

Brigham Young University BYU Scholars Archive

Faculty Publications

2020-05-04

A Qualitative Investigation of Middle School Students' Perceptions of Appropriate Instructional Practices in Physical Education

David C. Barney Brigham Young University, david_barney@byu.edu

Follow this and additional works at: https://scholarsarchive.byu.edu/facpub



Part of the Health and Physical Education Commons

BYU ScholarsArchive Citation

Barney, David C., "A Qualitative Investigation of Middle School Students' Perceptions of Appropriate Instructional Practices in Physical Education" (2020). Faculty Publications. 4173. https://scholarsarchive.byu.edu/facpub/4173

This Peer-Reviewed Article is brought to you for free and open access by BYU ScholarsArchive. It has been accepted for inclusion in Faculty Publications by an authorized administrator of BYU ScholarsArchive. For more information, please contact scholarsarchive@byu.edu, ellen_amatangelo@byu.edu.

Abstract Many middle school (MS) students have been exposed to many inappropriate instructional practices in physical education (PE). Involvement in, and exposure to these inappropriate instructional practices become common occurrences, causing students to believe this is what should take place in their PE class. The purpose of this study was to better understand MS students' perceptions and attitudes of appropriate instructional practices (AIP) in their PE classes. It was generally found from interviews that students perceived dodge ball to be acceptable, that wearing prescribed clothing (school shirt) will earn and easy 'A', and that having captains pick teams in front of the whole class all as appropriate practices for PE class.

26

27

28

29

30

31

32

33

34

35

36

37

38

39

40

41

42

43

44

45

46

24 Introduction

In 1992, the Council of Physical Education for Children (COPEC) published a position statement titled Developmentally Appropriate Physical Education Practices for Children. The National Association for Sport and Physical Education (NASPE) revised the document into three separate documents for elementary (2004a), middle school (2004b), and high school (2004c) physical education (PE). More recently, NASPE revised the Appropriate Instructional Practices (AIP) documents for elementary (2009a), middle school (2009b), and high school (2009c). In addition to other purposes, these documents "address key aspects of instructional strategies and practices that are essential to delivery of quality physical education to adolescents and young adults" (NASPE, 2000c). Another purpose for these documents is to give "specific guidelines for recognizing and implementing developmentally appropriate physical education activities and practices... practices that are in the best interests of children (appropriate) and those that are counterproductive or even harmful (inappropriate) need to be identified for the benefit of the students (NASPE, 2009c, p.7). With these purposes established, these documents serve as a tool "intended for policymakers, school administrators, and parents to provide specific guidelines...in the best interest of children" (2009a, p.7). The area of AIP in PE, research has been conducted among many different populations. For example, K-12 students (Barney & Christenson, 2014; Barney, Strand, & Prusak, 2013 & Barney & Strand, 2008), parents (Barney & Pleban, 2010), school administrators (Barney & Prusak, 2016), Physical Education Teachers Education (PETE) Majors (Barney, Christenson, & Pleban, 2012), PE teachers (Strand & Bender, 2011), and regular college students (Strand, Barney, & DeFries, 2008), have been studied to ascertain their knowledge of AIP in PE. After

analyzing the results from these populations there are several instructional practices that these populations have repeatedly misidentified as appropriate instructional practices for PE. For example, parents feel the curriculum should consist of large groups (teams) in game activities usually with one ball between the two teams. Another example of an inappropriate instructional practice is having captains pick teams in front of the whole class. This activity has happened for many years, leaving students hurt and embarrassed, along with wasting valuable class time. Yet, another example is the view that dodgeball is appropriate to play in PE class. This activity has been glamorized in movies (Cooper, Dobkins, & Gillespie, 2007) and print media (Reilly, 2001). The activity of dodgeball is typically enjoyed by males and disliked by females (Barney & Prusak, in press).

The AIP documents includes specific examples of appropriate and inappropriate instructional practices in PE. Research has identified two additional, specific inappropriate instructional practices that are commonly implemented in PE classes. The first, centers around students picking teams in front of the whole class. Barney, Prusak, Beddoes, & Eggett (2016) surveyed junior high school male students in PE class about picking teams. Students participated in two curriculum units (flag football and soccer). For these two units' students were picked by captains in front of their whole class or the teams were picked in a private draft with the PE teachers and captains. The researchers asked the PE teacher to have a captains pick teams for one unit and for the other unit, there would be the private meeting to select teams. After analyzing the data, the students did not express strong opinions or feelings about captains picking teams in front of their class or having a private draft. These results surprised the researchers, prompting a second study. The next study included units in basketball and volleyball and used the same methodology. Once again, the results were very similar to the data

from the flag football and soccer unit. The researchers decided to randomly interview the junior high school students to gain further insight. The results from the interviews painted a different picture. Students that were picked last or towards the end knew they would be picked last or towards the end and did not like how it felt to be picked last. The students that were captains and students who were picked first expressed empathy for those students picked towards the end. They stated that they felt "bad" for their classmates, and that they "wouldn't be thrilled" if they were picked last.

A second study instructional strategy looked specifically at exercise as punishment (EAP) in PE class. Barney, Fullmer, Higginson, Griffiths, & Whaley (2016) interviewed college-aged students regarding their thoughts and experiences of EAP during their time in K-12 PE. It was generally found that the college students in this study did not enjoy EAP while they were in K-12 PE. When the college students were asked how it made them feel when they experienced EAP, they said "it was humiliating", "it changes the mood [of the class]", and "embarrassed" when I had to run in front of my classmates. The college students were asked if EAP would have any effect on their future physical activity (PA). One student stated, "Why choose to do something that you've learned is a punishment." These two studies illustrate the impact these instructional practices can have on attitudes towards PE class and lifelong PA.

Many of these AIP studies have helped create a baseline of information helping PETE faculty better understand different populations and knowledge regarding instructional practices in PE. This information has been beneficial to current K-12 PE teachers and PETE faculty in preparations of their students. Although the many AIP studies that have been conducted, there is a paucity of qualitative results. This presents an opportunity to add to the AIP literature. Thus,

the purpose of this study was to better understand middle school (MS) students' perceptions and attitudes towards AIP in their PE classes.

94 Methods

Participants

This study included 25 students (eight males and 17 females; 12 6th graders, eight 7th graders and five 8th graders) from the southeastern region of the United States. Approval was obtained from the university institutional review board (IRB). The school district IRB gave approval, the researcher contacted the PE teachers at the MS to explain the study, which included student interviews. The four PE teachers (two males and two females) subsequently agreed to the study, as well.

Procedures

Over a three-day period, the researcher interviewed students, with parental consent, regarding their perceptions and attitudes regarding AIP in their PE classes Each interview took approximately 20 minutes and were audio recorded. All the students were asked the same questions during their interview. The interviews took place in an empty classroom in the gymnasium. At the conclusion of the interview the student would return to their PE class and activities.

Interview Questions

The interview questions that were formulated for this study came from the results of the Barney, Strand, and Prusak (2013) study. The results of the study found that students felt the following instructional practices were appropriate: a) teachers organizing activities involving large groups or teams with one ball for the activity, b) dodgeball, c) having captains pick teams in front of the whole class, and d) students' should be graded on wearing prescribed clothing and

e) students should being given outside-of-class assignments (homework) to apply what was taught in PE class.

Data Analysis

Participant responses to interview questions were analyzed for each interview question and reviewed to generate preliminary coding categories, with framework analysis methodology for participant responses, as outlined by Check and Schutt (2011). Framework analysis incorporated the stages of 1) familiarization, 2) thematic, 3) indentification and 4) charting and interpretation (Rabiee, 2004). The investigators used established categories from Barney, Strand and Prusak (2013) to sort the data. These categories included: a) student's participation in large groups or teams with one ball, b) dodgeball, c) students being graded on wearing prescribed clothing as part of their grade, d), out-of-class assignments (homework) is appropriate for PE class, and e) captains picking teams in front of the whole class (Table 1).

127 Results

Student Participation in Large Groups or Teams

Student comments regarding their participation in large groups or teams dealt with a lack of students not participating, leading to students goofing off. During interviews students that were more skilled didn't like or were frustrated when they participated in activities in large groups and teams with one ball. Fran said,

"Because we play with one ball, students will not pass the ball to everyone. I hate that. I want to play, but no one will throw the ball. Because of this there is lots of arguing, which is just a waste of time."

Malcolm said,

"When we play with large teams the best players will hog the ball and will be playing the

138 hardest. Those that are not playing are standing around and talking. I guess as they are standing around they can watch the others play and learn." 139 140 Steve stated, "I don't like playing on large teams. I can't play as well, and I can't shoot the ball as much. I get mad at those standing around, because they get in the way." And finally, Lindsey 141 142 stated, "It can be rough. Everybody is going for the one ball. Some of the players are standing 143 144 off to the side. The athletic ones are playing. The ones standing off to the side have their 145 phones out. If the ball comes to them, they throw the ball away. It is a big pain." 146 **Dodgeball** 147 The second category dealt with dodgeball being played in PE class. The theme that came 148 from this category was that both male and female students liked playing dodgeball in class. A 149 majority of students believed playing dodgeball was an appropriate activity. Many of the student 150 comments dealt with having fun while they played dodge ball. John said, 151 "I played dodgeball in elementary school and now in middle school we have played it. It 152 is so much fun to play. I am a baseball player, and I can throw the ball pretty good (the 153 student had a big grin on his face as he made this statement). When I hit someone, I 154 don't think it hurts because the ball is squishy." 155 Kelsey stated, "Dodgeball is so fun! It is fun throwing at people. It is also fun trying not getting 156 hit by the ball." The researcher asked Kelsey how other students might feel when they were hit 157 by the ball. She said, "It is probably a bummer. Maybe they are saying, "Dang! After they get 158 hit they probably want to get back in the game. I do!"

Wearing Prescribed Clothing for a Grade

159

The third category looked at wearing specific clothing (school shirt) for a student's grade. The theme from this interview question was that this method of grading was easily a main part of getting a good grade. Stephanie stated, "It's an easy 'A'. All you have to do is wear the [school] t-shirt and you will get a good grade. I don't think that is the best way to be graded in PE." The researcher asked Stephanie what she thought she should be graded on. She felt that a student be graded on "what we do in class. If we play the games and do our warm-ups." Gus said,

"I don't want to lose points for not wearing my [school] shirt. I guess it is OK. There really isn't much to grade in PE. So, they need to grade something. If that is what they want to grade on I am okay with it."

Along with comments Stephanie and Gus made, many of the other students that were interviewed voiced the same opinions of wearing the [school] shirt would help get and "easy 'A'." The other opinion was that they did not want to lose points because they did not wear the [school] shirt.

Out of Class Assignment

The fourth category had to do with out-of-class assignments in PE. The general theme for this category received a universal reaction of "Homework in PE? No way!" Not one student said they liked the idea, or they thought having homework was unnecessary. For example, Jodie said, "I think it is unnecessary. I would not do it. Besides I play on the volleyball and softball teams, so that is my homework for PE." Teresa stated, "It would frustrate me. I already have other school stuff to do. And plus, PE is a class to have fun. Having to do homework would take the fun out of PE class. That is just dumb." Janet summarized student feelings about out-of-class assignments in PE when she said,

"I am not sure it is a good idea. I do know that if we had out-of-class assignments in PE,

183

184

185

186

187

188

189

190

191

192

193

194

195

196

197

198

199

200

201

202

203

204

not many people would do them. They would need to be recorded to prove the Coach Smith (pseudonym) we did it to get the points."

Captains Picking Teams in Front of the Whole Class

The fifth and final category was captains picking teams in front of the whole class. The two themes that came from the interviews. The first was that picking teams was a common instructional practice and students were used to it. The second theme was they wanted to be picked by their friends or pick their friends to be on their team. For the first theme, Paul stated, "When I am captain I hurry and pick my team, because I want to get playing." The researcher then asked Paul how picking teams in front of the whole class made others feel. Paul said," I think they are okay with it. Every time we play basketball and soccer, we pick teams. We do it all the time." John said, "Picking teams is okay. Everyone thinks it is fair. The only people that are not happy are those girls that are not on the same team with their friends." Kim said, "When we pick teams, I don't like it, because it isn't fair." Kim's statement alludes to the fact that picking teams is a common instructional practice. The second theme that was common among the participants was being picked by their friends or picking their friends. Lindsey said, "When I am captain, I always pick my friends to be on my team. It makes the game so much funnier. Last year when I was captain, one of my friends was picked by another girl. My friend was so mad at me. So after that I would pick her first." Brent stated, I try to pick my friends, but they are pretty good [players], so they get picked first. The girls get all upset if they don't pick their friends. One time after their teams were picked,

they were trying to trade some other girls so they could have their friends with them."

Interestingly, not all students felt picking teams was a good instructional practice. A few of the students commented that when teams were picked, students were "hurt", "embarrassed", "they had a sad look on their face', and said "it would be a bummer."

208 Discussion

The purpose of this study was to better understand MS students' perceptions and attitudes towards AIP in their PE classes. The qualitative results from this study came from five categories from previous research (Barney, Strand, & Prusak, 2013). From these categories there came four themes from the MS student responses during the interviews. They were: 1) students like dodgeball in PE class, 2) wearing prescribed clothing is an easy 'A' in PE class, 3) out-of-class assignments are not good for PE and 4) picking teams in front of the class is a normal practice in PE class.

The theme of the appropriateness of playing dodgeball does not come as a surprise.

Dodgeball has been played in PE class, and other settings, for many years (Barney & Pleban, 2010). Dodgeball, for some people is a rite of passage in a becoming young man or young women (Reilly, 2001). Dodgeball has been promoted to improve a students' ability to jump, to avoid getting hit by the ball, improve a students' throwing ability and to be courageous during the game (Barney & Prusak, in press). From this study many of the students stated the game was "fun", "exciting", and "awesome." Yet, NASPE, has come out with a position statement regarding dodgeball. It states, "dodgeball is not an appropriate activity for K-12 school physical education programs" (NASPE, 2006). The document continues to state that dodge ball doesn't build confidence in students, weaker students are targeted, phrases like "throw-to-kill", "headshots" and "annihilate" are used, which are not appropriate. With this statement not endorsing dodgeball as an appropriate instructional practice, students indicated otherwise with

229

230

231

232

233

234

235

236

237

238

239

240

241

242

243

244

245

246

247

248

249

250

such statements like "Dodgeball is fun. It is fun throwing at people" and "Dodgeball is a good competitive game, and I am competitive, I want to win." This mindset of dodgeball being appropriate will continue until PE teachers, parents and school administrators act otherwise.

Students indicated that wearing prescribed clothing was a procedure to help get an easy 'A' in PE class. Student comments were centered around wearing the prescribed [school] shirt to receive the 'A' grade. One student stated, "If you don't wear the right shirt at all you could get a bad grade for the class." Another student said, "Wearing the [school] shirt is an easy way to get a good grade in PE. The 'A' I get in PE is great for my GPA." Here again, students felt that wearing prescribed clothing was an appropriate practice for them in their PE class. Yet, Miller (2002) stated that basing grades on dress, attendance and effort undermine PE class. Dress, attendance and effort are relevant assessments of students' affective skills related to physical education. Rather, PE teachers should explore a variety of alternative assessment techniques to analyze students' understanding and the teachers' effectiveness. It's also possible that students understand that dress, attendance and effort are not appropriate and meaningful measures in the psychomotor and cognitive domain and defaulted them to the affective domain. But that would mean they have an incomplete understanding of how the social/affective domain contributes to learning in PE (Barney & Strand, 2006). This instructional practice does not have the potential to negatively affect student attitudes towards PE or physical activity (PA) throughout their life. Yet, the message is sent to students, that wearing prescribed clothing and showing up to class will guarantee an "A' grade. The message being sent to students, parents, and school administrators is that PE is not important for student learning and that it is glorified recess. Here again, PE teachers need to change this instructional practice, which in turn, may start to change a person's perception and mindset regarding PE.

251

252

253

254

255

256

257

258

259

260

261

262

263

264

265

266

267

268

269

270

271

272

273

Another theme dealt with out-of-class assignments (homework) and finding them unnecessary for PE class. When students were asked during the interviews about out-of-class assignments many of them laughed at the idea of having 'homework' in PE class. Not one student felt out-of-class assignments could even be a part of PE class. One student openly and honestly stated, "I would never do homework for PE." Out-of-class assignments give students opportunities to apply what they were taught in class. Mitchell, Stanne and Barton (2000) studied attitudes of high school students towards out-of-class assignments in PE. Generally, the students in this study vocalized the importance of out-of-class assignments for them. Yet, the physical educators in this study felt the students were not giving their best efforts to complete given assignment. The results from this study illustrates that students do not take out-of-class assignments seriously. Here again, physical educators need to hold students responsible regarding out-of-class assignments. This instructional practice can greatly affect a student's experience in their PE class. As students are given out-of-class assignments and are successfully accomplished, skills can improve, resulting in greater confidence in participating in the given game or activity.

Finally, many of the students in this study felt that picking teams in front of the whole class was a common (and largely appropriate) instructional practice for PE class. This practice of picking teams in front of the whole class usually occurred when the class played basketball and soccer, as stated by a student when he stated, "every time we play basketball and soccer, we pick teams." The researcher felt from this statement, this practice was a common place occurrence, or a routine established with the students. Another point from this category was that the students wanted to be picked by their friends and be on the same team. Student responses to this interview question were, "I want to be picked by my friends', and "I like it better when I am

on the same team as my friends." These types of responses are similar to what Barney, Prusak, Beddoes, and Eggett (2016) learned from their study, investigated junior high school boy's experiences when teams are picked by captains. In follow-up interviews students stated that in many cases captains will pick their friends. With these two themes being repeated during the interviews, there were still statements made that picking teams with captains in front of the whole class was not liked by everyone. One student that was a captain said, "I bet students that are picked last probably feel bad." Another student stated, "I don't like to be captain, because I have to pick the last one [student] to be on my team. I don't like the look on their faces." Once again, these students' statements are similar to findings from Barney, Prusak, Beddoes, and Eggett (2016). From their study, students stated, "that being picked last "can be [a big deal] because it excludes people." Other comments were, "It is not fun being picked last", and "Being picked last means you don't have any friends." This instructional practice can be completely eliminated by the PE teacher by taking time to thoughtfully thinking through and creating teams before game play starts in PE class.

288 Conclusions

The purpose of this study was to better understand MS students' perceptions and attitudes towards AIP in their PE classes. Interviews conducted with MS students in this study once again reaffirms the importance of MS physical educators, and all K-12 physical educators, to implement AIP in their lessons and activities. The results from this study reveal that such instructional practices such as captains picking teams in front of the whole class, being graded on wearing prescribed clothing, and the playing of dodgeball are still taking place in MS PE classes. Physical educators need to evaluate their instructional practices and make adjustments if they are taking place in their classes. These instructional practices have the potential to negatively affect

student attitudes towards their PE classes and eventually have a negative impact in a students lifelong PA. Luckily, these students in this study that were interviewed did not have negative attitudes towards their PE experiences. During the interviews the researcher asked the students what they like about their PE class. Students responded by saying they liked the games and activities they participate in, their PE teachers, and the opportunity to be with friends and make friends. It is hoped through continued exposure to AIP in PE, MS students will have positive attitudes and a desire to be physically active throughout their lifetime. This being one method in helping to combat obesity (Committee of Prevention of Obesity in Children and Youth, 2005; Jain, 2004).

Study Limitations

Two primary limitations are noted for this study. Participants came from one middle school either in the region or across the nation or world. Research involving additional MS students is needed to ascertain the pervasiveness of these practices. Another limitation is the categories used narrowed what was studied: many other instructional practices could be investigated that related to AIP.

320	References
321	Barney, D., & Christenson, R. (2014). Elementary aged students' perceptions regarding
322	appropriate instructional practices in physical education. The Physical Educator, 71, (1),
323	41-58.
324	Barney, D., Christenson, R., & Pleban, F. (2012). Pre-service physical education teachers'
325	knowledge of appropriate instructional practices in secondary school physical education.
326	Journal of Teacher Education for Sustainability, 14, (1), 30-38.
327	Barney, D., Pleban, F., Fullmer, M.*, Griffiths, R.*, Higginson, K.*, & Whaley, D. (2016).
328	Appropriate or inappropriate practice: Exercise as punishment in physical education. The
329	Physical Educator, 73, (1), 59-73.
330	Barney, D., & Pleban, F. (2010). Parents knowledge of appropriate teaching practices in
331	elementary school physical education programs. International Journal about Parents in
332	Education, 4, (1), 1-10.
333	Barney, D., & Prusak, K. (2016). Do school administrators' know what practices are
334	appropriate in physical education? Asian Journal of Physical Education & Recreation,
335	22, (1), 53-63.
336	Barney, D., & Prusak, K. (in press). Will dodge ball ever die? Former K-12 students
337	experiences and perceptions of playing dodge ball in pe class. The Physical Educator
338	Barney, D., Prusak, K., Beddos, Z., & Eggett, D. (2016). Picking teams: Motivational effects of
339	team selection strategies in physical education. The Physical Educator, 73, (2), 230-254.
340	Barney, D., & Strand, B. (2006). Appropriate practices in elementary physical education:
341	Creating a foundation for physical education majors. Teaching Elementary Physical
342	Education, 17, (5), 20-23.

343	Barney, D., & Strand, B. (2008). Do high school students know what practices are appropriate in
344	physical education. High School Journal, 92, (1), 33-39.
345	Barney, D., Strand, B., & Prusak, K. (2013). Middle grade students' knowledge of appropriate
346	instructional practices in pe. The Global Journal of Health and Physical Education
347	Pedagogy, 2, (2), 165-176.
348	Check, J., & Schutt, R. (2011). Research methods in education. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
349	Committee on Prevention of Obesity in Children and Youth. (2005). Preventing childhood
350	obesity: Health in the balance. Washington, DC: Institute of Medicine.
351	Cooper, R. W. (Producer), Dobkin, D. (Producer), & Gillespie, C. (Director). (2007). Mr.
352	Woodcock [Motion Picture]. United States of America: New Line Cinema.
353	COPEC. (1992). Developmentally appropriate physical education practices for children. Reston
354	VA: National Association of Sport and Physical Education.
355	Jain, A. (2004). What works for obesity? A summary of the research behind obesity
356	interventions. London, England: BMJ.
357	Miller, D.K. (2002). Measurement by the physical educator: Why and how. Boston, MA:
358	McGraw-Hill.
359	Mitchell, M., Stanne, K., & Barton, G.V. (2000). Attitudes and behaviors of physical educators
360	regarding homework. The Physical Educator, 57, 136-146.
361	National Association of Sport and Physical Education. (2004a). Appropriate practices for
362	elementary school physical education. Reston, VA: Author.
363	National Association of Sport and Physical Education. (2004b). Appropriate practices for middle
364	school physical education. Reston, VA: Author.
365	

366	National Association of Sport and Physical Education. (2004c). Appropriate practices for high
367	school physical education. Reston, VA: Author.
368	National Association of Sport and Physical Education. (2009a). Appropriate instructional
369	practice guidelines for elementary school physical education. Reston, VA: Author.
370	National Association of Sport and Physical Education. (2009b). Appropriate instructional
371	practice guidelines for middle school physical education. Reston, VA: Author.
372	National Association of Sport and Physical Education. (2009c). Appropriate instructional
373	practice guidelines for high school physical education. Reston, VA: Author.
374	Rabiee, F. (2004). Focus-group interview and data analysis. <i>Proceedings of the Nutrition Society</i> ,
375	63, 655-660. https://doi.org.10.1079/PNS200439.
376	Reilly, R. (2001. May). The weak shall inherit the gym. Sport Illustrated, 94 (20), 96.
377	Strand, B., Barney, D., & DeFries-Evans, N.* (2008). Knowledge of appropriate practices in
378	elementary school physical education: Research to application in a teacher preparation
379	program. ICHPER*SD Journal of Research, 3, (2), 24-30.
380	Strand, B., & Bender, V. (2011). Knowledge and use of appropriate instructional strategies by
381	physical education teachers. The Physical Educator, 68, 2-17.
382	
383	
384	
385	
386	
387	
388	

389 390 391 Table 1 List of Appropriate Instructional Practices (AIP) Categories and Student Interview Themes 392 393 394 395 **AIP Categories** Themes 396 397 398 Student Participation in Large * Students Goofing off 399 Groups or Teams * Not enough Interaction with the Ball 400 401 * Student like playing Dodge Ball 402 Dodge Ball *It is fun 403 404 405 406 Wearing Prescribed Clothing * Wearing the [school] shirt aids in getting an easy 'A' 407 408 409 * Homework in PE? No way. 410 Out-of-class Assignments (homework) *Students wouldn't do it (homework) 411