An Historic Account of Music Criticism and Music Critics in Utah

Basil Hansen
Brigham Young University - Provo
AN HISTORIC ACCOUNT OF MUSIC CRITICISM AND MUSIC CRITICS IN UTAH

*****
****
**

Basil Hansen

A THESIS SUBMITTED TO
THE DEPARTMENT OF MUSIC
OF
BRIGHAM YOUNG UNIVERSITY
Provo, Utah

IN PARTIAL FULFILLMENT OF THE REQUIREMENTS FOR
THE DEGREE OF
MASTER OF ARTS
This Thesis by Basil Hansen is accepted in its present form by the Department of Music as satisfying the Thesis requirement for the degree of Master of Arts.

May, 1933

__________________________
Major Professor

__________________________
Thesis Committee
INTRODUCTION

CONCERNING THE PROBLEM

The subject, "Music Criticism in Utah," may arouse merriment in some or perturbation in others. Acquiescent individuals will accept the thesis as stated. Skeptics, on the other hand, will probably question the premise "There has been music criticism in Utah." The premise may be easily disproved if criticism is defined so as to eliminate the fragmentary materials which support such a statement. Criticism, however, cannot justifiably be limited to close and narrow precincts. The emotional impression of any individual will not permit a too limited restriction as to the quality or intensity of the measurement made. I feel, therefore, that I am within the confines of propriety and intelligent reasoning in my assertion that Utah has had music critics and music criticism.

I shall surely encounter no opposition to my assumption that verbal critical reactions have been expressed between music leaders of the state. Otherwise, music would not have developed from congregational singing and brass band music (Capt. Pitt--the group of musicians who migrated from Nauvoo)\(^1\) to a great Tabernacle choir of some three

\(^1\)Cf. Appendix II.
hundred voices, very commendable choral societies, city symphony orchestras, a professional theatre orchestra, and a variety of bands.

Perhaps, too, I am conservative of fancy to presume that a more subtle critical force made itself felt in the leadership and personnel of each music organization. That force was the music merits that trained musicians of Europe brought with them into this new country. Such men as Domnico Ballo, David C. Calder, C. J. Thomas, John Tullidge, George Careless, and others were conscious of the demands each other musically trained individual would make of him. That which stimulated such feelings could not have been other than critical in nature and will consequently fit no other category more conveniently than that of criticism. The growth of music and music interest is consequently a reflection of the thing called "music criticism."

However, the music public of Utah was not and is not yet educated to a status at which it can absorb intelligent critical analysis. This is evident from the fact that the State, if it has a proficient critic, will not allow candid expression through its journals. Newspapers in Utah are not large enough to maintain special music critics on their staffs. If a music critic were active concerning local productions and if he used professional attainments as criteria he would receive a rebuff in reciprocal dissatisfaction that would effect the sales of the paper. Yet, acute criticism would unquestionably jar local
talent out of their complacency with their own mediocre efforts. A sympathetic but severe critic might even help raise music attainments of home talent.

The present reviewers of the State's largest dailies are frank and unpresuming. They are efficient reviewers, considering that music reviews are but one small part of the work for which they are hired and that their profession is not music.

Reviews of major music events are abundant. However, almost invariably they are insipid rehashes of publicity folders and proverbial adjectives. This type of review must be interesting to performers who anticipate finding their names written in the newspaper. For economic reasons journals do not print adverse reactions to local talent. And, a reporter who without a thorough schooling in music disapproved of a Kreisler interpretation and technique, would be incredibly impudent. The musically untutored reviewer is as capable of assembling and applying flowery sentences as is the critic. The type of newspaper comment wanted by both performer and public is a conglomeration of dainty compliments. The papers have what they want. The people are satisfied. A music critic will perhaps find his most profitable employment in criticising the radio broadcasts and reading the result to the canary.
PURPOSE OF THE THESIS

My purpose in making a study of music criticism in Utah is to realize a reliable historical account of criticism as expressed by means of journals and the growth of music within the state. This study, it is granted, is not a complete history of music in Utah. It merely treats one phase of a yet unwritten history.

A secondary interest is to defend the assertion that Utah has had music criticism and not to eulogize or deride the music pioneers of the state. It may also impress the need of constructive criticism to insure the stimulus and incentive necessary to the continued growth of any music center or organization.

The scope of the study includes Utah's history of music criticism from the first years of settlement until 1935. Any mistakes, omissions, or ambiguities contained herein are unrealized by the author.

METHOD OF GATHERING MATERIAL

There is no royal index to the Utah newspapers. The problem presents itself as the prodigious task of picking information from news stacks. With the exception of about four years of the Deseret News in its first decade, Tullidge's Quarterly, The Deseret Weekly, and the Utah Magazine there are no indices. My method of approach in gathering material was to consult Utah magazines and news-
papers page by page. The method of research later found most efficient and effective was that of examining weekend music sections for program (concert) announcements and carefully searching the issue following the concert.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

My appreciation extends to the L. D. S. Church Historian's Office and the Salt Lake Public Library staff for their kind consideration given my problem. Of other assisting faculties I am likewise appreciative.

To the Brigham Young university music department and to Dr. Lowry Nelson I am grateful for suggestions and assistance.

ARRANGEMENT

The thesis proper traces some of the major music events in Utah. From reactions to these events a selective list of material has been gathered and arranged. The treatment commences with existing music conditions of the first decade of state music history. The second distinct stage of development treated is that which commences in the 1860's and extends to 1878 at which time itinerant artists commenced visiting Salt Lake City. Other critical and historical treatments are somewhat desultory but as nearly as possible they have been arranged in consecutive time sequence.
The type of journalistic criticism evinced in reviews is shown in the review section which contains examples selected as representative of different years from 1878 to the present.

The bibliography is annotated in order to give the reader an understanding of the time period covered by each publication and general characteristics of the journals.

The indices contain the more detailed or extended accounts which would interrupt the continuity and diminish the interest of the thesis if included in the body. All material of the appendices has some pertinent relationship to the subject matter of the study.
# CONTENTS

## INTRODUCTION

| Concerning the Problem                  | iii |
| Purpose of the Thesis                   | vi  |
| Method of Gathering Material            | vii |
| Arrangement                             | vii |
| Acknowledgements                        | vii |

## Chapter I

**STATUS OF MUSIC IN EARLY UTAH**  
1

## Chapter II

**CRITICAL EXPRESSION**  
5

## Chapter III

**JOHN TULLIDGE**  
8

## Chapter IV

**DEVELOPMENT STAGES**
- Tabernacle Choir
- Evan Stephens
- Theatre Music

## Chapter V

**CRITICAL DISSENSION**  
25
- Disagreements
  - Daily Herald
  - Goodwin's Weekly
  - Salt Lake Telegram
  - Salt Lake Tribune
  - Deseret News

## Chapter VI

**AESTHETIC APPRAISALS**  
35
- Miscellaneous Compliments
- Our Music Status (1895-1900)
- Eisteddfod Adjudications
- Arthur Shepherd
- John Morgan

## Chapter VII

**REVIEWS**  
50
- Unfavorable Comment
  - Wilhelmj
  - "Sorcerer"
  - Zion's Musical Society
  - Richings Bernard Co.
  - "Erminie"
- Favorable Comment
  - Gilmore
  - Choral Society
B. B. Young Concert
Choir Concert
Lucy Gates
Paderewski
"Messiah"
Kreisler

Chapter VIII THE REVIEWERS' EPITHETS

CONCLUSION

BIBLIOGRAPHY

APPENDICES

I John Tullidge
II Whitney, "Music in Early Utah Days"
III Theatre Music
IV Evan Stephens
V Eisteddfod Adjudications
VI First Performance of "Messiah"
AN HISTORIC ACCOUNT OF MUSIC CRITICISM AND

MUSIC CRITICS IN UTAH
CHAPTER I

STATUS OF MUSIC IN EARLY UTAH

Captain Wm. Pitt's Brass Band of Nauvoo blew the music for the notable march across the plains in 1847. Those worthy old tooters later constituted the nucleus for the development of a series of music organizations and the cultivation of a music audience and music enthusiasm that eventually elevated Salt Lake City to the dignity of a music center. Their beginning in music was, to be sure, one complementary harmonious blending with the environs under which they were so resolute as to place themselves. Prairie people--prairie music.

DESERET NEWS

Great Salt Lake City, July 10, 1850

GRAND CONCERT

Our friends, fellow citizens and emigrants are respectfully informed that there will be a Grand Concert in the Bowery, on the evening of Wed. 24th inst.

As the people love amusement we design to gratify them, with a series of Comic pieces and songs, most of which will be entirely new in the valley, and some original, got up expressly for the occasion. For particulars see hand bills.

Admittance by tickets which can be had at the Tithing or Post Office, 25¢ each.

---Wm. Clayton
No one would expect to hear a Beethoven Symphony, Bach Mass, or Handel Oratorio in a community where and at a time when the newspaper would expect satisfactory results from an announcement—"A Key found. Call at the Post Office." Such geniuses as Schumann or Wagner would have found no place in a country where fiddlers used their bows between concerts for shooting Indians.

DESERET NEWS
Great Salt Lake City, Sept. 21, 1850
CONCERT
Our patrons will take notice that the concert designed for this Saturday evening, will be unavoidably postponed, in consequence of some of the performers being gone to Ogden City, on the Indian expedition. Due notice will be given when it will take place

--Wm. Clayton

It would have been nonsensical extravagance for that first great news sheet of Utah to squander space on criticism or formal analyses of entertainments that had passed. Their musicians were the half dozen performers who did their best, between social and domestic obligations, to alleviate pioneer troubles with attractive melodies and pleasant harmonies.

Anything amiss said of their sacred music would be unjust. They sang to God with faith and assurance. Their degree of satisfaction was certainly as wholehearted and genuine as that felt by any choral society that ever sung—
perhaps much more than many.

The ultimate consequence assuredly has little place in the annals of world music history—maybe no significant consequence to the annals of the State music history. But music was with them and it was an expression of the social group. As the community developed their music advanced.

In the fall of the year of their arrival in Utah the old spirit of Nauvoo days was revived in a musical way. The Saints it seems had several choirs in Nauvoo and at least one band. The Tabernacle Choir made its beginning shortly after the arrival in Utah. The singing of that time did not have the assistance of an organ but the people contented themselves with the accompaniment given by a group of seventeen or eighteen instrumentalists. The Wm. Pitt band was immediately reorganized after the settlement in the valley and the second band in existence was the more highly developed Ballou's Band.

These two organizations joined forces on February 14, 1853, when ground for the temple was broken, and again on April 6, 1853, at services for the laying of the corner stone. Ballou and his band were the builders of the hall that once bore his name on West First South street, and many notable dances were given there in pioneer days to the music of the band.

From the Nauvoo Brass band radiated small bands and soloists without number. One organization called the "Shanghai" band, was especially notable at the dancing entertainments of those days.

When the Social Hall was opened in 1853, there was a rare entertainment at which a band called the "African Band" took part, but I have not been able to secure any information as to its makeup, or the character of its work.
Dimmick Huntington's noted Martial Band, dear to every boy who celebrated 4th or 24th, in those days, reached its greatest proficiency in the sixties.

The composer, John Tullidge, who came from England in the sixties, wrote music for the Tabernacle Choir, which was of a high grade, and his anthem, "How Beautiful Upon the Mountains," is still sung by the larger choirs of the Church.

The favorite vocal soloist of the early days was Mr. John Kay, whose singing of the old song, "The Sea," gave him a great reputation among the Pioneers. It was no doubt from hearing him render "The Sea," that President John Taylor fitted his hymn of the "Seer" to the same tune. W. C. Dunbar, another soloist sang at the opening of the theatre in 1862, and had previously acquired fame through the "Sing Zion, Brother Dunbar" episode of Echo canyon war times.¹

My justification for this little review and the others of the thesis is that without music there can be no criticism of that art. Also, the Pioneer musicians started things in Utah that if fully appreciated perhaps would stimulate the modern public to detach itself from its present state of delightful complacence. An understanding of the early music setting might assist people in seeing a possible benefit in criticism were they educated to other than a child's peevishness to corrections offered concerning their divine art. Our deficiency is not the lack of the possibility of importing a critic, but more probably the lack of the capacity of the public to assimilate criticism.

CHAPTER II

CRITICAL EXPRESSION

A newspaper is built in sections to satisfy publics. Musicians are few, pedants numerous, and music critics a rare but atrocious group. Criticism may effect local performing talent and stimulate it to better performances, but, performers must perform for their audiences and pecuniary returns. The audience demands its diet. That diet is not a technical exercise, a masterpiece of intricacies, demanding super-efficiency in compositional technique and super-excellence in execution and interpretation. Is the art in music at the disposal of only a few technicians? Perhaps true art is simplicity, a graspable self-exegetic matter within the comprehension of man, assuming that man means an alert and mentally normal individual.

The Utah newspaper music reporters are not technically trained musicians--as confessed by present members of the reviewing staffs of the Deseret News and Salt Lake Tribune. That part of their judgment which is expressed must be most totally impressionistic. Perhaps their judgment is reliable and perhaps not. Would the average newspaper man really enjoy the musical classic had he not been told it was a classic? The publicity which a paper gives
to an itinerant artist previous to his appearance is a major factor from which the music reviewer draws his reaction to the performance.¹ A newspaper could not ordinarily, with justification to itself, tolerate adverse reaction to that which had been highly vaunted in previous issues. The reaction as expressed by the paper can be no other than an artificial medley of impressions, a subjective and partial resume by an emotionally disturbed individual.

In some circumstances Plato's reasoning of music might be justified.

Music is a moral law. It gives a soul to the universe, wings to the mind, flight to the imagination, and charm to sadness, gayety and life to everything else. It is the essence of order and leads to all that is good, just and beautiful—of which it is the invisible but nevertheless dazzling passionate and external form.

This bit of excess offers little consolation to the adamant crusted critic. Plato's gem was meant to effect the lesser exacting individual. Utah's settlers were concerned with Plato's music. Their purpose of music was for

¹Journalistic attention devoted to music in early Utah varied quite in proportion with the size of the papers. From 1880 onward a considerably greater importance was attached to music reviews and program announcements. This was perhaps due to advertising road attractions, and the enthusiasm of the poetic C. C. Goodwin who became editor of the Tribune in 1880.

Journalistic attention at present devoted to music, as indicated by a Deseret News reviewer, varies proportionately with the space allotted to the subject. Music reviews, announcements of concerts, and discussions are regulated and written to accommodate available column inches.
a little idle pleasure or a simple impressive hymn for devotion. Some were oblivious to Europe's world of music, some were indifferent, and perhaps a few were interested.

Whatever one's surmise of the music status of the state during the first years of development, we learn something from the letter in Tullidge's History of Salt Lake City.

A graphic sketch from the artistic pen of a gold digger, a correspondent of the New York Tribune, under the date of July 8th, 1849.

"I this day attended worship with them in the open air. Some thousands of well-dressed, intelligent-looking people assembled; a number of them on foot, some in carriages, and some on horses. Many were neatly and even fashionably clad. The beauty and neatness of the ladies reminded me of some of our best congregations of New York. They had a choir of both sexes, who performed exceedingly well, accompanied by a band, playing well on almost every musical instrument of modern invention. Peals of the most sweet, sacred and solemn music filled the air."

Not having heard the performance, I cannot confirm the critic's opinion of the music. For general reasons it might be a feasible bit of logic to presume that he was not just being nice (nice used in the idiomatic sense) and complimentary to what must have appeared as a bunch of fools Mormons.

We may rest assured that music started as early as the state; that it developed as rapidly as any of the industries, that at periods it has surpassed the size and growth of the community in other respects; and that the present status is very susceptible of improvement.
CHAPTER III

JOHN TULLIDGE

A musician (in 1862) walked across the old trail from the music culture of England into a valley which within its fifteen years of development was establishing a music prestige. Music criticism in this pioneer setting perhaps would not be expected. The more anticipated condition would be something comparable to the lone shipwrecked sailor playing dominoes, each move being "Well done mate."

John Tullidge,¹ upon arriving in the valley, approached the situation of enjoying music of the settlement in a less seafaring fashion. The Deseret News, weekly, published his reaction to a program given by the Deseret Musical Association. Thus is preserved the earliest music criticism that I have been able to locate.² The article is "his honest opinion" of the concert. What reviewers have done since is a good indication of the people's reaction to honesty in judgment and appraisal of their music.

Mr. Tullidge quite shockingly states that "The horns were out of tune at the finale." That little note of cor-

¹ Cf. Appendix I, Life and musical training of Tullidge.
² Cf. Appendix II, Complete concert review.
rection (let us assume that this musician was sincere) could not have been more disconcerting than poorly played horns. His praise for the work in general is discreetly applied but complimentary—so written as to convince the reader that Mr. Tullidge was not merely strutting his feathers at the expense of music performers.

The following representative paragraph may well illustrate his apparently critically artistic but unpretentious attitude concerning Utah musicians.

The Association commenced with one of my old favorite Glee's, "Awake Aeolian Lyre, Awake." The opening strain is not one of easy rendering, and without great attention to the Largo movement with its first grand close on the dominant, that cautious awakening so necessary to the slumbering lyre, is entirely lost. In order to preserve the full effect of this movement, a tremolo vibrato should be employed to awake its drowsy strings from its forgetfulness with nature's simple ease.

It appears by the authors' working of the second period of the dominant "and give to rapture" that he had reserved for the finale of his first subject the thorough awakening of the instrument so descriptive of its joyous arousing. "From Helicone Harmonious Springs," is a lively imitation of parts, which produces a fine tonic termination. "The laughing flowers around them blow, Drink life and fragrance as they flow" is too far fetched, and the author has not succeeded in a good interpretation of the poetry. The first line is truthful enough, but the second one "Drink life and fragrance as they flow" is too gloomy with its termination on the submediant.

Such an analytic discussion might not stimulate artistic exuberance in the minds of the modern newspaper publics but it would have some pertinent relationship to the performing musicians. To my knowledge such objective (if the word has a place in aesthetic relations) understanding and sympathetic corrections have never been repeated in Utah
music journals. In 1869 Mr. Tullidge was a member of the Utah Magazine staff which published an extended account of Mozart's Overture to Figaro and Locke's Macbeth Music. In this criticism he seems to have shifted the emphasis from analysis of performance and composition to compositional interpretation.

One may see the policy of the papers in 1862 as being essentially the same as to-day when one reads the review of a concert which followed the account by John Tullidge. This review which contains the policy of the paper concerning criticism was published in the Deseret News about one month later (Dec. 17, 1862).

In further allusion to concerts of the Deseret Music Association held last week in the Tabernacle, it is gratifying to us to state that so far from satiated in their taste for music by the performances of the first evening out citizens seemed rather to be more awakened to the delightful character of this species of amusement. The truth of this was thoroughly evinced on the evening of the 2nd concert when the house was well filled by an auditory who were not deterred from going, notwithstanding an existing snow storm during nearly 24 hrs. and was yet in full blast at the hour of opening.

We have no disposition to enter into criticism upon individual performances, neither would it be just to do so, as we regard the distinctly stated objects of the concerts as having been exceptionally attained, that of publicly exhibiting the excellence of a new system of written music, in connection with the proficiency of classes for some time having received instruction therein; and secondarily, the obtainment of means to defray the many incidental expenses necessarily incurred during a series of gratituous winter evening lectures on this science.

The anthems and choruses sung, exhibited to the general satisfaction of the audience the skillful train-
ing of the association, under the superintendence of Prof. D. O. Calder. From the admirable manner in which the chorus of the Marseillais was sung, the fact that it was only 20 minutes before the classes, seems almost incredible.

In justice to our own feelings, we can scarcely refrain from particularly and personally referring to the enrapturing performances of some of the ladies association; but prudential considerations, commingled with a hearty appreciation of the whole musical performance by young and old, male and female, forbid.

As nearly as I can determine, the first criticism of composition as well as of performance was done by that same attractive character, John Tullidge. This bit of constructive criticism was directed at the musician Prof. Thomas. The situation has its humorous connotations. Yet, even though the stimulus for this reaction seems to have been accidental and unrepeated, it has recorded another most valuable early evidence of composition being written and criticised in Utah.

In answer to Professor Thomas' note we will observe that the omission of the title of Professor to his name was an oversight of the printer, and ourselves also, in inspecting the proof copy, and for this we tender our apology. We must, however, say that our attention was more directed to the correction of errors, than to musical etiquette.

We will also beg the Professor to bear in mind that to remove the errors of consecutive fifths—a very great fault—was the cause of the necessity of changing the two notes in his choral melody, in order to render the resolution perfect. We will also remind him that perfect resolutions, as well as preparations in harmonic combinations, are required for correct progression; and we will also observe that in chorale renderings the harmonics are of more importance than the melody. In fact the song compositions of the great Schubert will prove that in his songs he has bestowed more pains and produced more effect by his varied and beautiful harmonics than he has by his
melodies. We will observe that notwithstanding the Professor's objection to our altering his melody to remove errors, that the correct and pointed resolution of the passage more than compensates for the changing of the passing notes in his subject, and more especially as the linking character of the second period is not altered.

We are always much pleased with the Professor's compositions and shall always be glad to receive any favor from him and we will also say that if he would send his pieces correct we would deem it sacrilege to alter them; but if they are grammatically incorrect, we must make a change. This observation will apply to all our contributors.¹

¹Cf. Utah Magazine, 1869, p. 347.
CHAPTER IV

DEVELOPMENT STAGES

Tabernacle Choir

The identical Old Bowery that housed the first dramatic and music entertainments also accommodated the Tabernacle Choir during the first few years of its growth. The very nature of the choir (religious worship in song) extended to it the prerogative of exemption from critical expression. Its early members were songsters who had been parts of the old Nauvoo choirs. Their aims were to sing praises to their God. Their leaders were musical men but not musicians.

C. J. Thomas, a musician schooled and accomplished in Europe, arrived in 1861 and in addition to assuming leadership of Capt. Ballo's Band and the Theatre orchestra he commenced work with the Tabernacle choir. He evidently carried with him the ideals of English music development and demanded something approaching an equivalent from his musicians.

Professor Thomas was also appointed the leader of the Tabernacle choir which, until he took its charge, had been under Father James Smithies, as choir master. Indeed the Tabernacle choir had never risen above the musical status of an ordinary choir of a country church;

---

1 Cf. Appendix II. Whitney, "Music in Early Utah Days."
but under C. J. Thomas it soon became fairly metropolitan, and good anthem music was frequently performed on Sundays to the delight of the congregation, the majority of whom had come from the musical cities of Great Britain, who until Prof. Thomas took the leadership had seldom heard in the Salt Lake Tabernacle those fine English anthems with which they were familiar. In fine, the advent of C. J. Thomas marks an epoch in the musical history of the city; and he gave the first "grand vocal concerts" here, as benefits, and reaped a financial harvest.¹

A greater development of the choir came under the direction of George Careless who became conductor in 1865, succeeding Professor Thomas when the latter was called to St. George on a mission. He held the position for fourteen years during which time most commendable progress was made by the organization.

The position of Careless in Utah music is a most significant one in the training of class and private students, in the development of the theatre orchestra and the organization of musicians into the Handel and Haydn Society.² This organization produced the "Messiah" in 1875, the first time the oratorio was given between Chicago and San Francisco. The sum of receipts for the two performances was $2,150.50.

The choir under the baton of Evan Stephens yielded its most spectacular results at the World Fair Eisteddfod at Chicago in September of 1893. It won a second place in its competition and a high regard from musicians of the nation.

The personnel of the Tabernacle Choir conductors

¹Tullidge, History of Salt Lake City, pp. 771-72.
²Cf. Appendix VI for account of "Messiah" presented by this organization in 1875.

Evan Stephens

A delightful little posy extended to the Tabernacle choir by one Mr. Page of New York is included in the Deseret Weekly of June 4, 1892, Vol. XLIV, p. 782.

We have seen a number of very excellent notices in eastern papers of the visit of the Presbyterian ministers of this city and the services which they attended in the Tabernacle. They all speak in terms of praise of the music. We copy here as a sample the eulogy made by Reverend W. L. Page in the Rochester, N. Y. Democrat. After speaking of the kindness shown to the party by Pres. Woodruff and the Mormons generally and giving a glowing description of the city and the meeting he says:

"But right here let me do the Mormon music full justice. The second hymn sung by this most wonderful trained choir, a single choral tune of fine harmony, surpassed anything in the way of sacred music that I ever heard in my life. It paid me my journey across the continent and will linger in my memory till the hour I hope to go up to hear higher music and song."

Such an opinion, I insist, is criticism. It is an expression or judgment of final or ultimate music images. It is drawn from a gentleman's auditory reaction to the stimuli—sound combination and sequence. It is impressionistic in its nature. Every final criterion of judgment must include the impression or reaction of the critic. Just so every impression must be a compendium of reactions based consciously or unconsciously on theories of value. Such reasoning might serve to indicate that there are no so-called impressionistic critics; that they are merely the traditional
type of critic minus sufficient potency, intelligence, and logic to say that they (the impressionists) have reason. And even though the Reverend of New York had no other basis for judgment than a comparison of effects produced on him by other choirs, the Tabernacle Choir in his estimation was preeminent. A church choir is one art form and must be respected and criticised as such. Who then could more appropriately levy valuation on such a group than a Reverend gentleman. The severity of the music critic must modify itself for here he isn't judging complicated acquirements but the final suggestiveness of tone in a religious setting.

One of the most substantial evidences for the assumption stated in the Problem of the thesis, that we have had an unpublished criticism expressed through the growth and development of music, is contained in the determined letter to the Deseret Weekly by Evan Stephens in the New Year's issue in 1893. To read the article and reflect that in the course of that year he cultivated his choir to a state of efficiency which won recognition from world judges judging a world contest is to recognize the importance of this man in Utah music history.

The choir of the old Bowery days assumed new attributes. One was the prestige of having won the $1000 prize. But the significant point was that the world at large was told of a little church in a big country that had developed an art. The critical importance of the event is that such a turn of affairs was almost wholly due to a critic who was a trifle more severe than the complacent social group of which
he formed a part.

A more lucid characterization of the man may be found from contacting his own expressions than reading a descriptive analysis of him.

Our musical and mineral resources are under remarkably similar conditions at the present time. Rich beyond measure are we in each, so far as natural resources go; and while we have attained somewhat of a world reknown in both, their development is but in its infancy, and languishing for a better condition of things to dawn upon us. Our "Park," "Tintic" and other mineral districts are like our "Tabernacle Choir," "Choral Society," and other choral organizations—a fair index to the rich, undeveloped materials surrounding us. What is needed and what might be done to more fully develop our mineral resources and turn them into boundless wealth and financial prosperity to our growing community, I shall and will only take up the—more familiar to me—musical side of the question.

How may we develop our rich musical resources? What better conditions than we now enjoy are we capable of?

The first question I will try to answer. We must have more trained, intelligent leaders to direct the work of development. We have been "making shift" long enough. Musically talented young men and women (young men especially as they are generally called upon to take charge of choirs, etc.) should be given the time and the opportunities to fully master the principles underlying the successful guiding of musical growth in a community. We are perishing, musically for the need of such. The natural bright talents of many a young musician in Utah are being warped into mediocrity for the want of proper training, while the masses who show some devotion to the divine art are left in a still lower state of progress for the want of intelligent guiding. Do not understand me to mean to say that we are behind the world generally in these things, for we are quite abreast of it in some respects, that of choir singing especially. But in a comparative sense, when our possibilities are considered, I know of no people on the face of the earth who show more indifference to making the most of their possibilities than do we as a community. We have our schools where most other branches are well looked after, and a small sprin-
ling of music thrown in once or twice a week. In nearly every ward throughout our fair land one, two, or more young men are found who are passionately fond of music, and they generally get a smattering of how to read a little. This they manage in odd moments between hours of manual labor and the innumerable little duties to be attended to in the ward capacity (for such young men are generally very steady and useful). They then are called upon to direct the musical efforts of others, with their own but sadly developed, and too often the new charge releases them from none of the other duties, and they have less time than ever for self-improvement in the art which they are now to direct others in. Is the mastery of music so lightly and easily won, and its perfection of so trifling an importance that such should be the case in a community like ours? Solomon realized its importance in olden times sufficiently to "set apart" the musicians for the temple.

Now if these young men when their talent and devotion for music was proven by their own labors, instead of being pushed into a service they were unripe for, were taken (and if necessary helped financially by means of a couple of concerts thoroughly patronized) and released from other duties, then sent to some branch of a special training school organized for the purpose of thoroughly equipping students to teach and conduct music--kept there for two or three years as necessity required--they could then set to work to develop the musical talent of their native towns with as fair an opportunity of earning a livelihood as school teachers have. Let them take charge of the religious work of choir duties in return for aid given at the beginning. But let all other work such as class teaching, private lessons, etc., bring them a fair remuneration. And if there was not enough to do at first, the work on the farm would be at their disposal still, none the less because they were no master of music. Then we might look for real, intellectual, soulful advancement in our music.

What follows is a proposal and plan whereby choirs will be organized and conducted systematically under musical supervision.

In addition to these items we sadly need a musical journal devoted to our special needs, chiefly to furnish our various organizations with suitable music, to bring our composers' works to light and to aid in keeping our musicians alive by reading musical items of the day, giving encouraging and helpful hints in their labor, something to help in keeping us more closely ac-
quainted with each other and the musical world at large.

Compare our present musical condition with our possibilities under such a condition as this article suggests, and our present mammoth organization, the Tabernacle Choir with its four or five hundred voices becomes but a proper head to a gigantic chorus of trained singers that would lift us as a community into higher realms of art, refinement and religious fervor.

That such a day may dawn for Utah, and the little gusts of enthusiasm that vanish in so many Wards (and but seem to mock when a mighty purpose needs carrying out) may crystalize into deeds that will enable us to fully develop the talents which God has so abundantly bestowed upon us, is my Christmas and New Year's wish.¹

Concerning the World Fair Eisteddfod notes of critical interest on the Tabernacle Choir are found in the Deseret Weekly of that year.²

The great Eisteddfod choir competition was held on the World's Fair Grounds in Chicago yesterday and late last night the decision of the adjudications was given. According to this, the Salt Lake Tabernacle Choir carries off the second prize of $1000, having lost the first prize by only half a point--whatever that may mean--and Prof. Stephens will wear a gold medal as being the conductor of a winning organization.

Comments of individuals who heard the organization at the contest:

"You have a magnificent choir."--Caradog (leader of the Welsh choir who won the world's champion cup for choral singing in Crystal Palace, London.

"The finest rendition of 'Worthy is the Lamb' I ever listened to."--T. J. Davis, conductor of the winning ladies' chorus.


²Deseret Weekly, Vol. XLVI, September, 1893.
"Magnificent singing. So devoted a people who can sing so must be a good people."—Apmadoc, conductor of the Eisteddfod choirs, and secretary of the committee.

Mr. H. G. Whitney's impressions of the performance and the adjudication follow:

Regarding the contest, said Mr. Whitney, There was, of course, some disappointment among the singers in the first moment of hearing the decision, but this soon wore away, and I believe all the choir reached home as happy as though they had won the main prize. You see the trouble was, that the judges in summing up the merits and demerits of the various choruses, scored rather severely, the faults of which our competitors had been guilty, and left our faults unmentioned. This built up a rather confident hope that we were to be successful, so when the final words came that we were entitled to a second prize, the effect was at first rather stunning. But both Scranton choirs, reinforced as they were by the prize winners from across the water, sang beautifully. I assure you I had little hope even after hearing number one, which got no prize at all. But we sang "Worthy is the Lamb" in a way they could not touch. "Blessed Are the Men" I think was a tie; the Scrantons certainly sang it admirably, and if we came up to them, it was all we did do. On the last piece, and the most difficult one, "Now the Impetuous Torrents Rise," we outshone them all in tempo and conception—they all ran away with it as though it were a gallop. But they held to the key at the finish just a trifle better than we did.

Theatre Music

The Deseret Musical and Dramatic Co. originated in 1850. During the fall and winter of that year entertainments were given in the "Old Bowery." ²

² In 1852 this organization was changed to the Deseret Dramatic Association.
The orchestra used in the "Old Bowery" was selected from members of the Nauvoo Brass Band and was directed by the band-master, Captain William Pitt, who played violin and flute. Jacob F. Hutchinson played violin and clarinet; James Smithies, cello. Other members were David Smith and George Warde. Messrs. Kay, Burton, Clayton, and Whitney, when not taking part upon the stage, also assisted in the orchestra.

In 1850 an amusement house was opened at the Warm Springs for concerts and socials. The building was used almost exclusively for dancing. A number of printed invitations to concerts and socials are in the possession of the Daughters of the Utah Pioneers at the State Capitol, and one written in fine script is as follows:

G. S. L. City, Dec. 10/51

The company of Mr. Kinsey and Lady is respectfully solicited to attend a grand Military Ball, given by Professor Ballo at the Bath House, on Friday the 12th Decr. 1851, at 4 o'clock P. M.

Ball Managers (William Staines
(Doctor Andrews
N. B. Admittance for Gentleman and Lady Three Dollars.

SCHEME

Professor Ballo's Military Band will be in attendance and will open the Ball with
Governor Young's Grand March....By D. Ballo
President Kimball's Grand March.. do
President Richards' Grand March.. do
Governor Young's Grand Quickstep do

DURING THE REPAST

Grand March from the opera of Tancred and the Love Not.................Arranged by D. Ballo
I Should Like to Marry.... do
Life on the Ocean's Wave.. do
Desert Waltz.............. do

&c., &c.

1Pyper, Romance of the Old Playhouse, p. 42.
The Social Hall was dedicated Saturday January 1, 1853. Its orchestra was directed by the former West Point bandmaster and Milan Conservatory graduate, Dominico Ballo.

Among the features lending atmosphere and contributing in a large degree to the amazing success of the early performances presented in the Salt Lake Theatre, was the orchestra. Indeed, it was second only to the play and the players, for in those days the people listened attentively to the music and applauded the renditions, if meritorious. The orchestra was not a mere background for the chatter and gossip of the audience, to which place it seems now relegated, but was a necessary and highly appreciated part of the evening's entertainment.

At the opening of the theatre there was an efficient orchestra of twenty men assembled under the direction of Prof. Charles J. Thomas, a musician of marked ability.

Here is the personnel of the first Salt Lake Theatre orchestra: First violins, Major William Pitt and David Evans; second violins, William Clayton, Stephen Alley and Ebenezer Beasley; violos, John Toone and George D. Watt; violoncellos, Joshua H. Midgley and James Smithies; contrabass, David O. Calder; flutes, Horace K. Whitney and a Mr. Mines; clarionets, Henry Sadler and Stephen Hale; cornet, Mark Croxall; French horns, Charles Evans and ophicleide, John Wakeham; director, Charles J. Thomas.

Professor Thomas conducted his unpaid musicians for a little more than two years, when he was called by the Mormon Church authorities on a mission to St. George, Southern Utah. Although an unpaid leader, he laid down his baton with regret and to the disappointment of the theatre-goers. 1

These early theatre orchestra leaders, it may be very appropriately mentioned, composed and arranged much of their own music to fit the dramatic settings of plays.

Under Prof. Careless the orchestra was reduced to seven

1Pyper, History of an Old Playhouse.
musicians to whom was given pay for their services. The previous orchestra had not maintained the standard of music at a level which the critical Careless demanded. Mr. Pyper relates some interesting stories of his musicians' adaptations to hurried calls for music accompaniments.¹ It might be noted that Mr. Careless was proficient enough as a composer, arranger, and improviser to meet these emergencies.

In 1865 Professor took the leadership of the Salt Lake Theatre orchestra, which he held five or six years, during which time he produced a number of musical plays, including "Macbeth," "The Brigands," and "Aladdin." For the latter he composed the entire music, (for over forty numbers), comprising solos, duets, choruses and dramatic music, Professor Tullidge copying the parts. For several years many of the melodies were sung around the streets. He also composed the music for "Cinderalla;" and did all the composing and arranging work for the orchestra to the close of his leadership. It was during this engagement he conducted the first opera given in Utah--"The Grand Duchess"--with the Howson troupe, and an act from "Der Freischutz," and several operettas.

Other leaders who have maintained the high standard of the Salt Lake Theatre orchestra are E. Beesley, Willard Weihe, Arthur Shepherd, Fren Midgley, Squire Coop and the present efficient conductor and talented violinist Arthur Freber. Wm. C. Clive, another well known Salt Lake musician, who has played first violinist for a number of years, was the first native Utah composer to write an overture, "The Golden Crest," which was played in the Salt Lake Theatre.²

A critical estimate of the status the Theatre orchestra had attained to by 1869 is contained in a supplementary paragraph to an article on Congregational singing

¹ Cf. Appendix II.

² Pyper, History of an Old Playhouse.
published in the Utah Magazine, of which the musician John Tullidge was a member. The orchestra had been conducted for four years by George Careless. It might be observed that the critical nature of this man found its expression through an advancement in musicianship of this organization as well as that of the Tabernacle Choir.

In this (orchestral) branch of the Art Utah has reached a higher excellence than in the vocal department. The orchestra of our theatre, for instance, has at times compared with the very best metropolitan orchestras, though at present its members are not so numerous as they once were. They are, however, very efficient, and often "discourse most eloquent music" indeed, the band performance is sometimes the best of the evening's entertainment. Professor George Careless is the leader. He has held that position for four years with credit to himself and satisfaction to the public.
CHAPTER V

CRITICAL DISSENSION

The critic of manuscript will adjudge a work on its relationship or similarity to various mathematical combinations of music symbols arranged by past artists. The symbols as they are (are symbols and nothing more.) When interpreted they become musical art, jazz, or noise. The critic now will pass judgment upon the composer by drawing from his memory of past experiences witnessed from auditory images which were stimulated by tone combinations of artists. If the critic takes inventory of form, variety, suggestions, anticipations, developments, simplicity, rhythmic, harmonic, and structural bases of music, imagery stimuli, and ultimate delight he has justification for assuming the prerogative to label good or bad.

The interpreter perhaps has not translated correctly; he has expressed his own neural organism's reaction to the printed symbols; he is a "rotten performer" or a "grand artist" depending. The performer presents his reactions and experiences as he witnesses them consequent to contacting the hro-glyphics on the music score. The symbols are only a partial representation of the composer's experience. The interpretation will be a quantitative thing depending on whether the performer is greater or less intellectually, imaginatively and emo
tionally than the writer of the music score.

Ultimately the composition is either good or bad (permitting intermediate degrees) according to the analytic capacity and disposition of the critic. Factors influencing his judgment are multitudinous, some tangible and commanding support, others are impressionistic and undefinable. The confines of aesthetics are not facile or definite.

The robust will make an exceedingly fine ditch digger but a poor life companion, a slightly incompacitated musician, and a somewhat less than satisfactory critic. He is not an individual. He is a form, a cast, and will measure and judge by using only intricately precise criteria for judgment.

The artist need not question the need of science to his art. The scientific aspects of music should be cared for by individuals of that department. Why should the music artist fear the invectives of the robust? It is seldom the metrical exactness of tone delineation that gives music its fascination. The oddities, the deviations, the little eccentricities break the monotony of routine for the artistically active mind. Only an iron man should be expected to give an exactly proportioned expression of an experience. The artist is at liberty to choose from the mass of possibilities that which appeals to him. The musician will most frequently work to an advantage by making his choice a varied selection. The scientist realizes his duty by being exact—scientifically precise; he must adhere rigidly to his can-
ons. The artist smiles complaisantly, fains indignation at a constraint, and commences to mould available material into the expression of his own warped personality. The result if recorded by an informed, discriminating, and intelligent creator will be art. It is good.

A contrast of reporter opinions of the four dailies and Goodwin's Weekly of Salt Lake City is well expressed in the following accounts which are replete with information relative to public sentiments concerning criticism. By exposing these accounts I do not mean to insinuate that three newspaper reviewers were wrong or that the Herald critic was right. But, even if every postulate that the Herald makes is wrong (a thing one can not wholly prove or disprove), the article would undoubtedly have made the performing organization conscious that they played to other than Morpheus bound self-praisers.

Evidence that the Herald did not revel in its accomplishment and that it had made a mistake, as felt by public opinion, is strongly intimated by the expression of Goodwin's Weekly and the failure of the Herald to repeat such attack in following issues of the paper.
The first symphony concert of the season was a personal triumph for Spencer Clawson, Jr., the pianist, and a decided disappointment so far as the work of the orchestra was concerned. The orchestra showed plainly the result of the change of directors, and its attack was marked by an uncertainty that was most noticeable. Mr. McClellan has evidently not gotten thoroughly in touch with the musicians under his direction, and failed signally to achieve the desired effects on the dramatic climaxes of the selections on the program. A program of a symphony orchestra is supposed to be an education in musical matters, yet to placate the untutored element, "The Rosary," which violated every principle of harmony, was placed on the program, and was very badly played. It secured one beneficial effect. The encore which it received was responded to with a Spanish dance which was played with appreciation, fervor and feeling by the orchestra, and was by all odds the best selection of the program.

Clawson's number, Beethoven's concerto, opus 73, was the real feature of the program. In spite of the fact that the orchestra exhibited a timidity of attack which might well have disconcerted any musician, Clawson's rendition was marred by adequate technique, delightful phrasing and a delicacy of touch and feeling which made his performance stand out in decided contrast to the rest of the program. After the unfeeling interludes of the orchestra, his playing fell upon the ear like a needle bath. Every note was as clear, pure and serene as a drop of cold water upon the parched tongue, and he played with a lack of mannerism that was delightful.

The program opened with Mendelssohn's Italian symphony. The legato and scherzo passages were delightfully rendered, but it was evident that Mr. McClellan, in spite of his personal efforts, could not lift the orchestra into the intensity of the dramatic passages, and the anti-climaxes were most marked.

The Lohengrin prelude was also marked by a lack of decision and an uncertainty which suffered especially in view of the lack of strength among the reeds and brasses.

The Beethoven concerto for piano and orchestra was undoubtedly the best number on the program. Encouraged by the decision and perfect technique of Clawson's playing, the orchestra exerted itself to its best efforts, and the number was thoroughly enjoyable.
The concerto was followed by the selection from Puccini's "Madam Butterfly." What might have been an otherwise perfect but unsympathetic rendition of the selection was marred by a 'blue note' hurled at the audience by the cellos. The pizzicato movement was badly handled and the climax never arose above the first floor.

The next selection was Schumann's 'Traumerei.' It was played with a phrasing which caused acute discomfort among the musicians present. Even the conventional interpretation was overlooked, and while the selection was played with the precision of a pianola, it was also played with an absolute lack of feeling. It would be impossible for anyone who heard the number to imagine Concert Master George Skelton playing the 'Traumerei' in such a manner as a solo.

The orchestra then chewed off a portion of 'The Rosary,' and flung it at the audience. It was badly played, but secured the first encore of the program.

The final number of the program, the march from 'Tannhauser,' was played in a tempo which would make the fat chors of the Metropolitan opera house imagine they were engaged in a Marathon race. The intention of Herr Wagner when he wrote the selection was that it should be sung. In the time in which it was played it would be impossible for any human vocalist to sing it.

A large and frigid audience listened to the program.
THE CONCERT

With the exception of the representatives of a local paper whose attack on the work of the Symphony Orchestra was both unwarranted and unreasonable, those who heard the music at the Colonial Theatre on Sunday afternoon were delighted with the rendition of the different numbers under the leadership of Professor J. J. McClellan, and the new arrangement proved so successful that it is earnestly hoped that the orchestra may be heard more often this winter than during preceding seasons.

There is little question that the musical ear in front, especially when the earl is prejudiced, can detect some trivial faults, but that is scarcely an excuse for an attack on those musicians who are giving Salt Lake music lovers more for their money than they have ever received from a local musical organization, and that for the slightest recompense. Even if the efforts of the splendid orchestra were not up to their present standard, it would not be sufficient reason for disparagement, but with their work so near perfection as it is, there can be no excuse for not lending all possible encouragement to the men and women who are devoting their time and talents to the task. It is true that the orchestra showed plainly the result of the change of directors for there was none of that cold, unsympathetic and seeming distant feeling between the leader and the men as heretofore, but on the contrary a warmth that was reflected in the effort of every single musician and which found its echo in the attitude of an appreciative audience.

Adding very materially to the pleasure of those present, was the work of Spencer Clawson, Jr., who is a pianist of rare ability. The ease and expression in his interpretations of the most difficult selections with which he was wont to delight his friends before studying abroad, have been but accentuated by the experience, until he has come dangerously close to perfection. One of the most notable numbers of the excellent program was the Beethoven Concerto, which, with the orchestra, he executed with rare skill.

Among the selections played by the orchestra that from Puccini's "Madam Butterfly" was perhaps the most enjoyable, but in the prelude to "Lohengrin," Bertholdy's "Italian" Symphony and Schumann's "Traumerei" their work was of finished excellence.

Sunday afternoon seems to meet with popular approval and with the Colonial Theatre at the disposal of the management, the struggle of those who love art for art's sake would seem to be over, so far as any financial difficulties are concerned. 1

1
SYMPHONY CONCERT DELIGHTS AUDIENCE AT NEW COLONIAL

The colonial theatre was filled yesterday afternoon with an enthusiastic audience to hear the twelfth concert of the Symphony orchestra. The program was well chosen and the heavy classical numbers were so interspersed with lighter classical numbers that the program failed to grow tiresome toward the end of the hour and a half taken up by the rendition of the numbers.

It was the first concert by the orchestra which I have been so fortunate as to hear, so I cannot possibly draw a comparison between the directorship of Prof. J. Arthur Shephard and that of Prof. J. J. McClellan, but I realize, as I believe the whole audience did, that this orchestra is doing very fine consonant ensemble work under the directorship of Professor McClellan and that the musicians as a whole follow his baton with precision and perfect faith in his knowledge and technique.

Spencer Clawson, Jr., the piano soloist, touches the piano with a faultless precision and displays fine technique and one of the features of the concert was his playing of Beethoven's "Concerto" for piano and orchestra, and the audience was so enthusiastic that he responded to the applause with "Valse Opus 34," by the Russian composer, Sapelinikioss a new composition, odd and very attractive.

The opening number was Felix Mendelssohn Barthology's fourth movement from "Italian" symphony No. 4 Opus 90 Salterello (presto). It was played with precision and delicate shading of tone and a certain quality of sympatheque.

In spite of the advertised request that all should be in their seats before the opening number, quite half the audience was ushered to their seats at the close of the rendition of the first number.

The prelude to "Lohe grin," by Richard Wagner, was rendered exceedingly well.

The difficult music of "Madame Butterfly" was not so well played as some of the other numbers, but certainly could not be called "poorly rendered."

"The Rosary," so well known and loved, was beaufitul given, as was also the "Traumerei," by Schumann. One critic says the interpretation of this number differed decidedly and the inference is, presumptuously, from the usual one. I should like to know how. This has been my favorite composition for
a good many years and I have heard great soloists from all countries play the composition, and I did not detect more of a difference than any individual musician will lend to an interpretation, and it is this individuality which lifts music above the commonplace. Criticism or comment, I consider, should be made in a spirit of helpfulness and absolute impartiality; is it not so? Emerson says, "It is difficult to get beyond your public; if they are satisfied with cheap performance you will hardly arrive at better." Perfection in any line is rarely reached and those who stand at the top of the ladder musically could be criticised if we were desiring to harp. For instances, the great Elam sometimes in singing, accents a word on the last syllable; but she does it for some musical reason, taking the latitude of interpretation given a great singer. I consider the Symphony orchestra, with its director, an organization of which Salt Lake may be very justly proud and as the present predicts the future, each successive concert given, and there are to be several during the season, with their conscientious rehearsals, will approximate as fine a rendering of their chosen programs as any body of such musicians, east or west. Perhaps the best number on yesterday's program was the last, the march from "Tannhauser" by Wagner.¹

¹Telegram, November 30, 1909. (Salt Lake City)
SPLENDID CONCERT AT THE COLONIAL

Eighteen hundred Salt Lakers turned out Sunday afternoon and filled the Colonial theatre and heard a most delightful concert by the Salt Lake symphony orchestra. It was the twelfth concert given by this orchestra and one of the best ever given by the organization.

The programme was an admirably arranged one. It was a delightful programme—there was variety enough in it to win the approval of all in the big audience and the several numbers were rendered most charmingly.

It was the first appearance of Spencer Clawson, Jr., who was the soloist, since his return from Berlin, and that he will be a favorite with Salt Lake music lovers is demonstrated by the manner in which this talented young man captured the audience. In response to the encore, after he had rendered the third number on the programme, he played in a most charming manner, "Valse" by the Russian composer, Sapel

The occasion was the first that Professor McClellan has appeared as the director of the orchestra since he succeeded Professor Shepherd. That he has the orchestra with him in every way was demonstrated by the almost perfect ensemble.

Heretofore the orchestra has given four concerts during a season; that is, one about every six weeks. It is the intention in the future to give, if possible, a concert once every month, and it is believed that the Salt Lake music lover will support the orchestra in this new move.1

1Salt Lake Tribune, Monday Morning, November 20, 1908.
THE SYMPHONY CONCERT

The twelfth concert of the Salt Lake Symphony orchestra, and the first under the new director, Prof. McClellan, was given yesterday afternoon at the Colonial Theatre. The event was viewed as considerable of an experiment for several reasons: First, it was the first time that a Sunday afternoon concert had been tried in the city; second, many of the friends of the organization had deplored the necessity of any Sunday performance whatever; third, the concert was announced for a house given over to the popular grade of attractions; and fourth, the new conductor was to stand comparison with his gifted predecessor, Mr. Shepherd, in the handling of his men and the make-up of his program.

The verdict rendered at the close was an enthusiastic one. The turn-out was one of the largest and most brilliant to which the orchestra ever played, and the expressions of gratification were general and genuine. Mr. McClellan raised his baton over 62 musicians, most of them trained men, but quite a number of advanced students. The usual effect of so many ladies in the string sections was especially pleasing. All continue to show decided advancement, and Prof. McClellan is entitled to credit for having trained them especially in precision and attack; the work of the strings was thoroughly noticeable in this regard. He held his players under good control throughout, and they worked with care and taste, and in general with excellent effect. The audience, too showed that it appreciated the popularizing of the program, and the applause accorded "The Rosary" was among the strongest of the afternoon. Indeed it was something of a disappointment not to have it given again. Another feature which was greatly appreciated was the length of the entertainment, which lasted just an hour and a half, and sent the audience away wishing for more instead of wearied with what it had had.

1 Deseret News, Monday, November 30, 1908. (Salt Lake City)
CHAPTER VI

AESTHETIC APPRAISALS

Everything holds a charm for someone. Some individual will find aesthetic delight, beauty, and satisfaction in the most uncouth and hideous of conceptions. And, each person is intentionally or unwittingly subjective in his reaction, appraisal, and enjoyment of conceptions. Were he totally objective it would be omnipotent intelligence balancing, weighing, and classifying in order to act with scrupulous mathematical precision regardless of the nature of the subject being judged. The final criterion of all aesthetic criticism must of necessity be the individual's reaction realized through his mental and emotional processes. His reaction will be governed by classified results from analysis of the circumstances plus the influencing factors of mental sets and prejudices he has aggregated through past experience.

Critics of aesthetic values cannot measure by inches or pounds, yet they respect standards of evaluation. The critic's mind analyzes and discriminates in concordance with the knowledge it contains. The emotions respond in recognition of experiences they have previously felt with pleasure as well as anticipation and realization of new agreeable situations. The critic attempts to maintain austere impar-
trality, a fatal fallacy. His former contacts and associations necessarily make him partial to what he has heard or the unspoken ideal he should like to hear. His physical state of health necessarily becomes a major governing factor. He is only "a part of all that he has met," responding to his new situations with nothing more than the barren resource of past experience from which to draw.

"The aesthetic analysis of complete musical works of art, and the comprehension of the reasons of their beauty, encounter apparently invincible obstacles at almost every step."

--Helmholtz

Miscellaneous Compliments

The following entities, which in themselves as being critical reveal very little of music criticism in the state, do give evidence that Utah's music has been observed and commented on from within and without. A consciousness of attention being paid a singer generally makes him sing the louder.

Reading from the Evening Star, Washington, D. C., entitled "Beautiful Salt Lake City" we find:

"Did you know that Salt Lake City is one of the most beautiful places in the whole world? After luncheon we went to service in the Tabernacle. On each side of the organ are tiers and tiers of seats for the choir. We got good seats right in the middle aisle and watched the congregation come in. Then the organ struck up, and we stared at each other in wonder, for it is the most beautiful I ever heard, and was most admirably played. The "vox humana" stop was too much for me, and I actually wept; it was so exquisitely pathetic and sweet."

"A leader stepped to the front and lifted his baton, and the choir of 300 rose like one man and burst into such a magnificent volume of music as I have seldom heard. It was grand. The roof acts as a sounding board and we could hear the words, and were perfectly carried away by the wonder of it. I never saw such training, for they sang like one voice. After the sermon the choir sang a glorious anthem, which I would give anything to hear again, and at the end of it the leader turned so as to face the congregation, and the organist struck up "Old Hundredth," and that vast throng of people sang the dear old tune. It was tremendously impressive. Then there was a benediction and the service was over."

The charmed listener in this case was Nannie Belle Maury, daughter of the assistant attorney-general at Washington and special correspondent of the Star.

A traveling correspondent of the national newspaper of the Welsh in America, The Mirror, devotes nearly two columns to our Tabernacle, its great choir and a biographical sketch of its conductor, Brother E. Ste-
phens. Among other commendatory things he says:

"Back of the pulpit is one of the largest organs in the world, also a great choir numbering 350 voices conducted by a Welshman by the name of Evan Stephens, and I can assure you they sing well."

"It is to be hoped they will enter the world's grand musical contest Eisteddfod, at Chicago, in 1893."

Then follows nearly a column giving a sketch of the life and musical progress, names of compositions and mammoth musical entertainments given by Mr. Stephens; ending with:

"Thus you perceive that I am not taking the columns of the Mirror to display an ordinary character, but one of the most successful and talented musicians on the continent of America. When Gilmore visited Salt Lake City lately, Stephens furnished him a chorus of 500 adults and 1000 juvenile voices to take part in his concerts. He has since organized a large choral society, and his Tabernacle Choir is doubtless the largest and best church choir in the world. In the face of all this, possibly some of my musical readers will smile incredulously and ask in derision: "who speaketh thus?" "Can it be that true genius could take root and bloom in the Zion of the Mormons, between the barren rocks of far away Utah?" To all such I say, Come and see, without lens of prejudice blinding your eyes."

Our Music Status in 1895 and 1900

There is an incessant existence of discontent concerning the decadence of immediate circumstances which results in a pitiable reverting to a glittering past. Evidence of such in relationship to music was sounded in the Daily Tribune of January 6, 1895 and again in the Deseret News of December 13, 1900. Neither of the articles are signed. The essence of their theme is a requisition for a renovated music culture. Too significant consideration might not be attributed to such an inventory if one reflects that the same choir leader of their day whipped his organization into a second place accomplishment with world competition in 1893. Nevertheless these accidental publications of dissatisfied music enthusiasts give expression to that, which if one is lenient with terminology, might be labeled criticism.

Present Situation (the final paragraph of a brief history of Utah Music, printed in 1895)

In closing the imperfect glance at the musical situation both past and present in Utah, it is but just to call attention to the sad lack which exists to-day of a comprehensive organization of important works. Why is it that with all the rich material from the conductor's wand to the piano, to the organ, to the orchestra chairs, and on to the member's seats which lie scattered about this city in wasteful profusion, we seem to be dissolved from possessing a first-class musical society? An apathy has taken paralyzing hold of the energies of the musicians, and it is well-nigh a shame. The Choral Society ought never to have collapsed. Evan Stephen could not in the nature of things maintain its conduction, but others here are fully competent of, if unwilling, then talent from the
thronging East could have been commanded. There was more generous enthusiasm on the subject of broad musical study in this city sixteen years ago than there is to-day. What is the matter? Is it the new City and County Building which is draining all the resources of our praising spirits? Has our fresh zeal become sealed up in the San Pete ballot boxes and been counted on the wrong side of things by the Utah Commission? What has politics to do with music? Harmonious ideals are quite apart from all that. Who will start the enterprise for an old fashioned singing school where one can study "Messiah" and other works of God's experts without any reference to politics, religion or the Colorado Utes?

Our Musical Status, 1900

It is not with a heart exactly bounding with joy, or a pencil sharpened with delight, that I chronicle the true status of things musical in our community at the end of the nineteenth century. True, if merely glancing at the progress made during the past fifty years (or even fifteen years) the bird's eye view would be such as to gladden the heart of any one whose whole ambition had lain in the musical welfare of a community, as I think mine has, and does, in ours. But speaking of the conditions at the present time without reference to the long past, he must humbly confess that to-day, and for two or three years back, it is and has been the day of the low ebb of adversity—the dark hour (let us hope), before another dawn—a reawakening to our great musical mission and possibilities.

Tabernacle Choir

To begin at the top, our one and only GREAT musical organization in numbers, in aims and character of work—the wholesome, serious, most elevating kind of music. It is in a comparative sense (notwithstanding it is yet a magnificent organization of over 300 capable, fairly faithful members), a neglected, wilted, plant, bearing its precious flowers with difficulty; the more or less faithful servant of a more or less united twenty-four wards. For the permanent welfare of each, the ward and Tabernacle choirs ought to be so closely allied that like a tree and its branches, the one is simply a part of the other.

1Daily Tribune (Salt Lake City), January 6, 1895.
Other Organizations

As might be expected when the "head" is not at its best, neither are the lesser members.

Our Harmony Club is no more. Our Orpheus Club is almost silent. We have no choral organization of any sort; comic opera is even napping; those seriously inclined in music will, perhaps, not regret it, as musically, anything that places the clown or the buffoon on a higher plane than the singer, is not the ideal of musical progress. Indeed, charming as it is for a trifling pastime, it is a very serious misleader in the musical advancement of a young community, just as the vaudeville or the burlesque is in the dramatic line. It is almost impossible for an individual, much less a community, to be true, ardent admirer of Hoyt and Shakespeare or Herbert and Wagner at the same time. So I congratulate sincerely the admirers of Daniels and Neilson, and their "operas" (?), on having escaped "Lohengrin;" such a somersault would have broken their necks—whatever it might have done to their purse strings.

Educational

We are—notwithstanding great general progress as the years go by—not in the most wide awake condition possible in a musical way, educationally speaking. More attention by far is given in our advanced schools to furnishing a musical entertainment now and then, especially at the end of the year, than to plant the seeds of elementary future musical growth and knowledge in the minds of the students. This eternal servitude of Music as an "Entertainer"—just because she happens to be a good one—is not only the curse, destroying her own advancement, but is making her a general nuisance.
Eisteddfod Adjudications

In October of 1895 an Eisteddfod was held in Salt Lake City between musicians of that city and of Denver. It was an attempt to establish an annual Eisteddfod comparable to that of the Welsh custom. Contests were conducted in choruses for both sexes, ladies' quartets, church choirs, and composition fields. The adjudications were compiled and published in the October 12 issue of the Deseret News. These critical analyses are interesting as an indication that there were men available who could have criticised quite efficiently and regularly had they been given incentive and opportunity. The adjudicators quoted are "Messrs. Evans, Watkins and Davis." Weaknesses are revealed without the friendly niceties or stock phrases of the newspaper reviews. It is another exhilarating example of that in which the state so badly feels a poverty. As concerns music interest shown by the public of that time one can glean a little knowledge from the article of the Deseret News which follows the final program of the concert on Saturday 5.

The article is published Monday October 7.

THE EISTEDDFOD IS ENDED

Big concert in the Tabernacle on Saturday Evening. Thirty-five thousand people have attended the greatest musical festival ever held in the West.

"Cymru am Bytt!"

The Eisteddfod is a thing of the past as a fact, but as a pleasant memory it will always be pres-
ent. On Saturday evening the grand finale was reached in the concert at the Tabernacle. The great building received a vast audience estimated at twelve thousand souls and interest was at its highest point—not on account of the natural liking in human beings to see a struggle for supremacy but having seen "the best man win," the audience of Saturday night felt a satisfaction in the anticipation of seeing and hearing the best efforts of the victors.

In spite of the big parade and its thousands of spectators the Tabernacle was early filled with lovers of music, who had been witnesses of the largest Eisteddfod ever held in America with the exception of the one at the World's Fair.

This Territory can claim the distinction of having inaugurated in the West the old Welsh custom of holding an annual Eisteddfod, and when the next one is held a year from now in Denver the great affair which has just ended will be an example well worthy of imitation by our Colorado friends; and no doubt the object of their efforts will be to excel, if possible, the results achieved by Utah's Cambrians and their associates.¹

¹ Cf. Appendix V for the complete adjudication of this concert.
Arthur Shepherd

A prize composition won in 1906 by Arthur Shepherd\(^1\) was criticised by Eastern critics. The objections they raised were, let us assume, justified. Mr. Shepherd's compositional technique was still young even though sufficiently artistically finished to attract a set of Eastern judges. The critics were most probably idealists and compared his work quite relentlessly with that of the mature masters. His friends' rationalization is one of those choice and revealing expressions on which our community dotes. "His closest friends think that the unfavorable tone of the critics is due to Mr. Shepherd's having written over their heads." His friends thus justify Mr. Shepherd and their community for him and all is at ease with the world again.

The following concerning the criticisms of the composition is taken from the Deseret News of March 24, 1906.

Shepherd's Prize Work Does Not Please New York Critics

Arthur Shepherd is at present revelling in the somewhat rare---to him---sensation of being grilled by the New York critics. After having enjoyed the distinction of seeing his composition win in the Paderewski competition, and pocketing the $500 prize awarded by the judges, he had the further pleasure of hearing Damrosch's orchestra rehearse his work, and of seeing it placed on the program for the Russian Symphony orchestra's concert

---

\(^1\) Now conductor of the Cleveland Philharmonic Orchestra, nationally recognized, and undoubtedly Utah's most accomplished composer in the larger forms.
given in Carnegie Hall March 10. All this evidenced that the composition was something out of the ordinary, but what that something was, the long-haired gentry apparently have not been able to discover. The "News" has furnished the following summary of press opinions by Mr. Shepherd himself, who laughingly says he doesn't in the least mind an occasional "roast." As for the opinions, he says some of them are true and some of them are not. His closest musical friends here think that the unfavorable tone of some of the critics is due to Mr. Shepherd's having written over their heads, a habit, it must be said, to which he is no stranger.

Following are the press excerpts as far as they have been garnered by Mr. Shepherd:

"The 'Overture Joyeuse,' by Arthur Shepherd, that gained the Paderewski prize last year, begins well, with a swinging and expansive phrase brilliantly proclaimed by the orchestra, but the composer is not well able to sustain his music at this level, and he lapses into laborious and inconsequential treatment of his material, and continues it to too great length."


"The final piece was the 'Overture Joyeuse' of Arthur Shepherd, which won the Paderewski prize a few months ago. There is no original message in this, but the orchestra is, on the whole, cleverly handled. Mr. Shepherd is a native of Idaho and a resident of Salt Lake City. The 'Joyousness' of his overture suggests the animal spirits of the Utah aboriginals."

--Evening Post.

"The much discussed 'Overture Joyeuse' of Arthur Shepherd proved to be more ambitious than successful. Why a composition by an American living at Salt Lake City should bear a French title was not explained."

--The Globe.

"Young Mr. Shepherd's overture, which came last on the program, impressed one as music that needed filtering, if one may be allowed the term—it was a musical stream a bit clouded, muddy, not so much probably from lack of clear ideas on the composer's part as lack of technical skill in expressing his ideas orchestrally."

--Tribune.

"The overture was exactly the opposite of what its title promised. The fact that this meager piece, which is not even skillfully orchestrated, could win the first prize in the Paderewski contest is a sad reflection on the musical productiveness of the country."

--The Stants Zeitung.
"Mr. Shepherd's overture, which closed the program, lacked somewhat in clarity of expression, due, evidently to the composer's conceptions. In contrast to this number, the 'Indian Suite' by MacDowell, stood out as the work of one who knows and can control his medium and is at the same time master of his style."

--Musical American.

The New York Musical Courtier, which has never shown any friendship for Mr. Shepherd, and which in the present instance shows less than ever (it will be remembered that the person who tried to hoax the judges in the competition with a work stolen from Berlioz, was an employee of that paper), has the following account:

"In the case of young Arthur Shepherd, criticism from us were in bad taste, as certain veiled accusations were made against the Musical Courier when Shepherd's Overture Joyeuse was given the Paderewski prize last autumn over Berlioz's Corsair Overture, supposed to have been submitted by John Rice, Jr., circulation manager of the Musical Courier. However, although Berlioz was not present last Saturday, Mr. Rice was, and we asked him for his unbiased opinion of the Shepherd work. Mr. Rice's signed criticism (he is not a musician, be it explained) reads as follows:

'Why the judges of the Paderewski prize contest would award the first prize to the composer of the Overture Joyeuse as the best musical (?) composition is more than I can conceive. The composition sounded to me like a King's Royal band on the right side of the hall, the Roosevelt's Hot Time in the Old Town band on the left, and the Salvation Army band in the rear. The entire composition sounded unmusical to me. Perhaps this is real music; I don't know. If the judges say so it must be so. I am now convinced that if Berlioz could not write better music than that of the Overture Joyeuse, then he lived in vain, and chose the wrong vocation.'"

(signed) John Rice, Jr.

Local criticism of his prize overture was not made, nor, so far as I can detect, were criticisms made of other of his compositional efforts. The above criticism concerning the title appended to his work may well deserve the reaction given if one is justified in taking offence to his using a hybred title of French and English.
John Morgan

In the category of reviews the convincing sincerity and overt evidence of a music background in an article by one John Morgan "the veteran Welsh Eisteddfod singer of Garfield" is most attractive. He comments on the capabilities of the Ukrainian chorus by using as a criterion the comparative accomplishments of the Welsh. He also includes his estimate of Salt Lake City choral development signifying the lack of music knowledge in the person of one Anent R. J. J., who in the previous week's issue of the paper expressed the peoples' weariness of Handel's "Messiah" consequent to knowing it too well. The first article also included a suggested list of oratorios the local musicians should try. Mr. Morgan expostulates concerning the suggested list and the local people's excess familiarity with the oratorio.¹

It is questionable if the local oratorio society is even well acquainted with the "Messiah" as the performances all along have been very incomplete, thereby losing the continuity of their work. At home in Wales, or in England, when one goes to hear this work, he goes prepared for a performance lasting anywhere from three to three and one-half hours as only a few minor items are omitted; consequently eighteen or twenty of its choruses will be sung. Here, the average is seven or eight at most, thus omitting nearly two-thirds of the work and as the same choruses are practically repeated at each performance it means that even so well known and oft sung theme as the "Messiah" is more or less a sealed book to the majority of the members of the local oratorio society. One of its most exacting and dramatic choruses is, "He Trusted in God," yet I have never heard of this being sung during the last ten performances and competent critics pass judgment on interpretation the choir gives of this

¹Deseret News (Salt Lake City), Saturday, January 12, 1924.
fairly difficult chorus; yes, some go so far as to aver that to omit this chorus is akin to going to witness a performance of Hamlet with the melancholy Dane left out.

During the last few years so far as Salt Lake City is concerned we have had a continuous performance of the same themes, one eternal "merry-go-round" of the "Messiah" "Elijah" and "Creation" without ever venturing any further into the wide field of oratorios. Such a state of things is no wise creditable to a city of the size and also of the musical pretension of Salt Lake. What of even the familiar ones, such as Mendelssohn's "St. Paul," "Hymn of Praise," and "42nd Psalm," Handel's "Israel in Egypt," "saul," "Samson," "Jeptha," etc. Mozarts's "Requiem Mass," Spohr's "Last Judgment," Gounod's "Faust" and "Redemption," Rossinini's "Stabat Mater," let alone that fine quartet of modern works by Elgar, "Dream of Gerontius," "Apostles," "King Olaf."

Why we have not as yet commenced to even scratch the surface let alone delve deep in the field of oratorio. And the greatest of them all, the might orb, hovering around whom such men as Mozart, Handel, Beethoven, Mendelssohn, Haydn, etc. are satellites, in the immortal J. S. Bach; and a city with the musical pretensions of Salt Lake ought to possess a chorus able to present his incomparable "Mass in B Minor." All choir trainers of experience and musicians are in one accord in acclaiming this as the world's masterpiece in oratorio. Then there is the "St. Matthew Passion" by the same author. This is a shade less difficult than the B Minor Mass. If the local oratorio society cannot take up St. Matthew's Passion, then let the Tabernacle choir, under Professor A. C. Lund take up the study of this work, so that it could be performed either during the fall conference of 1924 or spring conference of 1925. There are some very fine double choruses in this work. These latter are in the nature of glorified hymn tunes, where the immortal Bach has taken hold of some old German melodies and clothed them with divinely glorious harmony.

In reality, one expects better performances in a city where a permanent choir of 200 voices is at the immediate call of an experienced choral conductor.

Such a note by an informed gentleman does not substantiate any conclusions as to a need or value of critical thought. The revealing factor is that an individual detected an incongruity in the social complex; that a critical reaction was felt and expressed.
In the review of the Ukrainian chorus the same agreeable element of sincerity is felt—a recording of his emotional experience realized through contact with the music of the concert. His account is mostly free from the conventional nauseating terminology employed by the reviewer. The review is good as criticism since it contains a supposedly qualified and intelligent individual's impression of an emotional auditory experience—which must be a final criterion to the appraisal of tonal art.

The Ukrainian concert was one of the finest musical feasts I have attended anywhere. When this glorious choir sang some of their national music, especially that that had a strong strain of the minor chords in them, by closing my eyes I could almost persuade myself I was back in Wales listening to the performance of some really first class Welsh choir, so similar in many respects were the music and the interpretation thereof, especially in the tone coloring the majestic swells and dynamic contrasts. Yet in many instances these Ukrainians excelled as their singing was free from the disturbing influence of the piano whereas the majority of Welsh choruses nowadays stick like leaches to this tin can accompaniment, when in reality the performance would be better without it. William Byrd the great Tudor composer of England, four centuries ago, wrote that there is no instrument comparable to the human voice when properly trained and guided by a master hand, and the Ukrainian chorus completely demonstrated this fact. Let some of our local organizations take this to heart, especially our male voice choirs as the main drawback to the Mendelssohn Male Chorus concert early last year, in the First Congregational Church was that all the singing was accompanied, and the grouping on the stage all around the piano was detrimental to good choral singing.¹

¹Deseret News (Salt Lake City), Saturday, January 12, 1924.
CHAPTER VII

REVIEWS

Mistakes in lighter music programs do not justify a too serious critical attention. Programs are entertainment and excessively discriminating musicians might best let criticism rest with the promoters of the performance and social reformers. The advisability of tolerating such cheap and sentimental stuff which classified would be an abortion or Jazz, belongs to societies of altruism and the pulpit. Attacks on music by the Church find little if any consideration in Utah. The simultaneous growth of secular and sacred music cultivated a respect of each for each. The same fiddlers played for both church and theatre. The Church officials attended music programs of both types. And, equally encouraging reviews were made by the papers for each type of performers.

Criticism on music of the larger forms and satisfactory recording of reactions to performance of the greater composers has not yet become a part of Utah music. The most attractive compiling of program notes and excessive compliments predominates over attention given to attitudes, expressions, or experiences which might have been derived from auditory stimulations. A timidity of reviewers seems to exist in reporting concert performances to give any intima-
tion that the reporter witnessed an experience. That experience should perhaps assume related external dimensions in most alert listeners but the sound sequence dictates as it properly should a unique set of mental imagery to each individual. One must of course assume that most audiences are nonprofessional but appreciative groups who do not rely for pleasure on their ability to hotly pursue figures, motives, and themes as suggested or imitated in some thematically varied form by the composer.

Criticism of composition, it seems, is still restricted to the class rooms of colleges. Reviews of composition are a negative element in newspaper consideration.\(^1\) Essentials lacking in this respect are: first, composers; and second, individuals sufficiently experienced to intelligently criticise composition.\(^2\)

The reviews of performances contained in this section are chosen as pertinent selections of expressions found in different journals. The period of time represented falls between 1876 and the present. The necessary similarity of each to each palls on the reader (I can only beg indulgence for the writers). A few of the exceptions, the negative reactions, if of no other consequence than that they irritated the performers when given institutes for us an interest in

\(^1\) Exceptions are the Eisteddfod adjudications and the criticism by John Tullidge contained in those sections of the thesis.

\(^2\) Notes by Eastern critics of Arthur Shepherd are contained in the division by that title.
reading the reviews. It gives us the pleasure of knowing that all performers were not beautiful and good and that there was an occasional individual who realized the same. These reviews are criticism if one wishes to defend this pedestrian style of treatment as criticism. The noticeable feature of piquant disapprovals is that they did not follow in any regular succession but were more properly brazen expostulations pulled on the public at irregular intervals. It is conjectured—that each individual needs only about one attempt to appreciate the consequence of crossing public approval. The objective verification of these accounts, if it were possible, would indicate little or nothing since the reporter's impressions might be as well justified as another's opinions.
The farewell concert of Wilhelmj last evening was the best given by the great violinist. The audience was not such as the extraordinary richness of the programme demanded, a misfortune which may very honestly be attributed to the unpropitious state of the weather. Wilhelmj's first number was a concerto from Mendelssohn, the first he has given us from the great composer. It was rendered, of course, faultlessly, and with great depth of feeling and breadth of thought, which are qualities to be predicated of the wonderful violinist's playing. A love song, composed by Mr. Vogrich, was his second selection. It is a composition pregnant with melodies and symphonies, and was rendered with exquisite delicacy. The accompaniment, which was one of the most pleasing and unique that our dellettanti will ever hear, added immeasurably to the performance. An encore was heartily accorded it and a concerto from Mendelssohn was the response. It was the feature of the evening. The concerto, which is of a slow movement, is one of Mendelssohn's most beautiful compositions and the fine cut tremolo notes which are characteristic of the piece, were as clearly distinguishable as his most fortissimo measures. His last number was an andante and allegro brillante from Ernest, aside from his participation in the finale, Bach's arrangement of Ave Maria in Wilhelmj's departure this morning from our city, there can be no hesitancy in recording the fact that the greatest violinist we have ever heard, and probably ever will hear, has left us. The singular fearlessness with which he masters the qualities of his violin, the remarkable purity of his tones and harmonics, the singular delicacy and ease with which he draws his bow, the entire absence of affectation and trickery in rendering the most intricate of passages and difficult scores, the fluency, softness and sensitiveness of his pianissimo notes, the ripeness and breadth of his fortissimo passages, the ringing and clear staccato intonation, are all perfect and heard but once in a lifetime.

Mr. Vogrich devoted himself to Liszt last evening. His first number was a fantasia on airs from Aida, and while executed with accurate technique, is not to be compared with his rendition of the Wedding March with variations.

Signora Salvotti seemed to be a favorite with the audience and in addition to her usual numbers gave on her encore "We met by Chance" and Pinsutti's "Love my Love. They were void of expression. While possessing a fine contralto, or at the most a mezzo-soprano voice, her schooling is bad and her method worse.
The Careless orchestra must come in for general praise. Their rendition of airs from Auber's Masanielo, the first number, was their best performance, but lacking in the staccato movements in parts. Their accompanying was excellent.

Much credit should be given Mr. Gregory, the manager, for the fact he has shown in organizing this farewell concert. Through him, the great master and our own splendid local talent were brought together, affording a treat which entitles him to the thanks of our musical public.

* * *

"SORcerer"

"The Sorcerer."--The first presentation of this opera, last evening was witnessed by a fair-sized audience, including many of the leading musical people of the city. The performance did not come up to the expectations of some, but far surpassed the general anticipation. The public, at large, were aware that the actors were amateurs, and went to see them make their first appearance with a view to encouraging, rather than criticizing them. Others, however, failed to take these matters into consideration. Taken as an entirety, the debut of Zion's Musical Society was a success. The choruses were rendered in excellent style, and well deserved the applause they received and many favorable comments passed upon them. The singing and general deportment of the 150 ladies and gentlemen, who made up the peasant's chorus, evidenced careful and thorough study and rehearsal, and reflected much credit upon the singers as well as those who have had charge of their training. The principal characters rarely overcome completely. Mr. Duncan McAllister looked every inch a sorcerer, and surprised even his intimate friends with his display of ability as a comedian. Mr. John D. Spencer's singing was good, and he also played the modest vicar very well, though the part is not one in which the gentleman could show the unquestioned talent he possesses as an actor. Mr. Gardner made a very nice appearance as "Alexis," the soldier lover, and sang sweetly, but gave evidence of embarrassment in his constrained movements and gestures, defects which time and practice will remove. Mr. Owen sustained the comic role of "Sir Marmaduke" with success, but should clear his voice behind the scenes, instead of waiting un-

1 Salt Lake Tribune, March 7, 1880.
til he gets before his audience. Such things always detract from a performance, especially of this character. We make these suggestions in a kindly spirit, for the good of the performers. Mr. Morgan did not have much of a part to play, but looked the learned "counsel" to perfection, and acquitted himself with credit in singing as well as acting. Miss Libbie Sheets, as "Aline," presented a neat and elegant appearance, and played her part well, not withstanding the timidity manifested in her voice and movements. A little more freedom of gesture would add much to her acting. Miss Annie Mackay's singing was among the best of the evening. This lady has a good voice, but was also under the influence of "stage fright," and did not act with the ease that she will, as she becomes more familiar with appearing in public. Mrs. Annie Midgley sang with effect, as did Miss Edmunds. The former lady has an excellent voice, the latter excels in acting. If we were to make a suggestion to apply generally to the company, it would be that they put more force and spirit into their acting, which would enhance the merits of the entire presentation. The orchestra under Professor Thomas, played with care and precision, and rendered the beautiful music in fine style.

Monday evening, the opera will be played again, and for the last time.¹

***

ZION'S MUSICAL SOCIETY

Concert--Zion's Musical Society's concert took place last evening in the Assembly Hall. The building, besides being very beautiful, possesses rare acoustic properties, such as render the most delicate sounds audible in every part of the house, and such as enabled every person in the large audience to hear all distinctly. The concert, taken as a whole, was probably as good as any that has ever been given here; in some particulars it was inferior to some, in others superior; in still others on the par. Considering the number of instruments in the theatre orchestra its overtures were very finely executed. It was hardly fair, however, since it gave but two overtures that one, the latter, should have been a selection which many of the audience had heard in the Theatre. Those present were entitled to two new pieces. The choruses were all well given and gave evidence of correct practice and intelligent direction, and were a marked improvement on those in the "Sorcerer," perhaps because they were less difficult; but evidently because there were fewer and better singers who had received better training. The prize glee of "Jack and Gill" was

¹Deseret News, (Salt Lake City), March 6, 1880.
particularly good, while all were well rendered. In the choruses to the solos and the duets the same excellence was observable. The duet between Miss Horne and Mr. Gardner was very sweet. The lady was much the better of the two. She kept in tune, however, which cannot be said of Mr. Gardner, who was out badly at times. He has a pleasing voice but does not seem to understand how to control it, and exhibits no improvement since he appeared in the "Sorcerer." Its beauty is lost by a mushy sound, and the fault common to nearly all the vocalists of last night—he would not open his mouth and let the sound out. He made another mistake in singing the Cavertina from "Il Trovatore." The selection is a baritone solo, and one which has been sung here by a very noted baritone—Carlton. As Mr. Gardner has a tenor voice, the inappropriateness at once is evident; moreover, he did not seem to appreciate the beauty of the solo and failed to give it any affect whatever, which caused it to fall rather flat on an audience which had listened to its rendition by Carlton. Still, Mr. Gardner pleased a great many, and was encored; but would have pleased a great many more had he given instead, "Happy be their Dreams," or one of those superior ballads in which he excels.

The organ solo, overture of "William Tell," by Prof. Jos Daynes last night, was the finest part of the evening's entertainment; it was simple magnificent; and more than anything else served to show the public here what excellent instruments they possess, and what beauty, power and grandeur can be brought out of them. A few such selections as that of last night, wherein tones of the most inexpressible sweetness alternating with burst of power and representations of the different wind instruments, might educate the people to appreciate the organs now in the large Tabernacle and the Assembly Hall. Mr. Daynes was greeted with a tremendous and merited burst of applause, and forced to give an encore. Mr. Forster's "Bring Back the Old Folks, Willie Darling" with A. M. S. Chorus, and the Union Glee Club selection, "Come Rise With the Lark," were both well given and encored. Miss L. Nebeke sung "Coming." The selection was good but hardly suited for her voice, which is very sweet and expressive on the lower and middle notes, but ceases to be musical on the higher ones. For an encore she sang "Is It a Dream," and did it much better than the first song. The lady would show judgment in making such selections as would not tax her voice on the upper notes. Miss Sheets sung "In the Gloaming," a pretty ballad out of the usual order, and all took part in a quintette. She does not show any marked improvement since the "Sorcerer," which fact can only be attributed to a lack of proper and consistent training, as she evidently has much in her voice if it were properly developed. Regarding the quintette, which was taken from the "Sorcerer," rendered by Misses Sheets and
Campbell, and Messrs. Forster, Gardner and Owen, it is a question as to what can be found in it especially to admire, unless it was the fact that it gives each a short solo. Innumerable better selections could have been made. Miss Campbell has a good contralto voice. Her principal fault now is that she is inclined to give a nasal tone to it. She can readily overcome this.

Of Mr. Weihe's violin solo we can say nothing, excepting that we never saw him play with more ease or to better effect than he did last night. Mr. Owen, in his selection from "Judas Maccabeus, also showed improvement, and with the general chorus, his selection took well. Mr. Owen's voice, however, is better suited to chorus rather than to solo singing. In his selection from "Lucia" Mr. McAllister displayed a similar lack of good judgment with Mr. Gardner, and the faults of the one are common to the other. He also has a sweet voice, but does not know how to use it. The concert ended with a duet from "Judas Maccabeus" by Misses Rogers and Horne, with a general chorus, which was one of the best things on the programme, but which was spoiled by a large number of the audience in getting up and starting out before it had been ended. Regard for the wishes of those who desired to hear might have been sufficient consideration to have induced them to wait until the selection was closed before going out, if the feelings of the performers were not a sufficient inducement. Such an act is positively vulgar, and no lady or gentleman would wilfully be guilty of it, unless under the most unusual circumstances.

There were too many encores, some portions that deserved a repetition failing of securing a recall, while many that were unworthy were repeated. The applause at times, which frequently came from a crowd of children, was not sufficient to justify the encores, so many of which surfeited the audience and made them tired. The hall was also too close and had a tiring effect; other than this, everything was highly agreeable. The instrumental parts were much the best; the choruses next; the solos last; but as before stated the whole was much above the average, and had many of the encores been omitted, nearly the entire audience, so great and unexpected was the pleasure, would have gone this evening to hear the same over again, were the entertainment to be repeated tonight.

* * *

Salt Lake Tribune, November 9, 1880.
A complement but less exacting article on the concert by Zion's Musical Society November 9, 1880 is contained in the Deseret News. The Deseret News writer seems much more diplomatic; quite less frank, assertive, and exacting; much more lavish of praise; and much more respectful and considerate of his fellows' feelings. The concluding attitude is:

"As an entirety, we repeat, the entertainment fully deserved the generous patronage bestowed upon it, and was decidedly an artistic success. True, there were defects, but such things are common to all entertainments. The Concert was one to be agreeably remembered by all who were present."

Such an attitude concerning defective musicianship may reveal sufficient of paper and public attitude, in regard to attempted analysis, to justify any reader's deliberation. A question may still be open as to the intrinsic worth of that admirable adage, "Greater incentive is given through encouragement than through negative reaction even though it be honest. And, the logic of the home-folks' respect for and inveterate adherence to the usual praise for praise may assume less logical proportions if respect is paid to its syllogistic incongruities."
THE RICHINGS-BERNARD CO.

The Richings-Bernard Engl. Opera Co. gave five performances of opera in the theatre on the 18th, 14th, 17th, and 18th August. The first two performances were well attended, but the others drew very small audiences, no doubt owing to the powerful attractions of the Tony Pastor troupe, and the Forepaugh Circus. The operas given by the troupe were "Maritana," "Bohemian Girl," Il Trovatore," "Martha," and "Marriage of Figaro." Caroline Richings has been long and favorably known to the American people as a genuine artist, and one who has done much for the advancement of the musical art of America. Her voice is still in remarkably good condition, and her performances proved that she retains much more than could have been expected from the constant wear and tear she has undergone in her profession. As an organizer of an England Opera Troupe, Mrs. Caroline Richings-Bernard is a failure. "Her own magnificent corps of thirty artists and grand chorus" is the most miserable company that we have seen brought together to interpret the works of Wallace, Verdi, Flotow and Mozart. We are sorry to say so, but justice to musical art compels us.¹

* * *

"ERMINIE"

Long before the curtain rose at the Grand Opera House last evening every seat was taken, and the sign "Standing Room Only" was hung up at the book office window. The attraction was the popular opera "Erminie," which was presented by the Arosson New York Casino Co. This company has acquired a wide fame, but in the estimation of several judges of operatic performances it failed to sustain its reputation. Perhaps this was due to the fact that the troupe arrived in the city at quite a late hour, and the members, who were all tired, were rushed upon the stage without a moment's rest. At any rate, the performance at times dragged somewhat wearily, and made the audience slightly tired. There is not a star singer in the company. As a veteran opera-goer said it reminded one of a production of "Hamlet" with the gentleman from Denmark left out. The vocalists are only average, the girls are rather pretty, the orchestra music excellent, and the scenery especially in the second act, is brilliant and attractive. However, the audience upon the whole seemed well pleased with the entertainment.²

¹Utah Musical Times (Salt Lake City), Vol. I, p. 92, 1876.
²Salt Lake Tribune, March 4, 1890.
Favorable Comment

GILMORE

The concerts given in the theatre and in the Tabernacle on the twelfth and thirteenth inst., by P. S. Gilmore's famous band of fifty eminent musicians, will long be remembered by the thousands of people who were present at the performance. It is the first time that our citizens have been privileged with a visit of so large and so celebrated a musical organization.

At the theatre a house crowded in all its parts welcomed the entrance of Mr. Gilmore and his band with enthusiastic demonstrations of applause. The first piece on the programme was the overture to Roberpierre, but the overture to "Semiremide" was given instead. The rendering of this fine composition was well received, and proved to the audience that transcription of orchestral works for a military band can be rendered in a most charming manner by wind instruments when played by competent artists.

Mr. Letsch next followed with a trombone solo, air and variations from "Puritana." The trombone is an excellent instrument in its place in a band, but as a solo instrument, even in the hands of celebrated an artist as Mr. Letsch, it discourses but little music. The air and variations gave the performer an excellent opportunity of showing how cleverly he can handle his instrument.

Kontsky's Caprice Heroique--"The awakening of the Lion" was next given by the band in magnificent style, to the great delight of the audience.

Mr. Wm. M. Arbuckle, the great American cornet player, whose fame had preceded him, was next received with a hearty welcome. He played a solo--air and variations by De Beriot, in a manner that was highly artistic, and elicited great applause and an encore.

Miss Emma C. Thursby, the vocalist of the company, next made her appearance. This young lady received her musical training from Sig. Achille Errani, New York, and studied with him from Nov. 1871, until Oct., 1873. In appearance she is pretty, in manner unaffected and modest. She possesses a soprano voice of a high order--fresh, pure, and sympathetic. For a singer of so short experience she undoubtedly displayed, in rendering the two pieces on the programme, Polonaise from "Mignon," and the Shadow Song from "Dinorah," with their encores, the style of a true artist. Her liquid runs were given with great precision. Her intonation, quality of tone and expression are admir-
able. We doubt if any artist has ever produced tones more sweet, pure and bird-like in the highest regions of the voice. If she continues in her profession we predict for her a glorious future.

The first part of the programme concluded with the performance of Liszt's "Rhapsodie Hongreise Ho." This was the most marvelous as well as the most brilliant piece performed by the band. It was executed with wonderful precision, and stamped the performers, under Mr. Gilmore's baton, to be thoroughly competent to render the works designed for orchestras in the most artistic manner, and with an intelligence scarcely to be expected from the members of a military band. The rapturous and continued applause bestowed upon this performance evidenced a genuine appreciation by the whole audience. The overture to "Wm. Tell," "The Gems of Faust," and Mosaic—"From concert air and variations," in the second part of the programme, were performed by the band in excellent style. In the matter piece variations were introduced for flutes, clarionets, cornets, piccolos, baritones, and trombones to the great delight of the listening multitude.

Mr. J. Levy, the acknowledged peer of all cornet players of the present day, gave his audience a good opportunity of judging of his masterly performance in the solo, "Maud Valse," composed by himself. To say that his tone was pure and brilliant, his tonguing and execution wonderful, gives but a very faint idea of the ability of this artist. The enthusiasm with which the performance of the pieces were received must have been very satisfactory to him.

Mr. E. L. Lefebre's solo on the saxophone was well executed and very much admired. The saxophone was first introduced into this country by a European band at the Boston Jubilee. Its peculiarity of tone adds much to the general effect, combining as it does, the qualities of the alt-horne, clarinet, and flute. It is made of brass with a wooden mouth piece and reed tongue, and in form is very like a large meerschaum pipe.

The conducting of Mr. Gilmore, the prince of Am. conductors, pleased us very much. He was exceedingly modest in his movements and indifferent to self display. Sterling ability and great natural endowment such as he possesses require no showman's clap-trap to impress his audience with sense of greatness.¹

¹ Utah Musical Times (Salt Lake City), Vol. I, 1878, p. 38.
CHORAL SOCIETY

Daughter of Jairus—The Salt Lake Choral Society have reason to be proud of their first performance on last Mon. evening. Those who were fortunate enough to be present all agree in pronouncing it as a great musical treat, and one that was thoroughly enjoyed to the last of the cantata.

Mrs. Careless was never heard to better advantage, her beautiful voice ringing out in all the choruses, and full of expression in the song "Dreaming" as also in the exquisite recitatives and duets in the Daughter of Jairus. The critical audience showed their appreciation by encores, hearty applause and floral tributes.

L. L. Van Praag's cello solo received a well merited encore. His playing in the orchestra was also very much enjoyed.

Miss Edith Clawson sang very sweetly in the recitatives and trio. Mrs. Crawford was a little unfortunate in selecting a song that required a heavier voice than she possessed. She sang very effectively however, in the cantata.

The choruses were rendered in grand style, showing earnest study and careful training. The orchestra did splendidly, considering the short time they have been practicing. Prof. Careless may congratulate himself on scoring another success as a reward for his ability and perseverance. And the society should feel encouraged in continuing their labors in the divine art.

As matters are progressing, this city ought, in a little while more; to have more accomplished musicians town of its size in America. The younger generation seem to have a natural aptitude to acquire the art, and among them are some glorified voices. The performance on Mon. evening was worthy of any place, and was finer than anything which plenty of cities of five times the size of Salt Lake can produce. The people at large should give to those who try so nobly to please them every possible encouragement, for the fact is apparent enough that every year they pay enough to strolling singers to perfect right in their midst a musical society which would be a perpetual joy and wonder.¹

** **

¹Salt Lake Tribune, June 8, 1884.
B. B. YOUNG CONCERT

The second of the series of sacred concerts being given by Mr. B. B. Young and Mme. Mazzucato-Young, drew a large and splendid audience at the Walker Opera House last Sunday evening. Owing to the rule prohibiting encores, which Mr. Young no doubt adopted to add to the solemnity of the occasion, the programmes appeared to be very short and when the final chorus was ended it was with difficulty that the audience persuaded itself to leave. Everybody left with an Oliver-Twist-Like longing for more and therefore the impression on the auditors was all the more delightful. Mr. Young, with much good sense, avoids the lengthy and boring programmes that usually characterize entertainments of this character, and gives just enough music to make the evening enjoyable and not too much to cause a feeling of unrest among the listeners. The chorus showed a marked improvement and thrilled the house with its "Thanks be to God." The evidence of successful training by Mr. Young were very evident in that selection, and sounded grander effect than on any previous occasion.

Mr. M. H. McAllister's solo was, barring a slight huskiness, excellently well rendered and won the approval of the audience, there being an evident desire to applaud at the close of his rendition, "If With All Your Hearts."¹

* * *

CHOIR CONCERT

The appearance presented by the interior of the Tabernacle last night, was sublime. The vast sea of human faces which overspread the lower part of the great auditorium was an inspiring spectacle. The great choir with its 320 or more members, arranged with perfect regularity, was something to gladden the heart of the music lover. It is estimated that nearly 5000 people were present at the concert. Electric lights in profusion gave the place a midday brightness. In addition to this, the bright paint and fresh Kalsomining gave the scene a gala aspect.

The concert opened with the march from "Norma." Evan Stephens held the baton and Professor Daynes was at the organ. The march was rendered in magnificent style. How these great volumes of song rolled out, filling the immense building, and impressing the listeners with religious

¹ Salt Lake Tribune, December 1, 1885.
awe. There was hardly anything to equal it in the world. Even the choirs of the vast cathedrals of Rome and Paris could not surpass last night's performance in grandeur of melody and sublimity of song.

The second piece was a waltz, entitled "On the Waves," given by the Salt Lake Mandolin and Guitar Club. The members presented a handsome appearance. Their costume is both tasteful and picturesque. It would be difficult to find a finer-looking body of young gentlemen composing a musical club, in any city in the United States. All this the vast audience appreciated, and when the waltz was rendered with perfect smoothness, it is little wonder that the club received a hearty and enthusiastic encore.

***

LUCY GATES

Lucy Gates, singing as she has never sung before and surrounded by a company entirely local all of whom were equal to the exacting demands of Verdi's "La Traviata," scored such a success early in the week that the increasing audiences necessitated an extra performance which was given on Friday. Five nights of grand opera by a local company would never have been possible had the incentive been found in anything but the real merit of the singers. While Miss Gates was the bright particular star of the occasion, her orchestra under the direction of B. Cecil Gates, made her complete triumph possible. Some of the masters have compared Miss Gates' voice to those of many of the leading sopranos of the world and those who heard her Violetta during the week, will readily agree with them. She is an actress too, and this with the wonderful expression of her voice in differing emotions, resulted in complete success in this role which calls for everything a singer has, and if she was pleased with the warmth of her greeting, the feeling was mutual for she has never treated her local friends to anything so delightful. In her support John W. Summerhays who appeared as Alfred, was in splendid voice and his acting was fine. He has had considerable professional work, the benefit of which was shown in his performance. The other principals and the chorus had evidently been carefully selected and trained and the entire achievement was one to call further unstinted commendation.

1 Deseret News (Salt Lake City), Saturday, Feb. 29, 1891.
2 Goodwin's Weekly (Salt Lake City), Vol. 24, Oct. 9, 1915.
Paderewski's recital was a presentation of the most artistic, wholesouled, idealistic pianism one can imagine. Certainly, Salt Lakers never before heard a performance so nearly approaching the culmination of the pianistic art. Fortunately, conditions were most propitious at the Theatre for an ideal recital. The most whispering effects were wonderfully distinct, neither were the greatest fortés other than torrents of sonorous tone, and never at any time was there a jar to the ear. Let all musical mortals bow down to the perfection of tone he produced. After hearing Paderewski's rendition of that Chopin nocturne, one is tempted to eliminate the quality of percussion from the pianoforte.

The program was a veritable feast from beginning to end, though the two big numbers coming together was a rather odd arrangement. Great is Schumann. His turbulence is fascinating, his harmonies unexcelled, and his rhythm irresistible, but he suffered Saturday night in being placed in too close proximity with Beethoven. Had it been any other sonata than the "Appasionata," the comparison would scarcely be suggested; but when Beethoven exhibits his passion, let others write hymns and Te deums in humble acknowledgement of such a musical Jove. Paderewski is the possessor of qualities which must, beyond doubt, place his name, in musical history, very near the top of the list of performers. He is not only a great medium through which masters find ideal expression, but he is an excellent composer himself. Let musicians examine his two sets of variations, his "Fantaisie Polonaise" and his concerto. In these works there is abundant evidence of the sterling quality of his musicianship. He should be placed in an entirely different category from so many of the virtuosi, who are often tempted into acrobatic feats of technic, at the expense of artistic interpretation. Critics, in writing of his playing, generally place his emotional qualities first, but combined with that wonderfully magnetic emotion is a most satisfying solidity, and sane, conservative interpretation. As to his technic--well, it was enough to tire one's arms to watch him play the "Erl King" and Liszt's Rhapsody and still another rhapsody, after such taxing things as the Schumann Etudes, and the Beethoven Sonata. His powers of endurance alone are certainly marvellous.

A word of commendation must be said for the audience. No applause in the wrong place, no confusion, and evidently thorough appreciation. There seemed to be an exquisite sympathy between Paderewski and his listeners. It is much easier to appreciate such an artist than to put that appreciation into words. To me, he is the personifi-
cation of fine art.¹

***

"MESSIAH"

An audience that practically filled the great tabernacle yesterday gave enthusiastic approval of the tenth annual rendition of Handel's "Messiah" in the Tabernacle, by the Salt Lake Oratorio society. The rendition was pronounced by many as being decidedly the most finished yet given by the society, the big chorus, four soloists, forty orchestra players, Director Squire Coop, trumpeter, and a decided musical triumph. As is usual the chorus received the ovation, a recognition usually tendered the men and women who purely for music's sake spend many weeks yearly in preparing for the big community event.

Mayor C. Clarence Neslen, president of the Oratorio society, in a short address of welcome preceding the rendition read "A Drama" written some years ago by Mr. Coop in which visioned a rendition of Handel's masterpiece with choirs of all churches joining in the work before an audience of 10,000 people from all parts and conditions of the city. In conclusion, the mayor added:

"Now the dream has come true, Handel's Messiah has become established in Salt Lake. I ask you to give it your complete moral support, your kindest sympathy and your consistent patronage. I wish you a happy and prosperous New Year."

Following Mayor Neslen the orchestra with Arthur Freber as concert master began the overture of the famous oratorio. The big numbers of the chorus, "For Unto Us a Child is Born," "Hallelujah," "Worthy is the Lamb" and "Amen" were rendered with especial power and impressiveness. But all the choruses were given with an ease, a subtle understanding only possible through careful study. All through the rendition the skill and mastery of Director Coop was felt in his leadership of both chorus and orchestra. The latter did unusually good work, showing more finish and sympathy of rendition than ever before.

In discussing the excellent work of the soloists no attempt perhaps should be made to differentiate between them as to who should have first mention. All were so good in their respective parts that to make comparisons would be invidious. The soloist new to Salt Lake was the basso,

¹Arthur Shepherd, Deseret News (Salt Lake City), April 23, 1900.
Gustaf Holmquist, and he made a most favorable impression. His voice, the mastery of his role, technic and dignity of rendition won the hearty approval of his audience, fellow soloists and society members. His voice showed a remarkable finish, was especially effective in "Why Do Nations So Furiously Rage?" and "The Trumpets Shall Sound." His diction and enunciation in these difficult numbers were excellent and from his very first air, he displayed an unusual sureness and brilliancy of rendition and interpretation.

Marjorie Dodge, soprano, whose sincere, artistic and brilliant work has delighted local oratorio audiences in several renditions maintained if indeed she did not surpass the standard she has previously set. She gave her numbers with especial beauty and artistry. "Come Unto Him" and "I Know That My Redeemer Liveth" were especially enjoyed.

As usual Florence Jepperson's rich and soulful contralto voice and the artistic rendering of her solos formed one of the most delightful features of the occasion. Her rendition of "He Shall Feed His Flock," especially surpassed all her former renditions of this favorite number while "He Was Despised," was given with much emotional feeling and unusual purity of tone.

J. W. Summerhays, tenor, was in excellent voice and gave a splendid rendition of "Comfort Ye," and the difficult "Every Valley Shall be Exalted."

John Visser, solo trumpeter, ably supported the soloist and received much praise from both the latter and the conductor for his work.

Tracy Y. Cannon, solo organist, displayed a sympathetic understanding of the proper subordination of his instrument and gave a much appreciated contribution of masterful work toward the rendition.

In spite of the fact that Director Coop has been with the chorus for rehearsals for only about ten days, the rendition was most meritorious and praiseworthy. Much credit is due the chorus members and J. Spencer Cornwall, who conducted the first practices, for their successful effort in carrying on until their old time director could arrive from the coast to assume the baton.

The directors of the society itself also deserve much credit for the untiring effort which has kept the rendition before the public notice for the past month or so. From Mayor Neslen down the list, these directors have taken a keen personal interest in the matter and publicity work handled under the direction of Prof. Fred W. Reynolds of the U. of U. helped much in making the venture successful. On its part, the public of Salt Lake and surrounding
towns have demonstrated that they really want this annual rendition to become one of the unique and outstanding musical festivals of the country. The large attendance indicates that Utahns appreciate this annual telling of the world of the Christ tradition, translated by the master Handel into the very highest form of musical language. And it is not to be doubted that the oratoric renditions of the future will reach the very highest musical language. And it is not to be doubted that the oratoric renditions of the future will reach the very highest musical standard in a greater intensive interest in religious matters than most of the cities of the country.

* * *

KREISLER

Returning to Salt Lake for his first concert in more than ten years, Fritz Kreisler, peerless master of the violin, was heard last night by a large audience whose spontaneous welcome as he moved to the platform at the tabernacle for his first number paid tribute to his unrivaled genius. His performance made clear to any who had not been privileged to hear him before the reasons for his ascendance. It was a thrilling musical experience that will not be effaced from the memory.

From the first drawing of his bow across the strings, the audience was held under the spell of his magic notes. His program, including some of the more formidable works of violin literature, was played with perfection of technical detail. But his playing is more than a display of virtuosity, it has fervor and vibrant warmth of expression, reaching and playing upon the heart strings as well as stirring one out of his calm by brilliance of technique.

Mr. Kreisler's major vehicles of expression last night were the Beethoven Kreutzer Sonata and Mozart's great Concerto in G major. All the richness of the Beethoven tone and theme were superbly interpreted, his artistry filling every measure with interest, the delicate nuances of the andante movement beautifully observed, so that it seemed the sound of far angelic music. Yet it was in the Mozart composition that Mr. Kreisler revealed the majesty of his utterance, his bow evoking moving vibrant tones to stir the most inactive imagination. Under his bow the adagio became a thing of melting loveliness, the rondeau rendered with verve and flashing brilliance.

Deseret News (Salt Lake City), Jan. 2, 1923.
The last group of lighter pieces compromised some of the moderns and the violinist's own composition. The Ravel was an interesting example of tone color, and, in contrast with the sprightliness and dash of the Spanish pieces of his arrangement, the Debussy "La fille aux cheveux de lin" had a delicate, fairy-like beauty. It would be difficult to select the outstanding, but probably the delightful Kreisler "Caprice Viennois" and Liebesfreud," played as only Kreisler could play them, were favorites. To the unstinted appreciation of the audience the artist, who had seemed reluctant to play an encore; responded with two charming numbers that are always in favor.

In Carl Lamson, his accompanist, Mr. Kreisler has a worthy associate. The accompaniment was sympathetic, intelligent, full of expression, but never obtrusive.\(^1\)

* * *

\(^1\) Mrs. E. E. Hollis, Salt Lake Tribune, 1932.
CHAPTER VIII

THE REVIEWERS' EPITHETS

Criteria used for judging by the reviewers of Utah papers concerns itself generally with no more intricate or subtle standards than pitch, tempo, dynamics, appearance, suggestive superlatives and the good or bad epithet. The suggestion of a final or ultimate attitude or experience derived from the music and an attempt to evaluate the experience or the music by such an approach is an undawned effort. Music it seems is a mystery to most and holds its charm by remaining such. Any indictment placed on the divine art concerns itself with external relations—the grammatical and rhetorical significances.

A few of the more frequently applied descriptive terms used in the reviews concerning performances or performers are listed as an evidence of what is looked for and impressive to the reviewer. A judgment of the performances it seems is supposed to be derived from such as the following epithets which are applied indiscriminately to types or degrees of accomplishment.

absence of show
absence of affectation—simple dignity
reserved appearance

This criterion as applied by reviewers seems to have taken no account of the logic that studied lack of
affectation becomes itself an affectation.

applause--used as indication of the success attained

technical powers--a more specific intimation is generally omitted

Other very dependable measuring rods as used for evaluation are:

vocalists' appearance in good voice
exquisite tones--for vocalistic or instrumental art
effortless ease
brilliance of interpretation
absence of score
beauty and nobility of execution
magnificent range
liquid or limpid softness and purity of tone
performing equal to that of a much larger city
CONCLUSION

Utah music in its beginning was a pleasant mixture of the secular and the sacred—entertainment and vocalized worship. Criticism was an extraneous ingredient, an unessential element since there was yet no means of sustaining music as a profession. The musician's role included digging post holes or facing the lack of food and maintenance, a situation which confronted the band master Ballo in February of 1856.¹

With the advent of such persons as C. J. Thomas, John Tullidge, and George Careless in the decade from 1860 to 1870 music commenced to assume new and significant proportions. The critical consideration of their own and each other's work stimulated new acquisitions in a music way. Other early instigators of their divine art were: David O. Calder, George E. Whitney, Orson Pratt Jr., Thomas Radcliff, Joseph Daynes, Evan Stephens, B. B. Young, Willard Weihe, W. O. Clive, and H. S. Krouse. The roles played by these musicians resulted in a consummate Western final product which many have deservedly termed a music culture.

The rapid advance of music under the directorship of Careless indicates a strong self criticism which later

¹Cf. Pyper, Romance of an Old Playhouse, p. 48.
actuated Evan Stephens to a high accomplishment in a little state.

Major incidents of critical expression were started with the arrival of John Tullidge in 1862. His analytic treatments in regard to performance and composition were quite an astonishing reflection of careful observation. The situation adds other fascinations if one takes cognizance that in 1840 Hauptman, the Leipzig master, was upsetting accepted harmonic analysis; that until 1856 the masterly Schumann was busy in Europe criticising the great composers and opposing the radical innovations being waged by Wagner, Liszt, and Berlioz; and that the defence of "absolute music" against those men, had not yet started by the great Viennese, Hanslick. No implication is made nor is it presumed that the work of Tullidge is comparable to that made by European genius. The point is, that 1862 was relatively early in the history of modern music criticism.

The thirty years following 1878 with its popularity of road attractions resulted in a corresponding growth of publicity and reviews of the performances. Praise was the customary reaction given. In a few instances, as has been indicated in the review section, objections were expressed. Only on rare occasions during this period or years on either terminal of the period was unpraiseworthy notice emitted in regard to local performance.

The Eistedfodd adjudications in 1895 are a distinct evidence that there were individuals available at that time
who could determine values in music composition and production were their service requested.

From 1895 to the present, growth in music has been apparent. The effort seems to have exerted itself in raising the standard of acquirements in rural communities. The author does not wish to suggest that this standard is at present very high but that it has developed from its first elementary stages. Road performers and local associations have continued to give expression and to find adequate audiences who desire entertainment. Program reviews from 1900 to the present have pertained only to traveling artists and the major local music events. The reviews are apparently an exhaustless profusion of compliments. The newspapers give evidence of being aware of publicity consciousness. Concert announcements and recitals to be fill whatever space happens to be allowed for music.

Utah criticism attains little more as criticism than the poetic utterance or emotional expounding of news reporters. Reviews are evidence of expressions by impressionistic reporters. Reflective consideration is generally an element foreign to such reports. Since reviews constitute a type of journalistic criticism which is not easily ignored, a treatment of them has been included in the dissertation.

No definite school of composers has yet come into existence within the state. Most of the musicians who wrote made sacred composition their object. This magnanimous enterprise, while meriting a well deserved local
appreciation, somewhat limits its utility and recognition to the sect or church for which it was composed. And, criticism of the sacred is a precarious pastime.

Of secular music in the larger and art forms those writers of Utah who have won national recognition are scarce. Arthur Shepherd is evidently the most distinct of exceptions.

Criticism in the composition division of Utah musical art is exceptionally meager. But, perhaps, one should not anticipate published reaction to interpretation of composition before composition is created.

The ultimate value of a study of the problem "Music Criticism in Utah" does not lie so much in the finding of examples of ideal critical expression as in the historical growth of music and its relation to critical attitudes.
BIBLIOGRAPHY

The list contains only those early and recent publications which are accessible and which attached to music a degree of importance sufficient to include at least music program reviews. Excerpts and complete articles contained in the thesis are selected by the author as being most representative of his material. Footnotes contain sufficient information to direct anyone desiring the original sources of material used.

Deseret News—was the first paper printed within the rocky mountains, issued June 15, 1850 as a weekly, 8 pages 7 x 10 inches, three columns, edited by Willard Richards. Files are accessible at the L. D. S. Church Historian's Office, Salt Lake Public Library, and the Deseret News Office in Salt Lake City.

Utah Magazine—was a predecessor to the Salt Lake Tribune, published in 1869, Harrison and Tullidge editors. Copies are accessible in the L. D. S. Church Historian's Office and the Salt Lake Public Library.

Salt Lake Tribune—commenced as the Mormon Tribune January 1, 1870, Harrison and Tullidge editors. It changed to the Salt Lake Daily Tribune, April 15, 1871, as a "purely secular journal devoted entirely to the presentation of news and to the development of the mineral and commercial interests of the territory."

The Daily Herald—was first published June 5, 1870, E. S. Sloan, editor. It was a church publication as an anti-reaction sheet to the non-religious Tribune. The Herald became the Herald Republican from 1909 until 1918, and then the Salt Lake Herald until 1920 when it discontinued. Files are accessible in the L. D. S. Church Historian's Office, the Salt Lake Public Library, and the Tribune Offices.

The Deseret Weekly—was published 1867-1898. Copies are accessible in L. D. S. Church Historian's Office, the
Salt Lake Public Library, the Deseret News Offices, and B. Y. U. Library at Provo.

Tullidge's Quarterly--was published 1880 to 1885, E. W. Tullidge, editor. Copies are accessible at the L. D. S. Church Historian's Office, and B. Y. U. Library.

Salt Lake Musical Times--was published 1877-78, Calder and Careless, editors. Files are available at Salt Lake City Public Library and the L. D. S. Church Historian's Office.

Goodwin's Weekly--was published 1903-1918, C. C. Goodwin, editor. Copies are accessible at the L. D. S. Church Historian's Office.


APPENDICES
Professor John Tullidge (the father of Edward and John Tullidge) arrived in Salt Lake City, in September, 1863.

John Tullidge, Sen., was born in Waymouth, Dorsetshire, England, November 5th, 1807. In his childhood he was the musical prodigy of his native town. He sang in a Methodist choir at the age of six, and in his young manhood was ranked as the principal tenor singer of the county. Unsatisfied with local fame he left his native place and went to London, in 1837, to study under the great English masters. There he was engaged as principal tenor, of the famous Evans' Saloon, and while occupying this position he studied harmony and counterpoint under the greatest English master of those times, the world-renowned Hamilton. He next conducted the best glee party out of London, and traveled with them through the musical provinces, taking engagements to sing at the grand fetes of the nobility. In the year 1838, or 1829 he and his glee party sang at the Countess of Westmorland's in honor of the visit of the Duchess of Kent and Princess Victoria. Grisi and Mario, the then greatest singers in the world, were the musical stars of the occasion. The Princess Victoria did him the honor to "chat" with him a few moments to express her pleasure over a fine old English madrigal which the glee party had rendered, which charmed the English taste of the royal maiden more than did the classical pieces of the great Italians. Mario, struck with the compass and quality of Tullidge's voice, after the close of their service, asked Mr. Tullidge if he would allow him to test his full voice capacity and execution, which condescension of the great singer was gratefully met. At the close of the trial Mario exclaimed "My God, I never knew the English had voices till I heard yours;" and adding that his voice was equal to his own, he offered to bring him out in Italian opera. Perhaps Mario, in his condescension and generosity paid the English singer too high a compliment. Mr. Tullidge would fain have accepted the offer of Mario, but he knew not the Italian language and was not fitted for the operatic stage, which requires the actor combined with the star singer.

After singing at the Countess of Westmorland's, before the lady who became Queen of England, in the following
year Mr. Tullidge went to the city of York, where he quickly won the position as principal tenor of the York Philharmonic concerts, and became one of the four conductors of the York "Harmonious Society." His name may be found on its roll as John Elliot (Tullidge) his mother's maiden name. Mrs. Sunderland, known as the "Yorkshire Queen of Song," and later, succeeding Clara Novello as the greatest oratorio singer in England, was at that time the leading soprano of the society, and with her Mr. Tullidge was frequently sent out by the society to fill engagements as the principal singers at the oratorio concerts of the northern counties of England. It was one of these professional tours that led him into Wales.

Mr. Tullidge was conductor of St. Mary's Cathedral choir, Newport, South Wales, and was founder of the Newport Harmonic Society, in 1843, the offspring of which, years later, at the Crystal Palace, London, took the laurels from the choral societies of all England.

In 1863, he emigrated to Utah, and in September, 1864, gave his first concert in Salt Lake City, the first part of which consisted of the following selections:


He composed the Latter-day Saints' Psalmody, a number of whose hymns and anthems are sung at the Tabernacle.

In 1873, he fell down the theatre stairs, as he came from his music room, where he copied and arranged for the orchestra, and was killed in the fall. His anthem, "How Beautiful Upon the Mountains," the favorite of the Tabernacle, and the delight of the lamented Mrs. Careless, will perpetuate his name in the musical history of our city.  

---

1 E. W. Tullidge, History of Salt Lake City, 1886, p. 772.
JOHN TULLIDGE'S 1st UTAH CRITICISM

The Concert--We have received a length Critique on the D. M. A. Concert given in the Theatre last Wednesday evening, from the pen of Mr. Tullidge, Sen. who has just arrived in the mountains; but the very limited space this week at our disposal, forces us to leave it for another occasion.

It was with great bodily suffering that Mr. Calder could rise from his seat to conduct the singing of his pupils, and we regret to add that he is still severely indisposed. His illness preceding the evening of the concert prevented the rehearsals necessary to appearing before the public; but rather than disappoint his friends, he met his engagement and was successful.1

***

Sir:--In the year 1861 (if I mistake not) I saw an advertisement in the Deseret News of the intention of Dr. David Calder, aided by the patronage of President Young, to establish singing classes in large bodies, at G. S. L. City and Territory.

I was convinced by experience that the movement would be successful, if the pupils studied with attention. The method adopted by their teacher, [viz]: the Tonic-SolFa system, which is the only method published that can ensure success.

On entering the city on Saturday, Oct. 31, I was much pleased in seeing, per advertisement, that a concert was to be given by the Deseret Musical Association, on the Wednesday following; and notwithstanding the debility occasioned by the long journey across the plains on "shank's pony," I would not miss the opportunity of hearing for myself of the progress made in vocal music by that Association, and at the request of several friends, I will endeavor to give my honest opinion on the performances of that concert.

The concert opened with one of Professor Thomas' pieces, which did him credit as a composer. The introductions by the Cornet was a chaste piece of rendering; and the band did well in giving the gentleman, an opportunity of doing justice to that beautiful strain--in fact the gem

---

1 Deseret News (Salt Lake City), Oct. 4, 1862, Vol. 13.
of the piece—instead of destroying the effect by loud playing.

The horns however were out of tune at the finale, but it may be here parenthetically observed that I have since heard the same gentlemen play with fine expression. The horns are favorites with me and an orchestra would not be complete without those beautiful instruments.

The Association commenced with one of my old favorite Glee's, "Awake AEolian Lyre, Awake." The opening strain is not one of easy rendering, and without great attention to the largo movement with its first grand close on the dominant, that cautious awakening so necessary to the slumbering lure, is entirely lost. In order to preserve the full effect of this movement, a tremolo vibrato should be employed to awake its drowsy strings from its forgetfulness with nature's simple ease.

It appears by the author's working of the second period on the dominant "and give to rapture" that he had reserved for the finale of his first subject the thorough awakening of the Instrument so descriptive of its joyous arousing. "From Helicons Harmonious Springs," is a lively imitation of parts, which produces a fine tonic termination. "The laughing flowers around them blow, Drink life and fragrance as they flow" is too far fetched, and the author has not succeeded in a good interpretation of the poetry. The first line is truthful enough, but the second one "Drink life and fragrance as they flow" is too gloomy with its termination on the submediant.

"Now the rich streams of music winds along, deep, majestic, smooth and strong" is a passage slow, grand and expressive, and its alliance with the poetry is of close relationship. "Through verdant vales and Ceres golden reign," is a passage bordering on the pastorale at the opening; but as the subject proceeds it gains strength, and before the movement is terminated its expression is truly tremento and the effect produced by the finale is such, that it has secured a long life amongst some of the Glee's of our best composers.

The Association not only gave a truthful interpretation to what I have explained, but some portions of the Glee were excellent in its performance. Of course one would not measure a mixed choral body of pupils, giving their second concert under the direction of their master, with a chorus of professional performers, conducted by a Costa; yet it may be truthfully said that they did credit to their master as a first rate class teacher.

The duet "Hark 'tis music stealing," by Mrs. Trosper and Mrs. Horsley, would have been, for they both have
good voices, a favorable performance, but for the non-conception of the piece, and the stiff execution of one of the passages. In the first place it was a "leettle" too slow, and in the second the triplets were unskillfully treated. The first fault can easily be remedied, and the second also. To avoid the second, the mouth should be kept moderately opened and the tongue still and horizontal. The passage would then be of easy execution, while the moving of the tongue causes a stiff and uncouth delivery of the notes.

"In Jewry God is known" is a great favorite in all cathedral cities in the old country, and it is a favorite through its excellence and not from any capricious popularity; for it has stood the test of much trial. The class in this anthem, as in the glee sang with marked expression and good enunciation and precision. If fault there were, it was that the latter strain lacked energy; but upon the whole it was rendered with great credit. Indeed I expected from the manner in which it was sung that an encore would have followed; but such was not the case, and only a solitary echo of applause was heard throughout that gorgeous building.

This, at first, would seem discouraging; but a mature reflection would not expect, only from a highly cultivated musical audience, full appreciation of classical compositions.

I well remember, in the old country, when an oratorio could only be heard at long intervals in few places, and not without great expense to the lovers of the grand and majestic; but now tens of thousands can appreciate the beauties and glories of Handel, Mozart, Haydn and a host of other great masters.

Class teaching at the time to which I refer, was not known or most only in its infancy. Sight reading was then a work of much study and lengthened practice. Theory of sounds belonged to the Germans and Italians only; and the varied mixtures of harmony was a perfect secret, except to the above people. When the professors of music in England knew but little of harmony; it could not be expected that an English audience could understand classical works. But times are changed and in England the choruses of Handel and other great masters, are becoming familiar to the mass, and the grand Hallelujah chorus of the immortal Handel is almost as popular as "I wish I was in Dixie." Take heart, therefore, good teacher, and never tire until the like glorious consummation is reached in the land of the saints.

The stabet mater of Rossini was his last, best, and most classical work. Every piece in that Cantata is of the highest school of composition. The bravura passages require
great animation and volatility of execution, and it cannot be rendered effective without the study and experience of a great artist—At present I must say Maddie Ursenbach is not qualified to render such pieces with the effect that is required to excel. In the first place her execution was not regular, and again her ascending division of tones were anything but faultless. Let Maddie Ursenbach study—as all great singers are required to study for excellence—and doubtless in time she will find her reward by being pronounced an accomplished vocalist. Moreover, Italian music is not the element of an English or an American audience; and I would advise her to study well the English language—if she be not already acquainted with it—and select for her performances some of the excellent cavatines of Bishop; such as "Tell me my heart," "Ho! hear the gentle lark," "Trifler forbear," and a host of compositions of this class.

"Who will care for Mother now," is a composition of great expression; and I must say that the singing of the solo part by Mr. Dunbar was a creditable performance, but that irresistible comic face and attitude of his is much against him in this style of composition. The celebrated "Leston" was a tragedian by nature, but his face was of that peculiar comic form that his best hits in that line were laughed at by the audience and he was wise enough to change his tragic performance to comic and he succeeded in being considered the most accomplished comedian in England.

The "Bridal Wreath Quadrille" by Professor Thomas was a composition of great merit, and I must in honesty confess that I like the composer's style. The interpretation of this piece by the band was all that could be desired. "Man the Life Boat" was a failure. Mr. Isaacson should not make choice of such compositions requiring great pathos and wild expression. It is more in the recitative style, and requires great strength of rendering, which can only be given effectively by an accomplished singer. The gentleman's voice, if not of the highest order, is one that can be made useful and effective also.

The comic singing of Mr. Dunbar was of first class order, and the unanimous approval of the audience proves his high standing in public estimation.

I would fain notice the whole of their pieces, did space permit, but I must be content with adding that the performances of the Association with the exception of a few stumbles in the precision of time—were excellent.

It is only a little over two years that the Association began their elementary study, and now they appear in concert and are able to sustain their reputation as creditable amateurs not inferior to many long established soci-
etities in the old country.

All praise is due to the patient and persevering teachings of their master, Mr. Calder, and the time is not far distant when he will be hailed as the pioneer to a great and glorious movement by the Territory at large.

It must also be a gratifying consideration to those influential patrons of the Association, who have rendered their assistance in fostering this society, for art would droop and die without such aid. Long may they continue their support to so worthy a cause, and depend the domestic circle will soon feel the hallowed influence of music by its introduction, and the magic delights of this most beautiful art will adorn many a household fireside.

I should be remiss in my duty did I omit to make honorable mention of the excellent conducting of Professor Thomas in connection with his band; and also the creditable manner in which the gentleman accompanied the vocal orchestra of the Association.

By the way, I had nearly forgotten one of the greatest features of the concert, viz., the appearance of the Association at the rising of the curtain. In some orchestras the members walk in separately or in two's and three's, and it takes a considerable time before the whole of them are seated, and not withstanding their appropriate costume the effect on the audience, by this scattered entrance in the concert room is entirely lost. —In other orchestras the conductor, marshal, on his Soprani Alti, Tenori and Bassi in succession, himself bringing up the rear; and, if he is not well up to the mark, a certain amount of confusion is the result, and three or four pieces are performed before the audience are in sufficient humor to listen to the singing. —Mr. Calder, in his form, adopted the dramatic and invisible arranging of his orchestra, and never in my life did I feel the effect so great. The unique and innocent appearance of the members, in their beautiful but simple costume, on the rising of the curtain, and the simultaneous movement to a standing position on the lifting of the magic baton by the conductor could not fail to strike admiration to the beholder.

I will say but little on the appearance of the Theatre lest, through my ignorance of archetectural design, I should be thought trifling; but I may be allowed to say that in that great Babylon of the world—London—there are but three that will surpass it, viz., the Queen's Theatre, Hay Market; the Italian Opera, Covent Garden; and The National Theatre, Drury Lane; and perhaps with these exceptions, there are no others in England that will equal it. —

---

1 Deseret News (Salt Lake City) Oct. 21, 1863, Vol. 13.
MUSIC OF MOZART AND LOCKE

The passing of Mozart's overture to Figaro and Locke's celebrated Macbeth music, without special notice, would lead many to suppose that our critics were incompetent to the task of reviewing the inspirations of these two immortal composers, therefore, we cannot allow the present opportunity to go by without paying tribute to the merits of the above works.

It is now nearly two years since we have had the pleasure of hearing the weird compositions of Locke in Shakespear's great play Macbeth.

Locke's treatment of the poetry in this immortal tragedy has, in fact, almost converted it to a semi-opera; and indeed the play could not be so faithfully interpreted without the aid of the musical weird inspirations of Locke.

It has not only added scenic variety to the tragedy, but it has portrayed with much vividity Shakespear's ideas of the weird incantations of the witches so prevalent in the minds of the superstitious in Macbeth's time.

Before analyzing this great composition, we will make a few brief remarks on the subject of Mozart's splendid overture to Figaro and of its rendition by our band on Mon. evening September 20, 1869.

The overture to Figaro, not only abounds in brilliant prestissimo executional unisonic passages, but its contrapuntic harmonical beauties, are predominating throughout the composition.

Not only is Mozart unique in his melodical linking of sections and periods but his varied development of subjects shines forth in beauteous unity with his versatile harmonic combinations.

He is strong; he is majestic; he is impressive and inspiring, at the same time his graceful progressions are the same in effect, and the varied culminating creations brought out in his grand final movements displays wonderful genius. In fact such combinations as we have above named cannot be surpassed by an ancient or modern writer in the overture school of composition.

To render the difficulties of a work of this class with full effect requires not only the brilliant execution of the artists, but it also requires great study and practice of the artists, before an effective interpretation of the ideas of this celebrated composer can be produced.
Notwithstanding the many requirements necessary to conquer these difficulties, our orchestral band did justice to this noble composition.

The principal leading violin was up to the mark. The ripieno violin added weight to the principle instrument. The second violin was not behind with effect, and the contra bass also did its work.

The violoncello brought out many beauties with its pizzicatto and we were much pleased to see the introduction of this beautiful quartetto instrument in the orchestra. The flute also rendered good service, and we cannot omit to repeat our compliment of praise to Mr. Mark Croxwall for his purity and volume of tone and graceful executions produced by him on the cornet in this fine composition. In speaking of the pianoforte we can truly assert that this instrument is capable of producing great effects in a small band like ours; and to say that Professor Pratt brought out much brilliancy of execution and strength of expression in this overture is only saying what is due to this gentleman.

The applause which was tendered to the band by the audience for their faithful interpretation of Figaro was well deserved, and we were much pleased by the discovery that we had thrown aside our usual lethargy in showing our approval of what is good, and that we intended in future to render an honest stimulation to the orchestra for their endeavors to entertain us. We also feel confident that with proper applause that Professor Careless and the whole of the members of his band will study and practice, in order to produce a variety of first-class compositions to render the band entertainment worthy of approval.

In the two following issues of the Utah Magazine Mr. Tullidge analyses the music and production of Locke's Macbeth Music in an extended account.

1 Utah Magazine (Salt Lake City), 1869, p. 347.
APPENDIX II

MUSIC IN EARLY UTAH DAYS

The plant on which the musical taste of Utah grew had its roots in far off Nauvoo. It was a flourishing tree there when the storms broke that overwhelmed the Saints, but it was taken from the soil, nurtured with care in the journey across the plains and transplanted in the more congenial climes of "The Valley," where its branches today shed sweetness and fragrance on "Wide neighborhoods of man."

A vivid recollection of my childhood is hearing my grandmother, Elizabeth Ann Whitney, wife of Bishop Newel K. Whitney, sing many of the songs of Nauvoo. She was familiarly known in the early days as "The Sweet Singer of Zion," and she and her husband being intimate friends of the prophet Joseph Smith, she often sang for him in Kirtland and Nauvoo. She, Aunt "Em" Wells, Eliza R. Snow, the late Bathebe Smith and others loved to exchange recollections of the Nauvoo days, when they were members of the Temple choir, when they sang at various functions in the famous "Mansion House," and with others formed the nucleus of the vocal musical organizations which made up an important part of the social and church life of the "Mormon" city.

How highly the Church leaders of those days regarded music is shown by the fact that there were several choirs, and one or more bands in Nauvoo; one chorus was of considerable size and it sang for the general assemblages of the Saints in the Masonic Hall or in the grove, the latter during summer worship. The Temple Choir was the smaller organization.

What these choirs were to vocal music in Nauvoo, the famous Nauvoo Brass Band was to instrumental music. This band was organized in January, 1842, by Wm. Pitt, later called Joseph's City Band, but its name was changed to the Nauvoo Brass Band sometime later. From all accounts, it was quite an efficient group of musicians and the many parts it played in the stirring military life of Nauvoo are often referred to in the histories of those times. The Nauvoo Brass Band, under Wm. Pitt, deserves a chapter by itself. When the people left Nauvoo and started on near Council
Bluffs of today, the band was over in the lead. It cheered the hearts of the marchers by its martial strains, and its members scattered into smaller groups and played around the campfires at night. When the journey of the Pioneers brought them anywhere near an Iowa town or village, the band would send an agent ahead, engage a hall and give a concert and some of these events brought notable additions to the stores of the Pioneers.

Early in the fall of 1847, as soon as the music forces of the Pioneers had assembled in the valley of the Great Salt Lake, the old spirit of the Nauvoo days began to manifest itself, and the organizations which had flourished in Illinois, began to reflowerish in Utah. The Great Tabernacle Choir of today began its career by singing in the bowery on the temple block used for summer worship, and later in the old adobe tabernacle which stood where the Assembly Hall is now located. The first leader of the choir was John Parry, father of Bishop Parry of the 16th ward, who has inherited his father's talents as a composer. He was born in 1789, and was one of the early Welsh converts to the Church. He died in 1863. Stephen Goddard, James Smithies, C. J. Thomas, Robert Sands, grandfather of the gifted musician, Jennie Sands, and George Careless followed. On Prof. Careless's resignation in 1880, he was succeeded by Prof. E. Beesley, who was followed by Prof. Evan Stephens, the present conductor. Messrs. Goddard and Smithies, both led choirs in Nauvoo. Mr. Joshua Midgley, who died in May, 1912, and his wife, were members of the Choir of 1852. Mrs. Midgley still survives. Mr. Midgley informed me that in those days there was no organ here, but seventeen or eighteen instrumentalists furnished the accompaniments for the choir. He performed upon the bass viol, and prior to his arrival here had played with the choir in St. Louis in company with John M. Jones and Frederick Weight, two others of the early day music forces.

The Nauvoo brass band was reorganized in Salt Lake City under the direction of Capt. Pitt, almost as soon as the exiles had taken their bearings in the valleys of the mountains. Today the only survivor of the notable organization is the verterna actor, Phil Margetts. Other leading members who long since passed away, in addition to Capt. Pitt, were: Henry Margetts, Barnett and Seth Rigby, Wm. Dunn, etc.

Another notable band of those days was that organized by Capt. Ballou, whom I have often heard my father describe as the most accomplished clarinet player he ever heard. Ballou's band and the Nauvoo Brass Band, joined forces on Feb. 14, 1853, when ground for the temple was broken, and again, on April 6, 1853, at the services for the laying of the corner stone. Ballou, immediately after this, composed the march entitled, "The Cap Stone March," hoping that his
band might play it when the temple was completed, but few of the players ever lived to play it when the temple was completed, or to see the final stone of the structure placed in position forty years later. A notable exception was the veteran double bass player, Joshua Midgley. He not only played at the two ceremonies, but when the capstone was placed in 1893, he also took part. Ballou and his band were the builders of the hall that once bore his name on West First South Street, and many notable dances were given there in pioneer days to the music of the band.

From the Nauvoo Brass band radiated small bands and soloists without number. One organization called the "Shanghai" band, was especially notable at the dancing entertainments of those days.

When the Social Hall was opened in 1853, there was a rare entertainment at which a band called the "African Band" took part, but I have not been able to secure any information as to its makeup, or the character of its work.

Dimmick Huntington's noted Martial Band, dear to every boy who celebrated July 4th or 24th, in those days, reached its greatest proficiency in the sixties.

The composer, John Tullidge, who came from England in the sixties, wrote music for the Tabernacle Choir, which was of a high grade, and his anthem, "How Beautiful Upon the Mountains," is still sung by the larger choirs of the Church.

Such names as David C. Calder, A. C. Smythe, Mark Croxall, the accomplished cornetist and others belong in the later days of our development and can hardly be included in the term "Pioneer," though they exerted a great influence in the twenty years between 1860 and 1880.

The favorite vocal soloist of the early days was Mr. John Kay, whose singing of the old song, "The Sea," gave him a great reputation among the Pioneers. It was no doubt from hearing him render "The Sea," that President John Taylor fitted his hymn of "The Seer" to the same tune. W. C. Dunbar, another soloist sang at the opening of the theatre in 1862, and had previously acquired fame through the "Sing Zion, Brother Dunbar" episode of Echo canyon war times.

I have not been able to learn the names of the individual pianists and organists of the early days, except those of Orson Pratt, Jr., and Fanny Young, later Fanny Thatcher. She and her sister Dora, played in the old adobe tabernacle in the early sixties when the once famous organ blower "Charlie Moore" officiated, but there were many pianos and organs brought across the plains long before
the advent of the railroad, and the prominent teachers of those days seem to have been Mr. Cook and Orson Pratt, Jr. Think of the love of music that would justify buying a square piano in St. Louis—they were all square in those days, the upright was then unknown—and having it hauled 1,500 miles across the plains by oxen or mule teams!

The famous tabernacle organ of today was built by the veteran, Joseph Ridges, who is still living, and it was first heard when the Tabernacle was dedicated, October 6, 1867.

The organist at that time and for many years after, was Prof. Joseph J. Daynes, who had played the organ in the old adobe building. On Mr. Daynes' retirement some years ago, he was succeeded by the present organist, Prof. J. J. McClellan.

The opening of the Salt Lake Theatre, in March, 1862, witnessed a strong revival in musical affairs in Salt Lake. Prof. C. J. Thomas, an experienced London musician, was placed in charge of a group of twenty musicians and asked to form an orchestra for the Theatre.

In 1865, Prof. Thomas went to St. George, and his place as leader of the Theatre orchestra and later of the Tabernacle choir, was taken by Prof. George Careless, a young London musician, who reorganized the Theatre orchestra by retaining only five of the original players as follows: David Evans, H. K. Whitney, E. Beesley, Mark Roxall and Joshua Midgley. He added Orson Pratt, Jr. as pianist and with himself as first violin, formed an efficient orchestra of seven. The new organization was placed on a salary basis, which made it possible to get better results than under the old conditions, when Prof. Thomas says, "all the remuneration received had been in the shape of theatre tickets. Prof. Careless was in charge of the choir at the opening of the great Tabernacle of today which occurred in 1867. He enlarged the body of singers, and with his wife, the gifted Lavinia Careless, whose voice was often compared to that of Patti, as soloist, the Tabernacle choir was given a fame which extended throughout the country. The only survivors of Prof. Thomas' old orchestra are himself, Henry Sadler, Thomas McIntyre and Stephen Alley. Prof. Thomas himself, is now in charge of the Temple Choir. Prof. Careless is still actively following the profession of teaching; his hymns are universally sung by the choirs and Sunday Schools throughout the Church.1

---

APPENDIX III

THEATRE MUSIC

Until the railroad was built, Professor Careless composed all the dramatic and curtain music including many musical plays, such as "Pocahontas," "Cinderella," "Aladdin," "The Crystal Slipper," etc. The libretto for "Aladdin" was in his possession for six weeks but he forgot it until one morning he noticed on the theatre "Call board," "Chorus for Aladdin 8 o'clock tonight." He hurried to his office, asked John Tullidge to get his pens ready for copy and started to write. He composed all the choruses that day and finished the solos, duets, marches, dances, dramatic music, etc., next day—in all forty numbers. Such was his prodigious capacity for work! "Aladdin" had a longer run than any other play before or during his regime. Julia Dean Hayne took the part of Aladdin.

When Julia Dean Hayne came to Salt Lake she brought "Gamea," a play especially written for her. Manager Clawson sent to San Francisco for the dramatic music, and this was played at the first rehearsal. But Julia Dean went to Professor Careless and said, "I cannot act to that music. What shall I do?" Professor Careless said: "I will write it for you by tomorrow's rehearsal." When the newly composed music was played at the rehearsal next day Hiram came to the footlights and said, "George, that music is a fine example for you." But Mrs. Hayne spoke up and said, "Mr. Clawson, that is not your San Francisco music. I could not use it. Mr. Careless has written this for me since yesterday." It is needless to say Hiram was astonished and the then large sum of $40.00 paid for the San Francisco music went glimmering.

Another incident showing the aptitude of Professor Careless for meeting any emergency is related as follows:

One morning, during the engagement of Lucille Western, he asked the prompter, Henry McEwan, if there was any music in the play that evening. The prompter replied that there was none. The conductor thought it rather strange, so before the doors were opened, he arrived and found on the piano about 35 cues. He hurried to the band room and told the men. "What are you going to do?" he was asked.

"Well," the Professor said, "There's no other way
out of it—I will have to improvise the entire night, and Orson (Orson Pratt, Jr.) you will play my accompaniment on the piano." And so they did. Next morning, the famous actress said she had never played to music that so fitted her acting and she would like a copy.

"I'm sorry," said the Professor, "but I cannot give it to you."

"Oh," she said, "I'll pay you any price for it."

"I'll have to let you into the secret," Professor Careless said. "I was told there were no cues in the play, so having written, I had to improvise the entire night."

When the great Davenport played "Macbeth," Professor Careless put on "Locke's Witches music with about two hundred in the Witches Chorus. After the scene, Mr. Piper, owner of the Piper Opera House in Virginia City, called him out of the orchestra, and offered him a position in his theatre with a guaranty of six hundred dollars a month in gold, and a certainty of receiving four hundred more on the side.¹

¹ Pyper, *Romance of an Old Playhouse*, 1928, pp. 141-143.
APPENDIX IV

Evan Stephens

Stephens is a unique personality in the realm of Utah's music. He is a young old man, having done in his 32 or 33 years a prodigious amount of class teaching, chorus training and composition. If music had been to him a "Damned spot, he would not out." We hear that some men are wound up for thirty, some for forty, some for fifty years. Evidence is very good that Mr. Stephens is only half unwound as yet. He can no more help planning interesting musical enterprises than he can help thinking songs. He is a conductor sui generis. He has been kind enough to send the writer of this sketch of his life path thus far, and its wayside environment, which abounds in incidents of romance, mingled with hard trial in climbing his hill of difficulty. He was sure that the land of pure delight, with music as its God, lay upon the further slope, and so he knew not whether he was cold or hot dry or weary, only so that he could go forward. What a spur is in that brief sentence to the supine students of the art divine, who think that excellence will come to them while they are halting along in every gradum ad Parnassus. Mr. Stephen is from Wales and there was poetic justice in his meeting his countrymen on the field of artistic contest and carrying off a prize well struggled for at the Eisteddfod in the sublime White City. He almost scorned the second prize--said it should have been first.

The world wondered that he and his forces from the canyons of remote Utah should have dared to compete with those magnificently trained choirs, but when they won, the world said, "What manner of man is this?" Well just the kind of man who gladly went to work as shepherder and then as section hand on the railroad, to get money to buy music books, toiled ten hours a day and composed music, and plays, and operettas and choruses, and then threw them away because they fell short of his goal of truth.

My mind was filled with ideal music which I could not write. I seemed to live in a musical world aloud, especially when toiling on the farm. I took a job at Logan (striking for a blacksmith in the railroad yards) and became organist for the choir on Sundays. This led to my acquaintance with Bishop Preston, who has been an unfailing aid to me in accomplishing many things here in Salt Lake. Classes were provided for me, two
hundred juveniles concert in the Theatre, the four hundred more. In 1886 I went to the New England conservatory, and was instructed by George Chadwick in harmony, and by Whitney in composition. After a year I returned to Salt Lake and organized an opera company, which successfully rendered "Bohemian Girl," "Martha," and "Fille du Regiment." The concert for the Calveston suffers brought together the vocalists of the city. Then a chorus for Gillmore's Band was desired, which was given and this resulted in organizing the Choral Society. At this time I was appointed conductor of the Tabernacle Choir. The Choral Society gave two June festivals under my direction. "Buck's Light of Asia," Haydn's "Creation" and "Spring." The choir have been self-sustaining with their concerts, have had a trip to the World's Fair and gained a fairly good reputation for their work. I have had charge of the Normal musical class at the University for ten years, and nearly a thousand normals have left there with some talented young people, who are forging away with their voices.

Following 1895 Mr. Stephens, by means of concert tours, made large audiences of the East and the West acquainted with Utah attainment in choral music. His composition marks a progressive addition and commendable contribution to sacred music expression.

Mr. Stephens died October 27, 1930.

1 The Daily Tribune, January 6, 1895. (Salt Lake City)
APPENDIX V

EISTEDDFOD ADJUDICATIONS

The Adjudicators tell us how and why contests were won and lost.

The real educational part of the late Eisteddfod was given through the adjudications on the different contests. The musical adjudicators, Messrs. Evans, Watkins and Davis, were gentlemen of high musical ability and culture and their opinions as to the merits and demerits of the different renditions are very valuable to the student of music and the lover of voice culture.

Following are some of the verdicts exactly as given by the adjudicators in the Eisteddfod and their perusal will be interesting.

The Grand Chorus

The first paper is the adjudication on the grand chorus of mixed voices:

Chief Choral Competition

Chorus A (Glorious Songs of Freedom) voices rather coarse, bass bad in the opening, too boisterous. Reading as a whole correct, intonation very much in danger throughout, owing to the coarseness of the voices. Intonation on 8th page bad for the first five measures. Articulation was fairly good, phrasing not good, sopranos singing triplet, which is wrong. Accent forced and in some places accenting the second syllable of the word "power." Time, a little fast, lacked firmness and precision in places owing to this. Attack was quite good, excepting on 9th m. 8th page. Change of time on the prayer bad. Very ragged.

Chorus b (Wales of Deseret). Attack of this not good. No working out of climaxes, taking too much liberty with the time, waiting between different movements. Work as a whole was crude.

Choir No. 2

Chorus a (Glorious Songs of Freedom). Better quality of voices than No. 1; blending good, balance good,
phrasing good; one place bad, on 2nd m. 4th page, word "dungeons" not good, wrongly phrased. Good interpretation. Climaxes well worked, expression good throughout, articulation good; good dramatic ending.

Chorus b (Vales of Deseret). The whole work well sung; singing lightly and easily, as a glee should be sung. Nice shading; articulation very clean; the tra-la-la very playful and not too loud to cover tenor and bass, which should be a little prominent as sung by this choir. A very good rendition.

Chorus No. 3

First chorus--(Glorious Songs of Freedom)--Voices of this choir good, refined quality. Work on this chorus good, but too tame. Introduction was good excepting on the 6th page in the unison parts which were badly out of tune. Expression was good, excepting the prayer, this lacked feeling. There was a lack of fullness in the body of tone.

Second chorus--(Vales of Deseret)--Not as well sung as the first chorus. Did not sing as if they were sure of it; lacked firmness throughout; on the 2nd page, 4th m. parts at sea, almost causing a complete break. Attack throughout this chorus was uncertain. This choir has refined voices and shows intelligence; if augmented in numbers and practiced well together would make a very formidable competitor.

Chorus No. 4

First chorus--(Glorious Songs of Freedom)--This choir had good voices, but were too sulky in executing. The bass on the opening were particularly unwieldy and stiff. Reading and articulation were good. The intonation throughout the whole chorus was in doubt, owing to the forcing of the voices. Attack was fair; very bad on 9th m., 8th page. Expression not good; forcing too much. The six marks were very much overdone.

Second chorus--(Vales of Deseret)--Opening was rough, forcing as in the first chorus. The chorus lacked character throughout, ending first page not good; parts not stopping together. No effective shading done. This choir would be capable of good work if it would give more attention to the characters and finishing of their work. Haydn Evans, T. J. Davies, J. T. Watkins.

Following is given in full the verdict as rendered by the adjudicators on the male chorus competition:
Chorus No. 1

(G. J. Thomas)—Voices, fair; balance, fair; intonation, faulty; articulation, poor, attack fair, and precision poor, gaining very much from the allegro to the end. Tempo, a little too slow on the start, although it was well worked out by the leader. Faulty intonation by first tenors, page No. 1, 13th bar "D" sharp, and second tenor, page No. 1, 19th bar "B," word "love" very open, same page No. 2; seventh bar, and again the first tenors were slightly off pitch, page No. 3, 5th bar "D" sharp. The first tenors grew weaker as the climax on the last page was being reached, should have had reserve force enough to have made the ending the fitting climax which is intended by the composer. This chorus has its merits and demerits.

Chorus No. 2

(Harmony)—Voices better than first party, but still there was a voice or two in the first tenors so prominent that it marred to a considerable extent the singing throughout; balance good; intonation good with the above exception; articulation very good; blending good; phrasing good; precision steady and vigorous; tempo good; expression very good. The party sang with considerable finish, but the first and second tenors through the many open tones produced destroyed in some places the harmony, at times almost going off pitch, nevertheless the singing of this club as a whole was very satisfactory.

Chorus No. 3

(Ogden)—Voices fair; balance fair; intonation fair; articulation fair; blending poor; attack fair; precision and tempo good; expression fair. The first and second tenors of this party were somewhat below the standard, the second tenors especially giving us more trouble. The majority of men singing second tenor should sing first bass. The leaders of these male choruses should be extremely careful in the placing of the voices, and in order to get good results the parts should be well balanced and blended together. This was the only part observing (which we think is correct and effective) the solo part page No. 4, second brace, but the forcing of the tenor page 4, bar No. 12 made very bad work of it. The call "To Arms" by the second tenors, page No. 8, owing to the weakness of some, was very ineffective. The youthful conductor strove hard for good and effective singing, but in consequence of the poor material at hand, better results could hardly have been expected.

Chorus No. 4

(Orpheus)—Voices very good, especially low bass;
balance very good; intonation good; articulation fair; blending very good throughout; attack very good, with determination to conquer and this effect reached without forcing the voices. Precision well maintained to the end; tempo good, the various changes well brought out and carried through to successful and fitting climax, parasing good; expression very good. The singing of this chorus was characterized with considerable finish, the light and shade splendidly, handled giving confidence to the adjudicators that they were well controlled. The great fault found with this chorus was the articulating of the vowels and consonants "ear the shout," "len dof Mona," instead of "Hear the shout;" and "Land of Mona." We found more or less of this faulty articulation with all of the choruses. The solo parts were well sung, in unison, page No. 4, 7th and 8th bars, and 14th and 16th. In this party we felt the true spirit of this magnificent war song displayed. The second tenors on page No. 8, "To Arms," on B being very effective, the first of parties to properly sustain it, and all of the voices united in splendid form in making this ending a fitting climax to a most artistic rendition of the "Sound of war falls on my ear."

The adjudicators without hesitation make the following award:
No. 3, first prize.
No. 2, second prize.

The Female Chorus
Following is the adjudication on the female chorus.

Party No. 1
Voices, very good quality and well balanced, pleasing, good intonation, slightly off pitch, page 4, 10th bar.

Articulation, very good, and the voices blending nicely. The attack on pages 1 and 6, "Come, come," etc.

Precision, fair, somewhat hurried, but were well under the control of the leader. The tempo was rather fast, a few pulsations slower would have been better. The singing of this party was very good throughout and made a very pretty bridal rendition.

Party 2, Female Choir
Voices, good; the low alto very good the balance of parts fair, the second soprano marring the intonation in many places, and in consequence the blending of the parts was not quite as satisfactory as the first. Attack on page
l and 6 good. The tempo of this party was also too fast, somewhat faster than the first. Phrasing extremely good, the ending of bars 6, 8, and 10 was done to a nicety; precision good; expression good. The singing of this party as a whole was also very sweet, excelling in attack and precision the first party, but lacked in light and shade.

Female Chorus No. 3

Voices, fair; balance, fair; articulation, fair; intonation, fair; blending ordinary; the second soprano too light and of poor quality, and the first soprano on page 4, where the solo starts, contained too many voices of different qualities of tones, and the alto sang chest tones too high. If this is not remedied soon, it will be the ruin of their voice. Great care should be taken in the blending of the different registers of the voice the transitions from one to the other should be made as smoothly and evenly and passing points made strong through careful vocalization and culture. Tempo too slow; phrasing fair. It was nevertheless a commendable rendition.

The adjudicators in awarding the prize recognize the closeness of the competition between the first and second parties that the only satisfactory conclusion and also a unanimous one, is that the first prize be divided between No. 1 and 2 and the second prize given to No. 3.

Ladies' Quartet

The adjudication on the ladies' quartette is as follows:

Quartette No. 1

Voices fair, soprano thin, and unsteady in tones production. Balance second soprano and low alto too weak in most places. Introduction second alto off pitch page 3, sixty bar, articulation fair, blending poor, no assimilation of the voices. Attack fair. This selection should have been rendered with more emphasis given the first beat in the bar. Precision poor, the low alto dragging very much; making the singing sluggish and cumbersome. The tempo extremely slow throughout and became very monotonous. They failed to carry the pitch raising it a half tone, this fact alone sometimes debars competitors from wishing. The expression was very ordinary.

Ladies' Quartette No. 2

Voices fair, low alto poor, first soprano shrill in the upper register, second soprano on page 3, bar 5, was bad. Blending there seemed to have been a fraction between the voices and lack of affinity which made blend-
ing almost impossible. Balance, we found the second soprano too weak for the other voices. Intonation fair, low alto off pitch page 3, second bar, articulated fair, phrasing fair, precision poor, tempo too slow, both parties being very deficient in the expressive quality necessary to better portray the sentiment of this beautiful song. They also failed to maintain the pitch raising the same half a tone. Adjudication given by Jno. T. Watkins.

Church Choir Contest

The Church or ward choir contest was decided as follows and for the following reasons:

Contest on the glee, "The Summer," by Gwilym Gwent. We have heard this glee so frequently, that, like all other familiar things, it must be exceptionally well rendered in order to make any remarkable impression. Generally speaking, the three choirs that competed acquitted themselves very creditably.

Choir No. 1

The andante maestoso was taken up in good style and time; and the commodo taken gradually faster, as it should be. The quality of the voices was not to be commended in this choir, the altos and tenors being at times a little harsh and strained. I should have liked the andante marcato movement somewhat slower in order to give better contrast to the other movements. It would also show up the melody to better advantage in this portion, while the voices accompanied it softly in staccato. The sopranos took the liberty of too much portamento in the melody at times, which slightly marred the beauty of its legato character. I should prefer it cleanly sang without this sliding effect. The allegro was in good tune. It is faulty to end the tied notes in the last bar with an accent of jar.

Choir No. 2

This choir sang the movement much in the same tempo as choir No. 1. The voices were somewhat better and fuller. The alto part in this choir was much weaker than the other parts. In the andante marcato, the lower voices (alto, tenor and bass) would have showed the melody better had they sang softer. The tempo here also might be a little slower. The runs in the last movement were nicely done, and the ending was better than that of the first choir.

Choir No. 3

The andante maestoso tempo was proper. The commodo was—I should say—slightly fast. Andante marcato
was shown to better advantage than that given by the first and second choirs. The time was slower, the melody was more beautiful, while the lower part was light and soft, as it should be. The allegro was clear, light and cleanly executed. The voices in this choir were better than that of the choirs Nos. one and two, and the lights and shades, blending, and general interpretation better. Without the least hesitation we award the prize to choir No. three.

--T. J. Davis, Mus. Bac.

Prize Composition

The adjudication on the composition for the male chorus is as follows:

Adjudicator Mr. T. J. Davies, Mus. Bac., Scranton, Pa., on the male chorus composition, Salt Lake City, Eisteddfod, October 3 and 4, 1895.

Twelve compositions were received for the best musical composition, suitable for male chorus, (composers to select their own words) bearing the following names:


Since I have carefully marked the erroneous progress one of each composer on the MSS, I will not mention them here, but simple confine myself to a few brief remarks on the comparative character and merit of each writer.

The least pretentious of these compositions is the one assigned to E. F. Parry, it being cast in the plainest part--song form--without any desire for extension or independent part-writing.

The next in length is a beautiful part-song entitled "Alone," by Cambrian. He uses the proper G clef for the tenor parts. This writer is melodious, scholarly, and finished in every detail.

Basso Cantata's subject is "The Sailor's Song." The initial unison phrase is not a happy one, passing, as it does, from the tonic to the seventh of the key. Unhappily this portion is frequently repeated throughout the work. The harmonies in several places are rather crude; nevertheless B of cantata shows much ability, and would fare to better advantage in this competition were it not for his introducing so much foreign matter to the home key toward the end; after which he fails to establish the freedom necessary to from a happy and satisfactory finish.

Oregonian gives his description of A Storm at Sea
which covers twenty-one pages of full-sized music paper. He, doubtless has a gift for melody, but is sadly wanting in the means for harmonious dress.

Bertini writes in a light, pleasing manner. His form as regards cantata movements and change of key is the best part of his work. His shortcoming is the same as that of Oregonian—the want of originality and harmonic color. It is strange that one who writes so melodiously should have so many errors in his part writing.

Plaidy—This writer reminds me of the author of the technical studies for the pianoforte, for, indeed, his effort, comparatively, is almost as dry as five finger exercises. The unison given to the bass parts in the opening is uncouth and barren of any melodic effect. The matter following has little affinity with the initial phrase, on the second page there is incongruity of tonality, where the upper tetrachord in D minor is followed by that of the lower tetrachord in D major. There is nothing for any serious consideration in this author. He is more befitting where he portrays the Reapers.

Ap Ohio has written a war chorus. While he has much that is commendable, he failed to reach any high mark. The words are those of the "Camorian War Song," so ably treated by the late Brinley Richards in the Songs of Wales.

Masman submits to our consideration a sacred chorus of considerable length. The first chorus and the solos following it exhibit good taste, and are nicely worked out, with the exception of a few blemishes in the harmonies. The De Capo portion lacks the interest of the first portion of the work. With some remodeling of the concluding portion, this composition may be useful for church male choirs.

Sons of the Sea by "A Sailor," is a happy little work. He is contented with writing in a light vein. There is nothing much to note in this composition, save that it is pleasing and correctly written.

A writer of much ability, G. Minns, has a composition which he pleases to style a glee. The contrapuntal elaboration of this skillful writer barely justifies the title. There is too much effort on the part of the composer to take advantage of almost every possible opportunity in the display of florid writing, that he sacrifices the grace and elegance of a glee. In several instances the harmonies are faulty, as noted on the copy. I cannot leave this writer without paying him a compliment for displaying much ability. However, the composition must be judged as being more like an ingenious exercise than a meritorious vocal composition.
Pioneer is a writer of much melodic interest. I do not hesitate to say that he is the peer of his competitors in this most essential requisite in musical composition. But the composer who teems with melody beyond his ability of harmonic dress is one who treads on dangerous ground. Sometimes there is extravagance of melodic fragments and in this endeavor, faulty progressions creep in where a more masterly hand would evade trivial temptations. Pioneer's outlines in form are well contrasted. His part-writing and variety of key relation is generally interesting. With more breadth of style and better grammar he might have easily shared the honors in this competition.

Glyndwr soars to loftier heights than do his companions. He has chosen "A Psalm of Life," Longfellow, for his subject. His writing is broad, dignified and boundless in every effort. He has ample reserve throughout; his parts are within the bounds of the average vocalist, always melodious and with faultless rich harmony. He is scholastic and outclasses the other contestants in smoothness and purity of diction. His sequence of idea are towered to a happy climax and ends a work finished in every detail.

--I. J. Davies, Mus. Bac.

\[1\text{ Deseret News (Salt Lake City), Oct. 12, 1895.}\]
APPENDIX VI

"MESSIAH"

A epochal performance in the way of religious music was witnessed in Jan. 9, 1875 by the production of the "Messiah."

Professor Careless was engaged as conductor of the "Handel and Haydn Society," which afterwards changed its name to the "Philharmonic Society," under his conductorship. On the occasion of the performance of the "Messiah" the Deseret News said: "Several months ago something over a hundred (over two hundred) ladies and gentlemen, including and comprising the best musical talent, vocal and instrumental, of this city, organized themselves into a society for promoting musical culture and raising the standard of musical taste in this community. This was a most praiseworthy object, for the excellence which a community attains in musical science and art is no mean criterion by which to judge of its local status."

Of the performance (which was given in the Salt Lake Theatre, with over two hundred performers and a full orchestra) a reviewer in the Salt Lake Herald, Jan. 9, 1875, said: "Taking the orchestra as a whole, and laboring under the difficulties already described, from the fact of the impossibility of placing them on the stage, the effect and result was simply a marvel of excellence—especially with the first violins, whose singing tones so nearly approached the vox humana on several occasions, as to defy all recognition of which was the voice and which the violin. Mr. Kennicott's organ accompaniment also for some of the recitatives and arias was charmingly delicate and yet supporting. Of the solo singers it is difficult to do justice to and not praise in the very highest manner one and all, though we will be pardoned if we make particular mention of Mrs. Haydon, Mrs. Careless, and Miss Haydon among the ladies, and Mr. Williams, Mr. Black and Mr. Holister among the gentlemen. Mr. Horne also, as well as Mr. Podlech, deserve great praise for their admirable singing of music which must be doubly trying to them to sing in English. The gems among the solos were: "Oh thoust that tellest," (by Mrs. Haydon); "Rejoice greatly," (by Miss Haydon); "He was despised," (by Mrs. Haydon); "But thou didst not
leave," [by Mrs. Careless]; "Why do the nations," [by Mr. Black]; "Thou shalt break them," [by Mr. Podlech]; but if we must give the palm of excellence to say it must be in all justice to Mrs. Careless for her beautiful rendition of "I know that my Redeemer liveth." Her singing was simply perfection. We have already called attention to the dis-advantages under which the solo singers labor, but with all these Mrs. Careless' young, fresh voice seemed to defy all difficulties, coming forth with its rich "tombre timbre" bell like sympathetic. If angels had human voices, surely here would suggest heavenly music indeed. Fine, however, as the solo singing was, we must confess that the choruses were the great achievement of the whole entertainment, and taking into consideration the fact that very few of the singers concerned either sing at sight or are entirely familiar with music, Mr. Careless deserves unqualified praise for the masterly way in which they have been trained. Of the choruses the finest were, "For unto us a Child is Born," "All we like Sheep," the "Hallelujah" chorus, and "Worthy is the Lamb."

It is a great thing to be able to say (as the writer can truthfully) that, taken as a whole, the "Messiah," as performed last night, was far superior---both as regards the solos, choruses and orchestra---than the oratorio given in San Francisco some eight months ago, with Madame Anna Bishop, Mrs. Morrison, and several other vocal celebrities. On that occasion the trumpet obligato was played so badly as to nearly compel Madame Anna Bishop to stop singing. Compare with this the excellence of the cornet obligato in Mr. Black's solo, "The Trumpet Shall Sound," by Mr. Croxall, and here is proof of it.

To musical adepts who understand what a worthy execution of a complete oratorial composition means this performance of the "Messiah" in Salt Lake City may fitly be considered as one of the capital events in the musical history of America. There are only a few cities either in England or America, where the "Messiah" can be executed by their local philharmonic societies; and even when given in London itself, the principal vocalists and instrumentalists of all England are sometimes combined to render the oratorio in its full capacity, and that too with a profound realization among the artists that the composition will call into play all the human powers of voice, of soul, of intellect and instrumental execution. And even with such a combination of performers it requires the highest class audience to fully appreciate such music; so that if we can say that Salt Lake City is up to the standard of the "Messiah" (which is too much to affirm in the supreme sense at present) we substantially affirm that Salt Lake City is one of the greatest musical cities in the world. In this view the performance of the "Messiah" in our city in the summer of 1875, by a local philharmonic society under the conductor-
ship of Professor Careless was a prophecy of such a cul-
mination even in his own generation.

In Handel's day London itself was not up to the
standard of the "Messiah." London rejected it. Dublin,
in the month of April, 1842, had the honor of giving to
this immortal work its acceptance.

The "Messiah" is an epic in music. It is the most
complete in construction and voluminous in subject of all
the oratorios. The reviewer of the Herald defined the
oratorio "as a kind of a sacred composition either purely
dramatic or partaking both of the drama and the epic, in
which the text is illustrative of some religious subject." In
this definition the critic has confounded the oratorio
with dramatic compositions of the class of the Shake-
peareian plays, which though very high as comparison is not
theoretically correct. The oratorio is always an epic,
ever a drama in that sense, though true the epic does
compound dramatic elements. The oratorio has the subject
and harmonies of the two worlds combined as the two halves
of one whole; just as the epic poem has the subject and
action of the two worlds combined. . . .

Now the great and relative significance of the
performance of the oratorio of the "Messiah" in Salt Lake
City is, that it marks the beginning of the musical cul-
ture in their supreme line of a people with the genius and
subject of the "Messiah" actually embodied in their whole
history, running now through a fifty-six years' period.
The Mormon Temple, if it survive, will as certainly bring
the oratorio into its service as that its dispensation has
brought in the "gathering" of a modern "Israel from all
nations." The work of a George Careless and others like
him, then, has only just begun. The very prophecies, in
the history of the past of this peculiar community, pro-
claim with trumpet tongue that Salt Lake City in the com-
ing time will be the city of America preeminent in the
oratorio performances. The gentile artists as well as the
"musicians of Israel" will help to accomplish this grand
musical result, for art is not sectarian, but universalian.

Apropos of this latter remark may be noted partic-
ularly the fact that Professor Careless succeeded in com-
bining the principal singers and instrumentalists in a
"Handel and Haydn Society," for the performance of the
"Messiah," without the thought even occurring to the artists
whether their fellows were Mormons or Gentiles. This of
itself was a great musical triumph; and the fact that the
"Messiah" was performed in Salt Lake City in 1875, in a
style as it never was in any city west of Chicago, is most
worthy of a page in our local history; and, as we pass on
to the biography of Salt Lake musicians, the historian may
be allowed the personal expression of a hope that Salt Lake City may witness many repetitions of the example and many such triumphs in musical art.

Of Professor Careless' engagements as a conductor, it may be noted that he conducted the celebrated Parepa Ross concerts, in November, 1868; also the Madame Anna Bishop concert in the large Tabernacle, and the grand Wilhelmj concert in the Theatre, March 6th, 1880. Our talented citizen received the highest praise from the great virtuoso and many marks of his esteem. Since his presentation of the "Messiah," in 1875, he has given the 46th psalm; beautiful cantata "Daughter of Jairus;" made a brilliant success in April, 1879, with Sir Arthur Sullivan's opera, "Pianfore" and in November, 1885, Gilbert and Sullivan's latest and most difficult opera, the "Mikado;" these compositions were rendered by home talent.

In March, 1879, he organized the "Careless Orchestra, which gave a number of a orchestral concerts; and in 1885, he succeeded in organizing the largest local orchestra ever brought together in this city, consisting of forty-five members. 1

1 E. W. Tullidge, History of Salt Lake City. 1886, pp. 774-777.