1984

A Pale Reflection: American Indian Images in Mormon Arts

P. Jane Hafen
Brigham Young University - Provo

Follow this and additional works at: https://scholarsarchive.byu.edu/etd

Part of the Art and Design Commons, Indigenous Studies Commons, and the Mormon Studies Commons

BYU ScholarsArchive Citation
https://scholarsarchive.byu.edu/etd/4734

This Thesis is brought to you for free and open access by BYU ScholarsArchive. It has been accepted for inclusion in All Theses and Dissertations by an authorized administrator of BYU ScholarsArchive. For more information, please contact scholarsarchive@byu.edu, ellen_amatangelo@byu.edu.
A PALE REFLECTION: AMERICAN INDIAN IMAGES IN MORMON ARTS

A Thesis
Presented to the
Department of Humanities
Brigham Young University

In Partial Fulfillment
of the Requirements for the Degree
Master of Arts

by
P. Jane Hafen
April 1984
This thesis, by P. Jane Hafen, is accepted in its present form by the Department of Humanities as satisfying the thesis requirement for the degree of Master of Arts.

Richard H. Cracroft, Chairman

Arthur R. Bassett, Committee Member

14 III 64
Date

Steven P. Sondrup, Graduate Coordinator
CONTENTS

Chapter I  More Than Feeding and Clothing:
Native American Artistic Values ............... 1

Chapter II  "Dignity Befitting the Ancestry:"
The American Indian in Mormon Literature .... 14

Chapter III  "Great Spirit Listen to the Red Man's Wail:"
The American Indian in Mormon Hymns and Music .. 72

Chapter IV  "Classic Features:"
The American Indian in Mormon Visual Arts .... 87

Chapter V  A Pale Reflection:
American Indian Images in Mormon Arts ........ 118

Appendix I:
American Indians in LDS Church Periodicals
(1941-1983) ............................................ 122
  The Children's Friend .......................... 123
  Ensign ........................................... 132
  The Friend ..................................... 134
  The Improvement Era ......................... 138
  The Instructor ................................ 140
  The Liahona .................................... 142
  The New Era ................................... 143
  The Relief Society Magazine .................. 144

Appendix II:
A Partial List of Mormon Native American Artists 145

Bibliography ................................. 147
I came to this study in an effort to understand why some American Indian arts ring, in me, a tone of veracity while others produce a mere thud. Mormon arts seemed a natural choice for study because of a preponderance of American Indian subjects, sympathetically portrayed. This study has been a challenge and a journey for me, to separate reasoning from mere emotion and to redefine the terms which I or other people use to describe myself: Lamanite, American Indian, half-breed, half-blood, Mormon, Christian, Native American.

I gratefully acknowledge the heritage my parents have given me; the financial assistance of Brigham Young University's Multi-Cultural Education Department; the professional assistance of Janece Krahenbuhl, typist, Richard C. Hilligass who allowed me access to Brigham Young University's Art Collection, Committee Member Arthur R. Bassett, especially for Committee Chairman, Richard H. Cracroft; and, finally, my husband Jeff, and children, Arthur, Clark and Jessie for their patience and support.
Chapter I More than Feeding and Clothing: Native American Artistic Values

American Indians in Mormon arts suffer from the imposition of the white man's traditional ideas, images and stereotypes. Despite the theological affinity between Mormon Christianity and "Lamanites," as Native Americans are called in Mormon theology, non-Indian Mormon artists, with few exceptions, have obscured essential Native American values. Mormon arts began, as American art did, by superimposing white perception on Native Americans, and thereafter following established patterns where the dominant, articulate culture presumes spokemanship for the non-literate culture. American art progresses from the Noble Savage myth through cultural realism to authentic expression where, despite overlapping and tenacious Noble Savage interpretations, Native Americans artistically represent themselves. Mormon Native American artists are part of that expression of authentic Native American art, occasionally forging Mormonism into their work. Most Mormon art, however, continues to be dominated by a kind of historical tyranny, which subtly perpetuates racism toward Native Americans.
The purpose of this study is not to evaluate relations between The Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints and Native Americans, although I will conclude this chapter with a brief historical summary of those relationships, but to consider the attitudes of Mormon culture toward Native Americans as manifest in Mormon arts: literature, music, painting and sculpture. Such a study must begin with a clarification of terms used, an outline of delimitations and establishment of criteria for artistic evaluation.

**American Indian** is a broad term that classifies under a single entity at least two thousand cultures and more societies, who practiced a multiplicity of customs and lifestyles, held an enormous variety of values and beliefs, spoke numerous languages mutually unintelligible to the many speakers, and did not conceive of themselves as a single people.

Consequently, cautiously regard any statement of shared values. "American Indian" is the single term bestowed by the white man and signifies the white man's ideas and images. **Lamanite** is the term given by the Mormons. **Native American** is an evolutionary term developed to accommodate the actual peoples and to distinguish them from the designation of **Indian**. Most native peoples identify themselves with a specific tribal affiliation.


2 Ibid., p. xvii.
The definition of Mormon in this artistic evaluation is not limited to practicing members of The Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints, but also includes those who have been reared under the influence of Mormon culture, especially in the close communities of later nineteenth century Utah.

The literature I will consider in this study is confined to works written after 1941. The Giant Joshua by Maureen Whipple, published in 1941, is in close historical proximity to non-Mormon Frank Water's 1942 publication of The Man Who Killed the Deer. The Man, of The Man Who Killed the Deer, walks the twentieth century tightrope of the Pueblo community ritual traditions and the modern world. Water's novel transforms the Native American experience into universal terms, as well as abandoning historical fallacies regarding Native Americans. The Giant Joshua, a hallmark of Mormon fiction, is an historical novel which treats the Mormon settling of St. George, Utah, including Indian encounters. Whipple's novel thrusts the uniqueness of Mormon culture into a sophisticated literary form with universal themes.

Music considered in this study covers the history of the Church from 1830 to present. Inasmuch as the music generally reflects European standard four part hymnody, I will focus on the lyrics. The visual arts I will examine will also span the history of the Church. Some works not currently displayed or beyond the feasible means of viewing must be considered through reproduction, illustration, or simply not included. This study is not designed to be comprehensive but
rather representative of general trends portraying the American Indian.

In contrast to general trends of Mormon art, the works of Mormon Native Americans are mostly limited to visual arts with a few examples of traditional literature and music. Because of a difference in world view and values, the style of Native American art differs vastly from most conventional art of Western Civilization. However, a number of American artists have assimilated Native American values in their artistic representations of the American Indian.

The criteria, then, for evaluating works that depict the American Indian must be founded on values of the Native American himself. To judge otherwise would be tantamount to Mormons attempting to find valid art work, with obvious Mormon themes or history, by artists who do not accept fundamental premises of Mormondom: faith in God and the redemptive divinity of Jesus Christ, acceptance of Joseph Smith as a prophet, and The Book of Mormon as scripture. Such "outsider" art not only is without real significance to a Mormon, but often perverts basic tenets and exploits peculiarities such as polygamy and proselyting. Likewise, the Native American has been greatly misrepresented in the mainstream of fine art. Art by Native Americans and a few Americans accommodates these premises: a distinctive tribal identity or acknowledgment, an organic awareness of time and space through place, emphasis of community over individual. All these values arise from traditional ritual and myth.
A native person most likely identifies himself not as American Indian nor even Native American, but with a tribal association: N. Scott Momaday is a Kiowa; Leslie Marmon Silko, a Laguna; Howard Rainer, Taos Pueblo; Wayne Sekaquaptewa is Hopi. Despite modern urbanization of many Native Americans and an upsurge in Pan-Indianism, particularly by Eastern United States natives whose cultures have been lost through assimilation and European acculturation, the individual tribal affiliation remains fundamental in treating the Native American artistically, historically, socially or economically. Tribal identity intimates that the individual is part of a larger community with specific traditions and beliefs, and also suggests a geographic placement.

Much has been written about the American Indian and his regard for the land, mother earth. In an attempt to comprehend the occupation of the continent by Europeans, a general assumption is that, to the Indian, land could not be owned but was to be commonly used and shared as an integral component of all living things. Study of Native American myth and ritual, modern art, and literature demonstrates that geography is ontological, a means of defining individual awareness of self and existence. Geographical place is a source of existence that consumes both time and space. In emergence, creation, and origin myths of Native Americans, sequential time gives way to landscape, earth, sky, and cardinal directions. Space, personal and communal, is encumbered by the natural elements, originating with geography. Human beings fit
into that understanding of existence derived from the corporeal earth: "The horizon, where grandfather sky marries mother earth, gives birth to the children of this world. Look. This is who you are."  

**Place** also gives the sense of **community**, where, for many Native Americans, the individual is subsumed by the larger tribal whole. E. Relph notes in *Place and Placelessness*:

The relationship between community and place is indeed a very powerful one in which each reinforces the identity of the other, and in which the landscape is very much an expression of communally held beliefs and values and of interpersonal involvements.

Community is integrated into the individual through retelling of tribal myths, extended kinship terminology, and participation in ritual. Reconciliation to the community is a theme of many Native American hero and trickster myths and contemporary literature where the Native American is caught between traditional values and modern white society. Myth and ritual vary according to specific tribes.  

How **tribal identity** reflects ontology of **place and community** through myth and ritual becomes the criterion for

---


evaluating works that interpret the Native American, in addition to the fundamental integrity of form and content basic to all art. Art that is based on contrived or projected idea and imagery, whether romantic or savage, remains alien to the Native American experience, and becomes a bitter gruel to a people who have been dominated, assimilated, and occasionally exterminated. The resilience and persistence of the Native American shine through the development of their own statements in art and literature.

No matter how sympathetic because of historical and theological affiliations with Native Americans, Mormon arts that represent Indians must be judged on the criterions established by Native Americans themselves as their own art manifests their values and beliefs.

Considering the overall purpose of this study, a historical summary of relations between Native Americans and The Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints, must be necessarily brief. Another consideration for brevity is the availability of source material that reflects a single point of view, the perspective of the dominant, articulate white Mormon culture. Nevertheless, sympathetic Mormon bonds with Native Americans depart from general trends of hostile Indian/White relations, based on attitudes derived from a theological affinity. Early Mormon/Indian associations involved establishing theology and brief encounters. As the Church settled in the Western territories, constant Indian contact had to be confronted. More recently the Church has addressed social
problems of Native Americans. The state of current relations is reflected in the integration of George P. Lee, Navajo, into the leadership hierarchy of the Church, as an example of the fulfillment of theological promises which redeem the fallen Indian race.

In that fundamental cornerstone of Mormon theology, The Book of Mormon, Native Americans are known as Lamanites. Regarded as scripture, the book is a history of ancient America and was delivered to the Prophet Joseph Smith, who translated and published it in 1830. The Book of Mormon identifies the Lamanites as part of a group of Israelites who migrated to the Americas. As dissenters from the main group, white-skinned Nephites, the Lamanites were cursed with a dark skin as a sign of being "cut off from the presence of the Lord" (2 Nephi 5:20-21). The Nephites eventually became the more wicked of the two groups and were obliterated by the Lamanites.

The Book of Mormon, claim the Latter-day Saints, is an American testament to the divinity of Jesus Christ, who, after his resurrection, visits and teaches these people. Among the prophecies of the book is one concerning the destiny of the Lamanites. Because they will "dwindle in unbelief" in the Gospel of Jesus Christ, the Lord will "take away from them the lands of their possessions, and he will cause them to be scattered and smitten" (2 Nephi 1:11). Through the efforts of other nations or Gentiles, the Indian will eventually overcome his fallen state:
And at that day shall the remnant of our seed know that they are of the house of Israel, and that they are the covenant people of the Lord; and then shall they know and come to the knowledge of their forefathers and also to the knowledge of the gospel of their Redeemer. (1 Nephi 15:14)

The instrument of that restoration is The Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints, organized by Joseph Smith on April 6, 1830. Only seven months after the organization, four missionaries were called (Doctrine and Covenants 32) to begin the fulfillment of the above mentioned prophecy by preaching to the Catteraugus tribe near Buffalo, New York.6 Joseph Smith would later have several encounters with Indians—with the Sac and Fox people in 18417 and Pottawattamie leaders in 1843.8 After the assassination of Joseph Smith in 1844, Mormons migrated west to what would become Utah, arriving in 1847 under the direction of the new president, Brigham Young, who also was to become Territorial Governor and Superintendent of Indian Affairs. In constant proximity of various Plains cultures that were often at war with government troops, Brigham Young proclaimed a sympathetic policy toward Indians: "Feed and clothe them a little and you will save life; fight them, and you pave the way for the destruction of the innocent."9

6 Joseph Smith, Documentary History of the Church I:118-25.
7 Ibid., IV:401-02.
8 Ibid., V:478-81.
9 Brigham Young, Journal of Discourses X:107-08.
Missionaries were sent to various areas of the state (Manti, Provo, Bear Lake, and Santa Clara) to work with the Shoshones, Utes, Paiutes and Pavants, teaching them domestic and agricultural skills, and, of course, the Mormon Gospel. Jacob Hamblin was called to be an "Apostle to the Lamanites" and journeyed into Arizona to work with the Navajos and the Hopis. As did the early American Puritans, Mormons anticipated Indians being eager to change lifestyles and be baptized into Mormonism. Most natives, however, were reluctant to embrace Mormon principles, and conflicts erupted over land and livestock.

In the decades of the 1870's and 1880's, conflicts between the Mormon Church and the U. S. Government over polygamy relegated much of Indian missionary work to a lower priority, and by 1890 official Indian missionary work ended. As is evidenced by a dearth of information regarding Church/Indian relations, work with North American Lamanites in the early 1900's was limited as the Church concentrated its missionary efforts with the Polynesian and Latin American Lamanites. During this time Native Americans were being settled in reservations and the Bureau of Indian Affairs was being established. Occasional conflicts occurred on the

10 See Juanita Brooks, Jacob Hamblin: Mormon Apostle to the Indians (Salt Lake City, Utah: Westwater Press, 1980).

borders of reservations with the last significant "battle" fought in Blanding, Utah, in 1923 by townspeople and a reservation escapee, Posey, a Paiute. It was not until 1943 that Heber J. Grant, then president of the Church, created the Navajo-Zuni Mission for teaching the Gospel to the Lamanites of the American Southwest and renewed Church/Indian relations, expanding efforts beyond local interests.

Also in 1943, Spencer W. Kimball was called to be an apostle. In 1973 he would become president of the Church. Kimball, reared in Arizona, has particular affection for the American Indian and was the prime mover in organizing several Indian service programs for the Church, including educational, social and missionary activities. The Indian Placement Program gives Indian children the opportunity to receive an education while living in the homes of Mormon families. An alternative to government boarding schools, the Placement Program was most active in the 1960's and 70's. Brigham Young University boasts one of the country's largest Native American Studies Centers, encouraging higher education for Native Americans. The University also houses American Indian Services that encourage community self-help programs in agriculture and vocational skills. Expanded missionary efforts are not only

12 See Albert R. Lyman, The Outlaw of Navajo Mountain (Salt Lake City, Utah: Deseret Book, 1963).

directed toward conversion to Mormonism, but include social
aid by Welfare Service missionaries. Throughout his ministry,
Kimball's regular sermons were often aimed at raising Mormon
awareness of, and enlisting support for Indian programs. 14

As a product of Indian Placement and Brigham Young
University's commitment, George P. Lee, Navajo, Ed. D., has
epitomized the goal of the Church for the Native American,
that "the Lamanite shall blossom as the rose" (Doctrine and
Covenants 49:24). Past president of the College of Ganado,
Ganado Arizona, Lee currently continues his work in Indian
education while serving in the upper echelon of leadership in
the Mormon Church, the First Quorum of the Seventy. 15

The general trend of ideological positions of the Mormon
Church has been sympathetic to Native Americans. While there
may have been some discrepancies in practices by individuals
and flaws in the consequences of Mormon/Indian interactions,

14 John R. Maestas and Jeff Simons, The Lamanites: In
the Words of the Prophets (Provo, Utah: Brigham Young
University Native American Studies Center, 1981).

15 Lawrence Cummins, "Elder George Lee: 'I Owe Every

16 For more recent criticisms, see "The Mormon South­west," Akwesasne Notes, Winter 1978, pp. 16-19, a report
focusing in Indian Placement difficulties; Betty Trice and
Richard Prehn, "Utes in Slow Burn over Hansen's 'Termination'
Letter," Utah Holiday, July 1982, pp. 9-12, a summary of
back-pedaling by Utah Congressman Jim Hansen after a political
faux-pas; Fred C. Esplin and Kevin N. Anderson, "Slow Justice
Looking for Land with the Paiutes," Utah Holiday, August 1982,
pp. 55-61; Brent DelPorto, "Indian Voter Rights Lawsuits Jolt
San Juan," Deseret News, Utah County Ed., 23 November 1983,
Sec. B, pp. 1, 3 and "Information on Elections Will Be Printed
in Navajo," Deseret News, Utah County Ed., 13 January 1984,
Sec. B, p. 11.
the Mormon attitude is unique. When the government was at war
with many Indian tribes in the 1860's and 70's, the Mormons
were achieving general peace with Brigham Young's "feed rather
than fight" policies. The government vacillates between
assuming absolute control and responsibilities for Indians at
one extreme and discarding any financial aid or administrative
assistance at the other, all in disregard of signed treaties.
The Mormon Church, as a whole, has been fairly consistent in
its aims to foster cooperation. However, it is not the objec-
tive of this thesis to evaluate the performance of the Mormon
Church toward Native Americans, but rather to consider the
attitudes of the Mormon populace toward the American Indian as
manifested in Mormon fine arts.
Chapter II  "Dignity Befitting the Ancestry:"

The American Indian in Mormon Literature

Literary ideas, images and stereotypes of Native Americans begin with Columbus' navigational error and ascription of the term Indian. The literary idea of the Noble Savage was projected onto Native Americans with little regard for basic Native American values of tribal affiliation, place and community as found in indigent myth and ritual. Eventually, reconsiderations in American art created a place for authentic Native American literature, including works authored by Native Americans speaking for themselves. American Indians in Mormon literature are granted a history and destiny from The Book of Mormon, while current Mormon literature resurrects the historical Noble Savage imagery with little consideration of Native American values.

I

The American Indian represented a dualism of romanticism and savagery, in short, the Noble Savage. Fairchild defines the Noble Savage as "any free and wild being who draws directly from nature virtues which raise doubts as to the
value of civilization." Since the first European contacts, the Western image of the Native American has fallen somewhere within that definition, with vacillating emphasis on either naturalistic romanticism or "wild," and occasional synthesis. It was not until the twentieth century search for realism that Native American writers found a place to speak for themselves.

Reports from New World explorers contributed to the development of the Noble Savage idea by identifying the primitive state of the newly found natives and contrasting them to existing European society. The new land was virgin in nature, unencumbered by historical burdens and social demands, offering seemingly unlimited resources—apparently a paradise on earth. 2 The natives of the land had a dual role, both as the epitome of natural development and as a practical obstacle in claiming the land and its bounties.

For the religious, the Indian provided an opportunity to convert the heathen, both in the Southwest and New England. But he also posed theological complications as to whether or not he descended from Adam, how he arrived here after Noah, and if he did indeed have a soul. For Puritans Roger Williams and John Eliot, the Indian was representative of Edenic man,


degenerated to a vile state. The mainstream Puritans carried
the idea even further, typologically justifying their inter-
actions with the Indians. In the Puritan world of divinely
illuminated human reason, "the savage state itself was a
divine sign of Satan's power: a sign of struggle and sin."4

This metaphoric savagery was typical of a literary
genre of captivity narratives. Actual narratives such as Mary
Rowlandson's (The Sovereignty and Goodness of God, Together
with the Faithfulnes of His Promises Displayed; Being a Narra-
tive of the Captivity and Restauration of Mrs. Mary Rowlandson.
Commended by Her to All the Desire to Know the Lords Doings to,
and Dealings with Her [1682]), developed from the oratory
jeremiad, Puritan sermons, to literary fiction found in
anthologies and in such gothic novels of the last part of the
eighteenth century as Edgar Huntly: or the Memoirs of a
Sleepwalker (1799), by Charles Brockden Brown. 5

With the quest for a distinctly American literature in
the early nineteenth century, several authors turned to the
West as a natural topic, ripe with adventure and myth, and, of
course, the Indian. Among the literature of that period is

3 John J. Teunissen and Evelyn J. Hinz, Introduction,
Notes and Commentary to A Key into the Language of America by
Roger Williams (Detroit, Michigan: Wayne State University

4 Roy Harvey Pearce, "The 'Ruines of Mankind': The
Indian and the Puritan Mind," Journal of the History of Ideas,
13 (1952), p. 201.

5 Robert F. Berkofer, Jr., The White Man's Indian (New
James Fenimore Cooper's *Leatherstocking Tales*. Cooper incarnates a synthesized Noble Savage in Natty Bumppo's sidekick, Chingachgook. Chingachgook, while not above claiming enemy scalps, is savage and wily enough to survive the wilderness and other hostilities, yet civilized enough to live compatibly on the edge of civilization with the main character and other white men. Chingachgook never shoots quite as straight as Natty Bumppo, disappears when the situation becomes too domestic, and interacts with nature according to his own native state. He is further romanticized, in *The Last of the Mohicans*, by being the last survivor of his tribal group.

The Native American occupied the ever-changing frontier, as the location of the literary Indian moved west. With the official closing of the western frontier in 1890, the major Indian image in literature and popular culture stereotypes remained that of the Plains groups:

a man on horseback, wearing a flowing bonnet, breechcloth and moccasins, holding an upraised tomahawk in one hand [with] his wife . . . wearing a beaded browband with an upright feather at the back, a long, beaded buckskin dress and moccasins

are perpetuated from dime novels through Wild West shows to the cinema industry.

Serious literature began demonstrating a more sympathetic trend beginning in the 1880's with the publication of

---

Helen Hunt Jackson's *Ramona* (1884). *Ramona*'s half-breed heroine attempts to evoke for the Indian treatment (Jackson's phrase: "A Century of Dishonor") an indignation similar to that evoked for slavery by *Uncle Tom's Cabin*. Additional humanistic treatments occur in Willa Cather's works, *The Professor's House* (1925) and *Death Comes for the Archbishop* (1927), where Indians are one group of many human beings who inhabit and conquer the land.

Indian fiction reached a maturity with anthropologist Oliver LaFarge's Pulitzer Prize-winning *Laughing Boy* (1929), written after LaFarge's summer studies on the Navajo reservation. In the anthropological vein which examined Indian culture and tradition, some authors attempted to capture the disappearing oral tradition. Typical of such studies are Walter Dyk's *Son of Old Man Hat* (1938) and John Neihardt's *Black Elk Speaks* (1961).

The American Indian continues to play a role in historical fiction, as with Thomas Berger's *Little Big Man* (1964), and he makes occasional appearances in contemporary tales as a counter culture hero, as in Ken Kesey's *One Flew Over the Cuckoo's Nest* (1962). A few novels by white authors have depicted the world of the contemporary Native American facing cultural assimilation, the best of which is probably Frank Waters' *The Man Who Killed the Deer* (1942), also known for its universal themes.

7 Berkhofer, p. 106.
The bulk of literature regarding the American Indian relies on the duality of the Noble Savage myth coupled with the Indian's being either substantially better than or substantially worse than the white man. Many works sympathetic to the Indian continued to rely on the white man's point of view (even Longfellow's *Hiawatha* used the often misinformed Henry Rowe Schoolcraft's *Algic Researches: Comprising Inquiries Respecting the Mental Characteristics of the North American Indian* [1839]). Until Roy Harvey Pearce's *The Savages of America: A Study of the Indian and the Idea of Civilization* (1953), few works acknowledged the possibility of fundamental difference between a white-created myth of the "American Indian" and the essentially different point of view of Native Americans themselves.

II

Mormonism has established a literary tradition with stylistic trends that can be identified and categorized. These patterns consist of the First Generation (1830-1880), a Middle or Fallow Period (1880-1930), a Second or Lost Generation (1930-1960), and the current Third Generation (1960-). Each period has representations of the American Indian. Literature since 1941 still carries on historical trends and, of course, the Indian.

The first and greatest work of uniquely Mormon literature, *The Book of Mormon*, proclaims that the American Indian
descends from ancient inhabitants of the Americas who were visited by Jesus Christ. While Mormons accept the book as scripture, it also has literary qualities. Other literature throughout the existence of Mormonism has fallen into identifiable patterns, as outlined in critical essays by Eugene England, William Mulder, and Richard H. Cracroft, and in the major anthology, A Believing People: Literature of the Latter-day Saints, edited by Richard H. Cracroft and Neal E. Lambert. Besides the chronological divisions the patterns have general themes: First Generation, theological; Middle or Fallow Generation, didactic; Second or Lost Generation, critical; and Third Generation, universal themes.

The First Generation of Mormon literature is marked by a practicality resulting from the historical circumstances of the members of the Church. Driven from place to place, expounding the faith and formulating theology led to an abundance of diaries, sermons, letters, and autobiographies. The need for hymns (which I will discuss in "Chapter III 'Great Spirit


Listen to the Red Man's Wail: 'The Indian in Mormon Hymns and Music') produced poetic traditions and theology still used in the contemporary Church, including references to Lamanites. Among the most prominent works in this era are: The History of the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints, largely autobiographical, by Joseph Smith, Jr.; Autobiography of Parley Parker Pratt; Eliza R. Snow, an Immortal; Selected Writings; Journal of Discourses; and Discourses of Brigham Young.

The Middle or Fallow Period (1880-1930) witnessed a literary fermentation after the settling of Utah Territory. Faced with isolation and an influx of especially bad literature like dime novels, Mormons determined to create their own wholesome literature. The result was a didactic "Home Literature" where the message becomes more important than formal or aesthetic considerations. Home Literature curbed the appetite for fiction while demonstrating (none too subtly) righteous principles. Fiction appeared in Church periodicals, and a few major novels such as Nephi Anderson's Added Upon (1896) and Marcus King, Mormon (1897) were written. Eliza R. Snow continued to write poetry during part of this period, as did Orson F. Whitney, including such works as Elias: An Epic of the Ages (1904). Theological writings continue by such important authors as B. H. Roberts and John A. Widtsoe.

The Lost or Second Generation of Mormon writers created nearly an antithesis of Home Literature. These writers, disillusioned with the Mormon experience, often left Utah to find outlets to their Mormon background in the
mainstream of American literature. Major works of this era are Maurine Whipple's *The Giant Joshua* (1941), with a minor Indian character, and Virginia Sorenson's *The Evening and the Morning* (1949). These books capture cultural and historical Mormonism but obscure, by concentrating on social Mormonism, the central theological message of hope and redemption.

The current generation of LDS writers, many from Brigham Young University, seem to synthesize the Fallow and Lost generations. By realizing that the world has a broader focus than the Utah of Home Literature, and observing the pitfalls of the faithless world of Whipple and Sorenson, modern LDS writers affirm Mormonism in a universal sense. Short stories seem to be a preferred form in official Church periodicals, Mormon-oriented journals and magazines, and in individual collections by Douglas H. Thayer, Donald R. Marshall, Eileen Gibbons Kump, Bela Petsco, and Levi S. Peterson. Personal essays and poetry have also found a place in periodicals. An increasing demand has encouraged a flourishing popular market of fiction and drama that raises critical questions as well as resurrecting the didacticism of Home Literature.

And through all of these periods, Mormon literature has American Indian illusions: in the first generation hymns still sung by recent and contemporary congregations ("Chapter III 'Great Spirit Listen to the Red Man's Wail: The Indian in Mormon Hymns and Music"); in the literature published since 1941, still reflecting Home Literature, in the
literature of the Lost Generation, and in the writing of the present generation. Some works belong more in the mainstream of contemporary literature and have no distinguishable Mormon characteristics, but others bear the unmistakable Mormon touch—sympathy for "our Lamanite brethren."

**Novels**

Paul Bailey's sympathetic novel, *The Claws of the Hawk* (1966), with a Lost Generation tone, is subtitled "The Incredible Life of Walker the Ute." The book chronicles the major events of Walker's life, intertribal conflicts, horse raids to California, Mormon settlement into Utah, encounters with Brigham Young, and the final conflict of the Utah Walker War. Bailey attempts to create Walker's point of view, noting in the prologue: "This is the true story of one of America's more remarkable men. And there can be no doubt that Walker himself would have wanted it told."

Bailey skillfully manages to ally the reader with Walker despite the Ute's enormous ego and his audacious and scatalogical behavior. Walker is a horse thief, trader in human slaves—including his favorite wife—and unchallenged leader of the Utes, until Brigham Young undermines Walker's power through peaceful dealings with Utah Indians.

---

Walker's depradations are countered by equally atrocious acts of the whites. The reader senses Walker's confusion at losing his political power base and control of the land and economy (slaves and horses). The plot bogs down, though, because of attention to minute historical events, especially in Walker's encounters with Mormons. Walker himself is described in animalistic terms: with the "tawny skin of his tight-fleshed body" and his "bronze," "swarthy nakedness." His actions are "restless, avaricious, dangerous." The tribe is comprised of "squaws" and "braves." The omniscient narration moves along smoothly, but Walker speaks alternately with pidgin and rhetoric:

"The Hawk rides to no Mormonee for talk," Walker growled. "It is for Mormonee to ride to The Hawk."\(^{12}\)

And:

"You are old, my brother. Your many gray hairs have made you slow to anger, and a seeker of peace. I know you to be a wise and good man. But I also know the paleface. In him constantly is there evil and treachery."\(^{13}\)

The speaking discrepancy would be understandable if Bailey were representing a novice in the English language, but since Walker learns English much later in the plot, the examples above are meant to represent his use of the Ute language.

\(^{12}\) Ibid., p. 18.

\(^{13}\) Ibid.
Bailey is conscientious in identifying the various tribal groups of Utah in the mid-1800's. He also seems aware of the vital role of land to Walker's economic microcosm. Bailey's image of Walker is one of a self-gratifying, carnal, power-maniacal man that would fit a number of historical figures: Napoleon, Henry VIII, and Nero. But this interpretation of Walker as center of his universe lacks any sense of community, and, more significantly, it lacks any comprehension of a mythological motivation for Walker's beliefs and behaviors.

In contrast to the historical Indian, Little Injun, Big Injun, Mormon Injun (1972), by Robert Barlow Fox, treats the contemporary American Indian problem of juvenile delinquency through a Home Literature approach. The main character, Charlie Wallowing Bull, is sent to the reform school in Provo, Utah. Through a compassionate social worker, Charlie, known as Little Injun, joins the Mormon Church. He suffers several setbacks in his efforts to reform, including conflict with an evil guard and his own escape, after which he repentantly turns himself in. Big Injun, Little Injun's older friend, successfully reforms and joins the Marines as a role model for Little Injun. Finally Little Injun is released to the care of his foster family in Wyoming, having progressed to a Mormon Injun and Big Injun.

14 Robert Barlow Fox, Little Injun, Big Injun, Mormon Injun (Salt Lake City, Utah: Horison, 1972).
Fox prefaces the book with an acknowledgment of the variety of Indian tribes. He then gives a shopping list of Navajo characteristics pertinent to Charlie Wallowing Bull:

It might be generalized that it is the nature of most Indians to be quiet and reserved. The Indian is also not a slave to time, schedules and appointments. The Indian's concerns are in nature... [Navajos] are unique in many ways... Unlike most western tribes, the Navajo mounts his horse from the left side the same as whites. Adult Navajo males, unlike other tribes, often wear a mustache. Fights are rare among Navajos... A Navajo never looks directly into the eyes of another... The Navajo is not very demonstrative and hardly ever shows affection in public... A Navajo doesn’t crease his hat... Navajos take pride in their hair... Navajos may tell a lie three times, but the fourth lie would be drastic because it could lead to their being surrounded and eventually defeated by lies.

After this summation of Navajo culture, the reader must assume that Charlie shares and acts under the influence of all of these characteristics. In fact, he encounters many conflicts regarding his Indianness, but all conflicts are external, originating from other characters' taunting. Yet, at one point Charlie inarticulately explains part of the Navajo culture to his roommates:

Navajo, he put religion in many color and painting. He put sun or moon and sometime he put rainbow in sand painting. They more pretty than painting that hang on wall; and they all made from many color sand. Women can no watch when man make sand painting until it finish.

15 Ibid., pp. 7-8
16 Ibid., p. 116.
The loosely connected, preachy vignettes of this book are designed to create an empathy for Lamanites and inspire righteous living. Each of the supporting characters is one-dimensional. Apart from the formal flaws of this book, it perpetuates the stereotypical image of the stoic Indian. The title is enough to give away the author's attitude and the content of the book.

In a less obvious Home Literature approach, Dorothy M. Keddington's romance-suspense novel, *Jayhawk* (1978), is set on a contemporary ranch in Wyoming. The heroine, Angela, falls in love with half-blood Jayhawk, and together they unravel the mystery surrounding the disappearance of Jay's father. Jay is a contemporary Indian, a painter by profession, but also adept in wilderness tracking and subsistence skills. The story's conflicts rest in Jay's grandfather's prejudices. Grandpa's (as he is called in the story) brother had been murdered by a "red devil." Grandpa's first wife, unbeknown to him, was a half-breed. In bitterness he rejected her after the birth of Jay's father. Jay's father incurred Grandpa's wrath by marrying an Indian woman ("There isn't an Indian worth spittin' on."). Even though Grandpa had accidentally killed Jay's father and kept it secret for over twenty years, he never forgave his son for marrying an Indian, and had virtually no relationship with Jay.

The family who reared Jay remained essentially ignorant of his Indianness. Angela has to clarify that "Jay's Bannock-Shoshoni, not just Shoshoni. There's a difference." But that difference is never explained. Keddington does explain the differences in value systems when Jay responds to Angela's query, "Do you think like an Indian?":

An Indian would stand upon this hill and look out upon the land as a gift from God to all men. He can't understand how it can be broken into pieces and then claimed by various individuals. To the Indian, land is free, like air and wind and water. He will take from the earth only what he needs, because he understands that the earth is his mother. . . . No matter what name an Indian gives to his god, whether it's the Great Spirit, the Giver of Life, or Christ, that religion is the very essence of his life. Without it he is naked and frustrated.

With that summation of how an Indian thinks, the novel moves to its predictable resolution where the mystery is solved, the repentant Grandpa dies before facing legal justice, and Angela finds fulfillment, honesty, and virtue in Jay.

This quick-paced novel accomplishes its aim as a gothic romance. But Keddington fails to realize that two paragraphs of Indian philosophy and continual descriptions of dark faces and deep-set eyes do not construct an authentic Native American character. However, considering that Angela's character is developed mainly on her attraction for Jay and her own appearance, Jay's lack of authenticity is not surprising.

18 Ibid., p. 42.
19 Ibid., p. 25.
Keddington grasps at place but flirts more convincingly with "the image of the Indian who respects nature and possesses an ingrained sense of ecology." 20

The Proud Blood (1979), 21 by Maxine Anderson Henrie, has another half-blood as the major character of her "epic novel," another example of Home Literature. Jeffrey Thornton witnesses the death of his mother in childbirth while the doctor in town refuses to help because: "It ain't no harder for an Indian squaw to have her young than it is for a cow to have a calf." 22 Jeffrey grows up and succeeds despite racist obstacles, including his bigoted stepmother who, half-way through the book, inexplicably experiences a change of heart. Jeffrey, who becomes a famous doctor, saves the old doctor's life, marries the doctor's daughter and returns to practice in Panguitch, Utah.

Henrie is careful to balance the derogatory remarks of the antagonist characters with sympathy from protagonists. But the positive comments are peppered with "war-whooping," "squaws," "redskins," etc. Even Jeffrey's remarks are full of stereotypical imagery: "Indians are not of the black race! They're of the red." He describes his sister as "the loveliest, sweetest little squaw on the North American Continent."

20 Berkhofer, note, plate 11.
22 Ibid., pp. 16-17.
He handles others' racism "with a dignity befitting his ancestry."

This novel is "over wrought" and melodramatic. There is a sub-plot with the rape of Jeffrey's sister, Spring, who dies giving birth to the ill-begotten child, and the consequent emasculation of the perpetrator in a car accident. The major source of conflict is Jeffrey's heritage, but Jeffrey is a white boy in brown skin. It is hinted but never declared that his mother may be Navajo. The author never addresses any sense of Jeffrey's Indianness other than his proud heritage, the noble side of the Noble Savage image.

Blaine M. Yorgason has authored two novels about noble Indians: The Windwalker (1979) and Seeker of the Gentle Heart (1982), both co-authored with Brenton G. Yorgason. Both are Home Literature parables that exploit traditional Indian stereotypes.

The Windwalker is a tale of an aged Indian resurrected from near death on a burial scaffold to come to the aid of his family. Although blind, Windwalker overcomes natural obstacles, wolves, and a grizzly bear in order to reach the family and


25 Blaine M. Yorgason and Brenton G. Yorgason, Seeker of the Gentle Heart (Salt Lake City, Utah: Bookcraft, 1982).
protect them from the Crows. After securing their safety, he returns to seek his destiny in the wind.

The novel is interspersed with versified prose reflecting twentieth century self-help-pop-psychology:

Experiences must pile up,
as boulders do
at the foot of the cliff
of a man's life.

And as they pile up,
each one will give him
insight
into the others,
giving him the time
he needs
to evaluate and to think
about them.

The Crows as the enemies are the only identified tribe in the book. Windwalker and his family are illustrated in Plains stereotype: buffalo head and eagle feather head-dresses, shields decorated with thunderbirds, the burial scaffold. Much attention is given to the role of human beings with respect to other living creatures and Mother Earth. Windwalker carries on about Mother Earth but his attitudes are spoken rather than demonstrated by any place descriptions or interactions. The sense of community is in the family unit, but Windwalker is preoccupied with his own memories, reveries, and "his woman." Although the family unit plays primary importance, there is no sense or acknowledgment of myth or ritual.

26 Yorgason, pp. 58-59.
Yorgason's *Seeker of the Gentle Heart* is a condensed recapitulation of Cooper's *The Last of the Mohicans*. Both books are set in the early years of the United States, both feature the two remaining survivors of a New England tribe, both are hunted by the arch enemy, the vengeful leader of the Hurons. But while *The Last of the Mohicans* is a classic study of the Noble Savage and the balance of civilization and savagery, the objective of *Seeker of the Gentle Heart* is the message of peace and forgiveness. The two characters, one raised traditionally and one raised as a visionary misfit in the white world, without an understanding of his true Indian identity, encounter one another in the wilderness. The characters are really brother and sister, which is obvious early in the plot but not revealed until their climactic deaths at the hands of the Huron. The sister recounts the life of their grandmother, who has witnessed the death of her white husband and children. Upon confronting the murderers she refers to the tradition of an ancient "pale" visitor, again in the demi-poetry style:

He taught us that when our brother was in need we were to give him all we had.

He taught us that when we were offended we were to forgive, and to turn once more to the offender, our hearts filled with compassion and love.
In that way, we would live his peace religion.

These Indians are identified as being Susquehannock, part of the Iroquois confederation. The major culture distinction of this group is a matrilineal organization, common to the Iroquois. This trait gives credence to the power and influence of the grandmother of the tale. There is no sense of community, ritual or place. Yorgason's selection of a pale god myth typifies a Mormon weakness of choosing obscure cultural fragments correlating to The Book of Mormon while obfuscating the bulk of Native American myths and rituals that cannot be pigeon-holed as "evidences." The main characters are developed as visionary, near supernatural. The message of peace is blurred by continual violence and conflict.

The primary purpose of both of these books is to teach a message, and the medium of that message is the image of the American Indian, exploiting traditional Noble Savage stereotyping.

_Without Reservation_ (1980), by Kay H. Cox, is an example of Third Generation style of Mormon writings. In an extended personal essay with a lively style, the author reaffirms, through her trials and successes associated with the Indian Placement Program, the human experience. Cox

27 Yorgason and Yorgason, pp. 65-66.

28 Kay H. Cox, _Without Reservation_ (Salt Lake City, Utah: Bookcraft, 1980).
accomplishes her purpose, which is to tell the foster parent side of the Placement Program. Her affection for Indians is evident in the number of children who spent part of their lives in her home—she laughs with them, weeps with them, and loves them. As the author learns more about Indians, she dispels some stereotypes:

Indians don't feel pain? It isn't a matter of pain; it's a matter of reserve. No stranger will see the pain, the sorrow, or even the joy. But the Indian, of course, knows all of these emotions intimately.  

The author occasionally lapses into Mormonese, with "special experiences" and "correlation" and cutesy titles such as "The Morning Breaks" and the title of the book itself. The major weakness of the book occurs in occasional over-generalizations:

Indian children find it formidable just to say the words [Articles of Faith], let alone understand the meaning. . . . Teasing is a universal Indian pastime. . . . Indians seldom initiate conversations. . . . Indian fathers are almost never openly affectionate. . . . Indians love popcorn.

This woman's story becomes universal in that she respects the individuality of each of the children who entered her home and thus overcomes the cultural barriers.

A children's book that neither addresses elements of good story-telling, illustration, nor Native American values

29 Ibid., p. 23.

30 Ibid., pp. 20, 27, 35, 63.
is *A Mormon Boy's Indian Adventure* (1965), 31 by Bryan and Katherine Gardner. It is an inane little tale of a pioneer boy who encounters an isolated Indian—no tribe or culture. The book is illustrated in the extreme stereotype of Tommie Teepee with the Indian boy wearing fringed buckskin pants and vest, beaded headband and one feather. The pioneer Mormon boy learns not to fear the Indian. Even though this book is aimed toward children, it is Home Literature at its worst and pounds home an obvious moral—that Indians won't necessarily kill you—in form so poor that the lesson is soon forgotten anyway.

Of these books with major Indian focus, *Without Reservation* succeeds because it is intended to be about Indians rather than from their point of view. The remaining seven books fall victim to their inherent weaknesses, creating fictive Indian images. Four additional works of Mormon fiction feature major Indian characters, but they are auxiliary to the main characters of the novels and based on traditional stereotypes. As noted before, each of these works can be categorized into the larger trends of Mormon fiction.

Amelia Bean continues the Lost Generation trend of disillusion by creating her novel *The Fancher Train* (1958) 32 around one of the blackest events in Mormon history, the


Mountain Meadows Massacre. Taking the perspective of the emigrant train that is massacred by Mormons, assisted by Indians, Bean portrays the perpetrators as fanatical, vengeful, greedy and imperious. She suggests that Brigham Young's "feed rather than fight" policy was politically aimed to insure alliance of the Indians in the event of U. S. government opposition to the Mormons. The main characters of the book are Jed Smith, scout for the Fancher party, and Melissa Boller, a vivacious member of the party and Jed's romantic interest. The Indian character is Jed's friend, the son of Crazy Horse, Young Crazy Horse.

As the Fancher train travels across the plains and through Utah, they have various encounters with different tribes of Indians, all of whom are identified properly and geographically. Indian relationships function on three levels: scorn and disdain by the more sleazy characters of the emigrant train; paternalism and exploitation by the Mormons; trust and friendship by the primary characters. This variety of relationships points out a problem in writing historical Indian fiction: should the author depict Indians through contemporary attitudes, civil rights perspectives, or romantic hindsight? Lack of recorded history from the Indian point of view makes the creation of Indian characters even more challenging with the frequent result that Indians become white characters in brown skin with a tribal appendage.

Bean includes several attitudes toward the Indian: bigotry, "The emigrants didn't hold a redskin to be hardly
more account than an animal—sure not to be considered same as a man"; and historical paternalism:

"Feed them--don't fight them!" had been Brigham's edict concerning the redman, the wisdom of which had never been more apparent. For they were allies now and Brigham had forged himself a mighty tool. Thousands of red hands to fill with guns--just in case he needed to call on them.

The role of the Indian as human being, created with the same twentieth century enlightenment as the spirited woman and moral protagonist, however, falls back into the noble savage mode. In addition to enjoying incredible survival skills that save the trio from the massacre, young Crazy Horse has a "brown paw," "hawklike eyes," and looks like a Grecian statue:

His bony shoulders had breadth and the gaunted rib cage already swelled wide above the narrow hips and flexible thighs. His body seemed oddly, flowingly constructed--a tensile skeleton over which lay whipcord muscle. Even kneeling there quietly he gave the feeling of a coiled steel spring.

Bean is generally sympathetic to Indians, counter-balancing Indian savagery with an account of the rape of Pavant leader Kanosh's wife, Sally, by white men. She acknowledges tribal varieties. But the story is a white man's story and other essentials are not considered. The main Indian character, Crazy Horse, is not only the Noble Savage,

33 Ibid., p. 118.
34 Ibid., p. 311.
but is a Tonto-Chingachgook type, always available, always helpful, and always subordinate. Jed Smith is likewise a Natty Bumppo type, raised in the West, caught between survival and lack of civilization, while developing his own moral code. As in Cooper, these fallacies do not create bad fiction, but simply illegitimate Native American fiction.

Elisabeth MacDonald's *Watch for the Morning* (1978)³⁵ is both illegitimate Mormon and Native American fiction. A flimsy shadow of *The Giant Joshua*, *Watch for the Morning* begins in England but finally emigrates to the St. George settlement where the characters suffer the wilderness, tyranny of Mormon social pressure, and agonies of polygamy. Resolving these conflicts, the characters do not turn to religious principles but to apparent incest, pre-marital sex, and business acumen.

The two major characters of the novel are Kate and her daughter Mary Ann. Kate takes in an orphaned Indian child whom she and her husband, Burns Hamilton, name Tom. Tom grows up with the family, with an unusual attachment to Mary Ann. As an adult, and unable to face the consequences of interracial marriage to Mary Ann, Tom leaves to make his fortune in the cattle business, despite late nineteenth century prejudices that render this plot twist implausible. His occasional visits home and Mary Ann's waiting for him finally lead to

their plans to marry, which are thwarted by Tom's untimely murder.

As an Indian character Tom is aware of the implications of interracial marriage and little else. We have no idea of his tribal affiliation, nor of his feelings on being an isolated Indian in a white man's world. His role in the family is one of servitude, and in the larger community he is known as "Burns Hamilton's Indian boy." In a contrived plot, Tom is a contrived character reflecting not only the author's disillusion with Mormondom but a complete lack of awareness of Native Americans.

By contrast to Watch for the Morning, The Earthkeepers (1979), by Marilyn Brown, succeeds in creating viable Indian characters in a plausible historical novel. As part of the Third Generation of Mormon writers, Brown has woven her story around the settling of Provo, Utah, covering the historical data through Mara Eastman, who is the main character. Mara's character is well developed through her own integrity and her Mormon faith. Mara is directly involved with the major Indian characters, Spirit of Earth and Rain. Through her sometimes awkward plot shifts, from these women and their friend, Blueflower, emerge three generations of Indian characters who intermarry. The culminating character is Grace, fully assimilated, who bridges culture and race by marrying

Mara's nephew, Hanson Eastman. Historical Indian characters appear, as much of the conflict is derived from Indian-white relations in early Provo. Through her characters, Brown interweaves her own philosophy and symbolism into her understanding of Native Americans, producing, through Mara, an empathy for genuine human beings who happened to be Native Americans caught in transition in Utah history.

Spirit of Earth and her daughter, Rain, are identified as Piute women who have survived hostilities, and, rather than be sold as slaves, are cared for in the Eastman household. Spirit of Earth's Indian name is Sipapu, which is derived from the Pueblo tradition that a human being's spirit enters this world through a small hole (sipapu) in the earthen floor of the ceremonial kiva. Sipapu is a common Ute name, presumably acquired in Pueblo-Ute contacts. Spirit of Earth's and Rain's first sojourn with the Eastmans is short-lived, as they are claimed by the Utes and sold as slaves. Escaping from slavery by chewing through their bonds, Spirit of Earth and Rain return to the Eastmans in primitive Provo, where they remain a constant presence when not taking part in other major plot developments—Mara's romances, Indian conflicts, and polygamy. Mara, Rain, and

37 Doyle Jenks, Interview, 16 August 1983.

38 Ibid.
Spirit of Earth shelter another Indian woman, Blueflower, who is with child, by either her former Indian husband or the rape by Ivie Richards, a white Mormon. After Blueflower's death, young Mara takes the baby, Sobe, to raise.

As Rain begins to embrace Mara's values, Spirit of Earth tries to maintain a closeness to the earth by digging for roots, peeling bark, and gathering wild berries. She witnesses encroaching urbanization:

Sipapu saw the bones of the house rising in the flat wilderness . . . . Soon walls climbed into the sky. Other houses around the city rose. The men worked days and in the night making brick, cutting timber, fencing. They cut the desert into places for houses, sheared the ground of growth, until no animals lived under or over the ground. The earth was changing before Sipapu's old eyes.

Spirit of Earth feels compelled to leave the safety of the Eastmans and return Rain to the Utes, risking slavery for the hope of finding a husband for Rain, after forcing Rain to admit that no respectable white man would take an Indian wife. After gaining reacceptance and a husband for Rain, Spirit of Earth and Rain convince the Utes to return for Sobe, fully aware that he might be more valuable as a slave than as a part of the people. When the Utes return to claim Sobe, the Eastmans refuse to surrender him. In the conflict over the child, Rain's husband is killed by a Ute and Mama Eastman accidently shoots Spirit of Earth. The symbolic slaying of

Spirit of Earth at the hands of one who loved her, clearly underscores Brown's theme that even though the Indians suffered irreparably, the intentions of the Mormons were sincere:

Mara sat with Rain beside the quiet hearth, not speaking, her own heart heavy with grief. You are here with us, Rain. There have been wrongs, terrible wrongs. We had no intentions of destroying your people. We were also driven. All we wanted was to live and we thought—we were wrong, but we thought it all the same—that we would live beside you using the land beside you. . . . But we thought that we could teach you to live our way and that you would find the same happiness we find in order and cleanliness. Our order and cleanliness. We didn't stop, dear Rain, to see you had an order of your own, a harmony with the land. We didn't listen to you very well. Rain, oh Rain, we are sorry.

Rain is likewise symbolic as "Rain made the earth clean and new and brought life." As a second wife to one of Mara's spurned suitors, Rain indeed brings life to a childless family. Rain's husband, Sully Tuttle, is frequently on the fringes of Eastman propriety, splitting an Indian's stomach and filling it with rock to sink the body, gathering skulls from Indian bodies for an anthropologist, thus qualifying his compromised morals for an Indian wife. In spite of occasional lapses into stereotype—Rain as a fat Indian mama, and the perfect stoic at the funeral of her son, Tommy—Brown's portrayal of Rain creates a romantic visionary who becomes credible with spiritual compatibility of Mormon principles:

40 Ibid., p. 244.
obeying the promptings of the Holy Ghost, Christian charity, and sacrifice.

Rain's visionary moments occur when she follows her mother away from the Eastmans, hearing "the faraway voice of Sipapu in her heart," and she is instrumental in the rescue of another character by willing Sully to the scene:

"I had a feeling that you were here," he said softly. "The strangest feeling came over me that you needed me, and how I knew you were here, I'll never know, but I just came."  

Rain exemplifies charity through her unwillingness to seek revenge on those who wrong her, feeding the jailed Ute, Squash, and suckling Sobe's abandoned child. On her death bed, Rain breaks to Mara her silence of years of suffering, guilt over the accident of another character, Caroline, and the loss of all of her children:

"I told God I would give anything if [Caroline] could have a child . . . and . . . and . . . He took mine. All of mine. . . . I prayed to God I would give anything if Hanson come home, marry our baby [Grace]. All I have left is my life. I want God to take it . . . to save Hanson."  

While bargaining with the Lord may be faulty, Rain demonstrates a selflessness that Mara had yet to comprehend.

42 Ibid., p. 474.
Mara's most selfless act was in the rearing of Sobe, although he was often secondary to her romantic and personal pursuits. Sobe begins the dilution of the Indian characters, with each succeeding generation becoming assimilated, and less well-developed. Sobe is well educated by Mara, reading the classics and The Book of Mormon. After a short-lived secret marriage, conveniently producing a baby, and thus supplying another character for marriage to the half-blood Indian children of Sully and Rain, Sobe finds his place in life as a worker at the mill, and dies in a mill fire. Jenny, his daughter, shows promise as an opera singer, but returns to Provo to marry Sully and Rain's Charles. Together they drown in Utah Lake with all of Sully and Rain's other children. Conveniently ashore during the accident, Grace, the child of Jenny and Charles, becomes the fulfillment of all the generations from the Spirit of Earth, by marrying, for true love, the white man Hanson Eastman.

While the romantic ending of the book tidies up the plot, Brown leaves many loose ends. The Indian characters with greatest promise for success in the white world, Sobe and Jenny, falter without explanation. While it may be reasonable to assume that they were limited by the prejudices of white society, both Jenny and Sobe choose roles of subservience. Each succeeding generation loses touch with their Indian heritage, until Grace is simply described as "dark," and as a child asks Sobe, "Grandpa, if you were an Indian, did you wear paint?"
Painted Indians have a place in Brown's sprawling plot and they are her weakest characters. Several historical Ute leaders parade through the plot: Walkara, his brother Arrapene, Sowiette, and Squash, with Squash being Brown's only attempt at character development among such leaders, being a "fat duck." These leaders exemplify the savagery of the Utah Indians, selling human slaves, dashing out brains of children, attacking the white settlers, and abandoning families. All of these attributes are historically accurate for the sake of the plot, but provide a stark contrast that weakens the veracity of the gentle women, Rain and Spirit of Earth, who are assailed by stereotyped Indian men.

Brown's lack of viable male characters may result from her failure to address the characters through native myth and ritual. While creating her own myth around Rain and Spirit of Earth, Brown's Indians are not seen practicing their own beliefs except through minor cultural manifestations, weaving, or building a wickiup and a birthing hut for Blueflower. Brown identifies various Utah tribes—Utes, Paiutes, Pavants—but depicts no distinctive characteristics about each group. Nevertheless, a strong sense of Spirit of Earth's commitment to community and place enhance the believability of her character. Spirit of Earth is willing to risk slavery and her life

43 Several of these accounts recall familiar myths associated with Indians which are found in Leslie A. Fiedler, The Return of the Vanishing American (New York: Stein and Day, 1968).
in order to return Rain to the People, knowing that her future rests in her posterity. Rain delivers food to Squash while the people cry for his life. The earth is Sipapu's source of life, and physical descriptions of Spirit of Earth and Rain often include "earthy." But even more effectively, Brown's use of metaphors and symbols place Rain and Spirit of Earth in an integral symbiosis with the living universe.

The symbolic title, The Earthkeepers, aspires to a transfer of that organic harmony from Rain and Spirit of Earth to the new keepers of the earth, principally Mara. Ultimately, the book is Mara's. Even when the Indian women are taking an active role, we see them through Mara's eyes, which is most acutely painful during the mourning for Spirit of Earth. Rain remains a mystery to Mara, and to the reader. Mara's love for these women overcomes her repulsion at their stench (recall immaculate Mara in the wilderness cabin, without modern conveniences), but the source of her feelings is associated with theology—fulfilling Book of Mormon prophecies concerning Lamanites—and contains familiar civil rights rhetoric. The rhetoric comes from both whites and Indians as Rain and Sully's children are taunted with "Apple, Apple. Red on the outside, white on the inside." In spite of the shortcomings of The Earthkeepers, Brown, through Mara, captures an Indian essence of Rain and Spirit of Earth, while limiting these women to Mara's understanding.
Addressing the same locale in an earlier setting, Lee Nelson's *The Storm Testament* (1982) is another example of a Third Generation Mormon writer, but one who finds "Indians were hard to understand." This story consists of the reconstructed journals of Dan Storm. Dan and a new incarnation of Chingachgook, Ike, an escaped slave, wend their way westward to Utah through a variety of adventures, and separations, in a basic plot reminiscent of A. B. Guthrie's *The Big Sky*. Dan ends up with a Ute wife and Ike finds a place as leader of the degenerate, ant-eating Cosiutes. Of course in proper Eastern Mormon society Dan could never fulfill his foreordination as a Mormon patriarch with an Indian wife, so the young woman is captured by an enemy tribe, tortured, and in spite of Dan's rescue, dies. The second volume promises the tale of Dan's reconciliation to Mormonism.

In this adventure tale, the action is non-stop, leaving little room for any character development, setting descriptions, or theme. Even the plot has lapses: Blackfoot Indians are transformed inexplicably to Sioux, and, having lost all his weaponry, Dan mysteriously acquires a knife that saves him and a Ute warrior. Dan proves himself to the Utes by capturing, with Ike's help, horses for a dowry. But when the Utes migrate, Dan and his wife, Red Leaf, remain at Utah Lake until her

capture, rescue, and death. Dan summarizes his perception of Utes:

There were parts of their lifestyle that I loved—the carefree wandering, the buffalo hunts, the freedom, the love and respect for the land and animals. But they had other ways I hated—the torturing of prisoners, even women and children; the selling of children into slavery; their general lack of concern for human suffering.

As with other novels that are more style than substance, The Storm Testament falls victim to its own genre. Except for the summary quoted above, there is no recognition of values essential to Native Americans. Those Indians who participate in the plot ride out of a Saturday matinee, magnifying Dan Storm through their shallow imagery.

Of the four novels with auxiliary Indian characters, three contribute to stock images of Indians. Only The Earthkeepers makes a serious attempt to portray Native American values by creating valid characters. Indeed, Brown succeeds in The Earthkeepers even more than those authors whose primary focus is Indians.

Indians as incidental characters appear in five additional novels, most frequently as simple plot devices, or to create local color. The Giant Joshua (1941), by Maureen Whipple, a major Lost Generation novel, has two minor Indian

Ibid., p. 282.
Maurine Whipple, The Giant Joshua (Salt Lake City, Utah: Western Epics, 1976).
characters. Tutsegabbett is chief of the Paiutes, who makes grunting, gutteral appearances that foil the self-righteous Abijah Macintire. Buck, another Indian character, teaches Clory, the principle character, how to make buckskin gloves in order to earn money, while her husband, Abijah, is on a mission. For the sake of historical accuracy, Tutsegabbett rides through with Jacob Hamblin, and Whipple refers to the numerous tribes that had once inhabited the St. George area. Unseen Indians provide minor tensions by scaring Clory—although her own fear is substantially larger than the Indian threat—and abducting the child of another character.

Physical description reflects the Noble Savage image:

Tutsegabbett . . . sat his horse in kingly dignity, keeping his gaze straight ahead. . . . White and red and yellow stripes slanted across his high bronze cheekbones. His nose was arrogant and his liquid eyes expressionless.\(^{47}\)

Whipple is careful to make tribal distinctions, but without the creation of a functional character, there is little room for Native American values, nor should there be. The book is the story of Clorinda MacIntyre, whose incidental encounters with Indians were perceived largely on the basis of her imagination.

There is little imagination in the Home Literature novel, Valley of Tomorrow (1966),\(^{48}\) by Gordon Allred. Aside

\(^{47}\) Ibid., p. 171.

\(^{48}\) Gordon T. Allred, Valley of Tomorrow (Salt Lake City, Utah: Bookcraft, 1966).
from being an over-wrought tale, the only Indian appears when the main character is sent to jail: "Even the Indian lying half stupefied in his bunk began to join them." Claire Noall's Surely the Night (1972)\textsuperscript{49} is much better, as a novel, falling more in the Third Generation category as a woman tries to resolve the hardships of polygamy. One Indian appears to seek a midwife for a stranded white woman. He is identified as a Shoshone, but is classified as a wild animal—a horse, she writes, "can smell an Indian a mile away."\textsuperscript{50} Home Literature tale spinner Blaine Yorgason's Charlie's Monument: An Allegory of Love (1976)\textsuperscript{51} also has mostly imaginary Indians. Real Indians kill Charlie's mother, but after Charlie is employed to look for Indians from the top of the hill, they never appear again, even though he spends his time and energy watching for them.

Maxine Anderson Henrie's Spurlock' Saint (1981)\textsuperscript{52} is another western adventure—Home Literature tale that has more imagination about Indians than living characters. The Indian presence is felt through the abduction of the hero's sister. No details are divulged, but the Indian threat is omnipresent.

\textsuperscript{49} Claire Noall, Surely the Night (Salt Lake City, Utah: University of Utah Press, 1972).

\textsuperscript{50} Ibid., p. 32.

\textsuperscript{51} Blaine M. Yorgason, Charlie's Monument: An Allegory of Love, Photographs by Glen Ricks (Salt Lake City, Utah: Bookcraft, 1976).

\textsuperscript{52} Maxine Anderson Henrie, Spurlock' Saint (Orem, Utah: Randall Publishers, 1981).
Finally the hero, Eric, and the heroine, Zoe, catch a real Indian stealing a steer:

Like a panther, the warrior sprang about to face those who had invade [sic] his self-appointed domain, fierceness upon his Buffalo-nickel features that caused Zoe to shrink with fear.\(^{53}\)

Of course, the "squaw" is the long-lost sister who is returned to the white fold, with her two half-blood children, tidying up that aspect of the plot. Another Indian character is the maid, Little Spruce, who is full of profound "ugh"s. As with her other novel, The Proud Blood, Spurlock' Saint is mostly contrived plot with virtue rewarded (Eric and Zoe will be married in the "T-E-M-P-L-E") to characters who are so stiff that their artistic virtue is lost.

While each of the minor character Indians above may be valid in the context of the story in which they appear, they contribute to an overall image that is more savage than noble. With few exceptions to offset misperceptions of Noble Savage imagery, Mormon writers have contributed to the Noble Savage myth, while assuming on the other hand, a unique understanding of the Native American.

Since the 1942 publication of The Giant Joshua, several books have appeared under the guise of history, but with injections of dialogue and the unmistakable voice of the author. Several of these books focus on the early missionaries

\(^{53}\) Ibid., p. 90.
to the Lamanites, including Jacob Hamblin, Andrew Gibbons and Amos Wright. Others simply retell historical anecdotes. Those with missionary focus remain that, giving little attention to Indian cultural details. The Native remained an object to be subdued and converted as evidenced by the title of Andrew Gibbon's biography, *Saint and Savage.*

Juanita Brooks has, perhaps, the best literary style, and the worst stereotypes with no acknowledgment of Indians as human beings in either her biography of Jacob Hamblin or her recounting of *Frontier Tales.* In one frontier tale, braves are searching for a papoose left by the squaw in a pioneer home. The baby is hiding under the skirts of the courageous white woman Ann Chatterly MacFarlane. Although Brooks admits tribal differences in Jacob Hamblin, each Indian is still stereotyped in a savage state of bravery and squawdom.

Amos Wright's claim to fame is his baptism of Shoshone leader, Washakie. Although reconstructed from Wright's journals, *The Adventures of Amos Wright: Mormon Frontiersman* contains

54  Helen Bay Gibbons, *Saint and Savage* (Salt Lake City, Utah: Deseret Book, 1965).


57  Ibid., p. 31-32.

no sense of Wright's relations with Indians, other than his knowledge of Indian languages and his evangelical mission. As with Saint and Savage, the biographical objective is a tempered hagiography of the early missionaries. Such history contains the heavy hand of provincial attitudes toward cultures and races where the stereotypes of American Indians prevail.

Of the books reviewed, the weaknesses of the Indian characters lie in the inherent weaknesses of each book. Little Injun, Mormon Injun, Big Injun, The Windwalker, and Seeker of the Gentle Heart are so intent on their messages that they leave behind the fundamentals of fiction: character development, plot construction, valid conflict, and awareness of setting. Jayhawk, The Proud Blood, and The Storm Testament manage a plot, but fall short of the other elements. Although Jayhawk is the best of the group, all of these books are weak and are, at best, undeveloped. The Claws of the Hawk, The Fancher Train, and Watch for the Morning, as Lost Generation novels, are better books, but find their preoccupation in historical events and incongruencies of Mormonism.

Books with only passing mention of Indians, including the narrative histories, generally make use of the most convenient device of Indian stereotype. Even the best written Mormon novel, The Giant Joshua falls into the snare of the Noble Savage image. The two books that come closest to succeeding with Native Americans are Without Reservation and The Earthkeepers. Without Reservation has a more clearly defined purpose—the extended personal essay—that does not
attempt to create rounded Native American characters. The Earthkeepers has the most valid Native American characters, despite their limitations, and the highest artistic integrity.

Mormons have failed to rise to greater heights in fictionally treating the American Indian partially because they have failed to rise to great fictional heights. William Mulder suggests that Mormon fiction is limited by the Mormon audience:

One of the major threats to Mormon literary growth is what may be called the uneducated literacy of the Church membership, a greater danger perhaps than downright illiteracy because adult minds, capable of growth, have been arrested, in the official literature, at the level of the school lesson and never treated to the stimulation of the mature writing the whole Mormon tradition should have ripened by our time.

It is that adult illiteracy that continues to accept the literature that perpetuates the Noble Savage, limiting perception of Native Americans to stereotypes, ideas and images, thus prejudicing an acceptance of Native American values in literature. This limited perception is most apparent in the short stories and poems found primarily in the official Mormon publications.

Short Stories, Poems and Essays

Since 1941, Church publications have undergone a major consolidation. The 1941 publications included The Improvement

Era for adults, The Relief Society Magazine for women, and The Children's Friend for children. These magazines were consolidated in 1971 into the Ensign for adults, The New Era for teenagers and young adults, and The Friend for children. The Church also published a digest of three major publications, aimed at American Indians, called the Liahona, after a Book of Mormon compass. Since 1941, in the publications listed, at least 332 articles (See Appendix I), short stories and poems have appeared with the American Indian as focus. Unfortunately, only a handful of these articles have attempted to sharpen the image of the Native American into clear focus. The worst show the stereotypical Indians, tribeless, nameless, and below humanity, merely as foils for the noble pioneers. The tale of the woman or children, alone in the cabin, being accosted by savages and subduing the heathens with small tokens of food or kindness is retold in many forms. More often than not, the fear of hostility is more real than the actual threat.

Later short stories conquer the Savage but retain the nobility in a thin disguise of Home Literature. Until Cheryl Ann Tolino's essay, only a handful of children's stories have come close to incorporating the essentials of Native American aesthetic values. The remainder fall victim to misconceptions and inherent literary weaknesses, using the American Indian as a pawn in a game of didacticism. As representative examples, I will consider a poem from The Relief Society Magazine, a short story from The New Era, where several examples of good
Third Generation Mormon literature have appeared, and a smattering of children's stories, one typical and one refreshing.

Most of the Mormon poetry about Indians is found in The Relief Society Magazine and accompanies doctrinal articles about Lamanites by General Authorities of the Church. The quality of the verse varies widely from trite aphorisms ("Great Spirit, help me/Judge no man till I have walked/In his moccasins.")\(^\text{60}\) to evocations of American Indian muses: "In primitive grace and Indian art/She coiled the flowing stream."\(^\text{61}\) In one of the best poems, "Navajo Cradle Song," by frequently-published poetess Alice Morrey Bailey, the author evokes characters of Navajo deity:

Go to sleep, little one, don't you know it is night?
All around you is slumber, yet your black eyes are bright.
Dawn Boy has carried the sun to the West;
In the Turquoise One's house he is now at his rest.
Long shadows have thickened;
Outside is the dark,
And distant and weird
Is the coyote's thin bark.
All they of the winds, and the deer-folk are still,
And the soft-footed tribe stalks its prey on the hill,
And now the eyes of the Sky People peeping
At you through the snake-hole, their watch of you keeping.
Your father is nodding,
His fire has burned low,
And his silver-work gleams
In the red-embered glow.
Your mother is weary, now quiet her loom,
Its bright pattern dimmed in the hogan's soft gloom.


Your sister is dreaming, sleep-flung on her pelt;
In the blue of the firelight her small features melt.
Your brothers have watered
And bedded their sheep,
And your black eyes are drowsy,
So sleep, papoose, sleep.

Bailey's references to Navajo gods, accompanied by obvious Navajo vocations—silversmithing father, rug weaving mother and shepherding brother—authenticate tribal affiliation. The integration of the natural elements with the dieties demonstrates an understanding of place. Even though the element of community outside the family unit is omitted, the general aura of mystique recalls the tone of Navajo myth and ritual. Bailey's only lapse is in the final line where she lulls the non-Navajo, stereotypical "papoose" to sleep. Nevertheless, as one of the better poems from official Church publications, "Navajo Cradle Song" represents an awareness of Native American values absent in most Mormon poetry and short stories.

The New Era has been home for many short stories designed to influence the youth of the Church into proper behavior. Adolescent conflict is also the basis of "Drought on Reservations" by Patricia Bronson Brower. The main character is Sarah Yazzie, a Navajo Placement Student returning home for the summer. As with many other short stories in

Church publications, the author gives an expositionary grocery list of Navajo traits: the physical appearance of velveteen dress and silver jewelry, life in a hogan with meals of mutton stew, fried bread and beans, occupations of rug weaving and sheep herding. After these summaries of Navajo distinctions, the complication occurs in the introduction of the boy, Bennie. Bennie is not a Mormon, but Sarah agrees to accompany him to a dance. At the dance, Sarah is tempted by a sweet-smelling community cigarette which she bravely refuses at the expense of potential friendship with her peers—especially Bennie. Bennie, in a more mature manner, admires her resolve, thus concluding this tale.

Even in these few pages, Brower has ignored a potential for serious literary conflict—Sarah's transitions from one culture to another—to a typical boy/girl romance at the expense of Indian characters. Simple summaries do not suffice in creating a Native American short story. As in any good fiction, each item—the Navajo uniqueness, community, and place—should be interwoven into the motivations of the characters and the plot. The purpose of Brower's story is not to create viable Native American characters, but to teach a lesson of firm resolve, as Sarah says: "To thy own self be true."64 Unfortunately, the victim of the short story is the American Indian, who again is relegated to stereotype.

64 Ibid., p. 39.
Perhaps the worst use of inept imagery is in the Indian stories that infiltrate the children's publications. In stories from 1941 through the 1950's, Indians appear as threats to Mormon pioneers, giving the settlers opportunities to demonstrate courage, faith, patience, etc., in the face of savagery. Later stories have reduced the Indian to a little forest figure, void of tribe, place and community, but eager to demonstrate some aspect of moral character. If these stories were the only source of information about Native Americans, the following conclusions would be drawn from overwhelming evidence: Indians are frightening and dangerous, and speak nearly incoherently; they live in teepees, shoot bows and arrows, wear feathers in headbands, and beat tom-toms; they may have names like Little Squirrels that grow up into Big Squirrels, and there are twice as many boy Indians as there are girls. Even when some accuracy occurs, it is often negated by inaccurate illustration.

Typical of the later tales that epitomize misconceptions is "First Big Step," by Mary Joyce Capps. Capps is a frequent author of children's Indian stories in both The Friend and The Children's Friend. "First Big Step" is representative of her style and appears in the Liahona, produced especially for Indian children.

A bear cub looking for a substitute mother follows Little Wolf through the woods. The real mother bear catches up with them. Little Wolf takes refuge in a tree, not wanting to lead the grizzly into the village. As the determined mother bear tries to shake him down, the "shouting braves, led by his father, Chief Otoe" scare away the bears. Rewarded for bravery, Little Wolf's name is changed to Gray Wolf. Obviously this little story is saturated with typical Indian images: the Chief (there are other Indian leaders and titles), the braves, the manhood rite, the headband with feather, no tribe and no culture, just primitivism in the forest. The hazard of this type of story is that it is the milk on which Mormon youngsters are bred, preparing them for Texturized Vegetable Protein of the Noble Savage, with sorrowfully few alternatives.

These images are not unique to Mormonism, but, as documented in Arlene B. Hirschfelder's *American Indian Stereotypes in the World of Children*, are replete in children's literature. One can routinely find the stereotypical Indian under "I" in alphabet books, with headdresses in hat books, in counting books ("Ten Little Indians"), and as animals in animal stories. These caricatures are reinforced through the marketing of Indian toy paraphernalia. The consequence of this early socializing regarding Indian images is that many people will never take the time to investigate an alternative

of authentic Native Americans, thus perpetuating misconceptions and laying ground for another generation of ignorance that subtly relegates the Native American to a dehumanized state.  

A surprising alternative appears in a recent story in The Friend, "Nita's Sheep" by Elizabeth Fritz, illustrated by Mike Rogan, that treats Native Americans as authentic human beings. At first glance the illustrations are authentically Navajo, both in setting and spatial design. Although there are in this story some listings of Navajo traits, the details are associated with other elements of the story, not just catalogues for cultural veracity.

Nita and her family prepare the wool for their grandmother to weave a rug. The children choose colors for the rug. Although at first the children want bright colors, Nita goes with the grandmother to prepare the natural dyes. As they stop to pick the prickly pear blossom, Nita is excited that there may be a bright new color in the rug:

"You've never woven a rose colored rug before!" Nita said excitedly.
"I mix it with brown to make a good Indian color—the color of the earth that takes care of us."
Nita looked toward the hogan framed against the rocks. "It was kind of rosy brown in the setting sun. "Like that?" she asked, pointing.


"Yes, I see a design in my head that has many squares of the Indian earth color at sunset." The conclusion of the story is that Nita chooses the earth color for her wool. The grandmother finishes the rug, and it is completed. But the rug reminds the grandmother that the earth continues, renewing life with the recurrence of the seasons: "That is how the earth takes care of us." The little story successfully demonstrates basic Native American values by incorporating them into plot and characters. The story centers on the making of the rug and the elements that contribute to the task. It is an enactment of cultural ritual to shear the sheep, prepare and dye the wool, and finally weave the rug. Though the two main characters are Nita and her grandmother, there is a sense of larger family community with the appearance of other family members. The grandmother not only states that the earth is essential to her life, but she demonstrates it by the preparation of her art and acknowledgment of the earth's life-giving forces. "A little child shall lead them," and this children's story points the way for possibilities of sensitive portrayals of Native Americans within Church publications. A few short literary pieces by Mormon authors have appeared outside the realms of official Church publications, with uneven results in treating the Indian topic.

69 Ibid., p. 35.
70 Ibid.
The reflective essay "Winter Feast at San Idelfonso" by Karl Young, is a description of a visit he made to the San Idelfonso Pueblo for the January twenty-third Winter Feast. Young encapsules the basic elements of the feast: the combining of traditional religious beliefs with Christianity, the solemn rituals, the transformation of dancers into living beasts, obeisance to the cardinal directions of the earth. Young has missed some symbolic significance of the rituals and costumes, but on the whole he has given a good description of the Pueblo's Winter Feast without the scientific scrutiny of an anthropologist nor the ethnic superiority. Except for a lapse to describe a warrior or two, Young has, through a flowing style, charmed the reader into being a participating witness at a ritual that not only represents the peoples of San Idelfonso, but their beliefs and community.

Marilyn Brown's poem, "Indian Playmate," emphasizes the community of mankind. The narrator is a non-Indian child, witnessing mirror-like behavior of an Indian child. Unlike the characters in The Earthkeepers, Brown's narrator does not consider primitive pioneer life superior to primitive Indian life:

71 Karl Young, "Winter Feast at San Idelfonso," Brigham Young University Studies, 6 (1965), 93–99.

Your eyes, like mine, are black,
Your skin dust-worn.
You cling to your mother's colored skirts
Crusted with old mud
And tap with a sage-brush broom
like ours at your yellow dog
that crowds the same frayed hens. 73

Even though Brown's narrator senses the common threads between himself and the Indian playmate, he is unable to cross the river to establish any friendship. The last couplet acknowledges that regardless of likeness, the differences and the non-Indian will prevail:

You, busy, build the same crumbling walls.74
I build out of the same slivers of stone.

And, as with The Earthkeepers, Brown has rung a resonate bell of worthy human responses. But she has done so with the same tunnel vision of The Earthkeepers' characters, accepting only those traits which are common, overlooking the differences and the criteria of Native American values of tribal identity, place and community.

Like "Indian Playmate," Dawn Baker Brimley's "Koosharem, Utah--1914"75 treats Indian-white relations, but with a grisly ending. "Three brass-skinned boys of Box Creek Reservation" have been promised an education. Waiting half a day in the

73 Ibid., p. 20.
74 Ibid., p. 21.
rain for the teacher, the sky symbolically foreshadows their fate:

Then cracked the sailing sun and hung impaled
in blood-red sign from Spirit of the Sky:
out of the fabulous rain,
in the fierce clouds,
a great wound bloomed for Red Man,
on whom a world of ills came down like fire. 76

After school, three white boys stalk and scalp the Old Schoolman who had allowed the Indian boys to enter school. The stanza of the impaled sun is repeated with a slight alteration in the first line: "Then cracked the sun again..." 77

The poem ends with the white boys expelled from school, refusing to sit by the "Dumb Indians" and Old Schoolman never quite forgetting, even though his hair grew back, "times of vows and signs, the day the/sun bled twice and open skies cried long." 78

The central character of the poem is Old Schoolman, who is unable to fulfill his vow to teach the Indians. This graphic re-creation demonstrates the gap between good intentions and actual performance, not only on the part of the "white skinned savages" but Old Schoolman. Brimley carefully draws the reader into the poem, foreshadows the failure of the commitment, shocking with brute description and finally causing

76 Ibid., p. 106.
77 Ibid., p. 107.
78 Ibid.
the reader to mourn with the sky at the injustice of mankind. The symbolic use of the sky gives a sense of place, of the earth as a living being who mourns the foibles of man. The boys are identified as from the Box Creek Reservation, but the poem is the point of view of Old Schoolman, with the Indian boys being the inciting incident. Nevertheless, there is a sympathy for "Tommy Indian, Joe Bob and Walker" who are forced into the community of the outsider.

Virginia Sorenson is clearly an outsider in her short story "The Grandson." Although the story is a tightly constructed tale, it fails to capture the elements of Native American authenticity. The characters are Yaqui Indians who are faced with the traditional ways of the Grandfather and the enterprising realities of white contacts through the primary character, Adam. The tale recounts Adam's reconciliation with his Grandfather's traditional values. Adam is a fairly modern man with army experience and desires for material wealth, but the grandfather warns: "It is to be clean as it is to be rich—not of the body and fine clothing, but of the heart." Finally, after superficial anguish, Adam capitulates:

In the blaze of the afternoon outside, he stood wondering where he could be alone for a while. And he heard himself make a sound—he wondered whether his grandfather heard it—he sighed like a real Yaqui.

80 Ibid., p. 107.
81 Ibid., p. 110.
The Grandfather's desires for Adam to embrace traditional values imply the significance of community. But that suggestion is the closest Sorenson comes to utilizing values to create an authentic Native American short story. Even though the characters are identified as Yaquis, there is no distinction to support their tribal uniqueness, for which there is ample room, even in a short story. There is no sense of place or myth or ritual. The use of an elderly authority could be seen as stereotypical—the wise old chief whose character is never fully developed but serves as complication for Adam.

These four short pieces are generally of a higher quality than the short pieces of official Church publications. The number is too small to permit any significant conclusions regarding different publications, but these works point out possibilities for Mormon writers to be sensitive to Native American issues in literature.

Mormon literature featuring American Indians pays painfully little attention to essential Native American values. Most authors have vindicated eternal life by continuing to resurrect the Noble Savage stereotype. Part of the failure of Indian characters in most Mormon literature rests, as previously noted, in the failures of Mormon literature itself. So few alternatives are offered that the misconceptions continue, perpetuated through children and adolescent literature. The few exceptions of literature sensitive to Native American values of tribal distinctions, place and community, the role
of myth and ritual, still fall short of creating a Native American point of view. This point of view has been created by non-Indian authors in general American literature. But the most authentic works are created—and probably will always be created—by a growing generation of Native American writers who write about themselves.

III

The topic of cultural conflict seems to be the choice of most Native American authors, but with the widespread uses of Native American myth and ritual, where myth can heal cultural trauma or poison the self by overdose. The most prominent Native American writer in general American literature is N. Scott Momaday (Kiowa), who penned The Way to Rainy Mountain (1969) and House Made of Dawn, which won the Pulitzer Prize in 1966. Vine Deloria, Jr. (Sioux) revitalized Native American rhetoric with Custer Died for Your Sins: An Indian Manifesto (1969). James Welch (Gros Ventre) is known for his surrealist poetry and novel Winter in the Blood (1974). Leslie Marmon Silko calls on her Laguna heritage for her novel Ceremony (1977).

Mormon Native Americans have yet to make significant contributions to Native American literature or Mormon literature. Even though the Mormon Church published a periodical, titled Liahona, from 1964 to 1971, targeted at Lamanites, it was written by non-Indians. Two Mormon Native Americans,
Howard Rainer in conjunction with his photography exhibits, and a recent essay by Cheryl Tolino, published in the Ensign.

Howard Rainer, of Taos Pueblo, attempts to restore dignity to Native Americans in his overt response to American art's portrayals of the Noble Savage, to "edifices meant to be tributes to an unwanted race." However, Rainer's poetry, however, blurs the dignity of his photography. Most of Rainer's "poems" fail to condense language through poetic imagery. When he does create a memorable line—"our hair is black and shiny because our sacred rivers have washed it many times"—he kills the response with a sentimental last line bombast:

Look and ask yourself,  
"Why couldn't  
I love these faces?  
They are beautiful just like mine."  

In spite of the weakness of his poetry, Rainer proclaims a freedom tinged with bitterness that emerges only from a familiarity with traditional Native American values and modern racism:

83 Howard Rainer, "Profiles of A Proud People," Exhibit pamphlet, August 5 to August 30, 1983, Brigham Young University, Harris Fine Arts Center, Gallery 303, Provo, Utah. Works quoted from the exhibit used with author's permission.  
84 Ibid.
Stop and listen to me.

I want to be a part of you
America
But a part—
And still be who I am.

I want to defend
What you stand for
And still keep my forefather's ways.

I want to be an American,
But take pride in my heritage.
I want to be a part of you,

But let me be— 85
A Native American.

Native American values are clear in the prize-winning essay "A Piece of Earth in A Vacuum of Time," by Cheryl Ann Tolino. 86 Essentially the tale of individual growth recognized by a sojourn at home, this essay effectively fuses the basic elements of community, place, Navajo identity and a sense of myth and ritual. Tolino exudes the pervasive vitality of the landscape:

The hills in the distance outline the horizon, separating the brightening sky from the darker earth. The land is quiet. Here among the canyons and across the desert where silence pervades the air, life sits in a corner untouched. Time slips by unnoticed. This whole place is a piece of earth and time tucked away in the folds of the Navajo reservation. . . . 87

85 Ibid.
87 Ibid., p. 21.
Only later references to the Placement Program, Brigham Young University and a mission betray Tolino's Mormonism.

While Rainer's works are limited, Tolino combines good writing with personal experiences. Both clearly reflect the Native American point of view and Native American values. This small but growing voice, along with the few responsible works, such as *The Earthkeepers*, stands as contrast to the pervasive Noble Savage, both sentimental and beastly, that pervades Mormon literature.
Chapter III  "Great Spirit Listen to the Red Man's Wail:"
The American Indian in Mormon Hymns and Music

The historical Noble Savage enters the modern Mormon Church with the fanfare of congregational hymn singing. Standard hymn practices emphasize lyrics, with little consideration of Native American musical practices. Lyrics are a minor consideration in traditional Native American music which, because of its scalar patterns, pulsing rhythms and unique vocal styles, may be the most misunderstood expression of Native American values.

I

Mormon music had an auspicious beginning. The Lord directed Emma Smith, through her husband, the Prophet Joseph, to "Make a selection of sacred hymns, as it shall be given thee, which is pleasing unto me to be had in my church" (Doctrine and Covenants 25:11, 1830). Emma Smith gathered existing hymns and encouraged members of the new church to compose their own hymns with topics unique to Mormon theology, including, of course, the Lamanite. As the Church moved westward and established itself in Utah, which was Indian
territory, actual Indian encounters became a source for hymns and folksongs. These historical hymns, which partook of the First Generation literary style, and carried into recent and current Mormon practice by congregational singing, are in standard, homophonic four-part harmony with little musical regard to specific text. A more musical rendition of an American Indian song is in the current children's hymnal. Likewise, there is only a single example of twentieth-century secular music about American Indians by a Mormon composer.

**Hymns**

William W. Phelps (1792-1872) wrote twenty-nine of ninety songs in the first official hymnal of the Church, *Latter-day Saint Hymns* (1835). Included in that original collection, and each succeeding official hymnal until the current edition (1948), is Phelps' "O Stop and Tell Me, Red Man."

O stop and tell me, Red Man, Who are you, why you roam, And how you get your living; have you no God, no home? With stature straight and portly, and decked in native pride, With feathers, paints and brooches, He willingly replied.

---


2 *Hymns: The Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints* (Salt Lake City, Utah: Deseret Book, 1948).

3 *Latter-day Saint Hymns* (Salt Lake City, Utah: The Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints, 1927), No. 64.
The Indian responds by recounting his fall from light in Book of Mormon times "some thousand moons ago." He readily acknowledges his progenitors' uncivilized state:

And long they've lived by hunting instead of works and arts,
And so our race has dwindled to idle Indian hearts.
Yet hope within us lingers, As if the Spirit spoke,
He'll come for your redemption, and break the Gentile yoke.

The respondent expresses hope to "quit their savage customs, to live with God at home."

Phelps clearly incorporates the Puritan work ethic, that hunting is idleness and that a wandering, gathering society is not only homeless but godless. He also repeats a Puritan assumption that the Indian, once exposed to the Gospel, would quickly and willingly embrace a new life of obedience, with nobility overcoming savagery.

Another hymn connecting The Book of Mormon to the contemporary Indian is "The Solid Rocks Were Rent in Twain," by poet-apostle, Parley P. Pratt (1807-1857). The first four stanzas of the poem tell of Christ's crucifixion. The next six tell of the resurrected Lord's visit to America. Stanzas eleven through thirteen tell of the destruction of the Nephites and dwindling of the Lamanites until the restoration of the Gospel:

4 Hymns (1927), No. 331.
Until the Gentiles from afar,
Should smite them in a dreadful war,
And take possession of their land,
And they should have no power to stand.

But as their remnants wander far,
In darkness, sorrow and despair,
Lo! From the earth their record comes
To gather Israel to their homes.

Pratt uses the metaphoric darkness for description and may allude to Alexander Pope's well-known "Noble Savagery":

Lo, the poor Indian! whose untutor'd mind
Sees God in clouds, or hears him in the wind;

With the previous two hymns, "Great Spirit Listen to the Red Man's Wail!" by Charles W. Penrose (1832-1925) is included in the 1927 hymnal. This hymn, lamenting the depraved state of the Noble Savage Indian, calls out a cavalry of cliches:

Great Spirit, listen to the red man's wail!

. . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . .
Great Chieftain, save him from the palefaced foe!

His broad, green hunting grounds, where buff'loes roam
His bubbling streams where finny thousands play,
The waving prairies, once his happy home,
Are fast departing to the Christian's sway.

With curs'd firewater's stupefying flame,
(which lulled the senses of our chiefs to rest)
And soft-mouthed words, the cheating paleface came
And stole our lands and drove us to the west.

---


7 Hymns (1927), No. 77.
Our gray-haired med'cine men, so wise and good,
Are all confounded with the dread disease,
Which ne'er was known to flow in Indian blood
Till white men brought it from beyond the seas.

An angel hears the plight and comforts:

Not many moons shall pass away before
The curse of darkness from your skins shall flee,
Your ancient beauty will the Lord restore,
And all your tribes shall dwell in unity.

The arts of peace shall flourish ne'er to die;
The warwhoop and the deadly strife shall cease;
Disease shall then depart, and every sigh,
And health and life shall flow in every breeze.

The hymn closes with glorious promises of redemption.
In spite of the obvious and trite phraseology, Penrose is sympathetic. He stereotypes the Native American, by assuming that Indians are limited to the prairie and that "all ... tribes shall dwell in unity." Penrose also expresses the belief that the darkness of skin would undergo a literal change, a common perception until the recent rewording (1981) of 2 Nephi 30:6, where "pure" was substituted for "white":

... And their scales of darkness shall begin to fall from their eyes; and many generations shall not pass away among them, save they shall be a pure and a delightsome people. (emphasis mine)

Other hymns in the "Green Book," the 1927 hymnal, make occasional mention of Indians, usually in the context of white occupation of the virgin land, and also using animal imagery
and association to describe the Indian. In William Wills' "Deseret, Deseret! 'Tis Home of the Free," the Indian is paired with the animals:

Where the savage has wandered, by darkness debased,
Where the wolf and the bear unmolested did roam.

Theodore Curtis proclaims in "We're Proud of Utah" that the state was "won from a hostile band." And Charles W. Penrose again declares the western Mormon liberation in the hymn "O Wouldst Thou from Bondage," describing the plains with "waving grass, Where the red man roams in his pride."

In the current hymnal, published in 1948, there are three passing mentions of Indians. "O'er Gloomy Hills of Darkness," by Williams, first appeared in 1908, Songs of Zion. Hymning the sending of the Gospel to enlighten the world, the second verse begins:

Let the Indian and the Negro,
Let the rude barbarian see
That divine and glorious conquest
Once obtained on Calvary.

9 Hymns (1927), No. 189.
10 Ibid., No. 324.
11 Ibid., No. 376.
12 Hymns (1948), No. 127.
13 Songs of Zion (Salt Lake City, Utah: The Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints, 1908), No. 28.
"For the Strength of the Hills" also first appeared in Songs of Zion. In the 1927 hymnal, a new fourth verse appeared which again pairs the Indian with the animals:

Here the wild bird swiftly darts on
His quarry from the heights,
And the red untutored Indian
Seeketh here his rude delights.
But the Saints for thy communion
Have sought the mountain sod.

This verse was retained in the 1948 hymnal but was deleted between the eighteenth and twenty-third printings. Some editions attribute the lyrics to Lorenzo Snow, but the most recent printings cite the words as "Felicia D. Hemons, Altered by Edward L. Sloan."16

Orson F. Whitney's (1855-1931) poem "The Wintry Day Descending to its Close" is a reverie, beginning with symbols of earthly redemption. The third and fourth stanzas reflect on the western settlement, "Where roamed at will the savage Indian band."

14 Hymns (1948), No. 241.
15 Ibid.
16 Hymns: The Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints (Salt Lake City, Utah: Deseret Book, 1979), No. 241. Felicia D. Hemans (1793-1835) was a popular English poet whose favorite topics were home, country and nature.
17 Hymns (1948), No. 292.
Vivid verbal images, mostly savage, punctuate traditional Mormon folk songs. In "St. George and the Dragon" by Charles L. Walker, even "prowling Indians" cannot endure that "awful place." In "Root, Hog or Die," "bloody redskins" are classified with wild animals. The savage imagery is explicit in "The Ox-Team Trail":

And bands of redskin beggars
Molesting through the day
Would steal at night and kill
When they were brought to bay.

Acknowledging native barbarism in "Mountain Meadows Massacre," the Mormons dress "in Indian garb and colors," and attack "rush[ing] in Indian style," whatever that may be.

Indian styles also occur in "Book of Mormon Stories," in the current children's hymnal, Sing With Me, with words and music by Elizabeth F. Bates. Although the song is not about contemporary Indians, I include it because of its vacant land


21 Ibid., pp. 203-04.

philosophy—"Lamanites met others who were seeking liberty /
And the land soon welcomed all who wanted to be free"—and its
musical stereotyping.

Lack of understanding of the complexities of Native
American musical styles lead to the devices evident in "Book
of Mormon Stories." Melodically the first line descends along
a quasi-pentatonic scale which is somewhat accurate. The
second phrase, third line—"long ago," etc.—maintains the
pentatonic feeling and begins at a lower pitch than the opening
phrase, also semi-accurate. The stereotyping occurs in the
left-hand accompaniment that exploits a "tom-tom" rhythm by
utilizing open fifth chords and a rhythmic after-beat:

The "bold" rhythmic imagery may inspire children to imitate
tom-toms, chanting and other misperceptions of movie Indian
music:

23 Conversation with Merrill K. Bradshaw, 11 May 1983.
Contemporary Mormon composers give little attention to secular music with Indian topics, with the exception of William F. Hanson, who studied the Ute Indians and their traditional ceremonies. In 1913 in Vernal, Utah, Hanson wrote and produced The Sun Dance Opera, based on combined Sioux and Ute traditions. The production was substantially successful and travelled throughout Utah in occasional productions until 1935. In 1938, The Sun Dance Opera was performed twice on Broadway.

The score is unavailable, but the libretto is published in Sun Dance Land, which includes a history of the performances. The plot is a love story, superimposed on a re-creation of the Sioux Sun Dance ritual. The lead roles were played by whites with Indians providing the ceremonials. In early performances a main Indian character was a centenarian, "Old Sioux, reported to be a cousin to Sitting Bull and a veteran of Custer's Charge." Inasmuch as the bulk of the production consisted of oral tradition, only the summary of the ceremonials survives. Hanson's narrative is comprised of typical labels: squaws, papooses and braves—never men, women or children. He describes the stage cues as "tell 'em times."


26 Ibid., p. 80.

27 Ibid., p. 84.
Hanson's fondness for the Indian people is apparent through his devoted efforts to present them and their practices to the general public of Utah. The description of the Sun Dance Opera reads like a narrative of a glorified Wild West show accompanied by a melodramatic love triangle. While this genre may have been successful and appealing to the public, there is no evidence of any impact on Indian-white understanding or appreciation. Even the use of Old Sioux appeals to a stereotype of a wise old chief being in each tribe. It is never clear if the ceremonial is mostly Ute or Sioux, two disparate tribes. These flaws are partially mitigated by Native Americans performing their own music. However, since the only extant account is Hanson's description, it alone remains the basis for evaluation.

Most of Mormon music regarding the American Indian is confined to the historical traditions and conceptions of racism, placing the Indian in a lower sphere, with wild animals. This attitude is congruent with contemporary historical emphases on savagery. However, because these texts are sung by congregations, some currently, and some until 1948, prejudices are perpetuated.

II

American music as a whole has not embraced Native American music nor been significantly influenced by it. The early twentieth century composers Edward Macdowell and Rudolph
Friml produced a fair share of Indian love songs and calls, but these pieces were characteristic of late Romanticism more than valid Indian melodies. Ethnographic interest in Native Americans and their music was more characteristic of the attitudes. Recent resurgent interest in American Indians, combined with increased education among the Native American populace, has produced important contributions by Native Americans to the diversity of American ethnic musics.

With the aid of primitive recording devices, a number of anthropologists made their contributions by traveling among various Indian tribes and recording the native music. The primary purpose was not to evaluate the aesthetic value, but to demonstrate the role of music in primitive societies. While completing their recordings, Francis Densmore, Gertrude Kurath and others unwittingly preserved an oral tradition. Catalogued in the Smithsonian Institution are the songs of many tribes who no longer carry on the oral traditions, nor speak their native tongues. More recent evaluative work has been conducted by David McAllester, who studied Navajo music in a context of aesthetics.

Native Americans with the strongest sense of community carry on more traditional practices of song and the dance. It is a folk-art, and thus has no specific composers. Techniques vary with tribes and geographies; however, if generalizations are to be made, they must emphasize the disguised complexity of Native American music. To relegate this music to chanting,
whooping and drum beating is to ignore the aesthetic intricacies of a highly organized musical style.

Harmony and order are also characteristics of traditional American Indian music. Although often regarded as mere chanting, Native American music, an oral tradition difficult to transcribe accurately, demonstrates a complexity involving specific scalar and rhythmic patterns, balanced cascading phrasing, frequent pedal harmonies, imitative rounds and an abstraction of vocal styles that eliminates texting in favor of vocables.

One contemporary Native American has attempted to incorporate his traditions into the modern and Occidental style of music. Louis Ballard (Quapaw, Oklahoma), instructor emeritus of music at the Institute of American Indian Arts in Santa Fe, New Mexico, is known for his works that utilize Native American melodies in a symphonic or large choral setting.

One of Ballard's students is Mormon musician John C. Rainer (Taos-Pueblo), who collects traditional songs and styles while arranging and composing his own pieces for voice, drum, and flute. Making his own flutes, in traditional style, Rainer has gained national prominence as one who is attempting to preserve a fast-disappearing tradition. 28

Rainer has also sought to incorporate historical traditions with contemporary culture by arranging Native

American vocal pieces with Western idioms. Rainer's interpretation of the Mormon hymn, "I Need Thee Ev'r'y Hour," utilizes a mixed chorus. The men begin on a pulsating tonic tone. The women sing the melody in unison over the men's chant. The result emphasizes the pentatonic qualities of the melody of the familiar tune in a haunting amalgam of both familiar and foreign. Instead of forcing assimilation on non-Utah cultures, the tables have been turned and a different culture has been super-imposed on a Mormon tradition. Merrill Bradshaw recalled the consequence of "hearing that hymn in a way I had never thought of before, and sending chills down my spine." 29

Perhaps the most familiar Mormon Native American musical tradition is the song "Go, My Son," by Arliene Nofchissey Williams, a Navajo, and Carnes Burson, a Ute. The text is set to the popular folk music style of the 1960's:

Go, my son, go and climb the ladder;
Go, my son, go and earn your feather;
Go, my son, make your people proud of you.

Work, my son, get an education;
Work, my son, learn a good vocation;
And climb, my son,
Go and take a lofty view.

From on the ladder of an education
You can see to help your Indian nation;
Then reach, my son,
And lift your people up with you. 30

29 Conversation with Merrill Bradshaw, 11 May 1983.
Stepping into the modern world, this tune confronts a basic contemporary Indian problem of education while embracing traditional values. Although the sentimentality of this tune belies the hazard of the minority colluding with majority romantic imageries, the structure includes elements of community and tribal affiliation. Community is obvious as the song is directed from a first person speaker to "my son." In Navajo kinship, the relationship may not be a literal parent-child situation, but may present a variety of relationships. Education benefits more than the individual, as the last line admonishes. The grounding of the line, "my son," recalls the simple repetitive structures of traditional Navajo poetry.

Musically, Native American Mormons present both popular and traditional styles. Yet, each maintains a sense of integrity to Native American values of tribal recognition and community. This is contrasted by the anachronistic racial attitudes of First Generation Mormon hymn writers and oversimplification of contemporary composers. Because the Native American composers remain relatively unknown to the Mormon populace, the prevailing musical arts present and perpetuate prejudicial and outdated attitudes.
Chapter IV  "Classic Features":

The American Indian in Mormon Visual Arts

Indian visual arts crafted by non-Indian Mormons are somewhat more progressive than literary and musical arts in depicting the American Indian and accommodating Native American values of tribal identity, place and community. In recent years, artistic trends in American art have accommodated Native American art, overcoming pervasive stereotypes and inculcating Native American aesthetics. Although some Mormon artists have depicted cultural realism, even the most current interpretations of the American Indian are stalked by the Noble Savage myth. Mormon Native Americans are well represented in the Native American art world, several having international reputations exceeding those of non-Indian Mormon artists.

I

American Indians appear in early American arts as a component of the magnificent age of exploration, discovery and conquest. After the American Revolution, the Indian was one truly American artistic subject that was not connected with Europe. In romanticized interpretations, the American Indian
is portrayed as the Noble Savage. Seeking authenticity, artists began traveling West in order to use real Indians as models, beginning a trend in cultural realism that insisted on ethnographic details. The realistic trend flourished in the Southwest, establishing the region as an art center, influencing major twentieth century American artists and encouraging the development of Native American self-expression.

The earliest representation of American Indians in New World art is found in exploration narratives. The media, commonly illustration, were woodcuts and engravings depicting, in a stiff, primitive style, the indigenous inhabitants as well as the Europeans. The adventurers were, after all, adventurers, not artists. There is little distinction between the flat, lone European conquerer and the bands who greeted him, save that the European was clothed and the Native Americans were mostly naked. ¹

The primitive aspect of an image of an Indian holding a bow and arrow was designed for a weathervane atop Province House, the Massachusetts Bay Colony governor's residence. Although the design was functional, it was a symbol of the threatening Indian who had been tamed by highly civilized powers in New England, becoming a prototype for the savage

aspect of the Indian myth, where fear of attack was more significant than any actual threat.

The dominant art form of the Colonial period was portraiture. To acquire distinctively American characteristics, the canvas often included uniquely American attributes in the backdrop—an Indian or two, or Indians dressed as Europeans. Colonial artist Benjamin West (1738-1820), trained in Europe, was commissioned to paint portraits of many English loyalists. Living in England, he relied on his American childhood memories and imagination to recall the Indian aspects of his work and to illustrate An Historical Account of the Expedition against the Ohio Indians, in the Year 1764. Among West's most famous paintings are Death of Wolfe (1770), where the Noble Savage is seen prominently on the left in the pose of "The Thinker," and William Penn's Treaty with the Indians when he founded the Province of Pennsylvania in North America (1772). In William Penn's Treaty ..., not only does West imitate a legendary event that never occurred, but he followed and set precedent for encounter paintings where the Indians remain anonymous, in groups, the physical Noble Savage in his nakedness, subdued by one outstanding white leader. West's

3 Ibid., Plate 23.
idealization of the Indian emphasizes into the romantic nobility of the Indian.

Romanticism exploited the duality of the Noble Savage's roles. One role was that of tiny landscape figures in wilderness panoramas. In the early 1800's most of the scenes are located in the East, with Niagara Falls being a popular topic, as in Thomas Cole's *A Distant View of Niagara Falls* (1829). Later in the century, in the works of Albert Bierstadt and Thomas Moran, the locale migrates westward to the Rocky Mountains. Henry Farny's western style of landscaping grants larger significance to the Indian, idealizing the native, usually a Plains stereotype, in his/her natural setting.

The second role of Romanticism emphasized the savage, focusing on the brute physical appearance and dramatic situations. Captivity narratives were optimal material for scenes of Grecian-like figures posed in frozen moments of terror. John Vanderlyn's painting of the *Death of Jane McCrea* (1804) was based on an actual incident. Horatio Greenough's *Rescue Group* (1853) idealizes the conflict by subduing the savage threat with a brave pioneer man who rescues the helpless, cowering woman and child. This representation of civilization overcoming savagery is placed in the Capitol rotunda in Washington D.C.

At the height of nineteenth century Romanticism, a trend seeking to verify the physical appearance of American Indians resulted in the realistic portrayal of ethnographic details or a cultural realism. Seen with a subjective sympathy,
the Indian was pursued and pictorially captured by artists such as George Catlin, Charles Bird King, and Alfred Jacob Miller. Catlin was especially interested in compiling a portfolio of ethnographic data for what he believed to be a disappearing race. Following Catlin's first-hand observations but injecting dramatic situations into the content of painting and sculpture, Frederic Remington and Charles M. Russell synthesized both the noble physical appearance with acts of wildness that are still popular in western art today. Edward S. Curtis relied on artistic interpretation through the photographic lens to capture and preserve his idea of the Indian. Establishing a tradition of fusing subjects with landscape, Curtis verified his sympathetic views of the vanishing race by carrying with him a box of wigs to lend to his subjects.

In the twentieth century, many painters and sculptors followed the western migration, leading to the establishment of the Southwest as a cultural center "of sorts." In direct response to the artistic activity, Santa Fe's Museum of Fine Art, opened in 1907, was devoted exclusively to contemporary artists. Many artists remained in New Mexico, founding schools

---

5 Larry C. Coates, "George Catlin, Brigham Young, and the Plains Indians," BYU Studies, 17 (Autumn 1976), 114-18. George Catlin wrote to Brigham Young suggesting an alliance with the military and Mormons to preserve the vanishing race. Brigham Young politely replied that the Mormons had their own policies, finding it "cheaper to feed than to fight them, at the same time we do not believe in descending to their degraded level."

6 Berkhofer, p. 10.
such as the Taos society of artists, composed of Joseph H. Sharp, Ernest L. Blumenschein, Bert Phillips, Oscar E. Berninghaus, and six others. Some artists, John Sloan, Robert Henri, George Bellows, Leon Kroll, Adolf Gottlieb, and Maynard Dixon, came to the West and allowed its influence to shape their later works. Jackson Pollock's well-known adaption of Navajo sandpainting methods sometimes eclipses his incorporation of Navajo aesthetics—unification of the vast order of the universe. Some artists came West, left, but returned, most notably Georgia O'Keefe and Andrew Dasburg. All of the artists found a rich source of material in Indian cultures of the Southwest. Most portrayed Indians sympathetically and many of these artists transcended cultural differences to depict sensitively the Native Americans in the context of their own values. These values of myth, ritual, community and place are variously treated with the earlier emphasis on ethnic ritual disseminating to abstract expressions of place.

II

The American Indian is frequently represented throughout the history of Mormon painting and sculpture. The general

---


patterns of visual arts can be grouped into three periods: Pioneer Generation (1847-1890), Second Generation (1890-1930), and a Current Third Generation (1930-present).\(^9\) Because of the limitations of visual art medium, many works produced by Mormon artists have no apparent reference to Mormon history or culture, yet "Mormon Art" may assume the following characteristics as outlined by Mormon painter, Trevor Southey:

1. It is any art form created by a man who professes and strives to live according to the Mormon philosophy.

2. It is any art form that gladdens the heart, lifts the soul, elevates the mind, reveals truth, or in any way broadens horizons. Here the Thirteenth Article of Faith may apply.\(^10\)

3. It is any art form that springs from a confrontation of the artist with Mormon genre, history, doctrine, and philosophy.\(^11\)

I would also add that art created by one reared under the influence of close Utah Mormon communities of late nineteenth or early twentieth centuries must be considered Mormon.

---


\(^10\) The Thirteenth Article of Faith of The Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints: "We believe in being honest, true, chaste, benevolent, virtuous, and in doing good to all men; indeed, we may say that we follow the admonition of Paul—We believe all things, we hope all things, we have endured many things, and hope to be able to endure all things. If there is anything virtuous, lovely, or of good report or praiseworthy, we seek after these things."

Pioneer artists were primarily European converts to the Church who brought European art techniques to Utah. Early Utah culture was financially limited and some artists found work at other vocations. Nevertheless, many artists were commissioned to paint portraits, murals in Mormon temples, and illustrations for missionary tracts. C. C. A. Christensen was one of the few to address the painful recollections of the yet brief Church history, producing panoramas of historical scenes. Other early Mormon artists were Danquart Weggeland and George M. Ottinger, who later encouraged the second generation of Mormon artists.

The Second Generation of Mormon artists were sent to the major art centers, New York and Paris, to study the techniques of art. For John Hafen, J. B. Fairbanks, Louis Pratt, and, later, Edwin Evans, the journey was akin to a missionary call. Other Utah artists who studied at the Paris Academie Julian were J. T. Harwood, Cyrus E. Dallin, Lewis A. Ramsey, Mary Teasdel, Lee Greene Richards, Mahonri M. Young, A. B. Wright, and Donald Beauregard. Some never returned to Utah, remaining in the eastern United States. Others returned to form the Utah Art Institute and give impetus to art training at Brigham Young University, the University of Utah and local high schools, most notably Springville.

The current, or third, generation of Mormon artists, like the current movements in American art, covers a variety of styles. While some artists forge ahead with abstraction, others tenaciously hold onto realism as evidenced by the Springville Museum of Art's refusal to admit any abstract works to its annual National April Salon.

Through all three generations of Mormon artistry, the American Indian images give little attention to tribal identities, community or place. The physical appearance of Indians accords nominal recognition of ritual. Mormon Native American art is not generally considered in the mainstream of Mormon art, despite occasional highlighting by Church periodicals and an audience beyond the bounds of Mormonism.¹³ Most of Mormon painting and sculpture relegates the Native American to the traditional role of Noble Savage.

**Early Painters**

A whole band of American Indians appears in a scene from C. C. A. Christensen's (1831-1922) panorama of Church history.¹⁴ The organization is reminiscent of Benjamin West's William Penn's Treaty with the Indians where a single white

---


man, in this case Joseph Smith, holding a Book of Mormon, dominates the scene and the numerous Indians. None of the Indians has an identity, and in Christensen's version of white-Indian encounter the natives are clothed in buckskin and brilliant blue and red blankets. No distinguishing cultural characteristics are alluded to, other than Plains teepees in the background. The preeminence of Joseph in the painting relegates the anonymous Natives to objects, differentiated only by their nebulous dress, their black hair, and their red skins.

The physical appearance of Indians is kept only in the teepee in John Hafen's landscape TeePees (1907). As one of the academy-trained Second Generation artists, Hafen painted mostly portraits and landscapes such as this one. In the style of Bierstadt and Moran, Hafen’s romantic teepees are minutely incidental in realistic illustrations of Utah valley.

Even as Hafen's Indians are insignificant, two of his Second Generation associates, Cyrus E. Dallin (1861–1944) and Mahonri M. Young (1877–1957), rely on the American Indian as a prominent subject. Inasmuch as both Dallin and Young produced a large number of works with the Indian as topic, I will discuss representative selections that are generally available, through reproduction, for viewing and evaluation.

Cyrus E. Dallin

Cyrus E. Dallin (1861-1944) spent his early years in his Springville, Utah birthplace. Although his parents dis-associated from Mormonism, Dallin was reared amid Mormon culture and completed several significant statues for Mormondom, including *The Angel Moroni* (1891) atop the Salt Lake Temple, and the *Brigham Young Monument* (1897-1900), in downtown Salt Lake City. The American Indian is the single subject that dominates Dallin's sculpting career, comprising one quarter of his total known works. Through friendly association with Paiutes who traveled in and around Springville, young Dallin developed an aesthetic sympathy toward the American Indian. As he acknowledged, "Artistically, I feel that to the Indian I owe my first glimpse into the great world of art." His first international award in Paris was for the *Signal of Peace* (1890, Chicago), a Plains Indian astride a pony. Subsequent life-size Indian equestrian works are: *Medicine Man* (1899, Philadelphia), *Scout* (1914, Kansas City), and the best-known *Appeal to the Great Spirit* (1909, Boston). In Utah, Dallin added a breech-clothed Indian to the *Brigham Young Monument* to represent "the early condition that prevailed in the [Salt


17 Ibid., pp. 241-43.

18 Ibid., p. 36.
Lake] valley."\(^{19}\) The Menotomy [sic] Indian Hunter (1911, Arlington, Massachusetts) is a life-size bronze figure kneeling to drink.

Although Dallin created numerous Indian statuettes and models for public marketing, his next major Indian work was Massasoit, which is an excellent representation of Dallin's style. The twice life-size figure of Massasoit was erected in 1921 at Plymouth, Massachusetts, commemorating the Pilgrim tercentenary. The plaster model was given to the state of Utah, cast and placed at the capitol in Salt Lake City. The model was then given to Brigham Young University, where another bronze duplication now stands west of the Harold B. Lee Library. The original model is currently at the Springville Art Museum.

Like most of Dallin's other Indian statues, Massasoit is nearly nude, adorned with a breechcloth, knife, moccasins, beads and a single feather. His hair is in two braids. He cradles a "peace pipe" in his left arm, giving a sharp angle to the otherwise smooth curves of the classic contrapposto pose. Indeed, James Fenimore Cooper's description of Uncas, from The Last of the Mohicans, aptly fits Dallin's Massasoit:

\(\ldots\) the upright, flexible figure of the young Mohican [was], graceful and unrestrained in the attitudes and movements of nature \(\ldots\); there was no concealment to his dark, glancing, fearless eye, alike terrible and calm; the bold outline of his high haughty features, pure in their native red; or to the dignified elevation of his receding forehead, together with all the finest proportions of a noble head, bared to the generous

\(^{19}\) Ibid., pp. 75-76.
scalping tuft . . . The ingenuous Alice gazed at his free air and proud carriage, as she would have looked upon some precious relic of the Grecian chisel, . . . an unblemished specimen of the noblest proportions of man.

By artistically interpreting the Native American, Cooper, through literature, and Cyrus Dallin, through sculpture, have contributed to a distinctive and original aspect of American culture, the myth of the American Indian Noble Savage. By choosing the subject of the Wampanoag leader, Massasoit, Dallin had a ready-made myth. Tradition holds that Massasoit met the Pilgrims in Massachusetts, helping them through their early struggles and feasting with them at the first Thanksgiving.

Documenting cultural identifying factors of the Wampanoags would have been difficult, if not impossible, for Cyrus Dallin and probably not necessary for his interpretation of Massasoit. Still, a trend of romanticism obscures cultural differentiation and historical authenticity. There is no indication of Native American essentials: emphasis of place and space over linear time, community over individual, evidenced by a sensitivity to mass and space, and acknowledgment of the various tribes as distinct cultural entities. Cyrus E. Dallin was a maverick in invalidating the tobacco store and savage stereotype, but he produced, instead, an opposite

stereotype of the noble, idealized Indian. Massasoit, along with Dallin's other Indian works, remains an image and a monument to a vanishing race that has yet to disappear from the conscience of America. As E. Wilbur Pomeroy explains:

A century hence, when the towering blanket-clad figure of the North American Indian shall no more be seen, when the feathers of the Rocky Mountain eagle shall no more be proudly borne upon the head of the Indian hunter-chief, when the melody of Indian music and the grace of the Indian dance shall be among forgotten things, when the Indian himself shall live for new generations only in legends, then there will remain, wrought in bronze and stone, the statues by Cyrus E. Dallin, sculptor-portrayer of the North American Indian; statues that form a series expressive of the fate of the Indian from the time of the entrance of the white man to the dying of the Indian race.21

Mahonri M. Young

Likewise, as Cyrus E. Dallin intended to preserve the image of the vanishing American, Mahonri M. Young (1877-1957) was commissioned to preserve cultural aspects of the Native American by the Natural History Museum, creating, in 1916, a three-dimensional Apache exhibit,22 and, in 1924, a Navajo series exhibit.23 Versatile in the media of sculpting,


23 Mahonri M. Young: Retrospective Exhibition, Exhibit Catalog, 1940, Addison Gallery of American Art, Andover Massachusetts, p. 56.
painting and printmaking, Young's best-known Mormon works include statues of Joseph and Hyrum Smith (1910) and the Seagull Monument (1913), all on Temple Square, the This is the Place Monument (1947), at the mouth of Emigration Canyon, and a marble statue of Brigham Young (1950), in the Capitol Rotunda in Washington, D.C. In a Retrospective Exhibition sponsored in 1940 in Andover, Massachusetts, about one-quarter of Young's paintings, drawings and etchings featured the Indian. Many were preliminary studies for the Natural History Museum exhibits and paid close attention to cultural details of Navajos, Hopis and Apaches. Shown performing common duties of daily life, most of the Indians are depicted with a sense of contemporary cultural realism, in close relationship to the enveloping land. A stylistic example is reproduced in "A Portfolio of Mormon Painters," published in the Ensign (July 1977, p. 59), Navajo Girl with Goats (ca. 1925):

The Navajo Girl with Goats focuses on the main human figure, emphasized by the placement of the goats she is tending, and the lines of the background landscape. As is characteristic with Mahonri's Indian paintings, the land is not simply filler but plays an integral role in merging with the human being. The muted colors of the land, contrasted by the brilliant blue sky with scattered pillowy clouds, blend in with the traditionally clothed and dark-skinned girl. Even though the girl is the focal point of the piece, she is not overwhelming or assertive, but remains cloaked in the anonymity of a larger presence of the land, and culture, and community.
Despite Mahonri Young's sometimes distracting lack of perspective, especially in landscape details and horses, the flatness present in all of his two-dimensional media and exaggerated in his paintings by outlining the major objects in black, adds a spatial quality to the work that obliterates time for both the viewer and the characters within. Young's works featuring the Native American stand along with those of other American cultural realists of the time in depicting the Native American in the context of specific tribal identity, with a sense of place and community as acted out in the performance of daily tasks, tasks not mundane to the Native American but an intimate thread in the ritual of life.

Additional Artists

Like Mahonri Young, Donald Beauregard (1884-1914) was able to observe Indians firsthand and took pains to make a faithful record of cultural details. Born in Fillmore, trained at BYU and the University of Utah, Beauregard produced few significant Mormon paintings. Living in Santa Fe the last year of his life, Beauregard utilized the techniques learned at the Julian Academy in Paris and the immediately available subject matter of American Indians to produce a number of canvasses which are now in possession of the University of New
Beauregard's impressionistic style lends to a blending of spaces. Night in the Pueblo pays close attention to cultural details while providing a stark value contrast that accentuates the mystery of the pueblo cultures. Indian Observers (1908) depicts a group of mounted Indians, highly texturized in the oil medium, with blurred lines of impressionism obscuring details of specific culture, yet enhancing the relationship of individuals who obviously comprise a community. Donald Beauregard's portrayals are similar to contemporary interpretations in American art movements, presenting the Indian in his cultural setting.

Although Minerva K. Teichert (1889-1976) lived in approximately the same time period as Beauregard and Young, her painting was less sensitive to the American Indian. Known primarily for her illustrative scenes from Book of Mormon life, Teichart painted in a highly stylized manner and was somewhat impressionistic in use of line and atmosphere, relying on pale colors and subdued intensities. Two of Teichert's works with American Indians as subjects hang in the Wilkinson Center at BYU. Both were painted in 1935. Both mix tribal

24 Paintings by Donald Beauregard, Exhibit Catalog, November 10, 1964-January 12, 1965, Museum of New Mexico, Santa Fe.
25 Ibid.
26 Leek, p. 73.
cultures, betraying a lack of knowledge of subject. Rug Merchant overlooks the fact that most rugs are from Southwest tribes, not Plains tribes, and portrays stereotyped chiefs wearing headdresses. The pottery that accompanies the scene is decorated geometrically but with repetitive hexagonal designs which are foreign to the spatially related geometrics of Native arts. Washakie's Wedding also relies on the historical event, recalling the Shoshone leader who temporarily converted to Mormonism. Again, Teichert has scrambled cultures, depicting one woman with Navajo jewelry, another with brass earrings, and distinguishing Washakie with the typical Roman nose, eagle feather headdress, and background teepee. Washakie's attire may be semi-accurate for the Shoshone culture. In 1935, Teichert turned to an outdated image, oblivious to contemporary trends, to exploit the Noble Savage stereotype.

Many contemporary Mormon artists, such as Gary Smith and Trevor Southey, utilize modern techniques to interpret historical or theological events, while others rely on traditional methods to eternalize the traditional Noble Savage. Many of the traditionalists have little distinction in style, catering to the Cowboy and Indian kitsch market which memorializes the mythic West. Little such art is progressive or imaginative and has even less to do with aesthetic values of

Native Americans, remaining historical reflections of images and stereotypes.

Among Mormon artists prominent in the Cowboy market is Grant Speed, whose works spin cowboy yarns with their narrative titles. A few of his works have the Indian as topic, the best of which is a bust, The Half-Breed. The rough-textured, flowing hair of the bust bridges traditional and modern styles, as Don Hedgepeth describes:

This is generally acknowledged to be the most artistically significant bronze in the series of six western busts created by Grant. It is also considered to be one of the two or three finest examples of contemporary western sculpture ever produced.

At the 1976 exhibition of the Cowboy Artists of America West it was awarded the coveted Gold Medal for sculpture. The entire edition of thirty was sold out during the first night of the show.

The delicately sculpted face and the sensitive posturing of the head give The Half-Breed an aura of art.

Were it not for the title, however, there would be no indication that the figure is anyone other than a woman. The large circular earring is especially misleading, having no resemblance to Native American jewelry styles. There are no indications of Native American values to give credance to this image of a half-blood woman.

Michael Coleman gives more attention to cultural detail, in the style of Henry Farney, while placing his Indians

---

Don Hedgepeth, From Broncs to Bronzes: The Life and Work of Grant Speed (Flagstaff, Arizona: Northland Press, 1979), p. 66. Also creating narrative bronzes in a similar style are Ed Fraughton, Stan Johnson, and Blair Buswell.
in the vast landscape of the Northern Plains. All of Coleman's Indians have donned traditional Northern Plains dress styles around softened, sentimentalized figures. This style lacks authenticity because there is no sense of connection between the human figures and the landscapes. The Indians are there as images because there is a sense that they should be there, but without understanding the intricate relationship between culture and place. Most of the figures are lone, without community, many conquering the wilderness in the true Rousseauian spirit of the natural being, the Noble Savage.

Occasionally the Noble Savage is placed in a contemporary setting, supposedly contemplating the cultural conflicts, as in Carol P. Harding's _Now and Then_, from the 1983 Springville Art Museum National April Salon. The subject is a brown-skinned girl surrounded by traditional Navajo objects. The whole scene lacks any intensity of emotion, such as Fritz Scholder's anger or T. C. Cannon's sardonic wit. The conflict has been sentimentalized for the sake of the sympathetic subject. If the objective is that the girl has lost her cultural identity, it is clear that there is nothing Navajo about her. More likely, the blank look on her face reveals the blanket assumption that a non-Indian artist could assume the traumas of acculturation.

Some contemporary Mormon artists completely acculturate the Indian. Valoy Eaton accomplishes this in his *Day of the Lamanite*, the 1970 Mormon Festival of Arts Purchase Award Winner, by placing Native Americans in contemporary settings. Eaton has painted three boys blessing the sacramental water in the Mormon Sunday service. Two of the boys have dark skin and brown hair and one boy is obviously Caucasian. According to Eaton:

I created this painting because of my extreme interest in the Indian Placement Program of the Church. The boy kneeling on the left is my foster son, Jerry Plummer, a Navajo. ... The boy in the middle, Verdi Stone from Arizona, was chosen for the painting because of his classic features and fine spiritual attitude. ... In general the Indian people have a simple spiritual outlook on life and are teachable and humble. It is obvious that they are beginning to realize the great promises that the Lord has given them. This is the reason I chose the title, *Day of the Lamanite*, for my painting.  

This painting demonstrates the complications of a dominant institution assuming responsibility and spokesmanship for a primal culture. The consequence is that blatant content consumes formal aesthetic considerations. The Native American boys with their classic fine nobility are identical to white boys, having, supposedly, assumed the white culture to fulfill their potential of the Lamanite ideal. The dominant culture seems to have difficulty allowing the minority to be members

---

of the Gospel of Jesus Christ while maintaining a sense of the primal cultural identity.

That artists continue to rely on the Noble Savage portrayal of the American Indian would not be such a problem if there were any acknowledgement that the artists were recreating images and stereotypes that may be historically accurate but have little relevance in today's world. If one is aware of that difference, one can acknowledge, with some gritting of the teeth, the inherent aesthetics in historical depictions of Indians as Noble Savages. But more often, blatant content consumes formal aesthetic considerations. If one is aware of the alternative in contemporary American art and Native American art, all the better. However, if the public believes that the Noble Savage is truly representative of Native American values, the consequence is the molding of Native American individuals to fit the image. The forced value system obliterates a culture without recognizing its inherent worth. Discriminatory behavior, no matter how sympathetic, is just as dangerous (especially to the self-worth of Native American individuals) as overtly calculated prejudice.

Native Americans have found their role in American art. Native American arts which faithfully present a worldview that acknowledges tribal differentiations, myth and ritual, ontological place and community play a prominent role in American art. Mormon Native Americans significantly contribute to the American Indian art production. Yet in
historical Mormon arts, there seems to be little place for the Native American artistry.

Early Mormon trends followed general American trends with paintings of encounter and depictions of cultural realism, along with the omnipresent Noble Savage. This perpetuation of the Noble Savage stereotype, albeit sympathetic, is ironical considering the fine art produced by Mormon Native Americans and the alleged sympathy of the Lamanite connection of the Church. By continuing to speak in behalf of Native Americans regarding their culture, Mormon artists not only disallow significant artistic statements, but perpetuate misunderstanding through cliches and mediocre art. Inevitably, such art stymies the potential of Mormon Native American art. This type of presupposition feeds the worst kind of racism, a prejudice that is most dangerous because it is unrecognized.

III

In conjunction with the artistic activity of the Southwest, Native American artists have gained acceptance and recognition for both traditional tribal arts and arts created with the influence of European techniques. In 1920 John Sloan organized a New York exhibit of Indian painting while poet Mary Austin arranged a show at the American Museum of Natural History. Five Kiowa students were taught and encouraged at the University of Oklahoma in the late 1920's, producing murals of Kiowa rituals. In Santa Fe, Dorothy Dunn became the
prime mover in institutionalizing American Indian art, establishing the Studio of the Santa Fe Indian School (1932) which led to the founding of the Institute of American Indian Arts in 1962. 32

Native American painting and sculpture have evolved from Historical Expressionism (involving stylistically primitive representation) to Traditionalism, Modernism and an Individualism wherein Indian aspects are no longer recognizable. 33 Traditionalism is known for a flatness, two-dimensionality and was encouraged in Dorothy Dunn's Studio. Traditional sculpture has a sense of mass, such as Allan Houser's (Chiricahua Apache) *Heading Home* (1980), where the rounded edges and density inextricably connect the Navajo shepherdess with the earth, granting Native values to even the single figure.

Modernism freely incorporates varied contemporary techniques, with Native American motifs and themes. Oscar Howe (Yanktonai Sioux) was among the first to depart from Dorothy Dunn's traditionalism by painting cubistically. As a teacher at the Institute of American Indian Arts, Howe later influenced the most well-known Indian painter, Fritz Scholder (Luiseno). Scholder's expressionistic style exaggerates


traditional stereotypes of historical Indians to the point of absurdity, as in Super Indian or Indian with an American Flag. In the same ironical style, T. C. Cannon (Caddo-Kiowa) combines bitterness and absurdity in Osage with Van Gogh and Grandmother Gestating Father and the Washita River Runs Ribbon-like. R. C. Gorman (Navajo) departs from Cannon and Scholder's anger by depicting Indian women, mostly Navajo, with a simplicity, unity, harmony, and mass that is reminiscent of Picasso.

As an expression of unity and harmony, traditional arts rose from simply decorated utilitarian goods to intricate representation of world view, community, and place, symbolized by spatial and geometric patterns. As a visual interpretation of myth, many traditional arts have long surpassed their pragmatism, being accepted solely for their aesthetic value. Led by potters Nampeyo (Hopi) and Maria and Julian Martinez (San Idelfonso Pueblo), traditional arts began to be collected on the strength of an Indian artist's name, as well as artistic merit. 34

Mormon Native American Artists

A compilation of Mormon Native American artists who practice traditional arts was published by Richard Oman in an Ensign article (September 1982), "LDS Southwest Indian Art."

34 Ibid., p. 111.
Oman lists thirty-eight prominent artists (see Appendix II) and their contributions to local Church work. Rather than reiterate the entire content of Oman's work, I will discuss examples from the list of weaving, pottery and silversmithing by Mormon Native Americans, which stand as significant representations of traditional Native American arts.

Although Navajo rugs have general categorizations that identify general geographic locale, the details of each rug reflect the individual weaver. Mormon Rose Keith, Blanding, Utah, is known for her skill in weaving the Raised Outline pattern, but she also weaves pictoral and ritual Yeibichai rugs. A deceptively simple arrangement of geometric regularity, the Navajo rug, is:

... a unique combination and coordination of conceptual and manual skills. A woven rug is a product of the mind and the body. The inner form of the rug is in the mind; the outer form of the rug is projected onto the loom.

The Raised Outline, by having a static center that generates to the dynamic outlining pattern that is literally raised, reflects the basic Navajo duality of the cyclical

36 James, p. 109.
37 Oman. Works by Rose Keith, Fannie Nampeyo, Joy (Frog Woman) Navasie, and Ramona Nez referred to in the text are illustrated in this article.
38 Witherspoon, p. 161.
nature of life, movement and creation that always returns to death, rest and plainness. Balance and beauty are identified with the Navajo creation god Bik’eh Hozho, and are further emphasized by the spatial relationships of the Raised Outline pattern.

Balance and beauty are also emphasized in much Navajo silversmithing, again characterized by geometrical symmetry. Traditional wristguards have a striking parallel to the Raised Outline rugs with a static turquoise center emanating movement. Contemporary Mormon silversmith Ramona Nez, a Navajo, represents in a traditional Squash Blossom necklace not only organic mimesis, but the same integral symmetry and balance, off-set by the natural irregularity of the rough hewn turquoise stones. Hopis also work silver, and the late Wayne Sekaquaptewa was known for his work that fused polished silver over geometrical patterns of black oxidized silver.

But the most famous Hopi artwork is created by potters Fannie Nampeyo (daughter of Nampeyo) and Joy Navasie (Frog Woman), both Mormons. Using traditional methods of painting with yucca brushes and firing in adobe ovens, each

---

39 Ibid., p. 201.
40 Ibid., Plate 8.
41 Oman, p. 47.
43 Oman, p. 47.
has a unique style that abstracts Hopi traditions, with individual pots interpreting specific mythological tales or characters. Both are routinely included in publications and exhibits surveying Native American pottery. Again, a balanced precision of geometrics marks the need for harmony and order in the universe.

The success of Native American artists along with sensitive portrayals by non-Indian artists demonstrate the incorporations of Native American aesthetics. Non-Indians have discovered essential attitudes toward beauty with an awareness deriving from community and place as manifest in ritual, basic to cultures that perceive artistic creation so fundamental that there is no need for the word "art." Perhaps the cultural manifestation of order and beauty as a premise for creative activity alludes to the absence of Mormon characteristics in traditional works created by Mormon Native Americans. A few Mormon Native Americans have adapted contemporary European methods, and likewise portray order and beauty in the context of Native American values.

44 See also the following references:

In the tradition of Edward S. Curtis and Laura Gilpin, Taos Pueblo-Mormon, Howard Rainer's photographs absorb some of the acerbity of his writing ("Chapter II Dignity Befitting the Ancestry:" The American Indian in Mormon Literature) by presenting a proud heritage. In his most recent exhibit, "Profiles of a Proud People," at Brigham Young University, Rainer grasps for continuity in community by photographing the aged and traditionally attired, while declaring:

My camera has not captured
All that is Indian.
Their spirits
have never been captured—
It is their way.  

Most of the works are shown in the context of place or performing tribal arts and rituals. Only a few photographs fall to romanticism, while most, through the realism of the medium, paint portraits of character, courage and perseverance.

A similar depth of character is found in individuals painted by William Hatch, a Navajo Mormon. Honored at Brigham Young University's August 1982 Commencement by the College of Fine Arts and Communications, Hatch's realistic style captures the beauty and creative aspects of Navajo belief. Many of his


Ibid.
subjects are shown working traditional arts and crafts, or are still lifes of Navajo arts.

Mormon Brenda Stewart, who has shown and placed in numerous Western competitions, relies on her Iroquois background. One of her works is a cubistic drawing of a traditional ribbon shirt, demonstrating an acute sensitivity to spatial forms and relationships.

Abstraction of spatial relationship characterizes the style of Jerry Yazzie, Navajo, reminiscent of the flat, two-dimensional style of early American Indian artists and Navajo sand painting. Yazzie's subjects are often depicted performing ritual. Each of these painters adheres to an aesthetic viewpoint emanating from Native American values and influenced by European methods and styles. Yet each artist has remained loyal to the values of his or her individual heritage, depicting subjects in harmony with a whole community larger than the individual.

The authenticity of the art created by Native Americans presents a striking alternative to the historical fake image-ries, romantic, noble and savage, found in many arts created by non-Indian artists, by transcending the American Indian "device" to the mythic world that resonates with native values. Even the art in contemporary Western media speaks with an experience, a history of perseverance, that few living outside close Native American communities have been able to apprehend.

and convey. When Native Americans are allowed to overcome the images created for them by intrusive cultures, the product inculcates a high aesthetic order that, as good art should, reflects the values of its creators in both historical and modern media.
Chapter V  A Pale Reflection:
American Indian Images in Mormon Arts

There should no longer be any excuses for the perpetration by Mormon artists of stereotypes and images long outdated and abandoned by the mainstream of American art and Native American artists. Confinement to stereotypes subjugates Native American people to the worst kind of racism because these prejudices are unknown and unacknowledged by even the artists themselves. Mormon art depicting Native Americans has yet to break the bonds of its limited vision which reflects the historical role of the Noble Savage.

Mormon artists in literature, music, painting and sculpture, continue to rely on traditional perceptions of savagism, both noble and ignoble. More often than not, the use of Indian characters and subjects by non-Indian Mormon artists is a manipulative device, a device designed not to represent the Native American validly, but rather to capture an audience's attention. Mormon sympathies for Indians heighten the irony of artistic failures to represent the Native American accurately. Most Mormon artists have failed to consider values essential to Native Americans: tribal affiliations, the significance of place and community, myth and
ritual. Admittedly, many Mormon treatments of the Indian have inherent artistic weaknesses, and Mormon audiences tend to accept such mediocre art. These problems compound the failure of Mormon arts to interpret Native Americans authentically, in contemporary and historical context.

While Mormon artists adhere to both sides of the Noble Savage duality in historical representations of the American Indian, the dignified side of the dichotomy prevails in contemporary representations. Mormon artists seem to have avoided the negative aspects of the modern bifurcation, those of the inebriate, obese, indolent Indian, a most degrading stereotype. Nevertheless, Mormon arts contain more stereotyping than not, and may even project these images on Lamanites in Book of Mormon arts, as well as on the contemporary Native American.

A few Mormon artists have broken the bonds of stereotyping and phony imagery. These artists have obviously either spent much time in actual contact with Native Americans, without condescension, such as Mahonri M. Young, or given thoughtful consideration to the use of Indian characters, such as Marilyn Brown in The Earthkeepers. Such examples, however, are rare and pale when considered with arts by Native Americans. For the most part, though, the Indian remains misrepresented as a projection of the dominant society's ideas and images.

The cumulative effect of the continual presumption of spokesmanship in behalf of Native Americans by the dominant, articulate, Mormon society results in racism. Racism, in this case, is not open bigotry and disdain, but a "conformity to
the use of power, where power results in the subordination of others based on race.\footnote{1} Conforming racists either refuse to break from traditional images, despite their awareness that stereotypes are fallacious, or they remain oblivious to stereotypes altogether. Mormon artists manifest their power over Native Americans, historically and artistically, through primary spokesmanship. Subordination occurs by the dehumanizing of the Native American with constant references to braves, squaws, papooses, chiefs, and redskins rather than men, women, children, leaders, and human beings. Subordination occurs, ironically, by elevating the Indian to a noble state, choosing only those characteristics which fit the noble mold, again forgetting the human aspects. A real and painful subordination occurs when the individual Native American fails to fit the artistic imagery, thus affecting actual interactions between whites and Native Americans. And, subordination likewise occurs by failure to acknowledge values essential to Native Americans.

Native Americans, never inarticulate in their own culture, are no longer inarticulate in American culture nor should they be subjected to interpretation by the dominant majority. A few Mormon Native Americans have begun to speak for themselves, representing their own values which may include Mormonism. More such representatives are needed, however, and

\footnote{1} Kate Kirkham, "Rethinking Your 'Good Guy' Image," \textit{Exchange}, Fall/Winter 1977, p. 21.
Native Americans should be supported and encouraged in their efforts to enter the artistic arena. Many Mormon Native Americans have found artistic success beyond Mormon audiences. The works of Fannie Nampeyo, Joy Navasie and others are recognized for their integrity, not any particular Mormon quality.

I believe Mormon art must eventually reach a point where an overtly Mormon message is not preeminent, but artistic judgments can be made by responsible audiences on the basis of aesthetic integrity. This type of responsible art would not need evaluation for equitable treatment of race or sex. Such Mormon arts would no longer be considered provincial but more representative of The Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints, as admonished by Spencer W. Kimball:

We must recognize that excellence and quality are a reflection of how we feel about ourselves and about life and about God. If we don't care much about these basic things, then such not caring carries over into the work we do, and our work becomes shabby and shoddy. Real craftsmanship, regardless of the skill involved, reflects real caring, and real caring reflects our attitude about ourselves, about our fellowmen, and about life.²

Appendix I:
American Indians in LDS Church Periodicals (1941-1983)
The Children's Friend*


----------. "A New Name." August 1963, pp. 30-33.


Burleson, Helen L. "Como." 51 (1952), 184-85, 220.

*In 1958 The Children's Friend changed from continuous pagination throughout the annual volume to monthly pagination.
Capps, Mary J. "Cry of the Owl." September 1968, pp. 4-6.
Christensen, J. A. "How Corn Came to the Indians." November
1969, pp. 2-4.

Christensen, Jack A. "Benje's Goat." June 1959, pp. 5-8,
34-35.
Christensen, Joyce. "The Lost Trail." December 1964,
pp. 30-32, 48.
Collett, Farrell and Marty Collett. "Little Ute and the

"Little Ute Meets a Rock Dweller." 45 (1955),
288-89.

"Little Ute Smells a Skunk." 45 (1955), 449.

"Old Mister Bear Tells Little Ute a Bedtime
Cox, Nellie Iverson. "Little Lamanite Sister." October
1958, pp. 2-5, 41.
Dennis, Suzanne Easton. "Mahar and the White Magic." July
1969, pp. 36-38.
Driggs, Howard R. "Handcart Boy: Tepee Trail." 43 (1944),
484-85.

"Howard Discovers America." 53 (1954), 232-33,
280-81.
Foster, Irene. "The Indians are Coming." 40 (1941), 326.


---. "Kris Kringle Comes!" 56 (1957), 10-12.

---------. "A Papago Year—Month by Month with the Papago Indian." 43 (1944), 158.

---------. "A Papago Year—Season by Season with the Papago Indian." 43 (1944), 108.


Hinckley, Helen, "The Horse Trade." July 1966, pp. 2-5.


Knight, John M. "Missionaries to the Indians." 40 (1941), 300.


----------. "Ka-Teego of the Tangled Hills." November 1960, pp. 20-22, 44.

----------. "Redskin Ransome." 46 (1947), 94-96.

----------. "Stormy River." 49 (1950), 140-41, 178.

----------. "Traders of the Wilderness." 52 (1953), 276-77, 315.


Luce, Celia and Willard Luce. "Utah's Early People." 55 (1956), 224-25.


---------------. "The Wedding Shoes." 43 (1944), 300.

---------------. "Wetonah: Story of a Modern Indian Girl." September 1958, pp. 4-7.


Pace, Martha Ruth. "Indians in Ambush." 40 (1941), 313.


Peel, Johanna O. "An Experience with Indians." 40 (1941), 64-65.


Pringle, Murray T. "Mystery of the Redman's Penny." 52 (1953), 50.

------------. "Mystery of the Wooden Indian." April 1964, pp. 2-4; May 1964, pp. 10-12; June 1964, pp. 34-36, 43; July 1964, pp. 8-11; August 1964, pp. 36-38; September 1964, pp. 34-36.


----------. "Me Have Thanksgiving." November 1968, p. 10.


Tenny, Miles. "Saved by a Squaw." 40 (1941), 322.

Thomas, Estelle Webb. "Dez A-We." 40 (1941), 112-14, 135.

----------. "A Navajo Indian Folk Tale." 44 (1945), 229, 251.


Wolfe, Julia W. "Indian Children." 41 (1943), 516.


---------. "White Buffalo and the Tall One." 53 (1954), 273, 290, 293.


---------. "Learning the Best of Both Worlds' Cultures." December 1975, pp. 22-23.


Harris, Franklin S., III. "They Collected Legends." February 1977, pp. 80-82.


---------. "Toppling the College Barricade." December 1975, p. 25.


The Friend


Lundstrom, Harold. "Do You Think Only of Tom-toms When You Hear Someone Refer to American Indian Music?" February 1971, p. 43.


Boyce, George A. "Little No-Name's Grandson." 58 (1955), 704-06, 742, 744.


Hall, Eleanor M. "Quagunts." 51 (1948), 107-10.


Wangsgaard, Eva Wille. "To Bring the Chief His Son." 56 (1953), 158-59, 179-80.

Washburn, J. N. "Black Hawk." 50 (1947), 154, 166.


---------. "Unnamed but Honored." 52 (1949), 315.


Ashton, Wendell J. "They, Too are Pioneers." 93 (1958), 200-02.

---------. "Walpi." 93 (1958), back cover.

Barker, Clarence S. "Indian Mothers." 86 (1951), 238.

Bradford, Reed H. "We Are All His Children." 105 (1970), 402-04, 405.


Hatch, Boyd O. "Utah Trails Before the Mormons." 91 (1956), 169, 192.


---------. "An Indian Vision." 100 (1965), 363.


Lawrence, D. Max. ". . . But the Greatest of These is Love." 101 (1966), 344-45.


Porter, Elizabeth Cannon. "Chief Washakie." 82 (1947), 139.

The Liahona

Bloomfield, Lucy G. "Lamanite Song of Thanks." Fall 1963, p. 13.


--------- "Seed of Laman." 39 (1952), 75.

Collins, Helen Fletcher. "Nijoni (sic) (The Beautiful)." 51 (1964), 571.


Powell, Pansye H. "Indian Giver." 42 (1955), 784.

--------- "Navajo Weaver." 37 (1950), 505.

Roberts, Dorothy J. "Lehi Awakes Again." 40 (1953), 73.

Singley, Lottie H. "Maria's Return." 51 (1964), 571.


Appendix II:

A Partial List of Mormon Native American Artists
Basket Weavers
Tim McGee, Hualapai
Eleanor Maptis, Hualapai
Mardel Shing, Hopi

Beadwork
Lassie DeDios, Jicarilla Apache

Kachina Carvers
Douglas Douma, Hopi
Emil Pooley, Hopi
Lowell Talashoma, Hopi

Potters
Carolyn Browning, Laguna
Daisey Hooee, Hopi
Lucy McKelvey, Navajo
Fannie Nampeyo, Hopi
Isabelle Naranjo, Santa Clara Pueblo
Teresita Naranjo, Santa Clara Pueblo
Joy Navasie (Frog Woman), Hopi
Brenda Paloma, Zuni
Ida Redbird, Maricopa

Rug Weavers
Tiana Bighorse, Navajo
Cora Curley, Navajo
Esther Haskins, Navajo
Ora Jim, Navajo
Vida Jo, Navajo
Rose Keith, Navajo
Ruth Polacca, Navajo
Lilly Tachane, Navajo

Silversmiths and Jewelers
Paul Enciso, Apache/Pueblo
Wilbur Hunt, Acoma Pueblo
Glen Lucas, Hopi
Ramona Nez, Navajo
Bowman Paywa, Zuni
Wayne Sekaquaptewa, Hopi
Lee Yazzie, Navajo


Arnold, David L. "Pueblo Pottery: 2,000 Years of Artistry." National Geographic, 162 (1982), pp. 593-605.


Carter, Kate B., ed. "Early Arts and Crafts of the West." In Heart Throbs of the West, Vol. II. Salt Lake City, Utah: Daughters of Utah Pioneers, 1940, pp. 463-491.


Coates, Lawrence B. "Brigham Young and Mormon Indian Policies: The Formative Period, 1836-1851." Brigham Young University Studies, 18 (Fall 1978), pp. 428-452.


Cox, Kay H. Without Reservation. Salt Lake City, Utah: Bookcraft, 1980.


--------. "Seeking 'the Good, the Pure, the Elevating': A Short History of Mormon Fiction, Part 1." Ensign, June 1981, pp. 56-62.

--------. "Seeking 'the Good, the Pure, the Elevating': A Short History of Mormon Fiction, Part 2." Ensign, July 1981, pp. 56-61.


Eagle's Eye: Native American Studies Center, Brigham Young University, 15 (February 1983).


---------. "Sculptor Cyrus E. Dallin, Who Knew the Horse and Knew the Indian." The American West, 6, No. 6, pp. 22-23.


Fletcher, Dale E. "A Note on 'Baling Hay at Ganado.'" Brigham Young University Studies, 8 (1968), pp. 423-424.

Fox, Robert Barlow. Little Injun, Big Injun, Mormon Injun. Salt Lake City, Utah: Horizon, 1972.


-------------. The Lure of the Wigwam. Transcript presented to Brigham Young University, 30 November 1935.


-------------. To A Star: An Indian Lullaby. n.p., n.d.

Haseltine, James L., narration and documentation. 100 Years of Utah Painting: Selected Works from the 1840s to the 1940s. Exhibit Catalog, October 22-November 23, 1965, Salt Lake Art Center.


Hymns. Salt Lake City, Utah: The Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints, 1927.
Hymns. Salt Lake City, Utah: The Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints, 1948.


Jenks, Doyle. Telephone interview. 16 August 1983.


Maestas, John and Jeff Simons. The Lamanite: In the Words of the Prophets. n.p., n.d.


Mahonri M. Young; Retrospective Exhibition. Exhibit Catalog. 1940, Addison Gallery of American Art, Andover, Massachusetts.


----------. "LDS Southwest Indian Art." Ensign, September 1982, pp. 33-47.


Peterson, Mark E. Children of Promise. Salt Lake City, Utah: Bookcraft, 1981.


-----------. Profiles of a Proud People, Exhibit Pamphlet, Brigham Young University, Harris Fine Arts Center, Gallery 303, Provo, Utah, August 5-August 30, 1983.

-----------. Exhibit: Harmon Continuing Education Building, Brigham Young University.


Sing With Me; Songs for Children. Salt Lake City, Utah: Deseret Book Company, 1980.


Songs of Zion. Salt Lake City, Utah: The Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints, 1908.


Young, Karl. "Winter Feast at San Idelfonso." Brigham Young University Studies, 6 (1965), 93–99.

Young, Levi E. "Mahonri M. Young, Sculptor of 'This is the Place' Monument." Relief Society Magazine, 34 (1947), 435–44.

A PALE REFLECTION: AMERICAN INDIAN IMAGES IN MORMON ARTS

P. Jane Hafen
Department of Humanities
M.A. Degree, April 1984

ABSTRACT

American Indians in Mormon arts suffer from the imposition of the white man's traditional ideas, images and stereotypes. An examination of Mormon literature since 1941, Mormon hymns and music, and Mormon visual arts reveals little consideration of Native American values: tribal affiliation, significance of place and community, myth and ritual. While the mainstream of American art has incorporated Native American values into Indian representations, and even found a place for Native American artists, Mormon arts adhere to historical misinterpretations, despite a number of fine Mormon Native American artists.

COMMITTEE APPROVAL:
Richard H. Cracroft, Committee Chairman
Arthur R. Bassett, Committee Member
Steven P. Sondrup, Graduate Coordinator