William Claude Clive His Life and Contribution to Music in Utah

David C. Andersen
Brigham Young University - Provo

Follow this and additional works at: https://scholarsarchive.byu.edu/etd
Part of the Mormon Studies Commons, and the Music Commons

BYU ScholarsArchive Citation

This Thesis is brought to you for free and open access by BYU ScholarsArchive. It has been accepted for inclusion in All Theses and Dissertations by an authorized administrator of BYU ScholarsArchive. For more information, please contact scholarsarchive@byu.edu, ellen_amatangelo@byu.edu.
WILLIAM CLAUDE CLIVE
HIS LIFE AND CONTRIBUTION TO MUSIC IN UTAH

A Thesis
Presented to the
Department of Music
Brigham Young University

In Partial Fulfillment
of the Requirements for the Degree
Master of Science

By
David C. Andersen
July, 1963
TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>INTRODUCTION. ........................................</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Problem. ................................................</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Derivation of Material ..................................</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Definition of Terms ......................................</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Organization of the Remainder of the Study ..........</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II.</td>
<td>REVIEW OF COMPANION STUDIES ..........................</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Musicians. ................................................</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Organizations ............................................</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Schools, Critics, Hymnology ............................</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III.</td>
<td>PERFORMER ...............................................</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV.</td>
<td>COMPOSER .................................................</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V.</td>
<td>INSTRUCTOR OF MUSIC .....................................</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Music Preparation of the Clive Children ...............</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Methods of Teaching ......................................</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Violin Maker .............................................</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Summary ...................................................</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VI.</td>
<td>SUMMARY, CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS. ..........</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Conclusions ...............................................</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Recommendations ..........................................</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BIBLIOGRAPHY</td>
<td>.........................................................</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>APPENDICES</td>
<td>........................................................</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A.</td>
<td>Letters ..................................................</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B.</td>
<td>Biographical and Auto-biographical Sketches ..........</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C.</td>
<td>Speech Given in Sacrament Meeting by Agnes Clive Andersen</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D.</td>
<td>Musical Families of Utah Scrapbook &quot;William C. Clive and Family.&quot;</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Gratitude is hereby expressed to Dr. A. Harold Goodman and Dr. Quentin Nordgren, for their time and assistance in helping the writer to accomplish this work. The writer feels a particular indebtedness to Dr. A. Harold Goodman for his many helpful suggestions and the many hours of consultation.

Special acknowledgement is due my wife Jeanette, whose patience, helpfulness, insistence and love helped bring this study to completion.
CHAPTER I
INTRODUCTION

Much may be gained by music educators developing a greater appreciation of the historical influence and contributions of the performers and teachers that precede them. To examine the evidence and experience of the past as an aid in analyzing and interpreting the present is an important aspect of music education. In order to refine, enrich and advance the music program of the present, it seems important to investigate and treat the past with the view that here was the foundation of the procedures and methods as we know them today.

Upon examining the past we are able to secure information about famous men with comparative ease. However, in seeking out the men who assisted in carrying the burden of work without noticeable distinction, the research becomes more difficult. These men rarely achieved public acclaim or recognition, yet they gave of their time and talents to add to the growing culture of the area in which they lived. Without the contribution from these men, the culture would not be able to circulate, flourish and develop as it does.

Problem

One of the men who achieved momentary public acclaim for his musical ability was William Claude Clive. Mr. Clive was a performer,
director, composer, teacher, violin maker and an active member of the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints. These were the activities of a man who loved music and lived his life according to his beliefs. The purpose of this study was to determine the influence and contribution of William Claude Clive to the musical culture of Utah. In order to determine the measure of his influence and contribution, answers to the following questions were sought: Did William Claude Clive have the training necessary to offer a contribution to the musical culture of Utah? Was his contribution primarily from his performing, composing, or teaching? Were Mr. Clive's students instrumental in spreading any contribution offered by him?

Derivation of Material

The material for this study was gathered from personal notes and diaries written by Mr. Clive, articles written by members of his family, correspondence and personal interviews with members of his family, articles in newspapers and periodicals. Other sources of information pertaining to the subject which have contributed to the over-all portrayal are books, unpublished theses, records in the Church Historian's office of the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints and the Salt Lake City Public Library.

Definition of Terms

The term Church in this study will refer to the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints. The terms ward and stake refer to the organization within the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints. Ward
refers to a district consisting of approximately one hundred to three hundred fifty families with membership in the Church. Stake refers to a group of approximately five to ten wards in adjoining districts. The term Mission refers to the activities of members of the Church in seeking new members for conversion. Theater will refer to the Salt Lake Theater located on the Northwest corner of State and First South Streets and Grand will refer to the Grand Opera Theater located between State Street and Second East and Second South in Salt Lake City.

Organization of the Remainder of the Study

The second chapter contains a review of companion studies concerning other historical research. The third chapter presents information and material concerning his life as a performer. Mr. Clive's compositions are discussed in the fourth chapter. The part of his life which concerns his teaching and violin making are in the fifth chapter, and the sixth chapter gives the summary, conclusions and recommendations.
CHAPTER II
REVIEW OF COMPANION STUDIES

An investigation was made of the historical research completed with reference to Church musicians and music in Utah. These studies that were written about outstanding musical leaders and musical organizations are referred to as companion studies. These companion studies gave valuable assistance in locating material concerning Mr. Clive. Reference is made to each of these studies for assistance in future research.

The review of these studies was organized into a chronological sequence as far as is practical: (1) musicians who contributed to the musical growth of Utah, (2) musical organizations in the Salt Lake Valley during the life of Mr. Clive, and (3) schools, critics, and hymnology.

Musicians

The first five theses concern pioneer musicians who moved to Utah, bringing with them high standards of musical accomplishment. The first of these pioneer musicians was Charles John Thomas. His arrival in Salt Lake City heralded the beginning of an era of noticeable improvement in musical rendition in both choral and instrumental music. He organized

---

the first orchestra of any significance in Utah, the first grand benefit concert, what is purported to be the first male chorus in Utah, and was elected president of the first symphony orchestra in Utah. He taught, composed and conducted music that made a significant contribution to the spiritual welfare of his fellow Church members throughout his long and active life.

John Elliott Tullidge arrived in the Salt Lake Valley a few years later than Mr. Thomas. Mr. Tullidge had received an excellent musical education in England. His contribution came not through performance of music but, rather, through the giving of constructive criticisms of the performances of others. These criticisms were given with the hope of improvement of the individual performer.²

Arriving in the Salt Lake Valley shortly after Mr. Tullidge, George Careless left his impressions on the culture by the formation of musical societies which produced superior performances of worthy music. Mr. Careless was the first musician to bring about the payment of musicians for their services in the Salt Lake Valley. His most lasting contribution for members of the Church was the many hymns he composed. Twenty of these hymns are in the present edition of the Church Hymn Book.³

One of the most prominent organists and accompanists of his day


was Joseph J. Daynes. His influence was immeasurable in directing trends of achievements in music through his various musical and cultural activities, as well as commercial and civic enterprises in which he became engaged.

The Tabernacle Choir of the Church obtained national recognition under the direction of Evan Stephens. Mr. Stephens trained many thousands of students, some of whom became professional musicians. He established and directed his own opera company in conjunction with adult singing classes. He was instrumental in helping break down prejudices against Mormons through Tabernacle Choir tours. In addition to this, Mr. Stephens has composed many hymns which are in the Church hymn book.

Upon the retirement of Joseph J. Daynes as Tabernacle Organist, John J. McClellan accepted the post. He was active in the music circles of Salt Lake City, organizing singing groups, composing, performing and directing performances. For his flawlessness of performance he received a medal and recognition from the King of Belgium.

Before being appointed conductor of the Tabernacle Choir, Anthony C. Lund was active as an instructor at the Brigham Young Academy in Provo. Mr. Lund made a worthwhile contribution to the culture of Utah through his music teaching and choral directing. He strove to build higher ideals.


of music and elevate the public's appreciation of good quality music by presenting good music.  

Emma Lucy Gates and Brigham Cecil Gates both became proficient musicians in their respective fields. Miss Gates received the plaudits of the musical world as an operatic and concert singer. Her principal contribution to music in Utah was made as an opera and concert singer abroad and at home. Her later promotion of Utah music and musicians was consequential.

Having received a fine musical education in the East, and in Europe, Brigham Cecil Gates had a very distinguished career as a composer, conductor and administrator in his own native city. Mr. Gates founded the Latter-Day Saints' School of Music and served as the director of that school. He was the director of other schools for short intervals of time but still had the time to found a music publishing company for the publication of his compositions.

Lisle Bradford had a long and distinguished career as a music teacher at East High School in Salt Lake City. Miss Bradford's contribution was made in the field of music appreciation. She stimulated an appreciation of good music within the average citizen through her


8 John Louis Coray, "Emma Lucy Gates (Bowen), Soprano—Her Accomplishments in Opera and Concerts," (Unpublished Thesis, Brigham Young University, 1956).

interpretive powers, her ability to direct and her great love of music. 10

Two studies have been completed concerning musicians who have contributed to the culture of Utah in areas other than Salt Lake Valley. The first of these studies concerns Albert Miller, a bandsman who started the instrumental music program at the Brigham Young Academy in Provo. One of the objectives Mr. Miller worked for was to produce not only fine musicians but leaders of musicians. As with all great men, his life was one of service and of devotion to the lives of others. 11

The other study outside of the Salt Lake Valley concerns a musician who came to the Salt Lake Valley in the early days of 1864 and stayed in Salt Lake City to produce several successful operas before moving to Manti in 1869. This was A. C. Smyth, who became a leader in the development of choral music in Central Utah. He contributed to the musical culture through opera productions in Salt Lake City and Manti, by his direction of the Manti Tabernacle Choir and his teaching activities. He instructed his students and the choirs he directed to sing by note through the tonic sol fa method. He composed many songs which are in the Church hymn book and he edited others for the correctness of the harmony and harmonic progressions. 12


Organizations

The development and growth of instrumental and choral music organizations in Utah has been fascinating. Four studies have been completed concerning different performing groups.

The first study concerns the development of pioneer bands and orchestras of Salt Lake City. These early bands were formed by the remaining members of the Nauvoo Legion Band. After settling in the Salt Lake Valley, many pioneer musicians were called on missions to take music to the outlying settlements. This they did, taking everything musical they could locate and afford. Through these mission calls these bandsmen influenced Utah musical thought for several decades. 13

The development of a symphony orchestra took somewhat longer than the military brass band. As early as 1855 there was the desire to have symphonic music, as was evidenced by requests for symphonic music to be brought from Europe. The first symphony orchestra association was organized as early as 1888 when the majority of the orchestral musicians of Salt Lake City met and established the Salt Lake Symphony Orchestra. A symphony is a reality at the present time in Utah because of the years of struggle and the continued interest on the part of some individuals such as Mr. Arthur Shepherd and others. According to the study by Brown, the music literature is of a much better quality today than that of the earlier period. 14


The Salt Lake Theater Orchestra had an influence on the later establishment of a symphony by furnishing players of some skill. One circumstance that aided in the improvement of local talent in the Salt Lake Valley was the completion of the trans-continental railroad in 1869, which joined the Central Pacific with the Union Pacific. This made it possible to obtain travelling artists whose influence could not be measured; but it could be seen in the efforts of the management, the music played by the orchestra and the songs sung by the vocalists. The more impressive the artist the more the local musicians would excel themselves.¹⁵

There have been several Tabernacle Choirs in existence in the Church; however, all but the Tabernacle Choir of Salt Lake City have been disbanded. One of these choirs, the Ogden Tabernacle Choir, developed to the point where it was a fine organization. There were feelings of rivalry which developed between the two sponsoring cities of Salt Lake City and Ogden and their choirs. This feeling was resolved in 1949 when the Ogden Choir was disbanded, leaving the Tabernacle Choir in Salt Lake City as the official Church choir. The Ogden Choir contributed greatly to the culture of its area during the period of its existence by bringing credit to the State of Utah through the successful tours taken.¹⁶


The Church has long recognized the importance of music as being a part of the educational process. In order to determine just what had been done by the Church in the music education field, a study was undertaken by Harold R. Laycock which was pertinent to this study. Noteworthy features of the academy music program were the widespread popularity of light opera and the early development of academy bands. Choral proficiency led to numerous light opera performances, usually with community cooperation. Certification requirements of academy music teachers were at least equal to those for public school teachers.\(^\text{17}\)

The study of music contests and festivals in the secondary schools of Utah was made for the purpose of comparative analysis of the historical development of secondary school contests and festivals, the role these activities should hold in the curriculum and to formulate guiding principles for future development. Some conclusions were that many schools do not consider music a "curriculum activity." Many administrators do not plan for proper placement of music in the curriculum and participants of the old music contest received both good and bad effects through the administering of placements and criticisms in the contest.\(^\text{18}\)


Another study was done about the McCune School of Music and Art.\textsuperscript{19} This school was Church owned and operated although it did not offer religious instruction as other Church schools did. It served a useful purpose in Salt Lake City, training musicians and stimulating public interest in music.

It is not often that critics attract favorable attention. However, a comprehensive history of the music critics and music criticism in Salt Lake City has been compiled. The ultimate value of a study of this sort lies in the historical growth of music and its relation to critical attitudes.\textsuperscript{20}

The many collections of hymns in the Church came under consideration in the study completed by Ina T. Webb. The purpose of her study was to bring together, in a more accessible form, material pertaining to the congregational singing practices of the Church. It lists works and composers, with a short sketch of the lives of prominent composers who are the main contributors to the Church hymn book. The study suggests ways of improving congregational singing by such means as dramatizing the incident of the composition's origin, the story of the hymn, talks concerning hymns and their relationship to the gospel, and having them played very artistically.\textsuperscript{21}


\textsuperscript{21} Ina T. Webb, "Congregational Singing in the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-Day Saints," (Unpublished Thesis, Brigham Young University, 1931).
CHAPTER III
PERFORMER

William Claude Clive was born on the 15th day of April, 1860, in Salt Lake City, Utah. His mother, Mary Ann Pullen, and father, Claude Clive, had been friends in London. They were both converted to the Church about the same time. According to family records, they travelled in the same party from England to Salt Lake City, marrying shortly after their arrival.¹

Through hard work and thrift, Claude Clive became the proprietor of his own tailoring shop, which employed several men and had the reputation of doing good work. However, due to poor business investments, Claude lost most of his holdings. Although able to continue his trade, every member of the Clive household was expected to assist in the earning of the daily fare.²

Claude Clive, although not demonstrating any considerable amount of talent for music, was interested in music and encouraged the study of music in his family. Claude's son William became interested in music at an early age, and to encourage this, Claude Clive gave his son a concertina. William learned to play this instrument well and was being

¹ Robert Bee, Historical sketch of Claude Clive. (See Appendix.)

² Ibid.
featured at Church meetings and social gatherings before his ninth year.3

The beginning of William Clive's violin playing came during his ninth year when his father gave him a violin. Magnus Olson, a veteran pioneer musician of the day, began the task of training Mr. Clive. William (hereafter referred to as Mr. Clive) became so interested in the violin and studied so intensively it became necessary to call him from his practice for fear he might become ill from such strenuous concentration.4

An incident which illustrates the diligence with which Mr. Clive practiced was related by a former baker of Salt Lake City. This baker found it necessary to rise at four o'clock in the morning to prepare the day's supply of bakery goods. His path to work led him by the Clive's tailoring shop and upon passing the shop he would hear music. Being a curious man, he would peer in the window and witness Mr. Clive sitting on his father's tailoring table practicing by lamplight.5 Practicing late at night and early in the morning became one of his habits.

Mr. Clive's education consisted of three or four years of formal schooling. He was an avid reader and received further education from reading and studying books. Because he always carried at least one book in each pocket (and more if they would fit), the first parts of Mr. Clive's clothing to wear out were the coat pockets.6

---


4 Clifford C. Clive, in a letter dated August 21, 1961. (See Appendix)

5 Ibid.

6 Agnes C. Andersen, Speech given in Sacrament Meeting, March 10, 1940. (See Appendix)
Mr. Clive was able to receive his music education from prominent musicians of his day in Salt Lake City. John Tullidge gave him his first instruction in the rudiments of music. Magnus Olson began Mr. Clive's instruction on the violin. Later Mr. Clive studied with Andrew Mineer, Ebenezer Beesley and George Careless. He studied theory and harmony under such musicians as Ebenezer Beesley, George Careless and Orson K. Pratt, Junior.

Starting his training as an orchestral performer under the direction of C. J. Thomas, Mr. Clive later continued his study under George Careless. Under these inspiring men, he spent hours perfecting and improving his technique. In later years, Mr. Clive felt he owed a debt of gratitude to these men for their painstaking patience with him.

In 1871, when Mr. Clive was eleven years old, Professor C. J. Thomas invited him to play in the Salt Lake Theater Orchestra. This was the beginning of a long career in the Theater Orchestra. He performed with the Orchestra from 1871 until 1900, at which time he left to devote his full time to teaching. The only interruption in his playing with the Orchestra was a two-year Church mission call to Colorado.

---

7 Musical Families of Utah Scrapbook, "William C. Clive and Family," National Federation of Music Contest, Baltimore, Maryland, May 1939. (See Appendix)


9 Ibid.

10 Agnes C. Andersen, Speech given in Sacrament Meeting, March 10, 1940 (See Appendix)
When Mr. Clive entered the Orchestra of the Salt Lake Theater, he astonished his hearers with the accuracy, professional ease and the tone quality with which he played. He had some imperfections, however, for Mr. Clive related later that during the second night he played some high notes and the violinist sitting by him told him if he could not play them better he had better go home. Mr. Clive stayed on with the orchestra to gain experience and increase in performing ability.

One custom of the Theater during this period was to give a benefit performance to a performer who was leaving the employ of the Theater. The management donated the profit of the performance to the individual for whom the benefit was tendered. To the performer who had gained the respect of his fellow workers in the Theater, it was not uncommon for the remaining members to send a letter pledging their support. Connected to this letter was a signed list of all the people employed by the Theater. These letters, for some unknown reason, nearly always found their way into the newspaper.

The first chair cornet player in the Theater Orchestra, Mark Croxall, was given a benefit for the purpose of financing a Church mission to Australia. The letter and list for this benefit appeared in the Deseret Evening News of October 20, 1875. For the first time, W. C. Clive's name appeared as an official member of the orchestra. Mr. Clive performed regularly with the Theater Orchestra in 1880,

---

11 Ibid.

12 Preceding lists published in the Deseret Evening News did not contain Mr. Clive's name.
and on nights when he was not at the Theater, he rehearsed with the Careless orchestra. 13 Mr. Careless organized three concerts for his orchestra in January and February of 1880. The first concert was briefly mentioned in the newspapers. The second concert, however, brought forth critical comments. During this second performance, Mr. Careless programmed a string quartet, consisting of himself and Mr. Clive as violinists, Mr. Pederson violist and Mr. Hanson as Cellist. This quartet performed String Quartette Number 4 by Haydn. The performance elicited the following comments from the Deseret Evening News:

The string quartette was not appreciated as it deserved. This was due, no doubt, not only to its being a novelty but from the more cogent reason that the capacity of the building was too extensive for the volume of sound to be extracted from four such instruments alone [sic]. In another place the quartette would have been more successful. 14

During January, February and March of 1880, the orchestra gave five concerts. This was in addition to the entertainment offered and played for by the orchestra at the Theater. One of these concerts featured as soloist the world renowned violinist August Wilhelmj. Wilhelmj was pleased with the performance of the orchestra and told them he thought they were "as fine a group as he had heard since leaving New York, and though San Francisco had a larger orchestra, it could not lay claim to equal." 15

13 Deseret Evening News, January 26, 1880.
14 Ibid., January 27, 1880.
15 Deseret Evening News, March 6, 1880.
Mr. Clive first came to the attention of the press as a soloist at a Nineteenth Ward concert in 1883. The critic attending the concert was duly impressed with the solo by Mr. Clive, stating: "The violin solo by Mr. W. C. Clive was a masterpiece, executed in a manner rarely surpassed by any performer in this city."\(^{16}\)

Mr. Clive assumed the responsibilities of a family in 1885, marrying Isabella Campbell, a daughter of Robert Campbell, one of the founders of the University of Utah.\(^{17}\) The following year, according to Edward Tullidge, Mr. Clive was performing as the first violinist of the Salt Lake Theater.\(^{18}\)

The Salt Lake City Symphony Orchestra Association had been formed in 1888 and most of the musicians in the Salt Lake Valley became members.\(^{19}\) Early in 1892 this Association began planning a concert which was to be presented in the following May. The program for the evening of the concert listed Mr. Clive as the concertmaster of the symphony and as violin soloist, performing one number.\(^{20}\)

The critic who attended the concert for the Deseret Evening News was impressed with Mr. Clive's performance, and stated:

\[^{16}\text{Ibid.}, \text{November 15, 1883.}\]
\[^{17}\text{Agnes C. Andersen, Speech given in Sacrament Meeting, March 10, 1940}\, \text{(See Appendix)}\]
\[^{18}\text{Edward W. Tullidge, History of Salt Lake City}\, \text{(Salt Lake: Star Publishing, 1886), p. 784.}\]
\[^{20}\text{Deseret Evening News, May 15, 1892.}\]
Professor Clive rendered a violin solo "Souevenir de Haydn," and he was twice recalled, an honor which he acknowledged by playing for the first encore a familiar Scotch air and for the second, "Then You'll Remember Me." Mr. Clive will from this time be remembered by the public who listened to his soul stirring melodies as one of Salt Lake City's gifted violinists. The reception accorded was a compliment to his skill as much as an encouragement to appear again.

The next few years were occupied with teaching, performing in the Theater and composing. In addition, Mr. Clive instructed his children and performed at missionary farewells, funerals and Church meetings.

Earlier in his career, he had formed his own quadrille band for playing at dances. The specialties of this group, according to Mr. Clive, were the quadrille, mazurka, polka and waltz. In the 1890's he continued playing for dances with his own band and included in his performances the lakeside resorts during the summer while the Theater was closed.

Friends of Mr. Clive presented him with a testimonial concert on March 25, 1895, at the Fourteenth Ward chapel. The Theater Orchestra under the direction of George Careless performed several numbers. George D. Pyper, Professor H. S. Krouse, Miss Louise Boyden, Mrs. Lizzie Thomas Edward, John Robison, and Adelber Beesley all contributed their time and talents to the program. Mr. Clive performed two numbers during the program. The Salt Lake Tribune wrote the following comment concerning the playing of Mr. Clive:

21 Ibid., May 18, 1892.
22 Deseret Evening News, March 15, 1940.
23 Salt Lake Daily Tribune, July 26, 1896.
Mr. W. C. Clive is a rising young violinist, and the large audience which greeted him at the 14th Ward last night on the occasion of his testimonial fully attests the high esteem in which he is held by the music-loving public, while his work of the evening showed a steady improvement during the year. Mr. Clive played Paganini's "Bravoura Variations," (on one string) and a clever composition of his own inscribed to Professor Careless. This showed the musician as a composer as well as an artist, his renditions of the numbers being very well done. For an encore he gave "Souvenir de Cauviac."  

The Church called Mr. Clive on a mission to Colorado in 1896. To accept this call required great faith on the part of Mr. Clive and his family. He was thirty-six years old and in the prime of life. He had a large group of students, his ability on the violin had reached the point where he was considered one of the better violinists in Salt Lake City, and he had just completed a home, for which he was considerably in debt. With the encouragement of his family (especially his wife), he accepted the call and in December of 1896 travelled to his field of labor in Colorado. He took little money or personal belongings with him, since it was customary at that time for missionaries to travel without purse or scrip. He did take his violin, saying he could play much better than he could speak. During his mission Mr. Clive, according to the diary he kept for a few months, played at several meetings and usually played his own compositions. He commented later that his playing had furnished meals which he otherwise would have done without.

The mode of transportation Mr. Clive had while on his mission was either walking or riding a bicycle. On one occasion, while travelling to another town, he was riding his bicycle down a mountain and lost control

24 Salt Lake Tribune, March 26, 1895.
of the vehicle. In order to protect the violin he was carrying, he suffered a severe jolt which was absorbed by his shoulder. The shoulder was examined by other missionaries but the only visible damage was a bad bruise. Apostle John Taylor of the Church also examined it, but no one thought it was serious. The injured shoulder, however, caused Mr. Clive considerable physical suffering and mental anxiety throughout the remainder of his life.  

Many changes had taken place in Salt Lake City when Mr. Clive returned from his mission. The change that was to most affect his life was the re-establishment of the Salt Lake City Musician's Union. Before Mr. Clive's mission, musicians had asked for his support in forming an association, but he had refused to support anything resembling a union. After his mission the union officials came to Mr. Clive and requested him to join, as they wanted every musician to be a member. The officials specifically wanted the musicians who were orchestra or band leaders to join. They knew this would give the organization prestige and power. Mr. Clive's feelings were strongly against the union and he told them he did not feel he could join with good conscience. They replied that if he would not join, the union would eventually force him to join. They would boycott every place or person who employed him or was employed by him.  

Mr. Clive was a man who believed in the righteousness of his cause and he stayed with his decision, even though he was ostracized from professional playing. Due to this influence of the Musician's union, Mr. Clive sacrificed a great number of opportunities to perform during his 

25 Clifford C. Clive, in a letter dated August 13, 1961. (See Appendix)  
26 Ibid.
lifetime. Being a man of talent and great faith, Mr. Clive's family was never in need. His family had all the schooling they desired, he owned his own home and he was respected in all social circles.27

Mr. Clive resumed his position at the Theater upon his return from the mission field. In 1900, however, he left the Theater to devote full time to the classes he had developed.28 He continued playing publicly, particularly for benefits, such as the one given for the relief of the people at Schofield, Utah after the great mine tragedy. The benefit was presented in the Tabernacle and the finest talent performed that the city could offer. The concert was a success financially as well as artistically. Mr. Clive, according to the Salt Lake Tribune, "Stormed his audience as usual, and had to retire to avoid being forced into an encore."29

Paul Hammer, manager of the Grand Theater, employed Mr. Clive as orchestra director for several years commencing in 1903.30 The Grand closed during the summer months, but Mr. Clive remained actively employed at Calders Park with his dance band.31

During the spring of 1904, Mr. Clive decided to further his study

27 Clifford C. Clive, in a letter dated August 13, 1961. (See Appendix)

28 Salt Lake Tribune, April 10, 1900.

29 Ibid., May 10, 1900.

30 Ibid., January 7, 1903.

31 Clifford C. Clive, in a letter dated August 13, 1961. (See Appendix)
of music by studying at the Conservatory of Music in Boston, Massachusetts. Due to his lack of scholastic background, he was concerned about being accepted by the Conservatory. Mr. George Careless wrote a letter of recommendation to the Conservatory stating Mr. Clive's competence. With this introduction he had no apparent difficulty entering, as he enrolled in the Conservatory to study harmony, theory and violin.

The newspapers of Salt Lake City had acclaimed Mr. Clive when he performed in Salt Lake City, and while he was in Boston his talent and performing ability were again recognized. Mr. Clive was offered positions in the Boston Conservatory Orchestra and an unnamed orchestra in New York City. He had no desire for big city life, however, and preferred returning to Salt Lake City.

While at the Conservatory Mr. Clive met a violin maker and repair man who was associated with the Conservatory. In Mr. Clive's possession was a violin he used at the Grand which, with very little effort, would fill the Grand with a rich sonorous tone. Upon hearing this violin, the repair man became very interested in it. He studied its construction and was convinced that by slightly thinning the top by a few shavings the tone would be improved. After continued persuasion and insistence that the

32 Members of Mr. Clive's family differ on whether it was the Boston or New England Conservatory. As near as can be ascertained the Boston Conservatory was attended.

33 Personal interview with Mrs. Clifford C. Clive, June 28, 1962.

34 Clifford C. Clive in a letter dated August 13, 1961. (See Appendix)

35 Ibid.
tone would be mellowed, Mr. Clive reluctantly consented and the change was made.  

After completing his summer of study, Mr. Clive returned to Salt Lake City and started the winter season at the Grand. Playing night after night seemed to be a heavy strain on the violin, for after approximately a week of this heavy playing, the violin tone appeared to become weak and Mr. Clive would be forced to give it a rest for a few days. After the rest the tone seemed to revive and the violin would be as good as ever. Due to this apparent tiring of the violin, Mr. Clive felt that the instrument had been injured rather than improved by the change made in Boston.

During the period that Mr. Clive was orchestra director of the Grand, his son Clifford began his career as a professional musician. Clifford joined Mr. Clive's orchestra as a substitute pianist for Alvin Beesley. Then after Mr. Beesley left the orchestra, Clifford became the regular pianist. Clifford played as Mr. Clive's accompanist for many years after his debut at the Grand.

One of Mr. Clive's characteristics was that he could never refuse a request to perform. According to Jenson, it was due to this generosity that he probably played at more missionary farewells, Church socials, and funerals than any other violinist in Salt Lake City.

One missionary farewell where Mr. Clive had been scheduled to perform was in Murray, Utah. During the course of the evening one of the speakers became too verbose. Prior to their anticipated performance,  

36 Clifford C. Clive, in a letter dated August 13, 1961. (See Appendix)  
37 Ibid.  
38 Deseret Evening News, May 11, 1903.  
Mr. Clive and his son were forced to depart through an open window in order to take the last street car of the evening back to Salt Lake City.  

The employment of Mr. Clive as orchestra director of the Grand came to an end when the management received notice from the musician's union that Mr. Clive should join. Mr. Hammer, manager of the Grand, called Mr. Clive into his office and literally begged him to join, stating by way of inducement that the Grand would pay all dues. Mr. Clive refused and, rather than cause difficulty for Mr. Hammer, resigned and departed from the Grand Theater. 

40 Personal interview with Clifford C. Clive, June 28, 1962. 

41 Clifford C. Clive, in a letter dated August 13, 1961. (See Appendix)
CHAPTER IV

COMPOSER

The pioneer musicians in the Salt Lake Valley were confronted with the problem of obtaining printed music. Printed music was scarce and expensive due to the distance and rate of travel from the printing houses of the East. The music performed by the musicians of the Salt Lake Valley during the early days of the Theater was nearly all in manuscript.¹

The principles of writing music were generally included in the first lessons of an aspiring musician. In order to have music to practice Mr. Clive learned to copy music early in his career. Along with practicing the violin long hours at night, Mr. Clive spent other night hours copying music.²

The years of copying music and a gift for melodic inspiration assisted Mr. Clive in composition.³ In order to obtain the necessary training for composition, Mr. Clive went to Mr. George Careless for instruction, as Mr. Careless had established himself as a teacher of harmony and theory, and was a well known composer.⁴

² Personal interview with Clifford C. Clive, June 28, 1962.
³ Ibid.
Mr. Clive had two mottoes which asserted that, "Anything worth doing was worth doing well," and "Do it now." With these mottoes becoming part of his character, he diligently practiced and applied the lessons he received from Mr. Careless in original compositions. Mr. Careless selected one of Mr. Clive's more advanced compositions and published it in the June, 1877, issue of the Utah Musical Times.

The Utah Musical Times contained articles concerning Beethoven, Mozart, Haydn and other composers, as well as articles designed to assist choir leaders in improving the Ward choirs. Included in the magazine were interesting items concerning musical activities in Salt Lake City and highlights from the world of music. Each copy of the magazine had two original compositions published therein. Most of these were composed by Mr. Careless during the first year of publication. During the second year, however, other composers' works began appearing along with those of Mr. Careless, two of them being written by Mr. Clive.

The first work of Mr. Clive's to be published was the choral anthem Alpha. The editorial of the same issue mentions that Mr. Clive was "our young friend and an industrious pupil of Mr. Careless."
With the industry of youth, he continued his efforts and the following December the Utah Musical Times published another of Mr. Clive's choral anthems with the title of Kindness. As in his first published work, Mr. Clive wrote both words and music. In some of his later anthems he collaborated with several other people who wrote the words while Mr. Clive composed the music.

The following year (1878) he directed his efforts towards a longer form of composition, that of the overture. He composed his first overture the same year, which he called The Golden Crest. This overture was performed in 1882, the performance being directed by C. J. Thomas. It was the first overture by a native Utah composer performed in the Salt Lake Theater. The performance took place January 25, 1882, in connection with a play called The Strategists. The comments in the newspapers following the debut of this overture were full of approval, stating that the rendition of the overture was received with applause. The critics called Mr. Clive a "progressive young musician.”

Three years passed before Mr. Clive brought his second overture Evening Thoughts before the public. This overture was composed especially for the occasion of a "Mammoth Concert" presented by the Careless Orchestra in the Salt Lake Theater. Mr. Careless had organized this thirty-five piece orchestra (the largest that had been heard in Utah at that time) from the nucleus of the Theater Orchestra. At the initial
performance of the overture *Evening Thoughts*, the audience called for it a second time. After the second rendition, Mr. Clive was called for and applauded as loudly as the music itself.14

The third overture composed by Mr. Clive was titled *Zetae*. This overture was performed at a concert in 1886 by the Careless Orchestra. Both *Evening Thoughts* and *Zetae* were performed in the Theater at special concerts.

Many of Mr. Clive's compositions were written for violin with piano accompaniment. Being a master of his instrument, these works are difficult for the average violinist to perform. *Melody in A* was probably the easiest of his compositions and became Mr. Clive's most popular composition. He composed *Melody in A* in 1905 and it sold as his most successful composition.15

During Mr. Clive's mission in Colorado, he did not want his son William to neglect the violin. In order to further William's progress, Mr. Clive composed a set of studies that William was to practice. These exercises were not of a beginning nature and consisted of scales with explicit instructions on how to practice them. Each scale was followed by a composition in the same key, either composed by Mr. Clive or edited from some other source.16

Another set of exercises composed by Mr. Clive gives explanations of bowing, lines and spaces, and a few terms with rudimentary symbols. These exercises were an outgrowth of Mr. Clive's teaching and were labeled "Wm. C. Clive's Violin School; Book One of Very First Studies and

---

14 Ibid.
15 Personal interview with Clifford C. Clive, June 28, 1962.
16 Manuscript composed by William C. Clive in archives of Brigham Young University.
Some Familiar Melodies."  

At one time Mr. Clive was the director of the music for the morning sessions of the Salt Lake Temple. During his tenure in this position, he composed several anthems which were sung only in the Temple. Other of Mr. Clive's anthems were sung throughout the Church. He had compositions in Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-Day Saints hymn books and sold other compositions to Church choirs both in the United States and in the foreign missions of the Church.

Mr. Clive's overture *The Golden Crest* was performed by two separate organizations in 1935 and 1936. The Salt Lake Philharmonic Orchestra performed the overture in 1935 with Mr. Clive directing. In 1936, the University of Utah performed this overture at a concert in Ogden, Utah.

The compositions of Mr. Clive were as varied in type as they were numerous. His works consist of anthems for choir, overtures, violin solos, piano solos, string duets, string trios, string quartets, suites, marches for band, a symphony and exercises for beginning students. He also composed two novelties for two like instruments, which were called table duets. Table duets may be played by two instrumentalists, one standing on each side of a table on which the one sheet of music is laid. Each person plays the music from his position.

The compositions of Mr. Clive are rarely heard today. Much of his music has been lost or discarded. Members of his immediate family have a variety of his compositions that were published but rarely play them, with the exception of his *Melody in A*.

---

17 Ibid.
18 Personal interview with Clifford C. Clive, June 28, 1962.
19 *Musical Families of Utah Scrapbook*, May 1939. (See Appendix)
Mr. Clive's contribution to the musical culture of Utah through composition was made while he was actively composing. His compositions were sung and played throughout Utah, Idaho, Nevada and some were sung and played throughout the world.\textsuperscript{20}

\textsuperscript{20} Personal interview with Clifford C. Clive, June 28, 1962.
Teaching became the sole manner of financial support for Mr. Clive and his family after he left the employment of the Grand Theater. With the musicians' union ostracizing him from performing in public for remuneration, Mr. Clive devoted his life to teaching.¹

Mr. Clive taught literally hundreds of students to play the violin and piano.² His teaching period extended over sixty-four years. The first half of this sixty-four year period consisted of performing in public as his primary occupation, with teaching as a secondary activity. For the remaining years the primary source of employment was teaching, while performance in public was regarded as a personal pleasure.

The beginning of Mr. Clive's teaching went back many years. In order to support a wife it was necessary to have more of an income than was being paid to the musicians in the Theater Orchestra. Teaching allowed Mr. Clive to have the necessary financial income to support a wife and growing family.

Mr. Clive, in order to accept many students, arranged his schedule of private students in forty-five minute lesson periods, with one

² Personal interview with Clifford C. Clive, June 28, 1962.
lesson per student each week. This schedule was flexible, for many stu-
dents received not the forty-five minutes allotted but an hour, or an hour
and a half lesson. Mr. Clive was hesitant in allowing the student to de-
part until the particular exercise was played in the manner he expected it
to be. This practice brought unnumbered scoldings from Mrs. Clive, but
Mr. Clive continued giving his lessons in this manner throughout his
Teaching career.3

When he returned from his mission in 1898, he came home to a
practice which had been dormant for two years. Within a few months, how-
ever, he was busily riding his bicycle from one lesson to another.4 If
Mr. Clive saw the student who was to receive the next lesson playing in
the fields with playmates, he would go after him, climbing over fences and
jumping irrigation ditches to take him home for the lesson.5

The students Mr. Clive instructed on the violin and piano partici-
cipated in at least one recital per year. This event was usually pre-
sented in the early spring, although the time varied. Invitations were
issued through the students to parents, relatives and friends. The newspa-
pers either received an invitation or were notified concerning details
of the recital. Frequently the notification of a recital by one of the
music teachers in the city would be published in the Deseret Evening News
and the Salt Lake Tribune.

One of Mr. Clive's instructional techniques was to have several of
his students perform as a group. The largest group which was organized

---

5 Ibid.
for a recital was an orchestra of twenty-two students.\textsuperscript{6}

Mr. Clive was employed by the Brigham Young College in Logan in 1907 as director of the orchestra and as an instructor of violin. The understanding with which he accepted this position was that he could use the studio provided by the College for students he was able to obtain privately, as well as for the students who were regularly enrolled in the school. He was most successful in his endeavors to recruit students for his classes and soon had a sizable group. The president of the College, noticing Mr. Clive's large group of students, decided that all students should be enrolled in the College. Due to this decision, which was contrary to the agreement Mr. Clive had with the College, he was unable to continue his teaching duties.\textsuperscript{7} Severing his connection with the College, he returned to his home in Salt Lake City.\textsuperscript{8}

The Latter-Day Saint's University in Salt Lake City also employed Mr. Clive as an instructor of violin for three years, 1903-1906.\textsuperscript{9}

Music Preparation of the Clive Children

When Mr. Clive's children reached an age where they were able to properly hold a violin, they were given lessons. After learning the violin reasonably well, lessons on the piano were initiated. One son also chose to play the 'cello. As each child became proficient on his chosen instrument, he was admitted into the family orchestra. This family orchestra

\begin{itemize}
\item \textsuperscript{6} Deseret Evening News, May 11, 1907.
\item \textsuperscript{7} Personal Interview with Clifford C. Clive June 28, 1962.
\item \textsuperscript{8} Deseret Evening News, May 5, 1908.
\item \textsuperscript{9} Musical Families of Utah Scrapbook, (May 1939). (See Appendix)
\end{itemize}
at one time consisted of four violins, one 'cello and piano.  

William C. Clive, Junior, was the first child and, therefore, received the first family training on the violin from his father. William became adept at playing the violin and made numerous appearances in string groups and orchestras during his youth. William, however, did not choose to pursue a career in music.

Robert Clive, the second son, began the techniques of violin playing at the early age of three years on a quarter-sized violin. He was a gifted child and at the age of five was playing in public. Professional musicians were astounded when, at the age of six, he played with his father's orchestra at Saltair and superbly demonstrated professional skill.  

Many times when Mr. Clive would have friends at his home to enjoy an afternoon of music playing quartets, Robert would bring his violin to the room and play along with them. The manner in which the boy played amazed the friends and delighted his father. Robert was stricken with appendicitis during his seventh year. The doctors did not know how to care for this ailment in 1895 and, consequently, this gifted and beloved son died.

The third son was Clifford C. Clive and, although his father started him on the violin, it was as a pianist that he became the most proficient performer. At the age of thirteen, he was appointed pianist of

10 Ibid.
11 Ibid.
12 Ibid.
13 Personal interview with Agnes C. Andersen March 18, 1962.
14 Ibid.
the Grand Theater Orchestra which was directed by his father. The Deseret Evening News wrote the following article concerning this event:

Among the juvenile pianists of the city is perhaps not a more promising artist than little Clifford C. Clive, the thirteen-year old son of Professor Clive, the well known Salt Lake violinist. Almost from his infancy this child artist has displayed extraordinary fondness for music. Years ago he was able to play both violin and piano with skill and intelligence. Now he is taking first rank on these instruments and without question has a brilliant future. At present he is the pianist of the Grand Theater and performs like a veteran, and nightly surprises the patrons of the house who get close enough to the front to see the tiny little fellow perched upon an elongated stool in front of the piano fingering the keys like a professional. He has recently attracted the attention of a number of eastern managers who have been amazed at his proficiency and promise. Professor Clive, his father, is exceedingly solicitous concerning his musical career and is devoting much time to his instruction.\(^15\)

Soon after Mr. Clive left the Grand, Clifford went to Europe on a mission for the Church. After his mission was completed, he went to Paris, France to study with teachers of organ and piano in that center of culture. Upon Mr. Clive's request, Clifford returned to Salt Lake City. Staying but a few months at home, Clifford completed his study of music at the Juilliard School of Music in New York City and then moved to Idaho where he began his teaching career.\(^16\)

Through years of effort and work, Clifford became one of the prominent music teachers of Idaho. He gave private lessons in Blackfoot, Idaho Falls and St. Anthony along with teaching piano and organ for several years at the Ricks College in Rexburg.\(^17\)

\(^15\) Deseret Evening News, April 9, 1903.

\(^16\) Musical Families of Utah Scrapbook, (May 1939). (See Appendix)

\(^17\) Ibid.
Agnes Clive learned violin and piano from her father and had the added talent of a lovely voice. She participated in musical activities such as singing in the operas and playing the violin in the University of Utah orchestra. Upon graduation from the University, Agnes accepted employment by the school board in Overton, Nevada. She taught music in the high school and elementary grades in the Overton Public Schools for the better part of thirty-five years. Agnes also gave many private lessons on the piano and violin and she became a central figure in the community through her musical activities. Retiring from teaching in the public schools, she made her home in Mar Vista, California. Agnes has continued her activities in music, teaching her grandchildren piano and participating in the Church as Ward Choir Director. She is serving presently as the Santa Monica Stake Junior Sunday School Chorister.

Joseph C. Clive, the fifth child, chose the 'cello as his instrument. With his father’s teaching, Joseph was making appearances in public before he could carry his large instrument. He attended the University of Utah and upon graduation went to Los Angeles to study under such noted teachers as Amsterdam and Finelli. Later he went to New York and attended the Juilliard School of Music. Joseph taught at East and South High Schools and the McCune School of Music in Salt Lake City before joining the University of Utah music faculty. He made concert appearances throughout Utah, Idaho and Nevada, and was often heard as soloist on radio presentations. His present activity consists of being a member of the University of Utah music staff and 'cellist in the Utah Symphony Orchestra. He

---

18 Agnes C. Andersen retired with twenty full teaching years. During some of the years she did not teach full time, she did substitute for other teachers.
19 Personal interview with Agnes C. Andersen April 22, 1962.
is a member of Kappa Gamma Psi, the National Music Fraternity, and is active in music circles in Salt Lake City.\textsuperscript{20}

The last child, Annie Clive, studied both violin and piano under her father. Mr. Clive, according to Annie, was always after her to practice. It seemed that Annie never had anyone come to see her but what Mr. Clive would send them home so Annie could practice.\textsuperscript{21} Due to this manner of insistence on practicing, Annie became discouraged to the point where she lost interest in continuing her music study, although she still assisted others.\textsuperscript{22} William C. Andersen, a grandson of Mr. Clive, has stated that without Annie's assistance and insistence when he was studying the piano, he would not be able to perform as he does.\textsuperscript{23}

The children of Mr. Clive have carried his influence to many areas. Nevada, Idaho and Utah have received Mr. Clive's teachings through his children.

Mr. Clive gave instruction on the violin and piano to relatives other than his children. A nephew of Mr. Clive mentioned that his family always had music in the home and it was "Uncle Will" who always started them.\textsuperscript{24}

Mr. Clive taught violin until his death May 13, 1944. During the preceding year, he had been giving lessons to a few interested students.\textsuperscript{25}

\begin{itemize}
\item \textsuperscript{20} \textit{Musical Families of Utah Scrapbook}, (May 1939) (See Appendix).
\item \textsuperscript{21} Annie C. West in a letter June 30, 1962 (See Appendix).
\item \textsuperscript{22} Ibid.
\item \textsuperscript{23} Personal interview with William C. Andersen April 22, 1962.
\item \textsuperscript{24} Personal interview with Frank C. Taylor June 31, 1961.
\item \textsuperscript{25} Personal interview with Annie C. West April 19, 1962.
\end{itemize}
The week before his death, Clifford visited with him in Overton, Nevada where Mr. Clive resided. Together they played for hours as in earlier days, with Mr. Clive playing his violin and Clifford the piano.

Mr. Clive's death was very sudden and unexpected since he seemed to be in good health. However, a heart seizure struck him and within an hour he passed away.

Methods of Teaching

The students who studied with Mr. Clive were able to perform well and could read music and play well at sight. Mr. Clive depended upon technical methods to develop his students on both violin and piano. To develop the ability to read at sight Mr. Clive had the student play a considerable amount of music at sight.

In each lesson Mr. Clive gave students approximately fifteen minutes of scales and exercises. Starting with the scales and exercises practiced for that week, he made certain they were performed correctly. Depending upon the instrument of the student (either violin or piano), Mr. Clive insisted that fingerings, position of hands, bowings and markings in the music were observed.

Mr. Clive was a disciple of the touch method and students who watched their fingers on the piano more than they watched the music received a short lecture to the point that the music was not written on the keys. Then, to the student's consternation, Mr. Clive would cover the student's hands with a book. This forced the student to forget his

26 Agnes C. Andersen in a letter June 5, 1962. (See Appendix)
27 Annie C. West in a letter June 30, 1962. (See Appendix)
hands and concentrate on the music. With the music which had been assigned for that lesson performed in an acceptable manner, the student would proceed to other more advanced music.28

The remaining portion of the lesson was taken up in various ways. Mr. Clive would have them do a certain amount of sight reading each lesson. This would include hymns from the Church hymn book, and the new pieces to be practiced for the next lesson. The assignment for the next lesson consisted of technical exercises, a number of hymns from the Church hymn book and at least one new composition that the student had not practiced nor played before.

The one feature that Mr. Clive stressed in all playing was the technical perfection of the student. On the piano the touch method was used exclusively.29 Mr. Clive felt that technique was essential for fine performers, but he used selected music to polish the technical performance.

Mr. Clive was a strict disciplinarian, but he tempered this with an earnest desire for the student to achieve. To make the music more interesting and to inspire the student and add his own personal touch to the melody or scale being played, Mr. Clive would play with the student on his violin, or improvise in the upper registers of the piano.

In order to give the student new material each week, it became necessary to leave some material before it was polished. The end result, however, was that students could go back over material of the previous lessons and play with as much or more facility than they had with concentrated practice.30

28 Annie C. West in a letter June 30, 1962. (See Appendix)
29 Personal interview with Agnes C. Andersen May 27, 1962. (Appendix)
30 Personal interview with Agnes C. Andersen May 27, 1962. (Appendix)
The different technical problems encountered on the violin and piano were the only differences Mr. Clive made in teaching these instruments. Mr. Clive did more composing for the violin than any other medium but this was due mainly to the fact that the violin was his primary interest.

Mr. Clive expected a student to practice one hour per day, every day, at the very minimum. One of his traits was his impatience with some of his students who would not practice nor let him know in advance when they were unable to attend the lesson.31

Violin Maker

An activity that Mr. Clive started in order to supplement his income was that of violin making. Mr. Clive's first violin was made with the assistance of Jacques, who was a violin maker in Salt Lake City and a friend of his.32 The techniques of violin making were gleaned from the association with Jacques and an instrument repair man named Wetzel.33

Mr. Clive spent many hours scraping wood by hand until it was the desired thickness. After reaching the desired measurements, he would spend many more hours wetting the wood and carefully bending it to the shape of the violin.34 When Mr. Clive would be held up by a particular problem, he would walk down to Wetzel's repair shop seeking advice. After receiving the advice and instruction necessary to solve the problem, he would go home and continue the task.35 The work spent on the violins was

31 Ibid.
33 Personal interview with Clifford C. Clive June 28, 1962.
34 Ibid.
35 Ibid.
in addition to the many hours devoted each day practicing and teaching privately.

Mr. Clive made a total of thirty-five violins during his lifetime. He sold some of the violins he made to his own students and others to his children's students. The violins were sold in Idaho, Utah and Nevada. Other violins were given to his children as wedding, anniversary or Christmas presents. These violins are prized possessions of the people who own them.

According to the incomplete records which Mr. Clive kept, the prices of the violins varied considerably. One of the violins sold for seventy-five dollars, while another one sold for one hundred eighty dollars. Others sold for figures between these two extremes.

One of the primary sources for the wood from which Mr. Clive made the violins was wood obtained from the Salt Lake City Tabernacle Organ when it was rebuilt. Mr. Clive obtained this wood through special permission of the President of the Church, Joseph F. Smith. Other sources of wood were the Assembly Hall and the Whitney and H. C. Kimball houses.

**Summary**

William C. Clive taught literally hundreds of students to play the violin and piano. He made a special point to instruct each of his six

---


37 Agnes C. Andersen in a letter July 2, 1962. (See Appendix)

38 William C. Clive's Handbook, in the Archives of the Brigham Young University.

39 Agnes C. Andersen in a letter written July 15, 1962. (See Appendix)

40 William C. Clive's Handbook, in the Archives of the Brigham Young University.
children in the fundamentals of music. How successful he was is demonstrated by the fact that three out of his five living children have chosen music as a career in life.

Mr. Clive's strong point in teaching was his reliance on technique for the student. He was a disciple of the touch method on the piano, where the student watches the music instead of his fingers on the keyboard.

The violins Mr. Clive made have been sold in three states—Idaho, Nevada and Utah. These are prized possessions for both sentimental value and quality of tone.
CHAPTER VI

SUMMARY, CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

The purpose of this study was to determine the influence and contribution of William Claude Clive to the musical culture of Utah. The material for the study was gathered from personal notes and diaries, articles written by members of his family, correspondence and personal interviews with members of his family and articles in newspapers and periodicals. Other sources are books, unpublished theses, research through records in the Church Historian's Office of the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-Day Saints and the Salt Lake City Public Library.

William Claude Clive was born on the 15th day of April, 1860, in Salt Lake City, Utah. Mr. Clive's father, Claude, although not demonstrating any considerable amount of talent for music, was interested in music and encouraged the study of music in his family. The beginning of William Clive's violin playing came during his ninth year when his father gave him a violin.

Young Clive's formal education consisted of only three or four years of school, but he was able to receive his music education from able and prominent musicians of his day in Salt Lake City. In 1871, when William Clive was eleven years old, Professor C. J. Thomas invited him to play in the orchestra of the Salt Lake Theater. The accuracy, professional ease and the tone quality with which he played when he entered the orchestra astonished his hearers.
Mr. Clive performed regularly with the Theater Orchestra in 1880, and in addition he played with the Careless Orchestra, which used the Theater Orchestra members as a nucleus. The Careless Orchestra performed many concerts during the 1880's. He played in each concert and also had three overtures performed that he had composed. In addition to playing in the orchestras and composing, he was also noted for his artistic ability on the violin as a soloist.

Mr. Clive was called on a mission for the Church in 1896. During this mission he suffered an accidental injury to his shoulder which caused physical suffering and mental anxiety throughout the remainder of his life. He returned to Salt Lake City in 1898. During his absence the musicians' union had been re-established. Throughout his career as a musician in Salt Lake City he chose not to become a member of the union and, consequently, gave up many opportunities to perform. He became director of the Grand Theater in 1903 and remained at that position for several years. His employment as orchestra director of the Grand came to an end when the musicians' union notified the management of the Grand to have him join the union. With this ultimatum he departed from playing for remuneration.

The years of copying music and a gift of melodic inspiration assisted William Clive in composition. He received instruction in theory and harmony from George Careless, Ebenezer Beesley and Orson K. Pratt, Junior. He had several hymns published both in the *Utah Musical Times* and the *Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-Day Saints Hymn Book*. He composed three overtures which were the first overtures by a native-born Utahn to be performed in the Salt Lake Theater. He composed many numbers for violin and piano—one of his best known being *Melody in A*. The range of
his compositions consisted of anthems for choir; overtures; violin solos; piano solos; string duets, trios, and quartets; suites; marches for band; a symphony; and exercises for beginning students.

Mr. Clive taught literally hundreds of students to play the violin and piano. He began teaching early in his playing career in order to support a family. He taught privately in his own home or in the home of the student, and he also taught at the Brigham Young College in Logan and the Latter-Day Saints' University in Salt Lake City. Mr. Clive spent much time teaching his own children the fundamentals of music. How successful he was is demonstrated by the fact that three out of the five living children chose to teach music for a career.

Mr. Clive was a disciple of the touch method on the piano where the student pays more attention to the music than his hands on the keyboard. Mr. Clive relied very strongly on technical studies to make fine performers and sight readers of his students.

One avocation that he developed was the making of violins. He spent many hours on each of the thirty-five violins he made. These violins he sold in Nevada, Idaho and Utah and they are the prized possessions of the people who purchased them.

Conclusions

The training that William Clive received enabled him to make a contribution to the musical culture of Utah both in performance and composition. Although receiving little formal education, he received the best musical education possible in the Salt Lake Valley at that time. The men who taught Mr. Clive (C. J. Thomas, George Careless and John Tullidge) had received excellent educations at the music conservatories
of England. Other fine musicians that taught Mr. Clive were: Magnus Olson, Ebenezer Beesley and Orson K. Pratt, Junior. These men had the necessary training and knowledge to pass on to eager and willing students such as Mr. Clive. When he was financially able to attend a conservatory in the United States, he had no apparent difficulty in being accepted.

He joined the Salt Lake Theater Orchestra at the age of eleven and continued to play there twenty-nine years. He formed his own quadrille band, playing for socials and dances in addition to playing with the Theater Orchestra and performing as a soloist at other functions.

If psychological influence for good can be exerted on individuals by having them hear fine performances of excellent music, then Mr. Clive was undoubtedly influential. During his performing career he played for thousands of people under all kinds of circumstances. These circumstances ranged from performances at concerts in the Tabernacle to playing between fights at a local boxing arena; and from playing at missionary farewells to playing in cabarets. His facility on his instrument and the musicianship he displayed was such that whenever he performed he was encouraged by the audience to play at least one encore, and frequently two. Most of the compositions he performed were ones which were technically difficult but beautiful, written by masters of violin compositions. When he performed his own compositions the audience usually called for an encore. In the minds of many individuals, Mr. Clive was probably the premier violinist of Salt Lake City.

Mr. Clive learned to copy music early in his career in order to have music to practice. To obtain the necessary training for composition, Mr. Clive studied under George Careless and others. Under the guidance of Mr. Careless, he composed anthems for choirs, overtures and hymns. His
compositions were sung and played throughout the world. He composed frequently for his students in order to have exercises that fitted the level of that particular student's ability. He received many favorable comments from Chicago and other cities on his compositions.

His compositions were numerous and varied in type. His first work was the choral anthem Alpha. Then followed three overtures: The Golden Crest, Evening Thoughts and Zetae. Another choral anthem had the title of Kindness. He also composed exercises labelled "Wm. C. Clive's Violin School, Book One of Very First Studies and Some Familiar Melodies. He composed several anthems which were sung only in the Temple; other of Mr. Clive's anthems were sung throughout the Church. His most popular composition was Melody in A. Although his compositions are rarely heard today, Mr. Clive's contribution to the music culture of Utah through his composing was significant due to the many people who heard, performed and enjoyed his music.

The main source of music instruction during Mr. Clive's earlier years was not in the public schools but, rather, by the private teacher who started the student, trained him and sent him out into the world to show his capabilities. When the instrumental program was introduced into the schools, private teachers made it possible.

Mr. Clive's greatest influence and contribution was in his teaching. He taught hundreds of students the violin, piano and 'cello. A small sampling of his students includes William Hardiman, Harold and Wallace Bennett, Harold Groesbeck, Lee Jeremy, William Clark, Lorenzo Poulton, Charles Stewart, Rulon Haake, Samuel Spry, John Gunn, Milton Love, August Jones, Ruel and Thaddeus Walton, Sydney Beattie and Mary Taylor. A number of Campbells, Taylors and Stewarts took lessons from
him, as they were related through marriage. His many students have carried Mr. Clive's teachings and influence throughout the western states and some throughout the world.

The Clive children have continued to carry his influence and contribution along through their teaching and performing. Three of the children have chosen music as a career. Clifford made his home in Idaho, where he taught for many years before retiring. Agnes moved to Southern Nevada where she became a central figure in her community through her music teaching. Joseph remained in Salt Lake City where he is presently engaged in teaching at the University of Utah, has private students and is passing along his knowledge and experience to his grandchildren. All three are musically active in the wards in which they reside and are continuing the interest in music they have had all their lives.

Mr. Clive, in his teaching, emphasized technique very strongly. Probably his strongest point was on his reliance on technical studies. On the piano he insisted that the student not watch his hands but learn to watch the music and have his fingers play the notes he saw without looking at them. He insisted on good positions both on the piano and the violin, with half-way attempts never being accepted. Mr. Clive always worked for perfection in his students by encouragement and demonstration.

Mr. Clive is remembered in Salt Lake City particularly by the older generation for his character as well as his musicianship.
Recommendations

The research for this study brought out that there should be more historical studies of the early pioneer musicians. Studies of men such as Ebenezer Beesley; Orson K. Pratt, Junior; Willard Weihe and others would assist in the knowledge of the heritage of the past in Utah. There are other organizations which need to be studied—such as, the Salt Lake Theater Orchestra after 1870, the Grand Theater Orchestra and the Tabernacle Choir of Salt Lake City. Many of the directors of the above groups have been studied but some have been neglected.
BIBLIOGRAPHY

A. Books and Periodicals


B. Unpublished Material


## C. Other Sources

**Interviews:**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Date</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Andersen, Agnes C.</td>
<td>March 18, 1962</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Andersen, William C.</td>
<td>March 18, 1962</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bee, Robert</td>
<td>August 10, 1961</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Clive, Clifford C.</td>
<td>June 28, 1962</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Clive, Joseph C.</td>
<td>July 22, 1962</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Clive, William C.</td>
<td>August 25, 1961</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Taylor, Frank C.</td>
<td>June 30, 1961</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>West, Annie C.</td>
<td>April 20, 1962</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Letters:**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Andersen, Agnes C.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Clive, Clifford C.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>West, Annie C.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
APPENDICES
APPENDIX A

Letters from Agnes Clive Andersen.

... Dad was a great one for strong technic methods, both on piano and violin. Methods used were Ayer, Hohman, Herseys, Damela's Book one and two, Stubers, and Gruenbog's Violin Method. ... Dad made violins from pieces of wood from the Tabernacle and Assembly Hall Organs, when they, the organs, were being made over. Given permission by President Joseph F. Smith to get all the wood he wanted when it was taken out of the organs and replaced and how he took the wood and scraped and scraped until he had it like the measurements needed and then for the sides, wet and bent the thin pieces of wood until they were in the shape to fit. Many hours went into them. ...

Letters from Clifford C. Clive.

... While we were at the Grand, father had one violin that had a strong big tone that, with little effort, filled the Theater with a beautiful sonorous tone, night after night of continuous playing. During one summer vacation at the close of the winter season at the Theater, father went East to do some research work and some brush up study. He met a very fine violin maker and repair man who was a very popular violin expert connected with the Boston Conservatory of Music. Upon hearing father's violin he greatly admired it and became much
interested in it. He studied its construction and convinced himself that by slightly thinning the top by a few slight shavings the tone would still further be improved. After continued persuasion and insistence that the tone would be mellowed some, father reluctantly consented so the change was made. When the winter season opened and the heavy strain of the hard continuous playing was required of the instrument, after about a week the violin got tired, as it were, and the tone flattened out and father had to give it a rest for a few days. After each such rest period the tone would be revived and volume and tone as good and strong as ever. So father felt the instrument had been injured instead of improved.

While father was on his mission in Colorado in about 1897, he was riding his bicycle to a city located in the mountains. On one of the long steep mountain roads his bicycle raced out of control and he fell off injuring his shoulder. President John W. Taylor and others who inspected the bruised shoulder thought it not serious and that it would heal up in a few days. Nature did heal it over but in later years the injury began to give him pain and bother. This began to appear while he was associated with the Grand Theater. The injury became progressively worse until during his older age, in fact, until his death, gave him pain and mental anguish. In the final stages he could only with great difficulty pull on his coat. Father felt that unions deprived men of their personal liberty, were despotic, placed too much power in the hands of the officials, and used and was based on force. He
was told that if he did not join of his free choice they would starve him into it, they would boycott any and every place or person who employed him. As a result of his not joining he gave up many opportunities to earn considerable money. He had soul satisfying feeling that his cause was just and that he was living up to a principle that he thought was right. He never underbid the union scale of wage for any job although they underbid him and their scale of wage, threatened his employers, and boycotted places that hired him. He sacrificed much as a consequence but his family was blessed with sufficient of the necessities of life. His children were given all the schooling they wanted, he owed no man and was highly respected in all circles.

... Mr. Paul Hammer was the manager and he called father into his office and literally begged him to join. He even told father that the Theater would pay all dues if we would join. The Beesley boys were strong union enthusiasts and left the orchestra. Delbert Beesley was the finest drummer in the country. His roll was as smooth as a roll of thunder and Alvin was a very good pianist. I used to substitute for Alvin when he was unable to be on the job and when he quit I "took over." At that time I was thirteen years old in 1904.

... The incident of the compliment paid father was the director passing through Salt Lake was, as I remember it, that the director was a noted concert artist playing and when he came to this passage in the music he stopped the orchestra
and said: "That is the first time since I left Chicago that that passage has been played at sight and correctly, I compliment you. You should be back East in New York or Chicago." . . .

. . . One time I was introduced to an aged gentleman who was a baker by trade in the pioneer days. He told me that he used to go to work at four o'clock in the morning to get out the morning bread and rolls and that he always passed by my grandfather's tailor shop on the way to work. He told me that many a morning as he passed he would hear violin playing and would peer in the window and there seated on his father's tailor's table, father would be practicing his music by lamplight. Father often copied music that he needed all through the night as printed music was so difficult to come by.

Father played at dances with his band all his life so it is natural that he had a quadrille band. . . .

. . . Father composed the first overture played publicly in Utah. His "Melody in A" for violin was sold and played in most of the States of the U. S. and many foreign countries. He composed many compositions for violin and also piano that were used by pupils. Several of his religious anthems were sung by choirs throughout the Church. Many of his pupils became teachers and professionals in the music field. William Hardiman, for example; also Fred Midgley, William King, William Morris, and others. . . .

. . . He was also violin soloist for literally hundreds of missionary farewells. . . .
His dance orchestra furnished the music at the old Calder's Park for a couple of seasons when its name was changed and became the "Wandemere Park," then furnished the music there until it was closed because it had fulfilled the purpose for which the management had operated the resort.

Letter from Annie Clive West.

I know Dad was always after me to practice, never had anyone come to see me but that he would send them home so I would practice. I think that is what turned me against music. When I did practice the piano he made me watch the music not the keyboard, curve my knuckles, hold my wrists down, and always strike the keys from the fingers.

Dad used to get impatient with pupils that were late or those that didn't come and not let him know that they weren't coming.
APPENDIX B

Biographical Sketch by Robert Bee.

. . . Grandfather was born same place and chummed with my grandmother who when they arrived here were married. By this first wife the children were: Wm. C. Clive and Jed Clive. . . .

Auto-biographical Sketch of William C. Clive.

First little boy to play in the Salt Lake Theater with the grown mens theater orchestra.

Second night played some high notes, "If can't play better than that better go home."

Composed the first three overtures ever composed by a native born composer and they were all played by the Salt Lake Theater Orchestra. . . .
APPENDIX C

Speech given in Sacrament meeting March 10, 1940 by Agnes Clive Andersen.

W. C. Clive, a son of early pioneers from England... His opportunity for schooling was very meager but from earliest childhood, a book was his constant companion and every suit of clothes he has ever had, the pockets have always been the first thing worn out, because there was always at least one book in them, and more if there was room.

Music was his one dream from early childhood and at the age of nine, he began the study of the violin and so interested was he that he had to be called from his practice instead of being driven to it. He studied with the leading teachers at that time and at the age of eleven he was invited to play with the Salt Lake Theater Orchestra and the accuracy, ease and tone with which he played astonished his hearers...

... In 1885 he married Isabella Campbell, daughter of Robert Campbell, one of the founders of the University of Utah. They had four children when one, who was especially musically gifted was, after a long illness, taken away which was a very severe blow to him...

... After he finished his mission he went back home and rode from pupil to pupil on a bicycle to give his lessons...
APPENDIX D

Musical Families of Utah Scrapbook.

... The father, a son of early pioneers began his career at an early age studying the rudiments of music under John Tullidge, an English musician. At the age of nine, he began the study of the violin with Magnus Olsen, later studying with Mr. Mineer, Ebenezer Beesley and George Careless. So interested was he in his violin that it was often necessary to call him from practice for fear that he might overdo. As a child of eleven, he was invited to play with the Salt Lake Theater Orchestra and astonished his hearers by playing his part with such accuracy and professional ease. ...

In 1885, he married Isabella Campbell, daughter of Robert Campbell. They had six children, all of whom have been musical.

William C. Clive Jr. studied violin and made numerous appearances in string groups and orchestras during his youth and early manhood, but did not follow music as a profession.

Robert Clive, the second child was playing the violin in public at the age of five. Professional musicians were astounded when, at the age of six he played with the Saltair orchestra and demonstrated superbly professional skill. However such a genius was not meant to live for long as he passed away at the age of seven.
Clifford C. Clive studied piano and violin under the direction of his father for a number of years and then studied in Berlin, Germany, and still later at the Juilliard School of Music in New York. At present he is a prominent teacher in Idaho teaching in Idaho Falls, Blackfoot, and St. Anthony. His family is also outstanding in musical activities of the community, a daughter and son both playing violin and piano.

Agnes Clive Andersen, now a high school teacher in Overton, Nevada, added her part to the Clive musical family. Violin, piano and vocal were her accomplishments and she was well known for her musical activities throughout her school years at the University of Utah. At present she is not only a leader in her community but also has three sons who hold first chair positions in school bands and orchestras playing cornet, clarinet, violin, string bass, and piano.

Joseph Clive, the fifth child, chose the 'cello for his part in the family orchestra. He also was tutored by his father and was making appearances in public before he could carry his large instrument. He continued the study of 'cello along with other instruments and entered the professional field. He graduated with a Bachelor of Science Degree and a major in music from the University of Utah and studied 'cello in Los Angeles under such noted teachers as Amsterdam and Finelli. Later he went to New York where he studied at the Juilliard School of Music. He is a member of Kappa Gamma Psi, National honorary music fraternity and is at present a member of the faculty of the McCune School of Music and Art and is in
charge of the instrumental department of the South High School. He has made numerous concert appearances throughout Utah, Idaho and Nevada and is often heard as soloist on radio presentations.

Annie, the youngest child, studied both violin and piano. She played in string groups and school orchestras, filling her part in the family of musicians.
ABSTRACT

WILLIAM CLAUDE CLIVE:
HIS LIFE AND CONTRIBUTION TO MUSIC IN UTAH

The purpose of this study was to determine the influence and contribution of William Claude Clive to the musical culture of Utah. In order to determine the measure of his influence and contribution, answers to the following questions were sought: Did William Claude Clive have the necessary training to offer a contribution to the musical culture of Utah? Was his contribution primarily from his performing, composing or teaching? Were Mr. Clive's students instrumental in spreading any contribution offered by him?

The material collected was organized into three main activities: (1) performance, (2) composing, and (3) instructor of music. Also included was a review of companion literature concerning musicians of Utah, musical organizations in the Salt Lake Valley, and schools, critics, and hymnology.

Young Clive's formal education consisted of only three or four years of school, but he was able to receive his music education from able and prominent musicians of his day in Salt Lake City. The men who taught him (C. J. Thomas, George Careless, and John Tullidge) had received excellent educations at the music conservatories of England. He was invited by C. J. Thomas to join the Salt Lake Theater orchestra when but
eleven years old, and he continued in the Theater orchestra for almost thirty nine years.

Mr. Clive learned to copy music early in his career in order to have music to practice. To obtain the necessary training for composition, he went to George Careless for instruction. Under the guidance of Mr. Careless, Mr. Clive composed anthems for choirs, overtures and hymns. He had his first three overtures performed in the Salt Lake Theater which were the first overtures composed by a native Utahn to be played in the Theater.

Mr. Clive composed especially for his many students and for the morning sessions of the Salt Lake Temple where he served as choir director. Mr. Clive had hymns published in the Church hymn book and other of his hymns were sung by choirs throughout the Church.

William C. Clive taught literally hundreds of students to play the violin and piano. He made a special point to instruct each of his six children in the fundamentals of music. How successful he was is demonstrated by the fact that three out of five living children have chosen music as a career in life.

If psychological influence for good can be exerted on individuals by having them hear fine performances of excellent music, then Mr. Clive was undoubtedly influential. During his performing career he played for thousands of people under all kinds of circumstances.

Mr. Clive's compositions were sung and played through-
out the world. He composed frequently for his students in order to have exercises that fitted the level of that particular student's ability. He received favorable comments from Chicago and other cities on his compositions.

Mr. Clive's greatest influence and contribution was in his teaching. He taught hundreds of students the violin, piano and 'cello. The Clive children have continued to carry his influence and contribution along through their teaching and performing.

Mr. Clive, in his teaching, emphasized technique very strongly. Probably his strongest point was on his reliance on technical studies. On the piano he insisted that the student watch the music and not his hands, having his fingers play the notes he saw without looking at his hands.

It is recommended that there should be more historical studies of the early pioneer musicians and the various organizations they worked with.

APPROVED:

[Signatures]
Chairman, Advisory Committee

[Signatures]
Member, Advisory Committee

[Signatures]
Chairman, Major Department