loc. cit.
132 Ellis, op. cit., pp. 405-406.
133 *Development of the Sunday School 1780-1905*, loc. cit.
Summary. In summary, Sunday schools made significant progress in their teaching methods by 1900. Early secular instruction had generally given way to religious education by the early 1800's. Teachers became increasingly more conscious of new and improved teaching methods throughout the nineteenth century. They utilized teacher training classes, normal schools, and summer school teaching method seminars implemented to improve their quality of teaching. Methods developed from routine memorization and catechization exercises in the early 1800's to a wide variety of student-centered, teacher-centered, and object-centered methods by the end of the century. Maps, charts, libraries, blackboards, and resource and reference books were some of the improvements added to the Sunday school teaching program by that time. Problem solving, discussion, story telling, and object lesson methods were also added to give variety and versatility to Sunday school instruction. The sincere dedication of many Sunday school teachers, officers, and organizations toward improving teaching methods had developed an important religious educational program of high quality instruction by 1900.
CHAPTER IV

AN ANALYSIS OF TEACHING METHODS USED BY L.D.S. SUNDAY SCHOOLS PRIOR TO 1900, AND A COMPARISON OF THE SIMILARITIES AND DIFFERENCES BETWEEN THESE METHODS AND THE TEACHING METHODS OF THE NON-L.D.S. SUNDAY SCHOOLS OF AMERICA DURING THAT TIME

Few methods of instruction were used in the earliest L.D.S. Sunday schools; nevertheless, a wide variety of teaching methods were in use by 1900. Many of those assisting in the establishment of Sunday schools in the L.D.S. Church had very little or no previous pedagogical experience. Some of the teachers in these early Sunday schools utilized "day school" texts, and their classes consisted of little more than reading and spelling exercises.¹ Others read from the Bible and told religious stories.²

Those who became actively engaged in Sunday School work soon realized the necessity of better methods and facilities for carrying on and continuing the good cause then in its infancy, and the importance of co-operation to attain the desired results became more and more apparent.³

Throughout the nineteenth century, new methods such as reports,⁴

¹Jubilee History of Latter-day Saints Sunday Schools (Salt Lake City: Deseret Sunday School Union, 1900), pp. 13-14.
²Conway B. Sonne, Knight of the Kingdom (Salt Lake City: Deseret Book Company, 1849), p. 50.
⁴Latter-day Saints' Sunday School Treatise (second edition; Salt Lake City: Deseret Sunday School Union, 1898), pp. 37, 54.
student projects,\(^5\) finger plays,\(^6\) and field trips\(^7\) were brought into use in the L.D.S. Sunday schools.

The continual growth of the Sunday schools in the L.D.S. Church brought about the need for grading the students by 1884.\(^8\)

The grading of the Sunday School is the process of assigning each pupil to the department best suited to his or her capacity, and of arranging the departments in such a way as to enable the pupils to progress by a logical succession of studies. It is an essential feature, and, in its arrangement, requires a thorough knowledge of Sunday School work, --its spirit, aims and methods.

Grading brought the need for "modern teaching methods"\(^9\) and a "variety of teaching methods."\(^10\) Teachers meetings were conducted as early as 1873 in the L.D.S. Sunday schools where teaching methods were discussed among the teachers.\(^11\) By 1882 "teacher training" classes held semi-weekly were in operation to train teachers in better methods of instruction.\(^12\) They were increased to a weekly training program by

\(^5\)Ibid., p. 69.
\(^6\)Arthur Winter and Leo Hunsaker (reporters), Proceedings of the First Sunday School Convention of the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints (Salt Lake City: Deseret Sunday School Union, 1899), pp. 54-55.
\(^7\)Jubilee History of Latter-day Saints Sunday Schools, op. cit., pp. 31-32.
\(^9\)Latter-day Saints' Sunday School Treatise, op. cit., p. 19.
\(^10\)Fjeld, loc. cit.
\(^11\)Winter, op. cit., p. 23.
\(^12\)Fjeld, op. cit., p. 8.
\(^13\)Ibid., pp. 23, 52.
1893\textsuperscript{14} and continued throughout the century.\textsuperscript{15} In 1892 the Deseret Sunday School Union organized a normal training school in connection with Brigham Young Academy to train qualified instructors for the teacher training classes.\textsuperscript{16} The first course was for five weeks,\textsuperscript{17} but later courses were extended to twenty weeks.\textsuperscript{18} Commenting about these training sessions, the Deseret Sunday School Union stated:

In connection with the Brigham Young Academy at Provo, a Sunday School normal training class was organized in November, 1892. It was taught by the faculty of that institution under the direction of the Deseret Sunday School Union Board. The Board also contributed means for carrying on the work. In January, 1893, one hundred Sunday School workers, from Salt Lake, Utah, Davis, Juab and other Stakes, were called to attend this class, for the purpose of receiving the training there given, and thus qualify themselves for more efficient service in the schools from which they were called. In the latter part of the same year forty-eight more Sunday School workers were called to take a course of the same character in the same institution, for a similar object.\textsuperscript{19}

Various principles of teaching were also adopted to encourage Sunday school teachers to improve their instruction. The Deseret Sunday School Union suggested the following list to their teachers:

1. Cultivate an intense love for your work.
2. Give careful thought and prayerful study to each lesson before presenting it to your class.

\textsuperscript{14}Ibid., p. 52.
\textsuperscript{15}Winter, loc. cit.
\textsuperscript{16}Fjeld, op. cit., pp. 50-52.
\textsuperscript{17}Ibid.
\textsuperscript{18}Ibid., p. 55.
\textsuperscript{19}Jubilee History of Latter-day Saints Sunday Schools, op. cit., p. 30.
3. Manifest a deep interest in the welfare of your pupils at all times, making yourself their spiritual guardian.

4. Always govern your pupils through a spirit of love. Be diligent by precept and example in cultivating regularity, punctuality and order.

5. Make your exercises interesting, by frequent illustrations.

6. In all your teachings keep in view the end—spiritual growth and moral activity.

7. Cultivate in your own nature the virtues you wish to inculcate in your pupils.

8. All instruction in the Sunday Schools of the Saints should have for its aim and object the development in the hearts of the students of a love for God and their fellow-men, and faith in the Gospel of Jesus Christ and the great work of latter days.

9. Have pupils report the good acts they see others perform.

10. Proper incentives: a. Duty to God, to parents, to others and to self. b. The desire to secure temporal and spiritual salvation. c. The desire of enjoying the approbation of God, good men and your own conscience.20

Motivated by the graded Sunday schools, various teacher training programs, and sound teaching principles, many dedicated Sunday school teachers and organizations in the L.D.S. Church developed a wide variety of student-centered, teacher-centered, and object-centered methods of instruction by 1900. These methods, developed in the L.D.S. Sunday school program, were in many ways similar to those developed in the non-L.D.S. Sunday schools of America prior to 1900; nevertheless, a number of differences between the methods of the two Sunday school systems also developed.

20* Latter-day Saints' Sunday School Treatise, op. cit., pp. 16-17. 
I. STUDENT-CENTERED METHODS OF L.D.S. SUNDAY SCHOOLS

Many student-centered methods came into use in the L.D.S. Sunday schools in the nineteenth century. Similar to the pattern of the non-L.D.S. Sunday schools, more student-centered methods were used than teacher-centered or object-centered methods of instruction. The methods are discussed individually in this study, although they were often used in connection with other methods in the classroom instruction. They are treated chronologically according to the writer's findings.

Reading and spelling exercises. Reading and spelling exercises were used in the first Sunday school of the L.D.S. Church in 1849. In some of the early Sunday schools primers and spellers of the public schools were used for these exercises. These continued to be used as methods of instruction throughout the 1850's and 1860's. M. Lynn Bennion wrote: "During the early years of L.D.S. Sunday schools the Bible constituted the chief text. The students 'read around' and in some schools the alphabet and other fundamentals of education were taught as well as the doctrines of the Church." In 1874 the Deseret


22 Fjeld, op. cit., p. 4.


Sunday School Union published its first reader followed in 1880 by a second reader. In 1883 the Union published an intermediate reader "composed entirely of original articles written by members of the Church of Jesus Christ, and expressly adapted for the use and benefit of the children of the Latter-day Saints."  

*Instructional singing and praying.* Singing and prayers were a part of Richard Ballantyne's Sunday school in 1849. Sunday school exercises began with singing by the students—a practice continued through the 1800's. Sunday school services were often closed by singing a hymn. Singing instruction was emphasized as a significant part of the Sunday school program as early as 1865. Later in the century this was done during the last ten minutes of Sunday school. Singing practice was also conducted as part of the classroom instruction.

---


27 *Sonne, op. cit.*, p. 49.

28 *Jubilee History of Latter-day Saints Sunday Schools*, op. cit., p. 11.


30 *Benjamin Lang, "Correspondence," Juvenile Instructor*, II (January 1, 1867), 8.

in the 1890's, especially in the younger classes. In 1873 the Juvenile Instructor began publishing hymns with music which were used for Sunday school singing until Sunday school hymn books were published. Andrew Jenson stated:

Four hymn books have been published by the Deseret Sunday School Union for the benefit of the Sunday school, namely, the "S.S. Union Music Book" in 1884; the "Sunday School Hymn Book" in 1888; "The Deseret Sunday School Song Book" in 1892, and "Deseret Songs," containing 300 selections, in 1909.

Singing was generally done in concert by all students, although choirs were used on some occasions. During the latter part of the 1800's students were taught to offer the Sunday school prayers, and in the kindergarten classes children were taught to pray by repeating prayers in concert.

 Oral reading by students. Public readers were abandoned almost

32 Manner of Conducting and Grading Sunday Schools (Salt Lake City: Deseret Sunday School Union, 1894), p. 3.
33 Latter-day Saints' Sunday School Treatise, op. cit., pp. 23, 36-37, 102.
34 Juvenile Instructor, VIII (August 15, 1873), 136.
35 "Correspondence," Juvenile Instructor, X (April 3, 1875), 77.
37 Latter-day Saints' Sunday School Treatise, op. cit., p. 12.
38 Ibid., p. 107.
39 Winter, op. cit., p. 55.
Having students read for reading practice was replaced as early as 1865 by students reading aloud material pertaining to the lesson subject matter. This was generally done from the scriptures, Sunday school readers containing lesson material, articles appearing in the Juvenile Instructor, or materials appearing in the "Leaflets"--a lesson system begun by the Deseret Sunday School Union in 1889. This type of oral reading was done with explanations. A sentence or two was read and then explained before continuing with the text. This method was used more extensively in the more advanced departments.

Library work. Libraries were established in L.D.S. Sunday schools by 1865. Benjamin Lang in writing about the Salt Lake Tenth Ward Sunday School stated: "In connection with the school a Sunday

40 "Sunday Schools," Juvenile Instructor, XIII (April 15, 1878), 88.

41 Lang, loc. cit.

42 Latter-day Saints' Sunday School Treatise, op. cit., p. 67.


44 Ibid., pp. 43-44.

45 Latter-day Saints' Sunday School Treatise, loc. cit.

46 Jubilee History of Latter-day Saints Sunday Schools, op. cit., p. 41.

47 Karl G. Maeser, Sunday School Work (Salt Lake City: Joseph Hyrum Parry, 1892), p. 15.

48 Ibid., p. 9.
School Library has been established. In the Library are one hundred volumes of useful works, comprising biography of eminent men, history, travels, and other works of an instructive character. Books placed in the libraries were to have spiritual value. Each Sunday school library was to be a circulating library, and the librarian was to keep the "maps and books clean, whole, and in their proper shelves."

Examinations and reviews. L.D.S. Sunday school teachers were giving examinations as a method of instruction by 1865. At first these were given quarterly and were administered orally and publicly. By 1874 they were sometimes given weekly and were often in the form of class examinations. During the 1890's exams were used to determine advancements from Sunday school departments.

49 Lang, loc. cit.
50 Winter, op. cit., p. 36.
51 Ibid.
52 Maeser, op. cit., p. 40.
53 Lang, loc. cit.
54 James McKnight, "Correspondence," Juvenile Instructor, IV (February 13, 1869), 32.
55 "Sunday School Examination," Juvenile Instructor, IX (July 18, 1874), 170-171.
56 Francis Sharp, "Correspondence," Juvenile Instructor, IX (June 20, 1874), 149.
57 Fjeld, op. cit., p. 22.
58 Maeser, op. cit., p. 18.
continued to be given throughout the century. Reviews were introduced into L.D.S. Sunday schools in the 1870's. They were as often as weekly in the form of recitations, readings, songs, questions, etc. and were often administered publicly. In 1892 Karl G. Maeser, Second Assistant General Superintendent of the Deseret Sunday School Union, recommended "special" and "general" reviews.

Special reviews are conducted by department teachers as often as they deem it necessary; as, for instance, at the close of a certain section of a text book... or at the end of every principle, e.g. the Lord's Prayer... or, whenever it is deemed necessary by the teacher to be convinced that his department understands thoroughly that which they have passed over.

... . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . .

General reviews should be held at regular intervals. These consist of an actual repetition of the work done—a rehearsal, if you please, so held that every department will have the benefit thereof. And in these reviews, see to it, that every child has an opportunity of answering questions—not leaving it to one or two to do all the answering; for they soon become too much like "parade horses."

59 Winter, op. cit., p. 41.
60 "Deseret Sunday School Union Meeting," Juvenile Instructor, XIV (April 15, 1879), 93.
61 Ibid.
62 Ibid.
63 George Reynolds and Levi Richards, "Historical Review of the Deseret Sunday School Union," Juvenile Instructor, XIX (November 1, 1884), 323.
64 Maeser, op. cit., pp. 53-55.
The Deseret Sunday School Union continued to recommend reviews as late as 1898. The Union stated:

Reviews should be held in every department, except perhaps the theological, every Sunday for a few minutes on the previous lesson; every three months on the work of the term; and at the end of every summer and winter season to determine, among other things, the transfer of pupils to other departments. 65

Catechization (questions and answers) and explanatory questions. Teachers catechized students in the higher classes as early as 1865 in the L.D.S. Sunday schools. 66 By 1866 the Juvenile Instructor was publishing graded catechism questions for juveniles. 67 In 1872 Sunday school lessons for smaller students in catechism form began to be used. 68 John Jaques' Catechism for Children published in 1870 popularized this method of teaching.

There is a catechism, composed by Elder John Jaques, published for use in day and Sunday schools, which contains, in a condensed form, a great deal of information about principles of the Church. . . . Because of its simplicity, it is especially adapted to the minds of children; . . . 69

Karl G. Maeser recommended catechizing in all Sunday school

65 Latter-day Saints' Sunday School Treatise, op. cit., p. 12.
66 Lang, loc. cit.
67 Jubilee History of Latter-day Saints Sunday Schools, op. cit., p. 42.
69 "Sunday School Reading Matter for Children," Juvenile Instructor, VII (June 8, 1872), 91.
A catechism on the life and mission of Joseph Smith and many points in L.D.S. Church History was published in 1882 and was widely used in the Sunday schools. Catechizing was also encouraged on biographical characters to stimulate home reading about them. This method of instruction was still very popular throughout the Deseret Sunday School Union at the end of the century. A type of reversed catechization was also used in the Sunday schools of the L.D.S. Church during the 1890's. The teacher would present a subject through a story, article, scripture, etc., and the students would then ask the teacher questions about the subject which the teacher would answer. These questions were sometimes submitted in advance, and the teacher would answer them at a later time in catechization style.

Memorization and recitation. The term recitation is used in two ways in the early Sunday schools of the L.D.S. Church: (1) when referring to the delivery of a lesson by the teacher and (2) when referring to students reciting a specific scripture, poem, hymn, etc.

---

70 Maeser, op. cit., pp. 6, 9, 19.

71 Jubilee History of Latter-day Saints Sunday Schools, op. cit., p. 40.

72 Winter, op. cit., p. 35.

73 Latter-day Saints' Sunday School Treatise, op. cit., pp. 11, 30, 37, 40, 47, 53, 107, 110.

74 Ibid., pp. 67, 73, 98, 113.

75 Winter, op. cit., pp. 40-41.

76 Latter-day Saints' Sunday School Treatise, op. cit., p. 108.

The second is treated here as a teaching method. Students began reciting as early as 1867. They recited materials from the *Juvenile Instructor* various scriptural passages such as the "Sermon on the Mount," hymns, and L.D.S. Church "Articles of Faith." Recitations were often given in concert as class recitations. Each recitation was to emphasize a single point. Concert recitations were especially popular at the end of the century. Memorizing as a method was apparently not used extensively by the L.D.S. Sunday schools. When it was used, all students of each department were to memorize the same verse or quotation, and they were not to memorize any material until it was first thoroughly explained. About this latter point, Karl G.  

---

78 Andreas Engberg, "Correspondence," *Juvenile Instructor*, II (August 1, 1867), 120.

79 "Correspondence," *Juvenile Instructor*, X (April 3, 1875), 77.

80 James J. Chandler, "Correspondence," *Juvenile Instructor*, IX (January 2, 1874), 12.

81 Fjeld, *loc. cit.*

82 George W. Terry, "Minutes of the Rockville Sunday School from 1877-1881" (in the Brigham Young University Special Collections Library, Provo, Utah), p. 25.

83 *Manner of Conducting and Grading Sunday Schools*, *op. cit.* p. 3.


86 *Latter-day Saints' Sunday School Treatise*, *op. cit.*, pp. 105-107.

Maeser states: "Memorative exercises should be given only after thorough previous explanation. ... By way of illustration, the hymns to be sung congregationally should certainly be memorized, but not until thoroughly explained to the classes." Most memorizing in the L.D.S. Sunday schools prior to 1900 took place in the 1890's. Students memorized scriptures, L.D.S. Church "Articles of Faith," and catechism questions.

**Home study and application assignments.** Home study was assigned students in the L.D.S. Sunday schools as early as 1869. This practice continued throughout the century. These assignments consisted of questions to be answered by the following week; reading assignments related to the coming lesson; and reading the lesson itself when the "Leaflets" were being used. Students were also assigned to read good

---

88 Maeser, *loc. cit.*
89 Winter, *op. cit.*, p. 41.
91 *Latter-day Saints' Sunday School Treatise*, *op. cit.*, p. 11.
92 McKnight, *op. cit.*, p. 32.
94 "Deseret Sunday School Union Meeting," *Juvenile Instructor*, XVIII (April 15, 1882), 116.
96 Winter, *op. cit.*, p. 28.
biographical material\textsuperscript{97} and other good books in general.\textsuperscript{98} They were also assigned to make maps during the latter part of the century.\textsuperscript{99} Home assignments were to be within the capacity of the students.\textsuperscript{100} During the 1890's Sunday school teachers began stressing application assignments where students were given assignments to apply the teachings of their Sunday school lessons in their daily lives.\textsuperscript{101} Teachers were encouraged when teaching a principle to make their teaching such that the principle "finds a home in the hearts of the pupils and becomes a part of their very lives."\textsuperscript{102}

Field trips. Field trips were taken by L.D.S. Sunday school students as early as the 1860's.\textsuperscript{103} In 1872 a large number of students made a trip to the Salt Lake L.D.S. Temple. Concerning this trip Andrew Fjeld stated:

This excursion was a real outstanding, never-to-be-forgotten event in the lives of all who attended. To most of them it was the first time that they had ever seen a railroad train. It was the first time to ride on one; the first time to go to Salt Lake City. It was the first time they had seen the great tabernacle,  

\textsuperscript{97}Latter-day Saints' Sunday School Treatise, op. cit., p. 52.  
\textsuperscript{98}Winter, op. cit., pp. 33-35.  
\textsuperscript{99}Latter-day Saints' Sunday School Treatise, op. cit., p. 81.  
\textsuperscript{100}Ibid., p. 109.  
\textsuperscript{101}Ibid.  
\textsuperscript{102}Winter, op. cit., p. 39.  
\textsuperscript{103}McKnight, loc. cit.
and the temple, whose walls extended about four feet above the ground; the first time to enjoy a play in the historic Salt Lake Theater.

The 1300 excursionists, when they arrived in Salt Lake City, were taken on a sight-seeing tour, which was most interesting. Then they marched in procession in the middle of the street, headed by the American Fork brass band with William Grant as leader, to the theater which they filled from "pit to dome" and witnessed the gorgeous fairy tale, "Alladin's Lamp." It is not an exaggeration to say that this Sunday School excursion has never been excelled by any that have followed.104

Other trips were also made to the Latter-day Saint temple in Salt Lake City during the period of its dedicatory services in 1893. Many students throughout the counties surrounding Salt Lake City participated.105 Field trips were also conducted by Sunday schools to see points of local interest in the local community.106

Student readings, narrations, and dialogues. Students were giving special readings in the Sunday schools of the L.D.S. Church in 1874.107 Materials for the readings were often taken from the Juvenile Instructor.108 This method was used as late as 1898.109 Narratives

---

104 Fjeld, op. cit., p. 7.
105 Jubilee History of Latter-day Saints Sunday Schools, op. cit., pp. 31-32.
106 John M. Bowen, "Correspondence," Juvenile Instructor, X (May 29, 1875), 132.
107 Fjeld, op. cit., p. 15.
were read by students as part of Sunday school instruction in the latter part of the 1890's. For example, 

... the narrative of the resurrection of Christ, as given in Matthew, Mark and Luke, are found and read by the pupils, each rising, reading a verse or two, and speaking loud enough to be heard by the whole department, while the rest of the pupils are following from the text... A few questions in regard to the differences in these narratives, put at the next recitation, will be sufficient for review.  

Dialogues were being used by 1874 with singing background. The Juvenile Instructor contained dialogue material for use in the Sunday schools. These dialogue materials were so arranged that the teacher and a number of the students would go through a dialogue of a gospel subject such as "the first principles of the gospel," Historical dialogues were also given as late as 1898.

Student reports, talks, essays, and compositions. The Juvenile Instructor records the use of student compositions as a study method as early as 1874. Students were to write articles or compositions which were later read to the Sunday school congregation. During the 1890's, pupils in the intermediate departments were writing little essays on

---

110 Ibid., p. 67.
111 "School Anniversary," Juvenile Instructor, IX (September 26, 1874), 240.
113 L. K. Young, "Dialogue on the First Principles of the Gospel," Juvenile Instructor, XX (July 1, 1885), 205.
114 Fjeld, op. cit., p. 108.
115 Chandler, loc. cit.
what they had seen during the week, or from what they had learned in their course of home study. In the latter part of the century students were assigned to give reports on their home reading assignments and from their study of "Leaflet" lessons. Student talks were also given in the 1890's. These usually consisted of short lectures on the lesson subject.

Study periods. Teachers in the L.D.S. Sunday schools were using study periods as a method of instruction by the 1870's. These first study periods were part of the classroom activity and consisted of having students complete certain reading assignments by individual study. Towards the end of the century scripture study periods were also used where students were assigned to individually study certain scriptural passages.

Drill exercises. L.D.S. Sunday school teachers were engaging in

116 Manner of Conducting and Grading Sunday Schools, op. cit., pp. 3-4.
117 Latter-day Saints' Sunday School Treatise, op. cit., pp. 37, 54.
118 Winter, op. cit., p. 28.
120 Manner of Conducting and Grading Sunday Schools, op. cit., pp. 4-5.
121 Terry, op. cit., p. 1.
122 Winter, op. cit., p. 40.
drill exercises with their students as early as 1879. One form of this method was to drill students in locating passages of scripture. Another type of drill exercise was a repetition type drill. Students would repeat around the room certain important lesson points until all had thoroughly learned them. The principle involved here was to "keep the student on the subject until he understands it with fair thoroughness," then when the material was tied into future lessons the student could understand it.

Discussion. General discussion was evidently not used generally until the 1890's. It was then introduced into the theology classes of the L.D.S. Sunday schools. Principles of the gospel were discussed by the class until they had come to an understanding of them. General discussion was also used in the higher classes when treating topics in the "Leaflet" lessons.

Researching. Researching assignments were given L.D.S. Sunday school students in the 1890's. Biographical and geographical

---

123 Terry, op. cit., p. 15.
124 Maeser, op. cit., p. 18.
125 Winter, op. cit., p. 32.
126 Ibid., p. 30.
127 Maeser, op. cit., p. 20.
128 Manner of Conducting and Grading Sunday Schools, loc. cit.
129 Winter, op. cit., p. 29.
dictionaries were among the first resource books used. Compendiums were also used. Karl G. Maeser stated:

A very important work in the Higher department is the Compendium; for it is a collection of subjects contained in all the Church works. It should be used as a text book; a work of reference; from its adoption a great amount of good may be obtained. Several doctrinal and historical reference books were in use as well as scientific and scriptural resource and reference books by the end of the nineteenth century. These were generally used in the more advanced classes where students were assigned to look up answers to various questions.

Student testimonies, comments, explanations, and stories. L.D.S. Sunday school students were engaged in the practice of bearing testimony of their knowledge of certain principles and teachings of the gospel to their classmates in the late 1800's. This practice continued through the remainder of the century. A method engaged in by teachers of L.D.S. Sunday schools just before the turn of the century was that of

130 Maeser, op. cit., p. 61.
131 Ibid., p. 27.
132 Latter-day Saints' Sunday School Treatise, op. cit., p. 120.
133 Winter, op. cit., pp. 27, 29, 90-91.
134 Ibid., pp. 40-41.
135 Manner of Conducting and Grading Sunday Schools, op. cit., p. 4.
136 Latter-day Saints' Sunday School Treatise, op. cit., pp. 37, 38, 105, 117.
137 Winter, loc. cit.
having students comment about what they had learned from the lesson that Sunday. This was usually done during the last few minutes of class. It served as a repetition and review exercise and kept students alert during the general lesson. 138 Another method used in the 1890's was to have students explain principles and doctrines to each other followed by a question and answer period conducted by the teacher to clear up unclear points of the lesson. 139 Students were engaged during this period in the method of telling stories to their classmates about their personal experiences or other fitting stories about the lesson material. 140

Notebooks. During the latter part of the nineteenth century--particularly in the higher grades--Sunday school students in the L.D.S. Sunday schools were assigned to keep notebooks. 141 These notebooks or journals were used by the students to keep important information about each of the lessons for their personal records and to aid them in preparing for reviews and examinations. 142

Student projects. One of the more unique types of teaching methods was commenced in the L.D.S. Sunday schools in the 1890's in the form of student projects. Teachers were encouraged

138 Latter-day Saints' Sunday School Treatise, op. cit., p. 31.
139 Maeser, op. cit., p. 22.
140 Latter-day Saints' Sunday School Treatise, op. cit., p. 113.
141 Ibid., p. 120.
142 Maeser, op. cit., pp. 54-55.
to satisfy the restless activities of the pupils by assigning them something to do--some act of charity or kindness to the poor or indigent, something to beautify the school room, or that will enhance the comfort of the class or aid the teacher. \footnote{Latter-day Saints' Sunday School Treatise, op. cit., p. 53.}

Exhorting and counseling. During the early 1890's, L.D.S. Sunday school teachers began exhorting students to implant virtuous principles in their lives as safeguards against the problems of life. \footnote{Manner of Conducting and Grading Sunday Schools, op. cit., p. 3.} This was employed as an expository or explanatory method wherein teachers advised, warned, or cautioned students about problems of life and encouraged them in righteous living. \footnote{Latter-day Saints' Sunday School Treatise, op. cit., p. 107.} Similarly teachers employed the counseling method of giving students direction regarding their individual lives. \footnote{Winter, op. cit., p. 41.} This method was used as an informal method in place of lecturing to give direct information to students regarding their problems in living gospel principles. \footnote{Latter-day Saints' Sunday School Treatise, loc. cit.}

Problem solving. In 1898 students in the Sunday schools of the L.D.S. Church were given problems to solve. These problems consisted of finding scriptural proof of certain principles of the gospel. \footnote{Ibid., pp. 53, 69, 117.} This method of scripturally verifying parts of the gospel was a method
used mostly in the more advanced grades of the Sunday schools. 149

Question box. The "Question box" method of teaching was introduced into the theology classes of the L.D.S. Sunday schools in the 1890's. The following describes how this method was used:

The Committee of three, having charge of the "Question Box," present the accepted questions to the Instructor for distribution.

a. This committee should throw out any question that is not signed by a regular member of the department.
b. Any question should be discarded that manifests a spirit of inquisitiveness rather than of inquiry.
c. As the Secretary reads the questions, one at a time, the Instructor assigns the answer to one from among the volunteers, taking care, however, to make the assignment as distributive as possible.
d. The Secretary should record the subjects and to whom the questions are assigned.

e. No new questions should be assigned for answering until the whole regular program is disposed of. 150

The following describes the method followed for answering the assigned questions:

The assigned answers are given by the members to questions from the "Question Box" as they are called up in their order by the Secretary.

a. Members answering questions should make no statement which cannot be substantiated by scriptural evidences, from the authentic history of the Church, or other Church works.
b. Other members have a right to give additional information on the subject under consideration, or ask for explanation on points in the answers made.
c. Any remarks irrelevant to the subject under consideration should be ruled by the instructor as out of order.
d. This part of the regular program may occasionally consume the whole time of the recitation. In that case the

149 Winter, loc. cit.

interrupted program is to be resumed at the next session, until the whole program is disposed of. Such a continuance may become necessary at any part of the regular program.\textsuperscript{151}

**Finger plays.** One of the last methods of instruction to be introduced into the L.D.S. Sunday schools in the nineteenth century was finger plays. These were used in the smaller grades—the primary and kindergarten departments.

These plays should be watched and appropriate activities be given in the form of play which will interest the child and at the same time draw him from the sensuous to activities accompanied by uplifting thoughts. Such fingerplays and songs as: "Oh where are the merry, merry little men?" "You dear little thumb, etc." "The bee-hive," "Five little mice," and many others, are much enjoyed by the children and meet their needs.

\begin{quote}
Finger plays and simple exercises such as swinging the feet quietly, clapping the hands softly, representing falling rain or snow, or having a quiet march will be found very helpful.\textsuperscript{152}
\end{quote}

These exercises and finger plays were often accompanied by little songs which were sung by the children.\textsuperscript{153}

"Leaflets." The "Leaflet" lesson system began in the L.D.S. Sunday schools in 1889.

"Deseret Sunday School Union Leaflets" contain prepared Scriptural and historical lessons arranged in successive order and adapted for Sunday School class work. They are used in sheet form, each leaflet containing one lesson. One hundred and

\textsuperscript{151} Ibid., pp. 95-96.

\textsuperscript{152} Winter, op. cit., pp. 54-55.

\textsuperscript{153} Ibid.
seventy-two numbers have been issued since June, 1889—the date of the first publication. Over two and a half millions of copies have already been printed [19007], and the publication of them is being continued. 154

The "Leaflets" were prepared to provide L.D.S. Sunday school teachers a uniform set of prepared lessons for aiding them in teaching the gospel. 155 They contained the following parts: "1. Title, supplemented with time and place of incident. 2. Text. 3. Notes. 4. Questions. 5. The lesson statement. 6. The summary, or what we may learn. 7. Special references." 156 The following rules of procedure were to be used with the "Leaflet" lessons:

1. Introduce subject by a review of last Sunday's lesson.

2. Read the title, time, place, and question on it until thoroughly understood.

3. One verse to be read at a time, and at least one question to be asked from every sentence.

4. Encourage pupils to ask questions from every sentence read.

5. Bring in all the notes when they are wanted in the text.

6. Introduce additional notes whenever appropriate.

7. Dispose of all the questions on the Leaflet as the reading of the text proceeds.

8. Pursue the same course with references. Make a judicious selection from among them.

9. It is not necessary nor even expedient to go through the whole Leaflet at one lesson.

154 Jubilee History of Latter-day Saints Sunday Schools, loc. cit.
156 Ibid.
10. Let the class find the references in the Scriptures.

11. Encourage pupils to bear testimonies to the points named, or give additional references. 157

The value of the "Leaflets" to the individual Sunday schools and their teachers is stated by Andrew Fjeld:

About this time \(1889\) the "Leaflets" began to be published by the Deseret Sunday School Union Board. They consisted of a series of lessons on the Old Testament, The Life of Christ, and the Book of Mormon. Lessons on modern Church History were also given.

This was the first attempt of this central board to furnish the Sunday Schools of the Church with uniform lessons. They proved to be very helpful as they were replete with information on the subject, and contained helpful suggestions on how to present the lesson. 158

The first "Leaflet" contained the following "Suggestions to Sunday School Officers":

1. These lessons may be used either as the regular reading lessons of the Sunday School, or as supplementary thereto.

2. The "Lesson Statement," "What we may learn from this lesson" and the "Notes," may each be read by one scholar, or by the teacher, or each sentence may be read by the scholars in rotation.

3. The "questions" may be regulated according to the advancement of the class. The teacher in the advanced class can add to those given as he may deem advisable, or as the exercises of the class may suggest; the teacher in a less advanced class can select the simplest questions, or those he considers the most closely connected with the more important teachings of the lesson.

4. When the lesson is learned, those leaflets which are the public property of the school can be put away for future use.

157 Ibid., p. 117.

158 Fjeld, op. cit., p. 37.
5. The leaflets should be distributed a Sunday ahead to the teachers, and to those scholars who will promise to study them at home during the week. All scholars who are sufficiently advanced should be encouraged to study the lesson in this way.\footnote{Deseret Sunday School Union Leaflets, Lessons 1-136 (Salt Lake City: George Q. Cannon & Sons Company, 1898), p. 2.}

In later "Leaflets" beginning with "Leaflet Number 87" issued February 15, 1897, the following "Instructions To Teachers" were given:

1. Have only one verse read at a time.

2. Have all the references given below the text read and explained whenever they occur in any verse.

3. The same course to be observed with the notes.

4. After reading a verse, explanation of its references and notes, call for any questions from among the pupils on any yet unexplained point in the respective verse, reference or note.

5. If no questions are forthcoming, or they should not be sufficiently satisfactory, ask the needed questions yourself.

6. Follow the order of exercises as given in this leaflet.

7. Questions on the lesson are only suggestive and should be supplemented by as many more as occasion may require.

8. It is advisable that the teacher occasionally give the Lesson Statement himself as a pattern, or divides it between three or four pupils.

9. The points in "What we may learn from this Lesson" are only suggestive. One of these should constitute the chief part of the whole lesson, towards which the treatment of the whole lesson should have a bearing.

10. It is rarely possible to finish one Leaflet in one Sunday.\footnote{Ibid., p. 174.}
II. TEACHER-CENTERED METHODS OF L.D.S. SUNDAY SCHOOLS

The teachers of the early L.D.S. Sunday schools used a number of teacher-centered methods of instruction during the nineteenth century, but they were not used as extensively as student-centered methods. These methods were usually used in conjunction with each other or with student-centered or object-centered methods. They are treated individually in this study.

Reading by teacher. Richard Ballantyne read to his students from the scriptures in his first L.D.S. Sunday school in 1849. Teachers also read articles to their students from the Juvenile Instructor. In the intermediate departments teachers in the L.D.S. Sunday schools read "passages, paragraphs, and verses" to their students as part of the lesson material. This method remained part of Sunday school instruction through the end of the century.

Story telling. Story telling as a method of teaching in the Sunday schools of the L.D.S. Church also began with Richard Ballantyne in 1849. Other early L.D.S. Sunday schools also used this method.

---

161 Sonne, op. cit., p. 50.
162 Terry, op. cit., p. 7.
163 Maeser, op. cit., p. 16.
165 Sonne, loc. cit.
of telling stories surrounding gospel subjects. This method became very popular in the 1890's especially in the smaller grades. Story telling with pictures was used in this period also. Both scriptural and historical stories were told. Sunday school teachers also used biographical stories and stories about their personal experiences. Stories were not to be used in Sunday school instructions unless they had a religious or moral truth in view. The Deseret Sunday School Union encouraged its teachers to use the story telling method (1) "To illustrate a principle," (2) "To cultivate the formation of good resolutions," (3) "To produce interest and attention," and (4) "To encourage mutual confidence between teachers and pupils."

Lecture. The lecture method of teaching was used by L.D.S. Sunday school teachers as early as 1867. By 1884 short lectures were being given as part of the opening exercises. The lecture

166 Fjeld, op. cit., p. 4.
167 Maeser, op. cit., p. 8.
169 Maeser, op. cit., pp. 9, 17.
172 Latter-day Saints' Sunday School Treatise, loc. cit.
173 Ibid., pp. 113-114.
174 Engberg, loc. cit.
175 Fjeld, op. cit., p. 30.
method was generally used in the classroom when bringing in supplementary lesson material. These lectures were about such subjects as "family, parents, leaders, country and the life of Christ." Lectures were to be kept short when used in the primary departments. This method was still in use by L.D.S. Sunday school teachers in the late 1890's.

Elucidation. L.D.S. teachers were elucidating or explaining lesson subjects in the 1870's. At this time readings from the Juvenile Instructor were being explained to the students. This practice of elucidating parts of the lesson continued through the 1880's and 1890's. Karl G. Maeser emphasized in 1892 that all material to be memorized should be carefully explained to the students. He also encouraged teachers to explain textual parts of the lesson to their pupils. Teachers elucidated pictures and gave chronological

176 Winter, op. cit., p. 41.
177 Latter-day Saints' Sunday School Treatise, op. cit., p. 23.
178 Maeser, op. cit., pp. 9, 27.
180 Terry, op. cit., p. 9.
181 "Deseret Sunday School Union Meeting," Juvenile Instructor, XVIII (May 15, 1882), 151.
183 Maeser, op. cit., p. 8.
185 Latter-day Saints' Sunday School Treatise, op. cit., p. 30.
explanations as part of their lesson. The Deseret Sunday School Union encouraged its teachers to give background or historical explanations about parts of their lessons. For example, when speaking of Jesus' burial the teacher should explain as part of his lesson "the manner of burial among the Jews," and he might also explain that "the Romans and the Greeks burned their dead." Teachers were also using this method to explain difficult passages or words contained in the lesson material.

**Example.** During the latter part of the nineteenth century, teachers in the L.D.S. Sunday schools became more conscious of personal influence upon their students. The method of teaching by example was emphasized as a vital part of their teaching. They were encouraged by the Deseret Sunday School Union to live righteously, in order that the Spirit of God may influence their lesson preparations and their teaching. Teachers became aware of their personal influence in home study; if they didn't carry out effective home study, neither would their students. The Deseret Sunday School Union further recommended:

---

186 Winter, *op. cit.*, p. 35.
188 Ibid., p. 109.
190 *Manner of Conducting and Grading Sunday Schools, loc. cit.*
191 Winter, *op. cit.*, pp. 31, 90.
192 Ibid., p. 34.
The aim of the Sunday school teacher should be directed mainly to the implanting of religious truths by precept and example, rather than merely teaching theological facts, for the knowledge of facts alone will not make a child religious.193

Karl G. Maeser summarized the use of this method when he stated:

The example of a religious teacher should be consistent and always on the increase for good. He cannot get up an example for the occasion. It must be so every day in the week, month, year. He cannot put on a sanctimonious face and speak with an oily tongue today, and tomorrow commit some deed unworthy of a teacher. His example should bear out every word he speaks—it is far reaching in its results. It may be impressed upon the little minds for eternity. The best and noblest example possible is not too good to set before the young.194

Gem thoughts. Poems, short articles and stories, hymns and special thoughts prized for their beauty and perfection were used by early L.D.S. Sunday school teachers and were called "gem thoughts."195 These were frequently used by teachers in presenting their lessons in the intermediate departments.196 They were recommended and used as part of L.D.S. Sunday school instruction primarily in the 1890's.197

Individualization. Just prior to 1900 the Deseret Sunday School Union began emphasizing the need to individualize lesson material.198

194Maeser, op. cit., p. 35.
195Latter-day Saints' Sunday School Treatise, op. cit., pp. 14,
25.
196Ibid., p. 36.
197Manner of Conducting and Grading Sunday Schools, op. cit.,
pp. 3-4.
198Winter, op. cit., p. 11.
They encouraged Sunday school teachers to "make an individual study of each pupil, and give to each that personal attention needed to keep the pupil learning and also liking Sunday school work." Teachers were advised to adapt their lesson material to each student according to the student's individual age and capacity.

Harmonizing and summarizing. In 1898 L.D.S. Sunday school teachers were encouraged to harmonize their teachings by showing the harmony that exists between the various parts of the scriptures and between true religion and true science. They were especially encouraged to "show the harmony of the testimonies of Matthew, Mark, Luke, and John." When studying principles and ordinances, teachers were to establish a harmony between them. They were to also show the harmony between the teachings of these principles and ordinances in the present day with other dispensations. The practice of summarizing lesson materials was a teaching method used by L.D.S. Sunday school teachers in the 1890's. Especially when students had presented much of

199 Ibid., p. 40.
201 Ibid., p. 80.
202 Ibid.
203 Ibid.
204 Ibid., p. 88.
the lesson, teachers would use this method of tying together the important lesson points. \(^{205}\)

**Teacher testimony.** Another method used in the L.D.S. Sunday schools of the nineteenth century was teacher testimonies. This method was probably a part of L.D.S. Sunday school instruction from the very beginning, but no record was found of it being used earlier than 1898. \(^{206}\) Teachers would bear testimony of their knowledge of various gospel principles, ordinances, and truths, thus strengthening the students' knowledge and conviction of them. \(^{207}\) The Deseret Sunday School Union suggested: "When an important principle is to be presented, prepare the mind of the child by awakening its feelings through illustrations, testimonies, songs, etc." \(^{208}\)

**Visiting authorities.** One of the last teaching methods to be introduced into the L.D.S. Sunday schools in the nineteenth century was the use of visiting authorities. People with greater knowledge than the teacher of particular subjects were brought into the class to discuss certain parts of the lesson material with which they had become especially familiar. \(^{209}\) On some occasions missionaries, immigrants, and

\(^{205}\) Ibid., p. 30.

\(^{206}\) Ibid., p. 22.

\(^{207}\) Winter, *op. cit.*, p. 40.

\(^{208}\) *Latter-day Saints' Sunday School Treatise*, loc. cit.

\(^{209}\) Winter, loc. cit.
others with interesting stories or information to impart relative to the lesson material were engaged to participate as part of the lesson.  

III. OBJECT-CENTERED METHODS OF L.D.S. SUNDAY SCHOOLS

The use of object-centered methods of instruction played an active part in the overall teaching program of the L.D.S. Sunday schools in the latter half of the nineteenth century. Although these methods were not as heavily used as teacher-centered methods and student-centered methods, they were often used. They were generally used in conjunction with other teacher-centered and student-centered methods but are here treated individually.

Illustrations and pictures. As early as the 1860's, L.D.S. Sunday school teachers were using woodcut illustrations from the Juvenile Instructor in their teaching. Picture charts were in use by the 1880's. Later in the century, students were telling stories with the aid of pictures as part of their Sunday school lessons. Another method was to show the picture and have students discover truths portrayed in it. An alternative of this method was to have a student

---

210 Latter-day Saints' Sunday School Treatise, op. cit., p. 112.
211 Juvenile Instructor, II (1866).
212 "Deseret Sunday School Union Meeting," Juvenile Instructor, XVII (December 15, 1882), 382.
214 Ibid., p. 107.
explain a picture bringing out its spiritual or moral value. Karl G. Mäser "admonished all teachers of the young to see to it that object lessons be used so as to cultivate all the faculties, that thereby the pupils will read a picture and make it 'a living thing.'"216

Cards. Various types of cards were used in the instructional program of early L.D.S. Sunday schools. One of the first to be used was "alphabet cards" which were in use in 1874.217 "Bible scene cards" and "scripture cards" were also in use by the 1870's.218

Music cards, each containing two songs set to music, were issued periodically, commencing in March, 1877, numbered from one to twenty-four. Five thousand copies of each were printed as a first edition, and some were republished--making a total of over 120,000.219

In 1892 the first group of "Book of Mormon Chart Cards" were printed by the Deseret Sunday School Union.

"Book of Mormon Chart Cards," Parts I and II, contain miniature copies of the pictures on the charts, together with explanations of the scenes represented. Of these cards 20,000 sets of Part I and the same number of Part II were printed.

Besides the works named above a large number of catechism cards and cards containing the Articles of Faith of the Church

\[215\text{Winter, op. cit., p. 95.}\]
\[216\text{Mäser, op. cit., p. 10.}\]
\[217\text{George Goddard, "Correspondence," Juvenile Instructor, IX (March 28, 1874), 77.}\]
\[218\text{Fjeld, op. cit., p. 19.}\]
\[219\text{Jubilee History of Latter-day Saints Sunday Schools, op. cit., p. 40.}\]
of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints, have been published by the Union, and have received a wide circulation. 220

Charts, maps, and outlines. Charts were in use by L.D.S. Sunday school teachers by 1875. 221 Picture charts became part of Sunday school instruction in the 1880's. 222 Charts were widely used by the Sunday schools in the 1890's. 223 The Deseret Sunday School Union advocated: "We do not teach the chart, but teach some subject by the use of the chart as a means." They suggested that charts be used (1) "to hold attention," (2) "to aid the memory," (3) "to help the imagination," and (4) "to present illustrations of men, places and principles." 224 Teachers also conducted exercises with "scripture charts." 225 Karl G. Maeser advocated the use of scripture charts, charts when telling stories, and picture charts in the primary departments. 226 Picture charts with cards to match were prepared in 1892 by the Deseret Sunday School Union for use in the Sunday schools. 227

220 Ibid., p. 42.
221 "Correspondence," Juvenile Instructor, X (April 3, 1875), 77.
222 "Deseret Sunday School Meeting," Juvenile Instructor, XVII (December 15, 1882), 382.
223 Jubilee History of Latter-day Saints Sunday Schools, op. cit., p. 55.
224 Latter-day Saints' Sunday School Treatise, op. cit., p. 114.
225 Ibid., p. 30.
226 Maeser, op. cit., pp. 8-10, 26, 40.
227 Ibid., p. 17.
"Book of Mormon Chart," Part I, contains twelve large lithographed pictures in colors, illustrative of the Book of Mormon narrative. These charts were prepared at considerable labor and expense, costing over $2,000 for the work. To procure designs for the pictures, prizes to the amount of $240 were offered to competing artists and awarded to those whose productions were accepted. The chart was published in 1892, and 1,000 copies were printed.

"Book of Mormon Chart," Part II, is similar in size and style to Part I, and is a continuation of the same narrative. It was issued in 1897, 1,000 copies being printed.

"Bible Charts." In order to obtain suitable charts illustrative of Bible scenes, selections were made from pictures issued by eastern publishers. To bring them more in conformity with the ideas of the Latter-day Saints and make them better adapted for Sunday School use, the General Board had these charts altered both in subject and text. The first set of Bible Charts was published in 1895. An edition of 500 copies was issued. Four new sets of Bible pictures have since been prepared and similar editions published. In connection with them, Bible Chart Instructors, especially prepared under the direction of the Union Board, have also been issued.228

One picture chart used in the primary department entitled "From the Cradle to the Grave" depicting the stages of life was used for keeping children's attention.229

Maps were used as a teaching method in the 1890's in L.D.S. Sunday schools. One principal use of maps was in locating scripture geography.230 For example, students geographically studied the Land of

---

228 Jubilee History of Latter-day Saints Sunday Schools, op. cit., pp. 41-42.
229 Winter, op. cit., p. 94.
230 Maeser, op. cit., pp. 19, 40.
Palestine by using a Palestine map. Not only were maps used for locating places, but they were also used to indicate travel such as the wanderings of the Children of Israel in the wilderness and the travels of ancient patriarchs. Students were engaged in making their own maps by the late 1890's. Diagrams or outlines were used during this period to present the different features of the lesson subject--"a mere map of the subject." The Deseret Sunday School Union advocated that teachers use chronological outlines of lesson materials in their teaching.

The Sacrament of the Lord's Supper. The Sacrament of the Lord's Supper was introduced into the Sunday schools of the L.D.S. Church in 1877. It was introduced to give those children unable to attend Sacrament Meetings in the Church an opportunity to partake and learn the importance and significance of its emblems. Apostle Francis M.

---

231 Juvenile Instructor, XXIX (September 1, 1894), 550.
233 Ibid., p. 81.
234 Winter, op. cit., p. 11.
235 Latter-day Saints' Sunday School Treatise, op. cit., pp. 77-80.
237 Winter, op. cit., p. 74.
238 Manner of Conducting and Grading Sunday Schools, op. cit., p. 2.
Lyman of the L.D.S. Church advocated talks about the importance and significance of the Sacrament or the singing of hymns about the Lord during the administration of the sacramental emblems. The Sacrament was administered each Sunday. The following is given as part of a historical review of the Deseret Sunday School Union in the Juvenile Instructor:

In the year 1877 a new feature of much importance was introduced, by the direction of the First Presidency of the Church, into the services of the Sunday schools. We refer to the administration of the Sacrament of the Lord's Supper to the children attending them; which was directed should be done by the Bishops or by some member of the Priesthood of the Ward appointed by him, and administered to all the children under eight years of age, and to all those above that age who had been baptized into the Church. The effects of this counsel, where carried out in the spirit of the instructions given, have been marked for good. A better understanding of the divine mission of our Lord and Savior Jesus Christ and of His atonement for the sins of the world has been given to our children, and they are constantly reminded by partaking of these emblems, together with suitable hymns sung, and instructions given by the teachers at these times, of the necessity of honoring their Savior, of reverencing His name, and obeying His laws.

Physical objects. In 1892 Karl G. Maeser recommended that teachers in the primary department use physical objects as part of their lessons where feasible. He suggested the use of "blocks," "sticks," and other physical objects by the students in creating pictures. He stated:

---

239 Winter, op. cit., p. 75.
240 Latter-day Saints' Sunday School Treatise, op. cit., pp. 11, 18.
241 Reynolds, op. cit., p. 322.
242 Maeser, op. cit., p. 8.
The use of pictures brings into play another sense, that of sight, creating the same picture upon the mind through another means, and thus making the truth or picture stronger and more lasting. If, also, we cause the children to make that picture with blocks, sticks, or draw from it various object lessons, the sense of touch or feeling gives another impression of the same picture through a third sense. And so on; the more of the senses the teacher calls into operation the stronger that picture becomes.243

The Deseret Sunday School Union recommended nature objects in depicting certain aspects of the gospel such as "dying flowers representing death" or "flowers in the spring representing the resurrection."244 The method of using physical objects was especially recommended for children in the primary departments.245

Blackboard. The blackboard was used in the 1890's as part of L.D.S. Sunday school instruction. It was particularly useful for illustrating, diagraming, outlining and making comments about various lesson points. Map sketches were made on blackboards enabling the teacher to locate places and indicate travels of groups or individuals.246 The blackboard assisted in keeping student attention and helped students learn through the sense of sight.247

243 Ibid., p. 52.
244 Winter, op. cit., p. 56.
246 Ibid., p. 37.
247 Maeser, op. cit., p. 52.
IV. SIMILARITIES AND DIFFERENCES BETWEEN THE TEACHING METHODS OF THE L.D.S. SUNDAY SCHOOLS AND THE NON-L.D.S. SUNDAY SCHOOLS IN AMERICA PRIOR TO 1900

The findings of this study reveal a number of similarities and differences between the teaching methods of the L.D.S. Sunday schools and non-L.D.S. Sunday schools in America prior to 1900. These similarities and differences are compared and reported by sections as they related to student-centered, teacher-centered, and object-centered methods of instruction.

**Similarities between student-centered methods.** Both L.D.S. and non-L.D.S. Sunday schools began by using reading and spelling exercises from public school primers and spellers as part of their instructional program. Neither Sunday school system held onto this method over a long period of time, although the non-L.D.S. Sunday schools continued using it to some extent in the frontier area Sunday schools until the 1860's. Reading orally by the students was also used by both groups shortly after their beginnings, and both continued to use this type of instruction throughout most of the century. Catechization, although used much more heavily by non-L.D.S. Sunday schools through the extensive use of a wide variety of catechisms and question books, was used by both L.D.S. and non-L.D.S. Sunday schools in their early periods. It continued to be used as a popular method of instruction by both groups through the remainder of the 1800's. Memorization was used by both Sunday school groups but apparently much earlier and much more
extensively by the non-L.D.S. Sunday schools. The non-L.D.S. began using this method shortly after 1800, and during the next twenty-five or thirty years they required extensive memorization work from their students. The "Selected or Limited Lesson System" was introduced in 1825 to do away with long memorizations in the non-L.D.S. schools. No evidence was found that indicated the L.D.S. Sunday schools used memorization work before 1890, and then students were only memorizing short passages. Both Sunday school groups used recitations rather extensively in their early years and continued their use throughout the remainder of the century. Concert recitations were very popular in both groups. Instructional singing was used by both groups of Sunday schools soon after they began, and both used methods of classroom and congregational singing instruction. Singing was a part of both Sunday school movements from their origins to 1900. Instructional praying and memorizing of prayers was practiced rather extensively in the nineteenth century non-L.D.S. Sunday schools; whereas, in the L.D.S. Sunday schools, prayer instructions were given in the 1890's, but apparently prayers were never memorized in these schools. Libraries were a part of the early Sunday schools of both groups. They were more widely used in the non-L.D.S. group where thousands of books were published by the Sunday school unions. Libraries were utilized by most L.D.S. and non-L.D.S. Sunday schools throughout the nineteenth century. The discussion method was used as early as 1826 in non-L.D.S. schools, but evidently not until the 1890's by the L.D.S. schools.

Other similarities such as the use of the problem solving method,
application assignments, and researching were part of the instructional program of both L.D.S. and non-L.D.S. Sunday schools in the 1800's. They were introduced as teaching methods in the 1820's in the non-L.D.S. schools, but evidently not until the 1890's in the L.D.S. schools. Home study was used throughout most of the nineteenth century period of both groups beginning in 1826 in the non-L.D.S. schools and in 1869 in the L.D.S. schools. Both Sunday school groups used reviews and examinations about equally, but apparently reviews preceded examinations about fifty years in the non-L.D.S. schools, and exams preceded reviews about fifteen years in the L.D.S. schools. These methods were still being used at the end of the 1900's by both Sunday school groups. Themes, essays, and compositions were used rather extensively by the L.D.S. Sunday schools throughout the last quarter of the nineteenth century. They were also used in the non-L.D.S. Sunday schools toward the end of the century but evidently not as extensively as in the L.D.S. schools. Finger plays made their advent into the teaching methods of both groups just prior to the turn of the century in the primary departments. Counseling and exhorting were also used by both Sunday school groups in the latter part of the 1800's, but little evidence was found pertaining to their use in either Sunday school movement.

Differences between student-centered methods. Most differences between teaching methods used by L.D.S. and non-L.D.S. Sunday schools in America prior to 1900 resulted from methods used in one system but not the other. Fundamental writing exercises were a rather dominant part of the early non-L.D.S. Sunday schools until about 1820, but this
method was found to be nonexistent in the L.D.S. schools. Workbook and manual assignments were also a part of the instructional program of non-L.D.S. Sunday schools during the second quarter of the nineteenth century, but evidently they were not used by L.D.S. Sunday schools of the 1800's. On the other hand, the L.D.S. schools used notebooks and journals in their instruction of the nineteenth century while no evidence was found of their use by non-L.D.S. Sunday schools of that period. Harmonizing was done by the students in the non-L.D.S. Sunday schools prior to 1900, but rather than being done by the students, it was done by the teachers in the L.D.S. Sunday schools during that time. The "Limited or Selected Lesson System" which began in 1825 and the "International Lesson System" which was introduced in 1872 were both used by the majority of the nineteenth century non-L.D.S. Sunday schools, but they were not adopted by the L.D.S. Sunday schools of that period. The L.D.S. Sunday schools, however, began utilizing the "Leaflet Lesson System" in 1889. This system was not adopted by the nineteenth century non-L.D.S. Sunday schools, although some non-L.D.S. schools made some use of a type of leaflet instruction around 1875.

A number of methods of instruction were used by the L.D.S. Sunday schools of the nineteenth century that evidently were unused by the non-L.D.S. schools. Field trips, oral reports, student readings and dialogues, study periods, and drill exercises were all used quite extensively throughout the last quarter of the nineteenth century by L.D.S. Sunday schools, but no mention of their use in the non-L.D.S. schools was found. During the 1890's, L.D.S. Sunday schools utilized
the methods of student explanatory questions and student projects. Students were also utilized in L.D.S. Sunday school instruction during that period to bear testimonies, to make comments, to give explanations, and to tell stories. No evidence was found indicating the use of these student-centered methods by non-L.D.S. Sunday schools.

Similarities between teacher-centered methods. Reading by the teacher existed in the earliest L.D.S. and non-L.D.S. Sunday schools and remained to some extent with each group throughout the nineteenth century. During the first Sunday schools the teacher read lengthy scriptural passages, but later in the century only short verses or passages were read. The lecture and story telling methods were also used as part of the earliest Sunday school instruction in both L.D.S. and non-L.D.S. Sunday schools. These methods were both used quite extensively throughout the century—especially story telling in the primary departments of both groups. Teacher example as a teaching method was used by both L.D.S. Sunday schools of the 1800's. It was stressed as early as 1827 in the non-L.D.S. schools, but no evidence was found indicating the encouragement of this method in the L.D.S. schools before 1892. Both L.D.S. and non-L.D.S. schools utilized the method of elucidation or explanation throughout most of their nineteenth century instruction. Individualization of lesson material was stressed by both Sunday school groups, but evidently earlier in the history of the non-L.D.S. schools.

Differences between teacher-centered methods. The L.D.S. Sunday schools evidently used a few more teacher-centered methods than the
non-L.D.S. Sunday schools prior to 1900. Gem thought, summarizing, teacher testimony, and visiting authority methods were used by the L.D.S. Sunday schools in the 1890's, but no evidence was found to indicate that these methods were being used in the non-L.D.S. Sunday schools of that period. Harmonizing was teacher-centered in the L.D.S. Sunday schools of the 1800's, whereas it was used during that time as a student-centered method in the non-L.D.S. schools.

**Similarities between object-centered methods.** Maps were used as early as 1827 in the non-L.D.S. Sunday schools and quite extensively throughout the 1800's. The L.D.S. Sunday schools used maps, but the writer found no evidence of their use in these schools until late in the century. The L.D.S. schools used many charts throughout the last quarter of the nineteenth century. The non-L.D.S. schools also used them during that period but evidently not so extensively. Outlines of lessons were used late in the 1800's as part of the Sunday school instruction in both groups, but little information was located concerning their use. Many types of instruction cards were used as part of Sunday school instruction by both groups throughout most of the nineteenth century. The non-L.D.S. Sunday schools began using cards in 1827, about fifty years earlier than the L.D.S. schools. Physical objects were used by both groups as object-centered lessons—earlier in the non-L.D.S. schools but apparently more extensively in the L.D.S. schools. Illustrations and pictures were widely used throughout most of the nineteenth century L.D.S. Sunday schools, and they were also used by the non-L.D.S. Sunday schools for most of the century but apparently
less extensively. The blackboard was used by the non-L.D.S. Sunday schools throughout most of the last half of the 1800's, but evidently it did not come into use in the L.D.S. Sunday schools until later in the century in the 1890's.

Differences between object-centered methods. The non-L.D.S. Sunday schools prior to 1900 utilized bulletin boards to some extent, but no evidence was found to indicate that L.D.S. Sunday schools used them during this period. The L.D.S. Sunday schools began administering the Sacrament of the Lord's Supper in their services during the last quarter of the nineteenth century. One of the purposes for doing so was to provide a means of instructing the younger children of its significance and purpose. The writer found no evidence of this being done in the non-L.D.S. Sunday schools of the nineteenth century.

Summary. In summary, the Sunday schools of the L.D.S. Church made significant progress in their teaching methods during the nineteenth century. The use of teacher training programs aided the teachers of these Sunday schools to improve their teaching methods and techniques. Methods developed from reading and spelling exercises at the middle of the nineteenth century to a wide variety of student-centered, teacher-centered, and object-centered methods by 1900. Student reports, field trips, finger plays, and the question box are some of the many methods developed and used by the L.D.S. Sunday school teachers during this period. Other methods adding variety to the instructional program of these Sunday schools were pictures, charts, gem
thoughts, and visiting authorities. George Reynolds and Levi Richards wrote in 1884:

Not only has the Union [Deseret Sunday School Union] increased in numbers, year by year, but in compactness also, and a greater uniformity has been reached in the methods of teaching and in the modes of conducting the schools. At first there was considerable diversity of operation in the various Sunday schools situated in the various Stakes of Zion; but to-day, through experience, better methods have been attained which secure greater uniformity and more satisfactory results.248

Many similarities developed between the teaching methods of the L.D.S. and non-L.D.S. Sunday schools of the nineteenth century. Two factors apparently caused the majority of these similarities. First, a number of the teachers of the early L.D.S. Sunday schools had previously been associated with non-L.D.S. Sunday schools. When these teachers joined the L.D.S. Church they apparently brought with them methods and techniques used in the instructional programs of the non-L.D.S. Sunday schools. Catechization, instructional singing, recitations, Bible maps, the Sunday school library, scripture reading by the teacher, and the use of illustrations in the primary departments all appear to have been adopted by L.D.S. Sunday schools from non-L.D.S. Sunday schools. They were all dominant methods of instruction in the non-L.D.S. Sunday schools during the first half of the nineteenth century. Shortly after the L.D.S. Sunday school movement began in 1849, all of these methods had been implemented as part of the instructional program. The second factor contributing to similarities between L.D.S. and non-L.D.S. Sunday

248 Reynolds, op. cit., p. 317.
school teaching methods was the pedagogical philosophy of the nineteenth century. Such teaching methods as reading and spelling exercises, instructional charts and cards, home study assignments, teacher lectures, story telling, the blackboard, reviews, and examinations all appear to have been adopted by both L.D.S. and non-L.D.S. Sunday schools from the general educational systems of the century.

Most of the differences in the teaching methods of the L.D.S. and non-L.D.S. Sunday schools came in the last quarter of the nineteenth century. The major cause of these differences was the development and implementation of instructional methods made by the L.D.S. Sunday schools during this period. The results of this effort made by the L.D.S. Sunday schools was that about twenty new methods were implemented during this period into their instructional program. Evidently none of these new developments were used by non-L.D.S. schools of the 1800's. Most of these new methods were student-centered methods of instruction such as field trips, oral reports, dialogues, drill exercises, student stories, and student projects. On the other hand, the non-L.D.S. schools utilized five or six methods throughout the nineteenth century which were apparently not used in the L.D.S. schools of that period. Other differences were minor. There was some variation between the L.D.S. and non-L.D.S. systems regarding how extensively certain methods were used and the periods of time over which they were used, but the general use in the classroom instruction of the various teaching methods were very similar in almost all cases where both groups used the same method.

By 1900, the L.D.S. Sunday schools were evidently using a wider
variety of teaching methods than the non-L.D.S. Sunday schools which began over a half-century earlier than the L.D.S. Sunday schools.
CHAPTER V

SUMMARY, FINDINGS AND CONCLUSIONS

I. SUMMARY

Purpose of the study. It was the purpose of this study (1) to analyze the teaching methods of the L.D.S. and non-L.D.S. Sunday school movements in America prior to 1900; and (2) to compare the teaching methods of these Sunday school developments and determine similarities and differences.

Delimitations of the study. The study was delimited to include as Sunday schools of the L.D.S. Church (1) the early independent L.D.S. Sunday schools, (2) the Parent Sunday School Union, and (3) the Deseret Sunday School Union. The non-L.D.S. Sunday schools were delimited (1) to the early non-L.D.S. Sunday schools; (2) to the American Sunday School Union; and (3) to auxiliary unions of the American Sunday School Union. The study was also delimited to Sunday schools of the above mentioned groups conducted in the United States prior to 1900.

Research procedure. A review was made of the origins of L.D.S. and non-L.D.S. Sunday schools, and an overview report was given of the findings. An analysis was then made of the teaching methods of the L.D.S. and non-L.D.S. Sunday schools in America prior to 1900. A comparison was made to determine similarities and differences between the teaching methods of these two Sunday school developments. The major sources of information were various publications of the Deseret Sunday
Sunday School Union and the American Sunday School Union and its auxiliary unions.

II. FINDINGS

1. Many student, teacher, and object-centered teaching methods were utilized as part of nineteenth century Sunday school instruction.

2. Student-centered methods outnumbered the other types by about two to one in both L.D.S. and non-L.D.S. Sunday schools.

3. Most methods used by both L.D.S. and non-L.D.S. Sunday schools were used earliest by the non-L.D.S. Sunday schools.

4. The findings indicated that a number of L.D.S. Sunday school teachers had been previously associated with non-L.D.S. Sunday schools.

5. The L.D.S. Sunday schools used methods apparently not utilized by the non-L.D.S. Sunday schools, and the non-L.D.S. schools used methods apparently not utilized by the L.D.S. schools. For example, field trips and student projects were used by the L.D.S. Sunday schools but evidently not by the non-L.D.S. Sunday schools. Most of the differences between the teaching methods of the two Sunday school movements were of this type.

6. It was found that non-L.D.S. Sunday schools in America began in 1791, whereas L.D.S. Sunday schools commenced over a half-century later in 1849.

7. L.D.S. Sunday schools were utilizing a variety of teaching methods comparable to the non-L.D.S. Sunday schools by 1900.

8. Both L.D.S. and non-L.D.S. Sunday schools adopted a variety
of teaching principles to motivate their teachers to develop and utilize new and improved teaching methods and techniques.

9. The findings indicated that both L.D.S. and non-L.D.S. Sunday school unions had a variety of teacher training programs to train their teachers in improved teaching methods.

10. It was found that over half the methods used by either the L.D.S. or non-L.D.S. Sunday schools were also used by the other. Both used catechization, discussion, story telling, and many of the other methods of instruction found in use during the nineteenth century.


III. CONCLUSIONS

1. A number of the similarities between the teaching methods of the L.D.S. and non-L.D.S. Sunday schools such as catechization, Bible reading, and recitations apparently resulted from the previous association with non-L.D.S. Sunday schools by a number of the L.D.S. teachers.

2. The pedagogical philosophy of the nineteenth century evidently contributed to similarities between such instructional methods of L.D.S. and non-L.D.S. Sunday schools as the use of examinations, study cards, student readers, and home study assignments.

3. This study indicated that the L.D.S. Sunday schools evidently adopted from the non-L.D.S. Sunday schools' instructional program such things as Bible maps, hymns, and catechization.
4. The L.D.S. Sunday schools were apparently utilizing a wider variety of teaching methods by 1900 than the non-L.D.S. Sunday schools.

6. Teaching methods were improved and teachers were made more efficient through teacher training programs.
BIBLIOGRAPHY
BIBLIOGRAPHY

A. BOOKS


Jenson, Andrew. Latter-day Saint Biographical Encyclopedia. 1 vol. Salt Lake City: Andrew Jenson Historical Company, 1901.


Maeser, Karl G. Sunday School Work. Salt Lake City: Joseph Hyrum Parry, 1892.


### B. PUBLICATIONS OF LEARNED SOCIETIES AND OTHER ORGANIZATIONS

*Children's Hymn Book for Use in the Sunday Schools of the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints*. Salt Lake City: Deseret Sunday School Union, 1896.


*Jubilee History of Latter-day Saints Sunday Schools*. Salt Lake City: Deseret Sunday School Union, 1900.


Union Questions; or Questions on Select Portions of Scripture, from the Old and New Testaments. 1 vol. Philadelphia: American Sunday School Union, 1834.


C. PERIODICALS

Bowen, John M. "Correspondence," Juvenile Instructor, X (May 29, 1875), 132.

Chandler, James J. "Correspondence," Juvenile Instructor, IX (January 2, 1874), 12.

"Correspondence," Juvenile Instructor, II (May 1, 1867), 72.

"Correspondence," Juvenile Instructor, X (April 3, 1875), 77.

"Deseret Sunday School Union Meeting," Juvenile Instructor, XIV (January 15, 1879), 23.

"Deseret Sunday School Union Meeting," Juvenile Instructor, XIV (April 15, 1879), 92-93.

"Deseret Sunday School Union Meeting," Juvenile Instructor, XVIII (January 1, 1882), 5.

"Deseret Sunday School Union Meeting," Juvenile Instructor, XVIII (April 15, 1882), 116.

"Deseret Sunday School Union Meeting," Juvenile Instructor, XVIII (May 15, 1882), 151.
"Deseret Sunday School Union Meeting," Juvenile Instructor, XVIII (July 15, 1882), 220.

"Deseret Sunday School Union Meeting," Juvenile Instructor, XVIII (December 15, 1882), 382.


Engberg, Andreas. "Correspondence," Juvenile Instructor, II (August 1, 1867), 120.


Goddard, George. "Correspondence," Juvenile Instructor, IX (March 28, 1874), 77.

——. "Sunday Lessons for Little Learners," Juvenile Instructor, IX (February 28, 1874), 59.

Jones, Charles R. "Correspondence," Juvenile Instructor, X (March 20, 1875), 67.

Lang, Benjamin. "Correspondence," Juvenile Instructor, II (January 1, 1867), 8.

"Map of Palestine," Juvenile Instructor," XXIX (September 1, 1894), 550.

McKnight, James. "Correspondence," Juvenile Instructor, IV (February 13, 1869), 32.

"Opening Hymn," Juvenile Instructor, VIII (August 15, 1873), 136.


Sharp, Francis. "Correspondence," Juvenile Instructor, IX (June 20, 1874), 149.

"School Anniversary," Juvenile Instructor, IX (September 26, 1874), 240.

"Sunday School Examination," Juvenile Instructor, IX (July 18, 1874), 170-171.
"Sunday School Reading Matter for Children," Juvenile Instructor, VII (June 8, 1872), 91.

"Sunday Schools," Juvenile Instructor, XIII (April 15, 1878), 88.


Young, L. K. "Dialogue on the First Principles of the Gospel," Juvenile Instructor, XX (July 1, 1885), 205.

D. UNPUBLISHED MATERIAL

Terry, George W. "Minutes of the Rockville Sunday School from 1877-1881" (in the Brigham Young University Special Collections Library, Provo, Utah), 1877-1881.
A COMPARATIVE STUDY OF THE TEACHING METHODS OF THE
L.D.S. AND NON-L.D.S. SUNDAY SCHOOL MOVEMENTS
IN THE UNITED STATES PRIOR TO 1900

An Abstract of a Thesis
Presented to the
Department of Graduate Studies in Religious Instruction
Brigham Young University

In Partial Fulfillment
of the Requirements for the Degree
Master of Religious Education

by
Ronald Lewis Knighton
May, 1968
ABSTRACT

Purpose of the Study

Sunday schools were an important part of the development of religious education in the United States and in the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints (L.D.S. Church). It was the purpose of this study (1) to analyze the teaching methods of both the L.D.S. and non-L.D.S. Sunday school movements in the United States prior to 1900; and (2) to compare the teaching methods used by these Sunday school developments and determine similarities and differences.

Delimitations of the Study

The study was delimited in its scope to include as L.D.S. Sunday schools (1) the early independent L.D.S. Sunday schools, (2) the Parent Sunday School Union, and (3) the Deseret Sunday School Union. Non-L.D.S. Sunday schools were delimited (1) to the early independent non-L.D.S. Sunday schools; (2) to the American Sunday School Union; and (3) to auxiliary unions of the American Sunday School Union. This study was concerned with Sunday schools of America prior to 1900.

Method of Research

Origins of L.D.S. and non-L.D.S. Sunday school movements were reviewed and an overview report given of the findings. An analysis of the teaching methods of the Sunday school movements prior to 1900 was then made. A comparison of teaching methods was then conducted to
determine similarities and differences between those of the L.D.S. and non-L.D.S. Sunday schools during that time.

Findings

1. Many student, teacher, and object-centered methods were utilized by Sunday schools of the 1800's. Student-centered methods outnumbered the other types by about two to one in both L.D.S. and non-L.D.S. Sunday schools.

2. The development of teaching methods in both L.D.S. and non-L.D.S. Sunday schools was encouraged (a) by the adoption of sound teaching principles; (b) by the utilization of teacher training programs; and (c) by graded Sunday schools.

3. The L.D.S. Sunday schools used methods apparently not utilized by the non-L.D.S. Sunday schools, and the non-L.D.S. schools used methods apparently not utilized by the L.D.S. schools. Most of the differences between the teaching methods of the two Sunday school movements were of this type.

4. By 1900 the L.D.S. Sunday schools were evidently using more teaching methods than non-L.D.S. Sunday schools.

Conclusions

1. Similarities between the teaching methods of the L.D.S. and non-L.D.S. Sunday schools apparently resulted primarily from two factors: (a) many of the L.D.S. Sunday school teachers had previously been associated with non-L.D.S. Sunday schools; and (b) the general
influence of the pedagogical philosophy of the nineteenth century upon the instructional program of both L.D.S. and non-L.D.S. Sunday schools.

2. Teaching methods were improved and teachers became more efficient through teacher training programs conducted by both L.D.S. and non-L.D.S. Sunday schools.

ABSTRACT APPROVED

Nov 27 1967

Chairman, Advisory Committee

Howard A. Barry

Member, Advisory Committee

Chairman, Major Department