



10-1-1980

Addenda to "Explaining the Change from Republic to Principate in Rome"

Jürgen Deininger
Universität Hamburg

Follow this and additional works at: <https://scholarsarchive.byu.edu/ccr>

Recommended Citation

Deininger, Jürgen (1980) "Addenda to "Explaining the Change from Republic to Principate in Rome",
Comparative Civilizations Review: Vol. 5 : No. 5 , Article 6.
Available at: <https://scholarsarchive.byu.edu/ccr/vol5/iss5/6>

This Article is brought to you for free and open access by the Journals at BYU ScholarsArchive. It has been accepted for inclusion in Comparative Civilizations Review by an authorized editor of BYU ScholarsArchive. For more information, please contact scholarsarchive@byu.edu, ellen_amatangelo@byu.edu.

ADDENDA TO "EXPLAINING THE CHANGE FROM REPUBLIC TO PRINCIPATE IN ROME"

Jürgen Deininger

[The Editors regret the omission of the notes to Jürgen Deininger's article, which appeared in the previous issue of this *Review*.]

The article which appeared in No. 4 was delivered as a lecture at the Institute for Advanced Study, Princeton, N.J. (Dec. 1979) and at Columbia University, New York (Feb. 1980); an earlier German version had been read before the Mommsen-Gesellschaft at Augsburg and included in the unpublished Festschrift for W. Schmitt-henner in 1976. The English translation was prepared with the invaluable and patient assistance of Dr. Susan M. Babbitt, of the Institute for Advanced Study. I hope to treat the whole subject more thoroughly elsewhere; but the following notes and bibliographical references seem to me to be indispensable for a correct understanding of the text. - For the jurist Pomponius (p. 80 of the article) see *Digest* 1,2,9-12; cf. also, for ancient opinions, e.g., Tacitus, *Histories* 1,16,1; Dio Cassius 52,15,6ff.

The following list contains, in alphabetical order, the authors and titles of books mentioned in the article, and, if necessary, references to the pages quoted.

- P.A. Brunt, *Italian Manpower 225 B.C. - A.D. 14* (Oxford, 1971) esp. p. 155; cf. also *id.*, "The Army and the Land in the Roman Revolution," *Journal of Roman Studies* 52 (1962), esp. p. 84.
- K. v. Fritz, *The Theory of the Mixed Constitution in Antiquity* (New York 1954); esp. ch. 10 (pp. 253-305).
- M. Gelzer, *Kleine Schriften*, vol. 2 (Wiesbaden, 1963). For the reference on p. 92 of the article, see p. 341 (review of F. Münzer, *Die Entstehung des römischen Principats. Ein Beispiel des Wandels von Staatsformen*, 1927).
- E.S. Gruen, *The Last Generation of the Roman Republic* (Berkeley-Los Angeles, 1974), For the quotation (p. 88 of the article) see p. 4; for 'other authors' (p. 97 of the article) cf. Bringmann (below, under Mommsen) p. 361f. as well as K. Christ, *Krise und Untergang der römischen Republik* (Darmstadt, 1979), p. 6f.

- Problem des 'Sittenverfalls'" (1959), now in his *Geschichte als kirtische Wissenschaft*, vol. 3 (Darmstadt, 1979), pp. 22-47 (for criticism of the concept of moral decay).
- A. Heub, "Der Untergang der römischen Republik und das Problem der Revolution," *Historische Zeitschrift* 182 (1956), pp. 1-28; for the quotation (p. 87 of the article) see p. 24f.
- D. Hume's *Political Essays*, ed., with an introduction, by Charles W. Hendel (New York, 1953). For the remarks on p. 81 and 99 of the article, see "Idea of a Perfect Commonwealth," esp. p. 157f.
- J.A.O. Larsen, *Representative Government in Greek and Roman History* (Berkeley-Los Angeles, 1955).
- Chr. Meier, *Res publica amissa* (Wiesbaden, 1966); for the considerations on the vigor of the republican order in Rome, p. 101 of the article, see pp. 151-161.
- Ed. Meyer, *Caesars Monarchie und das Principat des Pompeius*, 3rd ed. (Stuttgart-Berlin, 1922); for the citation (p. 87 of the article), see p. 5.
- J. Molthagen, "Rückwirkungen der römischen Expansion. Der Übergang von der Republik zum Prinzipat - eine Revolution?" I. Geiss and R. Tamchina (eds.), *Ansichten einer künftigen Geschichtswissenschaft*, vol. 2 (Munich, 1974), p. 34ff. (against the modern notion of "revolution" for characterizing the change to monarchy in Rome - see p. 100 of the article; cf. also, in this sense, Bringmann (below, under Mommsen) pp. 354-377 as well as E. Tornow, *Der Revolutionsbegriff und die späte römische Republik - eine Studie zur deutschen Geschichtsschreibung im 19. und 20. Jh.* (Frankfurt a.M., 1978) and e.g., F. de Martino, *Storia della costituzione romana*, 2nd. ed., vol. 4,1 (Naples, 1974), pp. 1-46.
- Th. Mommsen, *Römische Geschichte*, 10th ed., vols. 2,3 (Berlin, 1908-1909). For the references (pp. 84 and 87 of the article) cf. Vol. 2, p. 380; vol. 3, p. 356. - For Mommsen, see now also the short remarks of K. Bringmann, "Das Problem einer 'Römischen Revolution'," *Geschichte in Wissenschaft und Unterricht* 31 (1980), pp. 354ff.
- Montesquieu, *Considérations sur les causes de la grandeur des Romains et de leur décadence* (Garnier edition, Paris 1967). For the quotation (p. 81 of the article) see ch. 9 (p. 50 in the Garnier ed.).
- Id.*, *L'Esprit des lois*, 2 vols. (Garnier edition, Paris 1961). See notably book 8, chs. 16-20 (vol. 1, p. 131ff. in the Garnier edition).
- F. Münzer: see M. Gelzer.
- C. Neumann, *Geschichte Roms während des Verfalls der Republik, vom Zeitalter des Scipio Aemilianus bis zu Sulla's Tode*, vol. 1

- (Breslau, 1881), esp. ch. 1 (pp. 1-103). - Mention could also be made, e.g., of F.B. Marsh, *The Founding of the Roman Empire*, end ed. (Oxford, 1927), with its two introductory chapters: "The Administrative Problems of the Republic" (pp. 1-20) and "The Development of the Military System" (pp. 21-49).
- J.G.A. Pocock, *The Machiavellian Moment. Florentine Political Thought and the Atlantic Republican Tradition* (Princeton, 1975); see esp. pp. 194-218, 383-400.
- A. V. Premerstein, *Vom Werden und Wesen des Prinzipats* (Munich, 1937).
- H. Schneider, *Wirtschaft und Politik. Untersuchungen zur Geschichte der späten römischen Republik* (Diss. Marburg; Erlangen, 1974); for references, see esp. pp. 318; 485; 488f. Cf., of the same author, *Die Entstehung der römischen Militärdiktatur. Krise und Niedergang einer antiken Republik* (Cologne, 1977); id., "Sozialer Konflikt in der Antike: Die späte römische Republik," *Geschichte in Wissenschaft und Unterricht* 27 (1976), pp. 597-613; also, 'Einleitung', in: *Zur Sozial- und Wirtschaftsgeschichte der späten römischen Republik* (herausgeg. v. H. Schneider) (Darmstadt, 1976), pp. 1ff. - Against the views of Schneider, cf. also Bringmann (see above, Mommsen), op. cit., p. 365; p. 371, n. 8.
- J.P. Sharma, *Republics in Ancient India, c. 1500 B.C. - 500 B.C.* (Leiden, 1968) (for the interesting (and exceptional) case of small "republican" states in early India; cf. p. 98 of the article).
- Q. Skinner, *The Foundations of Modern Political Thought, vol. 1: The Renaissance* (Cambridge, 1978). See p. 53 for Bartolus; on p. 151f. also Giulio Pomponio (1428-1497) and Mario Salamonio (c. 1450-1530) are cited for similar views as Bartolus's.
- R.E. Smith, *The Failure of the Roman Republic* (Cambridge, 1955); cf. p. 164. See also the review of W. Schmitthenner, *Gymnasium* 66 (1959), p. 70ff.
- R. Syme, *The Roman Revolution* (Oxford, 1939). For the references in the article, see pp. VIII, 4. - Cf., for a similar approach, the same author's Todd Memorial Lecture, "A Roman Post-Mortem. An Inquest on the Fall of the Roman Republic" (1950), now included in: R. Syme, *Roman Papers*, ed. E. Badian, vol. 1 (Oxford, 1979), pp. 205-217. For some limits of Syme's perspectives, see the review of *The Roman Revolution* by A. Momigliano, *Journal of Roman Studies* 20 (1940), pp. 77ff.
- S.L. Utchenko, *Krizis i padenie rimskoj respubliki (The crisis and fall of the Roman republic, in Russian)* (Moscow, 1965). The quotation on p. 87 of the article is from p. 3. - For the change from Republic to Principate in Soviet historiography, see id., "Stanovlenie rimskoj imperii i problema social'noj revolucii"

("The establishment of the Roman Empire and the problem of social revolution," in Russian), in: *Voprosy istorii* 1964, 7, pp. 106-118; E.M. Shtaerman, "Problema padenija rimskoj respubliki v sovetskoj istoriografii" ("The problem of the fall of the Roman republic in Soviet historiography," in Russian), *ibid.*, 1966, 3, pp. 83-93; K.P. Korzheva, "Problema upadka i padenija rimskoj respubliki v sovetskoj istoriografii" ("The problem of the decline and fall of the Roman republic in Soviet historiography," in Russian), in: *Acta Conventus XI Eirene* (Warsaw, 1971), pp. 147-160; also, M. Raskolnikoff, *La recherche en Union soviétique et l'histoire économique et sociale du monde hellénistique et romain* (Strasbourg, 1975), pp. 126ff.; 171ff.; 234ff.