

Journal of Book of Mormon Studies

Volume 9 | Number 1

Article 10

1-31-2000

Response to the Comments

Paul Y. Hoskisson

Follow this and additional works at: https://scholarsarchive.byu.edu/jbms

BYU ScholarsArchive Citation

Hoskisson, Paul Y. (2000) "Response to the Comments," *Journal of Book of Mormon Studies*: Vol. 9 : No. 1 , Article 10.

Available at: https://scholarsarchive.byu.edu/jbms/vol9/iss1/10

This Feature Article is brought to you for free and open access by the Journals at BYU ScholarsArchive. It has been accepted for inclusion in Journal of Book of Mormon Studies by an authorized editor of BYU ScholarsArchive. For more information, please contact scholarsarchive@byu.edu, ellen_amatangelo@byu.edu.



BRIGHAM YOUNG UNIVERSITY • PROVO, UTAH

Title Response to the Comments

Author(s) Paul Y. Hoskisson

Reference *Journal of Book of Mormon Studies* 9/1 (2000): 38–39, 77–78.

ISSN 1065-9366 (print), 2168-3158 (online)

Abstract

Hoskisson responds to and elaborates on the comments about the names *Lehi* and *Sariah* that Chadwick, Pike, and Tvedtnes provided in this onomastic discussion. Where Hoskisson disagrees with their conclusions, he uses examples to defend his position. He acknowledges the contribution this discussion has provided to the study of Book of Mormon proper names. He welcomes further examples on the points suggested by these scholars.

Response to the Comments

PAUL Y. HOSKISSON

As stated at the end of my article, "new suggestions are always welcome" when working with the onomasticon of the Book of Mormon. Therefore, I appreciate very much the helpful suggestions of Jeffrey R. Chadwick, Dana M. Pike, and John A. Tvedtnes. Each has contributed in a significant way to making the study of the names more complete.

I am grateful that John Tvedtnes called my attention to Jeffrey Chadwick's publication in the *Journal*,¹ in which Sariah is supposedly attested as a feminine personal name in the Elephantine papyri. The attestation is however contained in a restoration, and restorations cannot provide absolute proof but rather at best a suggestion. However, the very suggestion itself indicates that other scholars accept the possible existence of this feminine name in relative temporal proximity to the beginnings of the Book of Mormon.²

Sariah can mean "Jehovah is my prince," contrary to Chadwick's explanation, as well as "Jehovah is prince." In Northwest Semitic languages, when the first person possessive suffix is attached to masculine singular nouns in the nominative, it is indicated by the long vowel $\bar{\imath}$, not by the consonant *yod*. (Feminine nouns and oblique cases are treated variously.) This long vowel is not usually represented in the script until fairly late in the history of the Hebrew language when matres lectionis (the representation of long vowels with a consonant) became the norm. In addition, personal names can be very conservative, often reflecting archaic forms. Thus, in personal names such as Sariah, the presence of a yod at the beginning of the second element in the word does not exclude the presence of the first person possessive suffix. In short, the yod that Chadwick mentions does not have to perform double duty in order for the name to mean "Jehovah is my prince," even though there is evidence that some letters actually perform double duty.3

Professor Pike calls attention to the so-called Phoenician personal name *šlmlhy*, containing a possible analog to Lehi, namely the element *lhy*. In commenting on the text that contains this name, Joseph Naveh states "that we have here a Phoenician cursive script from the Persian period . . . [belong-

ing] to the late fifth or early fourth century B.C."4 This would of course postdate Lehi but still be relatively close to the beginnings of the Book of Mormon. However, he also states that the element lhy is "an unusual component in the Phoenician onomasticon." Nevertheless, he argues that since it appears in a list of other obviously Phoenician names and that the ductus is obviously Phoenician, the element, though unusual, is Phoenician. Frank L. Benz, in his classic study of Phoenician names published six years later, concluded that the element *lḥy* is of Arabic derivation, ⁶ perhaps because he can cite only Arabic parallels. Certainly there is some doubt about whether this name is Phoenician. In addition, from a strictly geographic point of view, Elath, where the text was found, is much more likely to be within the onomastic influence of Arabia than Phoenicia, though as Naveh points out, Phoenicians were certainly present there. What all of this means is that if *šlmlhy* is not Phoenician, then there is no unequivocal example of the element *lhy* in the Northwest Semitic onomasticon.

Dr. Chadwick argues that Book of Mormon "Lehi" and the KJV "Lehi" "must necessarily represent the same Hebrew term." This bothers me a little because it assumes that Joseph Smith was dependent on the KJV for pronunciation. While this may be the case with some recognized biblical names, such as "Sarah," it cannot be maintained across the board. For example, it is not the case with the Book of Mormon "Isabel," which certainly is the same name as "Jezebel," the name of the Phoenician wife of the Israelite king Ahab.

With regard to body parts appearing in personal names, I stand by my original statement: there is only one possible example in biblical Hebrew, and even that example is metaphorical. If, however, denominatives (nouns that have become verbs and therefore lost their nominal character) are counted, as Chadwick has done, but which I must reject, then there are a few examples. The example of ipi that he raises needs more comment. While it may have originally meant "beard," the word became denominalized (in Hebrew, Arabic, and Akkadian), coming to mean "to grow old." In its adjectival (i.e., stative) form derived from the verb it came to mean "old" and in the nominalized adjectival form, "elder." In these secondarily derived meanings, it is also used to describe women (see Zechariah 8:4), which probably rules out the meaning "beard." Neither is ימין, yamīn,

a valid example. While "right" can be used *pars pro toto* for "right hand," the original meaning is directional rather than anatomical. That is why some modern scholars translate "Benjamin" as "Son of the South." It cannot be assumed that "right" is always used synecdochically for "right hand." Therefore, I state once again, there are no unequivocal examples in biblical Hebrew of a body part being used in its strictly nominal form in any Hebrew name.

With regard to geographic names becoming personal names, there is not a single example that I am aware of in the Old Testament. (I would be delighted if someone could supply an example.) On the other hand, there are numerous examples of personal names becoming geographic names. Such is the case with all of the examples that Chadwick cites.

Lehi and Family Leaving by Sue Hansen. © Courtesy Sue Hansen.

However, my argument here is basically an argument out of silence: in all instances where a personal name and a geographic name coincide, the personal name always appears in the Hebrew text in a context prior to the context of the geographic name. I would welcome a clear example of a geographic name becoming a personal name.⁷

Professor Pike correctly perceived that my mention of the suitability of certain etymologies does not mean that suitability points to an etymology or even that suitability is an important factor in looking for meaning. When looking for possible meanings, suitability does not equate with etymology. However, the suitability of a name to an individual does come into play when the proposed etymology of the name would seem to be inappropriate. For

example, it would be unlikely that "Hater of Jehovah" would be possible for an Israelite of the tenth century B.C. Before accepting such an etymology, no matter how tempting it might be, most scholars would certainly ask many questions and have grave doubts. Nevertheless, some names seem, from their etymology and from the context in which they occur, to be suitable for that individual, even if we would find it hard to believe that someone would legitimately carry that name. For example, Chadwick cites in his critique the example of Nabal, which does mean "fool," If it were not for the context of the story, which makes it clear that the name is entirely suitable to the person who bears it, we would have to doubt the meaning, because no parent would give such a name to their child, nor would any sane person take such a name upon themselves. We are left to conclude that the name is probably a dysphemism à la Nebuchadnezzar for Nebuchadrezzar. As a dysphemism, the name suits the person.

- 23 William W. Phelps, "An angel came down from the mansions of glory," in Smith, A
- 24 See, for example, "The Indian Hunter" track?") by the English poet Eliza Cook (1818-1889), one of three Cook poems anthologized in Hazel Felleman, comp., The Best Loved Poems of the American People (New York: Doubleday, 1936), 625; Whittier: "My father loved the white men, when / They were but children, shelterless, . . . / Nor was it given him to know / Would rise at length, like armëd men, / To work his people's overthrow," The Houghton, Mifflin, and Co., 1894), 489. Eliza R. Snow was also fond of this tradi-1830, five years before she became a Latter-day Saint) was "The Red Man of the West": "The Great Spirit, 'tis said, to our forefathers gave / All the lands 'twixt Star, 31 March 1830. Much later she poem, retitling it "The Lamanite." It was published in the *Deseret News*, 20 September 1865. The expanded version now becloud their eyes, / And they, in
- 25 Grant Underwood, "Book of Mormon Usage in Early LDS Theology," Dialogue
- long had lain," in Young, Pratt, and in Europe, (1840), #258.
- 27 Parley P. Pratt, "The solid rocks were rent
- 29 Author unknown, "Ye wond'ring nations
- 30 When the plight of the Indians was treated in popular poetry, it was common for an Indian persona to speak a first-person lament; all three hymns printed with this
- (Boston: O. Ditson, 1906), #9.
- 32 The tune paired with this text in the Psalmody (#212) is "See, the conq'ering hero" from George Frideric Handel's 1974)—high expectations indeed from a
- 33 Louisa L. Greene Richards, "The Savior at Songs, #131.
- 34 J. Marinus Jensen, "A Voice Hath Spoken
- 35 This hymn is not listed under the Book of Mormon heading in the topical index! of the inclusive, ecumenical use it makes of the Book of Mormon, but apparently

- 36 Although the Book of Mormon presence in our modern hymnbook is rather modest, other kinds of music make rich use of Mormon heading in Children's Songs lists only twelve songs, many of these are immensely popular, and they play a crucial role in familiarizing young Latter-day in the works of serious Latter-day Saint composers, including Leroy Robertson's Oratorio from the Book of Mormon (Salt Cumorah Pageant, Music from the Hill Cumorah Pageant: America's Witness for Other examples are numerous. K. Newell 3 Nephi 13-14, "I Come unto My Own," Ralph G. Rodgers Jr. (lyrics), III Nephi market has used the Book of Mormon works, without the strict requirements of English-speaking LDS people is "Oh, That I Were an Angel" (Alma 29:1; music by
- 37 Alfred Tennyson (lyrics), Crawford Gates (music), "Ring Out, Wild Bells," in
- Lake City: Deseret Sunday School Union,
- 39 Noel B. Reynolds, "The Coming Forth of the Book of Mormon in the Twentieth Century," BYU Studies 38/2 (1999): 7.
- 40 Conversation with the author, 30

Seeking Agreement on the Meaning of Book of Mormon Names

al chapters in Lehi in the Desert and The Bookcraft, 1952). Robert F. Smith private ly distributed several papers that are still 141 (December 1977): 1-8. Joann Carlton, a Semiticist in southern a 1981 FARMS Paper, "Possible Linguistic Methodology for the Study of the Proper

and Stephen D. Ricks (Salt Lake City: Deseret Book and FARMS, 1990),

Lehi and Sariah

- See Ludwig Koehler and Walter Baumgartner, Hebräisches und 3rd ed., rev. Walter Baumgartner, Johann the "Name List" in Appendix 3 of Jeaneane D. Fowler, Theophoric Personal Names in Ancient Hebrew (Sheffield: JSOT the word for "ear," are probably denomi-Baumgartner, Hebräisches und Aramä-
- Chicago Assyrian Dictionary, L:150. I would like to thank Jonathan Gimmel for
- tury, was one of the first to derive the personal name lhy from "cheek" or "jaw interpretation, preferring Nelson Glueck's reading "Lahai," thus suggesting the bibliand 25:11. See Hugh W. Nibley, An Approach to the Book of Mormon (Salt Lake City: Deseret Book and FARMS,
- Hani Hayajneh, Die Personen den qatabānischen Inschriften (New York: meaning "Beauty (of God)." Note the semantic parallel in Akkadian, lú-ba-lí-1‡, (Chicago, University of Chicago Press,
- Translation from the Jewish Publication
- Zadok, The Pre-Hellenistic Israelite Anthroponymy and Prosopography (Leuven: Peeters, 1988), 61; "Lā'el (W)"

The Names Lehi and Sariah-Language and Jeffrey R. Chadwick

- The name also appears in Lachish Letter
- Ibid., seal #145 and p. 496. If "Aḥazyahu the Elder" were implied, the

- word pt (zagen) would need to include an initial π (\hat{h}) representing the direct object ha and would need to appear in a position following the name Aḥazyahu, as

- Jeffrey R. Chadwick, "Sariah in the Elephantine Papyri," JBMS 2/2 (1993):
- Ibid., xv; Bezalel Porten, Archives from Elephantine (Berkeley: University of
- California Press, 1968), 320. See 2 Samuel 8:17; 2 Kings 25:18; 23:25; 7:1; Nehemiah 10:2; 11:11; 12:1, 12;
- 10 Nahman Avigad, Hebrew Bullae from the Exploration Society, 1986), 47.

Response to Paul Hoskisson's "Lehi and Dana M. Pike

- See, for example, F. Brown, S. R. Driver, and C. Briggs, Hebrew and English Lexicon Hebrew and Aramaic Lexicon of the Old
- and Humanities, 1997), 163, #390.
- Phoenician and Punic Inscriptions (Rome: Biblical Institute, 1972), 180, 338, 418.
- See Mary Jane Woodger, "How the English Pronunciation of Book of

- 1 Jeffrey R. Chadwick, "Sariah in the Elephantine Papyri," JBMS 2/2 (1993):
- See John A. Tvedtnes, John Gee, and Matthew Roper, "Book of Mormon Names Attested in Ancient Hebrew Inscriptions," in this issue

Response to the Comments Paul Y. Hoskisson

- Jeffrey R. Chadwick, "Sariah in the Elephantine Papyri," JBMS 2/2 (1993): 196-200.
- In the original article I could have added more examples of the masculine name שריהו, but it seemed to me unnecessary. A clear-cut example of the name used for a female would be more helpful.
- ורפאל is interpreted as רפאל, "god has 3

- healed." The aleph that closes the first word also begins the second word. In essence the aleph is doubled, though the orthography would never reveal it.
- "The Scripts of Two Ostraca from Elath," Bulletin of the American School of Oriental Research 183 (1966): 27.
- 5 Ibid., 27-28.
- Frank L. Benz, Personal Names in the Phoenician and Punic Inscriptions (Rome: Biblical Institute, 1972), 338.
- Gentilic personal names from geographic names, of course, cannot be used as evidence because such names really mean "of the geographic feature X." A special case may be "Anathoth," which Professor Pike drew to my attention. This toponym is likely used as a personal name in two passages in the Bible after it first appears as a place name. However, this name can only be derived from the divine name Anath, a Canaanite goddess, in which case we have a divine name becoming a place name becoming a personal name. This is not the same as a purely geographic name becoming a personal name.

Book of Mormon Names Attested in Ancient

- Jeffrey R. Chadwick, "Sariah in the 196-200. The name is known from three Benjamin Sass, Corpus of West Semitic two bullae: Nahman Avigad, Hebrew (Jerusalem: Israel Exploration Society, in Syria, M. de Vogüé, "Intailles à légendes
- Paul Y. Hoskisson, "Alma as a Hebrew the discussion in David K. Geilman,
- Semitic Alma," JBMS 8/1 (1999): 70.
- fire from critics, who claim that it is from man's name as it appears on the Bar

- ed. (Salt Lake City: Deseret Book and FARMS, 1988), 95-97, 106, 113, 128; Lehi from a Book of Mormon Scholar (Salt Lake
- See 2 Samuel 8:17; 2 Kings 25:18, 23;
- Benjamin Sass, Corpus of West Semitic
- Robert Deutsch, Messages from the Past: Center Publications, 1997), 67-68.

- New Epigraphic Evidence from the Biblical Publication, 1995), 89-90.
- 15 M. A. Sbresny, Mormonism: As It Is To-
- 16 Jerald Tanner and Sandra M. Tanner, Ministry, 1987), 95.
- 17 William F. Albright to Grant S. Heward,

- Princeton University Press, 1969), 2-3,
- 21 See 1 Kings 11:29-30; 12:15; 14:2, 4-6, 18;
- (1961): 107; Nahman Avigad, "A Group of Hebrew Seals," Eretz-Israel 9 (1969): 5, pl. Nahman Avigad, "New Names on Hebrew Seals," Eretz-Israel 12 (1975): 70, pl. 14:16 Statement 56 (1924): 183-86, pl. VI;

- J. T. Milik, "Notes d'Épigraphie et de Topographie Palestiniennes. I: L'Ostracon de l'Ophel et la Topographie de Israel Exploration Journal 36 (1986): 28f. Y. Shoham, "A Group of Hebrew Bullae Letters (London: Oxford, 1938), 51; Avigad and Sass, West Semitic Stamp Seals, 69. The feminine form, 4t, is (1958): 228-30; Avigad and Sass, West
- Evidence, 21-23; Avigad and Sass, West
- 24 G. A. Reisner, Harvard Excavations at
- Harrassowitz, 1983), 134-35, pl. 79.
- 26 Aharoni, Arad Inscriptions, 80, 93, 97
- 28 M. Kochavi, "Khirbet Rabûd = Debir," Tel Aviv 1 (1974): 18; Avigad and Sass, West
- Semitic Stamp Seals, 200. 29 Avigad and Sass, West Semitic Stamp
- 30 Yigael Shiloh, "A Hoard of Hebrew Bullae Eretz-Israel 18 (1985): 80; Shiloh, "Bullae
- 31 Nahman Avigad in Supplements to Vetus 20 (1989a): 90.
- 32 Hugh Nibley, An Approach to the Book of Mormon, 283, 288-89; Nibley, Teachings
- 33 Avigad and Sass, West Semitic Stamp
- 35 Wesley P. Walters, "The Use of the Old Testament in the Book of Mormon, Seminary, 1981), 18.
- Tests for the Authorship of the Book of

- University of Chicago, 1931), 49-68, figs. 33-34; Avigad and Sass, West Semitic
- Ancient Seals" (in Hebrew), Bulletin of the
- 40 Nahman Avigad, "The Seal of Jezebel,"
- ostraca, Aharoni, Arad Inscriptions, 46f., 100; on a jar stamp, E. Grant and G. College, 1939), 80, pl. III:4; on six seals, (1901): 56f.; L. A. Wolfe and F. Sternberg, Objects with Semitic Inscriptions, 1100 (1968), 167, pl. XI:6-7; Yohanan Aharoni, Shallûm (KJV Shallum) for Shelemi
- P. R. S. Moorey (Oxford: Clarendon,
- 44 Torczyner, Lachish I, 37, 51, 117; Diringer,
- 39:4; 40:5 in A. Cowley, Aramaic Papyri of 1923). E. G. Kraeling, The Brooklyn